DEPARTMENT of EDUCATION
Louisiana Believes

Instructional Materials Evaluation Tool for Alignment in Social Studies Grades K – 12

FULL CURRICULUM
Instructional Materials

The goal for social studies students is develop a deep, conceptual understanding of the content, as demonstrated through writing and speaking about the content. Strong social studies instruction is built around these priorities.

Content: Students explain how society, the environment, the political and economic landscape, and historical events influence perspectives, values, traditions, and ideas.

To accomplish this, they:

- Use key questions to build understanding of content through multiple sources
- Corroborate sources and evaluate evidence by considering author, occasion, and purpose

Claims: Students develop and express claims through discussions and writing which examine the impact of relationships between ideas, people, and events across time and place.

To accomplish this, they:

- Recognize recurring themes and patterns in history, geography, economics, and civics
- Evaluate the causes and consequences of events and developments

Title: **Cicero: History Beyond the Textbook** Grade/Course: **6-8**

Publisher: **AKJ Books** Copyright: **2015**

Overall Rating: **Tier III, Not representing quality**

Tier I, Tier II, Tier III Elements of this review:

STRONG	WEAK
3. Questions and Tasks (Non-Negotiable)	1. Scope and Quality of Content (Non-Negotiable) *
	2. Range and Volume of Sources (Non-Negotiable)
	* Rated Strong in Grade 7

Each set of submitted materials was evaluated for alignment with the standards, beginning with a review of the indicators for the non-negotiable criteria. If those criteria were met, a review of the other criteria ensued.

Tier 1 ratings received a "Yes" for all Criteria 1 – 5.
Tier 2 ratings received a "Yes" for all non-negotiable criteria, but at least one "No" for the remaining criteria.
Tier 3 ratings received a "No for at least one of the non-negotiable criteria.

Click below for complete grade-level reviews:

Grade 6 (Tier 3) Grade 7 (Tier 3) Grade 8 (Tier 3)

The goal for social studies students is develop a deep, conceptual understanding of the content, as demonstrated through writing and speaking about the content. Strong social studies instruction is built around these priorities.

Content: Students explain how society, the environment, the political and economic landscape, and historical events influence perspectives, values, traditions, and ideas.

To accomplish this, they:

- Use key questions to build understanding of content through multiple sources
- Corroborate sources and evaluate evidence by considering author, occasion, and purpose

Claims: Students develop and express claims through discussions and writing which examine the impact of relationships between ideas, people, and events across time and place.

To accomplish this, they:

- Recognize recurring themes and patterns in history, geography, economics, and civics
- Evaluate the causes and consequences of events and developments

Title: **Cicero: History Beyond the Textbook** Grade/Course: **6**

Publisher: **AKJ Books** Copyright: **2015**

Overall Rating: **Tier III, Not representing quality**

Tier I, Tier II, Tier III Elements of this review:

STRONG	WEAK
3. Questions and Tasks (Non-Negotiable)	1. Scope and Quality of Content (Non-Negotiable)
	2. Range and Volume of Sources (Non-Negotiable)

To evaluate each set of submitted materials for alignment with the standards, begin by reviewing Column 2 for the non-negotiable criteria. If there is a "Yes" for all required indicators in Column 2, then the materials receive a "Yes" in Column 1. If there is a "No" for any required indicators in Column 2, then the materials receive a "No" in Column 1. (Note: If materials do not represent a full curricula, then some of Criteria 1 – 5 may not apply.)

Tier 1 ratings receive a "Yes" in Column 1 for Criteria 1 – 5.
Tier 2 ratings receive a "Yes" in Column 1 for all non-negotiable criteria, but at least one "No" in Column 1 for the remaining criteria.
Tier 3 ratings receive a "No" in Column 1 for at least one of the non-negotiable criteria.

CRITERIA	INDICATORS OF SUPERIOR QUALITY	MEETS METRICS (Yes/No)	JUSTIFICATION/ COMMENTS WITH EXAMPLES
I. Content			
Tier 1 and 2 Non-Negotiable **1. SCOPE AND QUALITY OF CONTENT:** Materials adequately address the Louisiana's Grade-Level Expectations (GLEs) at sufficient depth, accuracy, and quality to build social studies content knowledge. ☐ Yes ☒ No	**REQUIRED** **1a)** Materials address the content of 90% of the GLEs.	**No**	The materials only address about 56% of the 2011 Louisiana 6th grade GLEs. The curriculum includes a guide for correlation to these GLEs as well as links to content that correlate. GLEs that are not covered include 6.1.1-6.1.4, 6.2.2, 6.2.3, 6.2.7, 6.2.8, 6.3.1, 6.3.2, and 6.6.1-6.6.4
	1b) Materials provide regular opportunities for students to explore key questions and build knowledge and skills with the social studies content indicated by the GLEs.	**Yes**	The textbook provides opportunities for students to explore key questions and concepts in social studies, but these concepts are not centered on the Louisiana 6th Grade GLEs.
Tier 1 and 2 Non-Negotiable **2. RANGE AND VOLUME OF SOURCES:** Materials include varied types of primary and secondary sources. ☐ Yes ☒ No	**REQUIRED** **2a)** The main focus of the materials is on primary and secondary sources[1] to develop content knowledge and express claims.	**No**	The textbook is centered on a traditional narrative based on smaller lessons within a unit that can be accessed on the website. The publisher provides a plethora of primary and secondary sources (The Early Republic unit contains over two-dozen curated sources alone) but they are located in other sections of the textbook and not integrated into the primary narrative itself.

