

| CRITERIA | INDICATORS OF SUPERIOR QUALITY | MEETS METRICS (Yes/No) | JUSTIFICATION/ COMMENTS WITH EXAMPLES |
|---|--|---------------------------|--|
| I. Text Selection | | | |
| <p>Tier 1 and 2 Non-Negotiable 1. COMPLEXITY OF TEXTS: Materials present a progression of complex texts as stated by Reading Standard 10.³</p> <p><i>(Note: In K and 1, Reading Standard 10 refers to read-aloud material, which is typically from grades 2+. Complexity standards for student-read texts are applicable for grades 2+.)</i></p> <p><input type="checkbox"/> Yes <input type="checkbox"/> No</p> | <p>REQUIRED 1a) In grades 2-12, materials provide texts that are appropriately complex for the identified grade level according to the requirements outlined in the standards. Measures for determining complexity include quantitative and qualitative analysis.⁴ Poetry and drama are analyzed only using qualitative measures.</p> <p>In grades K-2, extensive read-aloud texts allow sufficient opportunity for engagement with text more complex than students could read themselves.</p> | | |
| | <p>REQUIRED 1b) Texts increase in complexity as materials progress throughout the grade level and across grade bands. Read-aloud texts follow the same trend, although they may have greater variability because listening skills in elementary school generally outpace reading skills.</p> | | |
| <p>Tier 1 and 2 Non-Negotiable 2. QUALITY OF TEXTS: Texts are of sufficient scope and quality to provide text-centered and integrated learning that is sequenced and scaffolded to advance students toward independent reading of grade level texts and build content knowledge (ELA, social studies, science and technical subjects, and the arts). The quality of texts is high—they support multiple readings for various purposes</p> | <p>REQUIRED 2a) 90% of texts provide rich opportunities for students to engage with tasks that allow them to meet the grade-level ELA standards using texts; the texts are well-crafted and authentic, representing the quality of content, language, and writing that is produced by experts in various disciplines (e.g., English language arts, history/social studies, science, technical subjects, and the arts).</p> | | |
| | <p>REQUIRED 2b) Materials provide a coherent sequence or collection of connected texts that build vocabulary knowledge and knowledge about concepts, themes, and topics through reading, writing, listening and speaking.</p> | | |

³ Grades 3-12 Example: Texts present vocabulary, syntax, text structures, levels of meaning/purpose similar to exemplars in [Appendix B](#).

⁴ The process for determining quantitative and qualitative measures is available at <http://www.louisianabelieves.com/docs/teacher-toolbox-resources/guide---how-to-determine-text-complexity-grades-k-12.pdf?sfvrsn=5> or the [Supplemental Information for Appendix A](#).

| CRITERIA | INDICATORS OF SUPERIOR QUALITY | MEETS METRICS (Yes/No) | JUSTIFICATION/ COMMENTS WITH EXAMPLES |
|---|--|---------------------------|--|
| <p>and exhibit exceptional craft and thought and/or provide useful information.</p> <p><input type="checkbox"/> Yes <input type="checkbox"/> No</p> | <p>In grades K-2, the inclusion of read-aloud texts in addition to what students can read themselves ensures that all students can build knowledge about the world through engagement with rich, complex text. These texts as well must form a coherent sequence or collection of connected texts that build vocabulary knowledge and knowledge about concepts, themes, and topics through reading, writing, listening and speaking.</p> | | |
| | <p>REQUIRED 2c) Within a sequence or collection of texts, specific anchor texts of grade-level complexity, as determined in 1a, are selected for multiple, careful readings throughout the unit of study.</p> | | |
| | <p>2d) 90% of texts are previously published rather than “commissioned.”</p> | | |
| <p>3. RANGE AND VOLUME OF TEXTS: Materials reflect the distribution of text types and genres suggested by the standards: Text types and genres generally reflect the definitions provided on page 31 (grades K-5) and page 57 (grades 6-12) of the standards and included in the text of the standards (e.g., RL.K.9, RI.1.9, RI.2.3, RL.2.9, RL.9-10.6, RI.7.7, or RI.11-12.9).</p> | <p>REQUIRED 3a) In grades K-12, ELA materials seek a balance in instructional time between literature and informational texts. (Reviewers will consider the balance within units of study as well as across the entire grade level using the ratio between literature/informational texts to help determine the appropriate balance.)</p> | | |
| | <p>REQUIRED 3b) Materials include texts of different formats (e.g., print and non-print, including film, art, music, charts, etc.) and lengths (e.g. short stories and novels).</p> | | |
| | <p>3c) Materials include many informational texts with an informational text structure rather than a narrative structure. In grades 6-12, materials include literary nonfiction (e.g. speeches, biographies, essays).</p> | | |