[1] Primary sources provide first-hand testimony or direct evidence concerning a topic under investigation and are created by witnesses or recorders who experienced the events or conditions being documented. Often these sources are created at the time when the events or conditions are occurring, but primary sources can also include autobiographies, memoirs, and oral histories recorded later. Primary sources are characterized by their content, regardless of whether they are available in original format, in microfilm/microfiche, in digital format, or in published format. (http://www.yale.edu/collections_collaborative/primarysources/primarysources.html) For additional definitions and examples, see also: http://www.princeton.edu/~refdesk/primary2.html and http://www.archives.gov/education/research/history-in-the-raw.html.

CRITERIA	INDICATORS OF SUPERIOR QUALITY	MEETS METRICS (Yes/No)	JUSTIFICATION/ COMMENTS WITH EXAMPLES
	REQUIRED **2b)** Materials include primary and secondary sources of different types (i.e., print and non-print, including video, audio, art, maps, charts, etc.) and varied lengths.	**Yes**	Materials include an array of different sources including the standard background information about each topic in the unit, multimedia in both audio and video,interactive presentations and maps, literature from the time period (ex-Epic of Gilgamesh), as well as artistic renditions (ex-paintings, poems, and lyrics). Many of the primary sources are of longer length, though shorter sources are provided as well. This could be improved even further with the addition of more primary and secondary sources from more ancient and medieval history topics to align with Louisiana Grade-Level Expectations.
	2c) Materials focus on both primary and secondary sources from different perspectives to allow opportunities for comparison and contrast, including sourcing[2] and corroboration.[3]	**No**	The sources provided in the textbook are from from a variety of perspectives, but the textbook only explicitly provides opportunities for basic compare/contrast instead of corroboration and viewing different perspectives, as seen in the lesson plans in the unit on the Roots of America. The textbook also emphasizes sourcing of documents in their activities, and Cicero provides a variety of their own strategies for sourcing documents. Each strategy is accompanied by an instructional video and

[2] Sourcing asks students to consider a document's author, occasion, and purpose to determine how those factors influence the content.
[3] Corroboration asks students to determine points where details and evidence across multiple documents agree and disagree.

CRITERIA	INDICATORS OF SUPERIOR QUALITY	MEETS METRICS (Yes/No)	JUSTIFICATION/ COMMENTS WITH EXAMPLES
			PowerPoint presentation to help prepare the teacher.
	2d) Materials focus on both primary and secondary sources from different time periods to enable students to make connections within and across time periods, including contextualization.[4]	**Yes**	The variety of sources in the textbook allow students to look at sources from different time periods to see historical trends. For example, in the lesson on the Greeks and Romans, students can look at the structure of the Delian League during the age of the Greek city-states and NATO in modern times. The sources can also be used for students to make connections across time periods. The textbook could strengthen this further through the introduction of more activities in line with 6th Grade GLEs.
II. Claims			
Tier 1 and 2 Non-Negotiable **3. QUESTIONS AND TASKS:** Materials offer opportunities to elicit direct, observable evidence of the degree to which students can independently demonstrate the grade-level expectations with source(s) described in Criteria 2 and genuinely measure how well students are able to make and support claims about social studies content.	**REQUIRED** **3a)** Questions and tasks focus on engaging students with content in varied contexts (e.g., examining different sources, completing tasks, answering multiple-choice questions, engaging in speaking/listening).	**Yes**	The questions and tasks focus on engaging students with content in varied contexts.The textbook uses Common Core aligned strategies and their own proprietary strategies (SPEECH organizers for instance). In addition to graphic organizers, there are open-ended questions and a variety of different projects. There are webquests in which students research various Greek philosophers (Unit 1: Roots of America) and interpret their findings to create a presentation. Students must teach about

[4] Contextualization asks students to determine the time and place a document was created and examine how those factors influence the content.

CRITERIA	INDICATORS OF SUPERIOR QUALITY	MEETS METRICS (Yes/No)	JUSTIFICATION/ COMMENTS WITH EXAMPLES
☒ Yes ☐ No			their assigned philosopher to classmates. There were very few multiple-choice questions--only found in the Unit assessments This could become more robust with the introduction of more sources and activities aligned to 6th Grade GLEs.
	REQUIRED **3b)** Coherent sequences of source-dependent questions[5] and tasks focus students on building knowledge and skill with content through various texts (primary and secondary sources), classroom research, conversations, etc. and then synthesizing and applying those understandings to recognize recurring themes and evaluate the causes and consequences of events and developments.	**Yes**	In reading source-dependent questions, virtually all questions require students to utilize evidence to answer questions. For example, when looking at activities such as comparing the Delian League and NATO, students look to the text to establish knowledge then expand the knowledge to larger concepts such as the need for alliances by people groups and nation-states. This could be strengthened further with the addition of more activities from ancient and medieval history.
	REQUIRED **3c)** Source-dependent written and oral tasks require students to demonstrate understanding of social studies content and make connections between ideas, people, and events across time and place, recognize recurring themes, and evaluate the causes and consequences of events and developments.	**Yes**	Based on the teacher toolbox provided, it is evident that this curriculum is designed to show connections across time and place. Throughout each Unit, students use sources to understand historical concepts. Cicero's own reading strategies such as ARTIST and R&B are designed specifically to help students understand the background, course

[5] Source-dependent questions or tasks are those that require students to pull information from a given source(s) to answer the question. Students still pull from prior learning, but the evidentiary support required in the students' responses are dependent upon the source(s).

CRITERIA	INDICATORS OF SUPERIOR QUALITY	MEETS METRICS (Yes/No)	JUSTIFICATION/ COMMENTS WITH EXAMPLES
			of a historical event, and the consequences of the event. Each unit is set up to take account of the cause and effect relationships throughout history. While this is useful for the topic of US history, world history activities could be easily adapted for use with these strategies.
	3d) Materials use varied modes of assessment, including a range of pre-, formative, summative and self-assessment measures that are unbiased and accessible to all students.	**No**	The range of assessment options are limited. There are some pre-assessments based on reading comprehension strategies as well as some project-based formative and summative assessments. However, there is not a systematic method of formative and summative assessment for all lessons. For instance, in the Radical Republicans lesson in the Civil War and Reconstruction unit, the lesson plan does not give any formal assessment options for the teacher to use. Each unit has a summative assessment, and consists of multiple-choice and short answer questions.
	3e) Aligned rubrics or assessment guidelines (such as scoring guides or student work exemplars) are included and provide sufficient guidance for interpreting student performance.	**No**	All of the writing activities and end-of-unit assessment have answer keys, and the textbook includes rubrics for various types of products including podcasts and Webquests. However there are no supplied student work exemplars for any activity.
4. RESPONSE TO SOURCES: Materials provide frequent	**REQUIRED** **4a)** Materials provide regular opportunities for students	**Not Evaluated**	This section was not evaluated because the

CRITERIA	INDICATORS OF SUPERIOR QUALITY	MEETS METRICS (Yes/No)	JUSTIFICATION/ COMMENTS WITH EXAMPLES
opportunities for students to engage in discussions (both formal and informal) around the content and then express their understanding of the content through the development and support of claims in writing. ☐ Yes ☐ No	through discussions to develop claims about social studies content identified in the GLEs.		non-negotiable criteria were not met.
	REQUIRED **4b)** Writing opportunities for students occur on a regular basis and are varied in length and time demands (e.g., notes, summaries, short-answer responses, whole-class shared writing/formal essays, on-demand and process writing, etc.).	**Not Evaluated**	This section was not evaluated because the non-negotiable criteria were not met.
	REQUIRED for **grades 3-12 only** **4c)** A vast majority of written tasks require students to present well-defended claims and clear information, providing evidence to support valid inferences from sources to explain how society, the environment, the political and economic landscape, and historical events influence perspectives, values, traditions, and ideas.	**Not Evaluated**	This section was not evaluated because the non-negotiable criteria were not met.
	REQUIRED **4d)** Materials provide frequent opportunities for students to conduct shared (grades K-2) or short research projects to develop the expertise needed to conduct research independently.	**Not Evaluated**	This section was not evaluated because the non-negotiable criteria were not met.
	4e) Materials build students' active listening skills, such as taking notes on main ideas, asking relevant questions, and elaborating on remarks of others to develop understanding of topics, sources, and tasks.	**Not Evaluated**	This section was not evaluated because the non-negotiable criteria were not met.
III. Scaffolding and Support			
5. SCAFFOLDING AND SUPPORT: Materials provide all students with extensive opportunities and support to explore key questions	**REQUIRED** **5a)** Activities and suggested approaches guide teachers on how to scaffold instruction for students to build understanding of the content.	**Not Evaluated**	This section was not evaluated because the non-negotiable criteria were not met.

CRITERIA	INDICATORS OF SUPERIOR QUALITY	MEETS METRICS (Yes/No)	JUSTIFICATION/ COMMENTS WITH EXAMPLES
using multiple sources to make claims about social studies content. ☐ Yes ☐ No	**REQUIRED** **5b)** The materials are easy to use and well organized for students and teachers.	**Not Evaluated**	This section was not evaluated because the non-negotiable criteria were not met.
	5c) Appropriate suggestions and materials are provided for supporting varying student needs at the unit and lesson level (e.g., alternate teaching approaches, pacing, instructional delivery options, suggestions for addressing common student difficulties to meet standards, etc.).	**Not Evaluated**	This section was not evaluated because the non-negotiable criteria were not met.
	5d) The content can be reasonably completed within a regular school year and the pacing of content allows for maximum student understanding. The materials provide guidance about the amount of time a task might reasonably take.	**Not Evaluated**	This section was not evaluated because the non-negotiable criteria were not met.

FINAL EVALUATION
Tier 1 ratings receive a "Yes" in Column 1 for Criteria 1 – 5.
Tier 2 ratings receive a "Yes" in Column 1 for all non-negotiable criteria, but at least one "No" in Column 1 for the remaining criteria.
Tier 3 ratings receive a "No" in Column 1 for at least one of the non-negotiable criteria.

Compile the results for Sections I-VII to make a final decision for the material under review.