| CRITERIA | INDICATORS OF SUPERIOR QUALITY | MEETS METRICS (Yes/No) | JUSTIFICATION/ COMMENTS WITH EXAMPLES |
|---|--|---------------------------|--|
| <input type="checkbox"/> Yes <input type="checkbox"/> No | 3d) Additional materials increase the opportunity for regular, accountable independent reading of texts that appeal to students' interests to build reading stamina, confidence, motivation, and enjoyment and connect to classroom concepts or topics to develop knowledge. | | |
| II. Foundational Skills (grades K-5 only) | | | |
| <p>Tier 1 and 2 Non-Negotiable*</p> <p>4. FOUNDATIONAL SKILLS: Materials provide instruction and diagnostic support in concepts of print, phonological awareness, phonics, vocabulary, development, syntax, and fluency in a logical and transparent progression. These foundational skills are necessary and central components of an effective, comprehensive reading program designed to develop proficient readers with the capacity to comprehend texts across a range of types and disciplines.</p> <p><input type="checkbox"/> Yes <input type="checkbox"/> No</p> <p>*As applicable (e.g., when the scope of the materials is comprehensive and considered a full program)</p> | <p>REQUIRED *Indicator for grades K-2 only</p> <p>4a) Materials follow a sequence of foundational skills instruction indicated by the standards and beginning on page 17 of Appendix A, while providing abundant opportunities for every student to become proficient in each of the foundational skills.</p> | | |
| | <p>REQUIRED</p> <p>4b) In grades K-2, materials include student texts that allow for systematic, regular and frequent practice of foundational skills as they are introduced.</p> <p>In grades 3-5, materials demand knowledge of grade-level phonic patterns and word analysis skills.</p> | | |
| | <p>REQUIRED</p> <p>4c) In grades K-2, materials provide instruction and practice in word study including pronunciation, roots, prefixes, suffixes and spelling/sound patterns, as well as decoding of grade-level words by using sound-symbol knowledge and knowledge of syllabication and regular practice in encoding (spelling) the sound symbol relationships of English. <i>(Note: Instruction and practice with roots, prefixes, and suffixes is applicable for grade 1 and higher.)</i></p> <p>In grades 3-5, materials provide instruction and practice in word study including systematic examination of grade-level morphology, decoding of multisyllabic words by using syllabication, and automaticity with grade-level regular and irregular spelling patterns.</p> | | |

| CRITERIA | INDICATORS OF SUPERIOR QUALITY | MEETS METRICS (Yes/No) | JUSTIFICATION/ COMMENTS WITH EXAMPLES |
|---|--|---------------------------|--|
| | REQUIRED 4d) Materials encourage students to use context to confirm or self-correct word recognition and understanding, directing students to reread purposefully to acquire accurate meaning. | | |
| | REQUIRED 4e) Opportunities are frequently built into the materials that allow for students to achieve reading fluency in oral and silent reading, that is, to read a wide variety of prose and poetry at students’ reading level with accuracy, rate appropriate to the text, and expression. | | |
| | REQUIRED 4f) Materials guide students to read grade-level text with purpose and understanding and to make frequent connections between acquisition of foundation skills and making meaning from reading. | | |
| | 4g) *Indicator for grades K-2 only Materials provide opportunities for educators to monitor student progress on every aspect of the foundational skills through diagnostic assessments offered at regular intervals. Monitoring must also allow for students to receive regular feedback on their oral reading fluency in the specific areas of appropriate rate, expressiveness and accuracy. | | |
| | 4h) Submissions provide abundant and easily implemented materials so teachers can readily provide more time, attention and practice for those students who need it. | | |
| III. Questions and Tasks | | | |
| Tier 1 and 2 Non-Negotiable 5. TEXT-DEPENDENT QUESTIONS: Text-dependent questions and tasks reflect the requirements of Reading Standard 1 by requiring use of textual evidence in support of meeting other grade-specific standards. | REQUIRED 5a) At least 80% of all questions in the materials are text-dependent questions; student ideas are expressed through both written and spoken responses. | | |
| | REQUIRED 5b) Coherent sequences of questions and tasks focus students on understanding the text and its illustrations (as applicable), expressing the knowledge students have built about concepts, themes, or ideas presented in the texts, and | | |

| CRITERIA | INDICATORS OF SUPERIOR QUALITY | MEETS METRICS (Yes/No) | JUSTIFICATION/ COMMENTS WITH EXAMPLES |
|---|--|---------------------------|--|
| <input type="checkbox"/> Yes <input type="checkbox"/> No | making connections among the texts in the collection. | | |
| | REQUIRED 5c) Questions and tasks include the language of the standards, and assess the depth and complexity required by the standards at each grade-level over time to advance and deepen student learning. (<i>Note: not every standard must be assessed with every text.</i>) | | |
| | REQUIRED 5d) Questions and tasks support students in examining the language (vocabulary, sentences, and structure) of texts measured by Criteria 1, 2, and 3 to determine meaning; questions and tasks also focus on engaging students with multiple repetitions of words in varied contexts (e.g., reading different texts, completing tasks, engaging in speaking/listening). | | |
| 6. ASSESSMENTS: Materials offer assessment opportunities that genuinely measure progress and elicit direct, observable evidence of the degree to which students can independently demonstrate the assessed grade-specific standards with appropriately complex text(s). <input type="checkbox"/> Yes <input type="checkbox"/> No | REQUIRED 6a) Measurement of progress via assessments should include gradual release of supporting scaffolds for students to measure their independent abilities. | | |
| | REQUIRED 6b) Aligned rubrics or assessment guidelines (such as scoring guides or student work exemplars) are included and provide sufficient guidance for interpreting student performance. | | |
| | REQUIRED 6c) Materials use varied modes of assessment, including a range of pre-, formative, summative and self-assessment measures. | | |
| | 6d) Materials assess student proficiency using methods that are unbiased and accessible to all students. | | |
| IV. Scaffolding and Support | | | |
| 7. SCAFFOLDING AND SUPPORT: Materials provide all students, including those who read below grade level, with extensive opportunities and support to | REQUIRED 7a) Pre-reading activities and suggested approaches to teacher scaffolding are focused and engage students with understanding the text itself. Pre-reading activities should be no more than 10% of time devoted to any reading instruction. | | |