Section	Criteria	Yes/No	Final Justification/Comments
I: Content	1. Scope and Quality of Content **(Non-Negotiable)**	**No**	The textbook only addresses 56% of the 2011 Louisiana 6th grade GLEs.
	2. Range and Volume of Sources **(Non-Negotiable)**	**No**	The textbook primarily relies on a traditional narrative for teaching the content but has a large selection of curated primary and secondary sources for optional use by the teacher.
II: Claims	3. Questions and Tasks **(Non-Negotiable)**	**Yes**	There is a wide variety of source-dependent activities that build student understanding of each topic and make connections across

CRITERIA	INDICATORS OF SUPERIOR QUALITY	MEETS METRICS (Yes/No)	JUSTIFICATION/ COMMENTS WITH EXAMPLES
			time and place. The textbook falls short in terms of assessment with no end-of-lesson assessment and lack of standardized test preparation materials
	4. Response to Sources	**Not Evaluated**	Not evaluated since non-negotiable criteria was not met.
III: Scaffolding and Support	5. Scaffolding and Support	**Not Evaluated**	Not evaluated since non-negotiable criteria was not met.
FINAL DECISION FOR THIS MATERIAL: **Tier III, Not representing quality**			

The goal for social studies students is develop a deep, conceptual understanding of the content, as demonstrated through writing and speaking about the content. Strong social studies instruction is built around these priorities.

Content: Students explain how society, the environment, the political and economic landscape, and historical events influence perspectives, values, traditions, and ideas.

To accomplish this, they:

- Use key questions to build understanding of content through multiple sources
- Corroborate sources and evaluate evidence by considering author, occasion, and purpose

Claims: Students develop and express claims through discussions and writing which examine the impact of relationships between ideas, people, and events across time and place.

To accomplish this, they:

- Recognize recurring themes and patterns in history, geography, economics, and civics
- Evaluate the causes and consequences of events and developments

Title: **Cicero: History Beyond the Textbook** Grade/Course: **7**

Publisher: **AKJ Books** Copyright: **2015**

Overall Rating: **Tier III, Not representing quality**

Tier I, Tier II, Tier III Elements of this review:

STRONG	WEAK
1. Scope and Quality of Content (Non-Negotiable)	2. Range and Volume of Sources (Non-Negotiable)
3. Questions and Tasks (Non-Negotiable)	

To evaluate each set of submitted materials for alignment with the standards, begin by reviewing Column 2 for the non-negotiable criteria. If there is a "Yes" for all required indicators in Column 2, then the materials receive a "Yes" in Column 1. If there is a "No" for any required indicators in Column 2, then the materials receive a "No" in Column 1. (Note: If materials do not represent a full curricula, then some of Criteria 1 – 5 may not apply.)

Tier 1 ratings receive a "Yes" in Column 1 for Criteria 1 – 5.
Tier 2 ratings receive a "Yes" in Column 1 for all non-negotiable criteria, but at least one "No" in Column 1 for the remaining criteria.
Tier 3 ratings receive a "No" in Column 1 for at least one of the non-negotiable criteria.

CRITERIA	INDICATORS OF SUPERIOR QUALITY	MEETS METRICS (Yes/No)	JUSTIFICATION/ COMMENTS WITH EXAMPLES
I. Content			
Tier 1 and 2 Non-Negotiable **1. SCOPE AND QUALITY OF CONTENT:** Materials adequately address the Louisiana's Grade-Level Expectations (GLEs) at sufficient depth, accuracy, and quality to build social studies content knowledge. ☒ Yes ☐ No	**REQUIRED** **1a)** Materials address the content of 90% of the GLEs.	**Yes**	The curriculum includes a guide for correlation to Louisiana Grade 7 GLEs as well as links to content that correlate to the GLEs. Over 90% of the 2011 GLEs are correlated and have accompanying activities. It should be noted that these materials do not sufficiently address grade Civics GLEs: 7.8.5--describe structure and power of 3 branches of gov't; 7.8.6--illustrate how a bill becomes a law; 7.10.3--Explain the duties and responsibilities of US citizens; and 7.10.4--Describe the qualifications or requirements for US citizenships
	1b) Materials provide regular opportunities for students to explore key questions and build knowledge and skills with the social studies content indicated by the GLEs.	**Yes**	The website allows the user to search the curriculum by grade level, subject, and state. From the list of aligned GLEs, the user can find materials that are correlated to them. The materials provided are very detailed and provide opportunities for students to explore key questions with social studies content. For example, in the unit on the Roots of America, students are asked to compare the concept of paideia for both the Greeks and Romans, and through the use of

CRITERIA	INDICATORS OF SUPERIOR QUALITY	MEETS METRICS (Yes/No)	JUSTIFICATION/ COMMENTS WITH EXAMPLES
			comparing and contrasting to highlight the political concepts of absolute (Byzantine Empire) and limited (England) monarchies.
Tier 1 and 2 Non-Negotiable **2. RANGE AND VOLUME OF SOURCES:** Materials include varied types of primary and secondary sources. ☐ Yes ☒ No	**REQUIRED** **2a)** The main focus of the materials is on primary and secondary sources[6] to develop content knowledge and express claims.	**No**	The textbook is centered on a traditional narrative based on smaller lessons within a unit that can be accessed on the website. The publisher provides a plethora of primary and secondary sources (The Early Republic unit contains over two-dozen curated sources alone) but they are located in other sections of the textbook and not integrated into the primary narrative itself.
	REQUIRED **2b)** Materials include primary and secondary sources of different types (i.e., print and non-print, including video, audio, art, maps, charts, etc.) and varied lengths.	**Yes**	Under the 'primary sources' tab, teachers can access diaries and journals, speeches and correspondence, literature from the time period, as well as landmark documents for each unit. There are also photos of various types of paintings and drawings, though there are few videos for use as sources as well as plays for students to act out. Many of the primary sources are of longer length, though shorter sources are provided as well.