| CRITERIA | INDICATORS OF SUPERIOR QUALITY | MEETS METRICS (Yes/No) | JUSTIFICATION/ COMMENTS WITH EXAMPLES |
|---|--|---------------------------|--|
| <p>encounter and comprehend grade-level complex text as required by the standards.</p> <p><input type="checkbox"/> Yes <input type="checkbox"/> No</p> | <p>REQUIRED 7b) Materials must have the goal of students gaining full comprehension of complex text (through read-aloud in grades K-1) and do not confuse or substitute mastery of strategies for full comprehension of text; reading strategies support comprehension of specific texts and focus on building knowledge and insight. Texts must not serve as platforms to practice discrete strategies.</p> | | |
| | <p>REQUIRED 7c) Materials regularly direct teachers to return to focused parts of the text to guide students through rereading, discussion and writing about the ideas, events, and information found there.</p> | | |
| | <p>REQUIRED 7d) The materials are easy to use and well-organized for students and teachers. The reading selections are centrally located within the materials and obviously the center of focus.</p> | | |
| | <p>7e) Appropriate suggestions and materials are provided for supporting varying student needs at the unit and lesson level (e.g., alternate teaching approaches, pacing, instructional delivery options, suggestions for addressing common student difficulties to meet standards, remediation strategies or suggestions for supporting texts, suggestions for more advanced texts for extension, etc.).</p> | | |
| | <p>7f) The content can be reasonably completed within a regular school year and the pacing of content allows for maximum student understanding. The materials provide guidance about the amount of time a task might reasonably take.</p> | | |
| V. Writing to Sources and Research | | | |
| <p>8. WRITING TO SOURCES: The majority of written tasks are text-dependent and reflect the writing genres named in the standards.</p> | <p>REQUIRED *Indicator for grades 3-12 only 8a) A vast majority of written tasks at all grade levels require students to demonstrate the knowledge they built through the analysis and synthesis of texts, and present well--defended claims and clear information, drawing on textual</p> | | |

| CRITERIA | INDICATORS OF SUPERIOR QUALITY | MEETS METRICS (Yes/No) | JUSTIFICATION/ COMMENTS WITH EXAMPLES |
|--|--|---------------------------|--|
| <input type="checkbox"/> Yes <input type="checkbox"/> No | evidence to support valid inferences from text. | | |
| | REQUIRED 8b) Materials include multiple writing tasks aligned to the three modes of writing (opinion/argumentative, informative, narrative) as outlined by the standards at each grade level. In grades 3-12, tasks included blended modes (i.e., analytical writing); narrative prompts decrease in number and increase in being based on text(s) as student progress through the grades, e.g., narrative description (text-based, chronological writing) rather than imaginative narratives. | | |
| | REQUIRED 8c) Writing opportunities for students are prominent and varied in length and time demands (e.g., notes, summaries, short-answer responses, whole-class shared writing/formal essays, on-demand and process writing, etc.). | | |
| | REQUIRED 8d) Materials build in opportunities for connections between writing, speaking and listening, reading, and the language standards. For example, in grade 1, students listen to a text being read, work collaboratively to develop a plan for writing, write independently filling out an answer frame, and then share their writing with a peer who reviews the writing against a word wall to ensure high frequency words are spelled correctly. For example, in grade 6, students read a text, work collaboratively to develop a plan for analyzing or emulating the text, write a response, and then share their writing with a peer who reviews the writing against using a peer review checklist. | | |
| | REQUIRED *Indicator for grades K-2 only 8e) Submissions address grade-level foundation standards that require students in the early grades to know their letters, phonetic conventions, sentence structures, and spelling. | | |

| CRITERIA | INDICATORS OF SUPERIOR QUALITY | MEETS METRICS (Yes/No) | JUSTIFICATION/ COMMENTS WITH EXAMPLES |
|--|--|---------------------------|--|
| | <p>8f) *Indicator for grades K-2 only Materials provide opportunities for educators to monitor student progress in the development of these foundational skills and respond to the needs of individual students. This monitoring should include attention to invented spelling as appropriate for its diagnostic value.</p> | | |
| | <p>8g) Materials engage students in many shared (grades K-2) or short research projects annually to develop the expertise needed to conduct research independently.</p> | | |
| VI. Speaking and Listening | | | |
| <p>9. SPEAKING AND LISTENING: Oral tasks must be text-dependent and materials for speaking and listening must reflect true communication skills required for college and career readiness.</p> <p><input type="checkbox"/> Yes <input type="checkbox"/> No</p> | <p>REQUIRED 9a) Speaking and listening questions and tasks use the texts measured by Criteria 1, 2, and 3.</p> | | |
| | <p>REQUIRED 9b) Materials demand that students engage effectively (as determined by grade-level standards) in a range of conversations and collaborations with peers about texts.</p> | | |
| | <p>REQUIRED 9c) Materials build in frequent opportunities for connections between speaking and listening, reading, writing, and the language standards. For example, in grades K-12, materials build in frequent opportunities for discussion about texts and, through directions and modeling, encourage students to use academic language and grade-appropriate oral language conventions. In grades 3-12, materials require students to gather and use evidence to orally present findings from research.</p> | | |
| | <p>9d) Materials develop active listening skills, such as taking notes on main ideas, asking relevant questions, and elaborating on remarks of others to develop understanding of complex texts and tasks.</p> | | |