[6] Primary sources provide first-hand testimony or direct evidence concerning a topic under investigation and are created by witnesses or recorders who experienced the events or conditions being documented. Often these sources are created at the time when the events or conditions are occurring, but primary sources can also include autobiographies, memoirs, and oral histories recorded later. Primary sources are characterized by their content, regardless of whether they are available in original format, in microfilm/microfiche, in digital format, or in published format. (http://www.yale.edu/collections_collaborative/primarysources/primarysources.html) For additional definitions and examples, see also: http://www.princeton.edu/~refdesk/primary2.html and http://www.archives.gov/education/research/history-in-the-raw.html.

CRITERIA	INDICATORS OF SUPERIOR QUALITY	MEETS METRICS (Yes/No)	JUSTIFICATION/ COMMENTS WITH EXAMPLES
	2c) Materials focus on both primary and secondary sources from different perspectives to allow opportunities for comparison and contrast, including sourcing[7] and corroboration.[8]	**No**	The textbook provides primary and secondary sources from broadly different perspectives, but seldom asks students to directly contrast historical perspectives. For instance, in the Chapter on the Civil War and Reconstruction, the lesson on the Confederacy asks the student to compare and contrast the US and Confederate Constitutions. In the subsequent activity, students are asked to identify differences but are not asked to give an explanation as to why these differences are present. The textbook does allow for sourcing and corroboration through their own learning strategies, but the textbook only explicitly provides opportunities for compare/contrast, as seen in the lesson plans in the unit on Jacksonians and the Whigs. In addition, there are instructional videos and Power Points presentations for teachers to use for teaching students historical concepts through viewing events through different perspectives.

[7] Sourcing asks students to consider a document's author, occasion, and purpose to determine how those factors influence the content.
[8] Corroboration asks students to determine points where details and evidence across multiple documents agree and disagree.

CRITERIA	INDICATORS OF SUPERIOR QUALITY	MEETS METRICS (Yes/No)	JUSTIFICATION/ COMMENTS WITH EXAMPLES
	2d) Materials focus on both primary and secondary sources from different time periods to enable students to make connections within and across time periods, including contextualization.[9]	**Yes**	The variety of sources in the textbook allow students to look at sources from different time periods to see historical trends. In addition, there are extension activities in every lesson plan that require students to compare the topics to current events. For example, in the lesson on the Greeks and Romans, students can look at the structure of the Delian League during the age of the Greek city-states and NATO in modern times.
II. Claims			
Tier 1 and 2 Non-Negotiable **3. QUESTIONS AND TASKS:** Materials offer opportunities to elicit direct, observable evidence of the degree to which students can independently demonstrate the grade-level expectations with source(s) described in Criteria 2 and genuinely measure how well students are able to make and support claims about social studies content. ☒ Yes ☐ No	**REQUIRED** **3a)** Questions and tasks focus on engaging students with content in varied contexts (e.g., examining different sources, completing tasks, answering multiple-choice questions, engaging in speaking/listening).	**Yes**	The curriculum uses a wide variety of tasks for students to understand historical concepts, mainly through Common Core-aligned strategies and their own proprietary strategies (SPEECH organizers for instance). Several units include questions and tasks focused on engaging students with content in varied contexts. There are also graphic organizers, open-ended questions and a variety of different projects. In Unit 9: Industry and Migration, students work together to analyze primary sources and then research political machines at the turn of the 20th century. There were however, very few multiple-choice questions, found

[9] Contextualization asks students to determine the time and place a document was created and examine how those factors influence the content.

CRITERIA	INDICATORS OF SUPERIOR QUALITY	MEETS METRICS (Yes/No)	JUSTIFICATION/ COMMENTS WITH EXAMPLES
			only in the Unit assessments.
	REQUIRED **3b)** Coherent sequences of source-dependent questions[10] and tasks focus students on building knowledge and skill with content through various texts (primary and secondary sources), classroom research, conversations, etc. and then synthesizing and applying those understandings to recognize recurring themes and evaluate the causes and consequences of events and developments.	**Yes**	In reading source-dependent questions, virtually all questions require students to utilize evidence to answer questions. For example, when looking at activities such as comparing the Delian League and NATO, students look to the text to establish knowledge then expand the knowledge to larger concepts such as the need for alliances by people groups and nation-states.
	REQUIRED **3c)** Source-dependent written and oral tasks require students to demonstrate understanding of social studies content and make connections between ideas, people, and events across time and place, recognize recurring themes, and evaluate the causes and consequences of events and developments.	**Yes**	Students are required to demonstrate understanding of social studies content and make connections on a variety of levels. In other words, the activities allow students to learn content chronologically and look at the cause and effect relationships within that era as well as how it has shaped our world today. The sources allow students to recognize themes from their 6th grade world history class and the application within their 7th grade American history class.
	3d) Materials use varied modes of assessment, including a range of pre-, formative, summative and self-assessment measures that are unbiased and accessible to all students.	**No**	The range of assessment options is limited. There are some pre-assessments based on reading comprehension strategies as well as

[10] Source-dependent questions or tasks are those that require students to pull information from a given source(s) to answer the question. Students still pull from prior learning, but the evidentiary support required in the students' responses are dependent upon the source(s).

CRITERIA	INDICATORS OF SUPERIOR QUALITY	MEETS METRICS (Yes/No)	JUSTIFICATION/ COMMENTS WITH EXAMPLES
			some project-based formative and summative assessments. However, there is not a systematic method of formative and summative assessment for all lessons. For instance, in the Radical Republicans lesson in the Civil War and Reconstruction unit, the lesson plan does not give any formal assessment options for the teacher to use. Each unit has a summative assessment, and consists of multiple-choice and short answer questions.
	3e) Aligned rubrics or assessment guidelines (such as scoring guides or student work exemplars) are included and provide sufficient guidance for interpreting student performance.	**No**	All of the writing activities and end-of-unit assessment have answer keys, and the textbook includes rubrics for various types of products including podcasts and Webquests. However there are no student work exemplars provided for any activity.
4. RESPONSE TO SOURCES: Materials provide frequent opportunities for students to engage in discussions (both formal and informal) around the content and then express their understanding of the content through the development and support of claims in writing.	**REQUIRED** **4a)** Materials provide regular opportunities for students through discussions to develop claims about social studies content identified in the GLEs.	**Not Evaluated**	This section was not evaluated because the non-negotiable criteria were not met.
	REQUIRED **4b)** Writing opportunities for students occur on a regular basis and are varied in length and time demands (e.g., notes, summaries, short-answer responses, whole-class shared writing/formal essays, on-demand and process writing, etc.).	**Not Evaluated**	This section was not evaluated because the non-negotiable criteria were not met.
☐ Yes ☐ No	**REQUIRED** for **grades 3-12 only** **4c)** A vast majority of written tasks require students to present well-defended claims and clear information, providing evidence to support valid inferences from sources	**Not Evaluated**	This section was not evaluated because the non-negotiable criteria were not met.

CRITERIA	INDICATORS OF SUPERIOR QUALITY	MEETS METRICS (Yes/No)	JUSTIFICATION/ COMMENTS WITH EXAMPLES
	to explain how society, the environment, the political and economic landscape, and historical events influence perspectives, values, traditions, and ideas.		
	REQUIRED **4d)** Materials provide frequent opportunities for students to conduct shared (grades K-2) or short research projects to develop the expertise needed to conduct research independently.	**Not Evaluated**	This section was not evaluated because the non-negotiable criteria were not met.
	4e) Materials build students' active listening skills, such as taking notes on main ideas, asking relevant questions, and elaborating on remarks of others to develop understanding of topics, sources, and tasks.	**Not Evaluated**	This section was not evaluated because the non-negotiable criteria were not met.
III. Scaffolding and Support			
5. SCAFFOLDING AND SUPPORT: Materials provide all students with extensive opportunities and support to explore key questions using multiple sources to make claims about social studies content. ☐ Yes ☐ No	**REQUIRED** **5a)** Activities and suggested approaches guide teachers on how to scaffold instruction for students to build understanding of the content.	**Not Evaluated**	This section was not evaluated because the non-negotiable criteria were not met.
	REQUIRED **5b)** The materials are easy to use and well organized for students and teachers.	**Not Evaluated**	This section was not evaluated because the non-negotiable criteria were not met.
	5c) Appropriate suggestions and materials are provided for supporting varying student needs at the unit and lesson level (e.g., alternate teaching approaches, pacing, instructional delivery options, suggestions for addressing common student difficulties to meet standards, etc.).	**Not Evaluated**	This section was not evaluated because the non-negotiable criteria were not met.

CRITERIA	INDICATORS OF SUPERIOR QUALITY	MEETS METRICS (Yes/No)	JUSTIFICATION/ COMMENTS WITH EXAMPLES
	5d) The content can be reasonably completed within a regular school year and the pacing of content allows for maximum student understanding. The materials provide guidance about the amount of time a task might reasonably take.	**Not Evaluated**	This section was not evaluated because the non-negotiable criteria were not met.

FINAL EVALUATION
Tier 1 ratings receive a "Yes" in Column 1 for Criteria 1 – 5.
Tier 2 ratings receive a "Yes" in Column 1 for all non-negotiable criteria, but at least one "No" in Column 1 for the remaining criteria.
Tier 3 ratings receive a "No" in Column 1 for at least one of the non-negotiable criteria.

Compile the results for Sections I-VII to make a final decision for the material under review.

Section	Criteria	Yes/No	Final Justification/Comments
I: Content	1. Scope and Quality of Content **(Non-Negotiable)**	**Yes**	The textbook addresses over 90% of the 7th grade GLEs and provides a large amount of high quality content for students. However, this program does not include a number of 7th grade GLEs tied to Civics.
	2. Range and Volume of Sources **(Non-Negotiable)**	**No**	The textbook primarily relies on a traditional narrative for teaching the content, but has a large selection of curated primary and secondary sources for optional use by the teacher.
II: Claims	3. Questions and Tasks **(Non-Negotiable)**	**Yes**	There is a wide variety of source-dependent activities that build student understanding of each topic and make connections across time and place. The textbook falls short in terms of assessment with no end-of-lesson assessment and lack of standardized test preparation materials
	4. Response to Sources	**Not Evaluated**	This section was not evaluated because the non-negotiable criteria were not met.

CRITERIA	INDICATORS OF SUPERIOR QUALITY	MEETS METRICS (Yes/No)	JUSTIFICATION/ COMMENTS WITH EXAMPLES
III: Scaffolding and Support	5. Scaffolding and Support	**Not Evaluated**	This section was not evaluated because the non-negotiable criteria were not met.
FINAL DECISION FOR THIS MATERIAL: **Tier III, Not representing quality**			

The goal for social studies students is develop a deep, conceptual understanding of the content, as demonstrated through writing and speaking about the content. Strong social studies instruction is built around these priorities.