| CRITERIA | INDICATORS OF SUPERIOR QUALITY | MEETS METRICS (Yes/No) | JUSTIFICATION/ COMMENTS WITH EXAMPLES |
|---|--|---------------------------|--|
| VII. Language | | | |
| <p>10. LANGUAGE: Materials must adequately address the Language standards for the grade, including through unpacking the vocabulary and syntax of text(s) (indicator 5e) as models of language use.</p> <p><input type="checkbox"/> Yes <input type="checkbox"/> No</p> | <p>REQUIRED 10a) Materials address the grammar and language conventions specified by the Language standards at each grade level and build on those standards that build from previous grade levels, as indicated by pages 30 and 56 of the standards.</p> | | |
| | <p>REQUIRED 10b) Materials create opportunities for students to discover accurate usage patterns, compare them to their own (oral and written), and develop proficiency in usage and language conventions.</p> | | |
| | <p>REQUIRED 10c) Selected vocabulary focuses on words critical to the meaning of the texts included in Criteria 1, 2, and 3. Materials also require students to model their own writing after texts measured by Criteria 1, 2, and 3 as a way to develop more complex sentence structure and language usage.</p> | | |
| | <p>REQUIRED 10d) Vocabulary study emphasizes advancing depth of word knowledge through determining word meaning and relationships among words (e.g., concept- and thematically-related words, word families, etc.).</p> | | |
| | <p>REQUIRED 10e) Materials build in frequent opportunities for connections between the language standards, writing, reading, and speaking and listening. For example, through directions and modeling, materials encourage students to use grade-appropriate language conventions when speaking and writing about texts.</p> | | |
| | <p>10f) Materials provide real-world activities for student practice with natural language (e.g. mock interviews, presentations).</p> | | |

| CRITERIA | INDICATORS OF SUPERIOR QUALITY | MEETS METRICS (Yes/No) | JUSTIFICATION/ COMMENTS WITH EXAMPLES |
|---|---|---------------------------|--|
| FINAL EVALUATION | | | |
| <i>Tier 1 ratings</i> receive a “Yes” in Column 1 for Criteria 1 – 10. | | | |
| <i>Tier 2 ratings</i> receive a “Yes” in Column 1 for all non-negotiable criteria (Foundational Skills (as applicable), Complexity of Texts, Quality of Texts, and Text-Dependent Questions), but at least one “No” in Column 1 for the remaining criteria. | | | |
| <i>Tier 3 ratings</i> receive a “No” in Column 1 for at least one of the non-negotiable criteria. | | | |
| Compile the results for Sections I-VII to make a final decision for the material under review. | | | |
| Section | Criteria | Yes/No | Final Justification/Comments |
| I: Text Selection | 1. Complexity of Texts (Non-Negotiable) | | |
| | 2. Quality of Texts (Non-Negotiable) | | |
| | 3. Range and Volume of Texts | | |
| II: Foundational Skills | 4. Foundational Skills (Non-Negotiable*) | | |
| III: Questions and Tasks | 5. Text-Dependent Questions (Non-Negotiable) | | |
| | 6. Assessments | | |
| IV: Scaffolding and Support | 7. Scaffolding and Support | | |
| V: Writing to Sources and Research | 8. Writing to Sources | | |
| VI: Speaking and Listening | 9. Speaking and Listening | | |
| VII: Language | 10. Language | | |
| FINAL DECISION FOR THIS MATERIAL: [Choose one: Tier I, Exemplifies quality; Tier II, Approaching quality; Tier III, Not representing quality] | | | |

*As applicable (e.g., when the scope of the materials is comprehensive and considered a full program)