Content: Students explain how society, the environment, the political and economic landscape, and historical events influence perspectives, values, traditions, and ideas.

To accomplish this, they:

- Use key questions to build understanding of content through multiple sources
- Corroborate sources and evaluate evidence by considering author, occasion, and purpose

Claims: Students develop and express claims through discussions and writing which examine the impact of relationships between ideas, people, and events across time and place.

To accomplish this, they:

- Recognize recurring themes and patterns in history, geography, economics, and civics
- Evaluate the causes and consequences of events and developments

Title: **Cicero: History Beyond the Textbook** Grade/Course: **8**

Publisher: **AKJ Books** Copyright: **2015**

Overall Rating: **Tier III, Not representing quality**

Tier I, Tier II, Tier III Elements of this review:

STRONG	WEAK
3. Questions and Tasks (Non-Negotiable)	1. Scope and Quality of Content (Non-Negotiable)
	2. Range and Volume of Sources (Non-Negotiable)

To evaluate each set of submitted materials for alignment with the standards, begin by reviewing Column 2 for the non-negotiable criteria. If there is a "Yes" for all required indicators in Column 2, then the materials receive a "Yes" in Column 1. If there is a "No" for any required indicators in Column 2, then the materials receive a "No" in Column 1. (Note: If materials do not represent a full curricula, then some of Criteria 1 – 5 may not apply.)

Tier 1 ratings receive a "Yes" in Column 1 for Criteria 1 – 5.
Tier 2 ratings receive a "Yes" in Column 1 for all non-negotiable criteria, but at least one "No" in Column 1 for the remaining criteria.
Tier 3 ratings receive a "No" in Column 1 for at least one of the non-negotiable criteria.

CRITERIA	INDICATORS OF SUPERIOR QUALITY	MEETS METRICS (Yes/No)	JUSTIFICATION/ COMMENTS WITH EXAMPLES
I. Content			
Tier 1 and 2 Non-Negotiable **1. SCOPE AND QUALITY OF CONTENT:** Materials adequately address the Louisiana's Grade-Level Expectations (GLEs) at sufficient depth, accuracy, and quality to build social studies content knowledge. ☐ Yes ☒ No	**REQUIRED** **1a)** Materials address the content of 90% of the GLEs.	**No**	The materials address 34% of the Louisiana's GLEs for social studies according to a chart provided when the user searches standards by grade level, subject, and state.
	1b) Materials provide regular opportunities for students to explore key questions and build knowledge and skills with the social studies content indicated by the GLEs.	**Yes**	The textbook provides opportunities for students to explore key questions and concepts in social studies, but these concepts are not centered on the Louisiana 8th Grade GLEs.
Tier 1 and 2 Non-Negotiable **2. RANGE AND VOLUME OF SOURCES:** Materials include varied types of primary and secondary sources. ☐ Yes ☒ No	**REQUIRED** **2a)** The main focus of the materials is on primary and secondary sources[11] to develop content knowledge and express claims.	**No**	The textbook is centered on a traditional narrative based on smaller lessons within a unit that can be accessed on the website. The publisher provides a plethora of primary and secondary sources (The Early Republic unit contains over two-dozen curated sources alone) but they are located in other sections of the textbook and not integrated into the primary narrative itself.

[11] Primary sources provide first-hand testimony or direct evidence concerning a topic under investigation and are created by witnesses or recorders who experienced the events or conditions being documented. Often these sources are created at the time when the events or conditions are occurring, but primary sources can also include autobiographies, memoirs, and oral histories recorded later. Primary sources are characterized by their content, regardless of whether they are available in original format, in microfilm/microfiche, in digital format, or in published format. (http://www.yale.edu/collections_collaborative/primarysources/primarysources.html) For additional definitions and examples, see also: http://www.princeton.edu/~refdesk/primary2.html and http://www.archives.gov/education/research/history-in-the-raw.html.

CRITERIA	INDICATORS OF SUPERIOR QUALITY	MEETS METRICS (Yes/No)	JUSTIFICATION/ COMMENTS WITH EXAMPLES
	REQUIRED **2b)** Materials include primary and secondary sources of different types (i.e., print and non-print, including video, audio, art, maps, charts, etc.) and varied lengths.	**Yes**	Teachers have access to dozens of written articles from the time periods studied as well as landmark documents for each lesson within unit. There are also photos of various types of paintings and drawings as well as plays for students to act out. Many of the primary sources are of longer length, though shorter sources are provided as well. The textbook would better serve Louisiana 8th Grade GLEs if a similar breadth of sources could be provided to cover Louisiana history.
	2c) Materials focus on both primary and secondary sources from different perspectives to allow opportunities for comparison and contrast, including sourcing[12] and corroboration.[13]	**No**	The sources provided in the textbook are from from a variety of perspectives, but the textbook only explicitly provides opportunities for basic compare/contrast instead of corroboration and viewing different perspectives, as seen in the lesson plans in the unit on the Civil War and Reconstruction. The textbook also emphasizes sourcing of documents in their activities, and Cicero provides a variety of their own strategies for sourcing documents. Each strategy is accompanied by an instructional video and PowerPoint presentation to help prepare the teacher.

[12] Sourcing asks students to consider a document's author, occasion, and purpose to determine how those factors influence the content.
[13] Corroboration asks students to determine points where details and evidence across multiple documents agree and disagree.

CRITERIA	INDICATORS OF SUPERIOR QUALITY	MEETS METRICS (Yes/No)	JUSTIFICATION/ COMMENTS WITH EXAMPLES
	2d) Materials focus on both primary and secondary sources from different time periods to enable students to make connections within and across time periods, including contextualization.[14]	**Yes**	The variety of sources in the textbook allow students to look at sources from different time periods to see historical trends. For example, in the lesson on the Embargo Act students are asked to compare the American dependence on British goods during the Jefferson Administration and today's dependence on Middle East oil to make connections across time periods. The textbook could strengthen this further through the introduction of more activities in line with 8th Grade GLEs.
II. Claims			
Tier 1 and 2 Non-Negotiable **3. QUESTIONS AND TASKS:** Materials offer opportunities to elicit direct, observable evidence of the degree to which students can independently demonstrate the grade-level expectations with source(s) described in Criteria 2 and genuinely measure how well students are able to make and support claims about social studies content. ☒ Yes ☐ No	**REQUIRED** **3a)** Questions and tasks focus on engaging students with content in varied contexts (e.g., examining different sources, completing tasks, answering multiple-choice questions, engaging in speaking/listening).	**Yes**	The curriculum uses a wide variety of tasks for students to understand historical concepts, mainly through Common Core-aligned strategies and their own proprietary strategies (SPEECH organizers for instance). Several units include questions and tasks focused on engaging students with content in varied contexts. There are also graphic organizers, open-ended questions and a variety of different projects. In Unit 9: Industry and Migration, students work together to analyze primary sources and then research political machines at the turn of the 20th century. This emphasis on a variety of tasks would mesh well with

[14] Contextualization asks students to determine the time and place a document was created and examine how those factors influence the content.

CRITERIA	INDICATORS OF SUPERIOR QUALITY	MEETS METRICS (Yes/No)	JUSTIFICATION/ COMMENTS WITH EXAMPLES
			Louisiana history topics for use in 8th Grade social studies.
	REQUIRED **3b)** Coherent sequences of source-dependent questions[15] and tasks focus students on building knowledge and skill with content through various texts (primary and secondary sources), classroom research, conversations, etc. and then synthesizing and applying those understandings to recognize recurring themes and evaluate the causes and consequences of events and developments.	**Yes**	There are source-dependent questions throughout the entire textbook. For example, in the Louisiana Purchase lesson where the lesson plan provided requires students to focus on building knowledge and skill with various texts by applying the reoccurring theme of push and pull factors for migration, and the mistreatment of people already living in the newly-acquired land. Additional material from Louisiana history in the same style would support more 8th Grade GLEs.
	REQUIRED **3c)** Source-dependent written and oral tasks require students to demonstrate understanding of social studies content and make connections between ideas, people, and events across time and place, recognize recurring themes, and evaluate the causes and consequences of events and developments.	**Yes**	Based on the teacher toolbox provided, it is evident that this curriculum is designed to show connections across time and place. Throughout each Unit, students use sources to understand historical concepts. Cicero's own reading strategies such as ARTIST and R&B are designed specifically to help students understand the background, course of a historical event, and the consequences of the event. Each unit is set up to take account of the cause and effect relationships throughout history--a theme that can be

[15] Source-dependent questions or tasks are those that require students to pull information from a given source(s) to answer the question. Students still pull from prior learning, but the evidentiary support required in the students' responses are dependent upon the source(s).

CRITERIA	INDICATORS OF SUPERIOR QUALITY	MEETS METRICS (Yes/No)	JUSTIFICATION/ COMMENTS WITH EXAMPLES
			easily adapted to Louisiana history.
	3d) Materials use varied modes of assessment, including a range of pre-, formative, summative and self-assessment measures that are unbiased and accessible to all students.	**No**	The range of assessment options are limited. There are some pre-assessments based on reading comprehension strategies as well as some project-based formative and summative assessments. However, there is not a systematic method of formative and summative assessment for all lessons. For instance, in the Radical Republicans lesson in the Civil War and Reconstruction unit, the lesson plan does not give any formal assessment options for the teacher to use. Each unit has a summative assessment, and consists of multiple-choice and short answer questions.
	3e) Aligned rubrics or assessment guidelines (such as scoring guides or student work exemplars) are included and provide sufficient guidance for interpreting student performance.	**No**	All of the writing activities and end-of-unit assessment have answer keys, and the textbook includes rubrics for various types of products including podcasts and Webquests. However there are no supplied student work exemplars for any activity.
4. RESPONSE TO SOURCES: Materials provide frequent opportunities for students to engage in discussions (both formal and informal) around the content and then express their understanding of the content through the development and	**REQUIRED** **4a)** Materials provide regular opportunities for students through discussions to develop claims about social studies content identified in the GLEs.	**Not Evaluated**	This section was not evaluated because the non-negotiable criteria were not met.
	REQUIRED **4b)** Writing opportunities for students occur on a regular basis and are varied in length and time demands (e.g., notes, summaries, short-answer responses, whole-class shared	**Not Evaluated**	This section was not evaluated because the non-negotiable criteria were not met.

CRITERIA	INDICATORS OF SUPERIOR QUALITY	MEETS METRICS (Yes/No)	JUSTIFICATION/ COMMENTS WITH EXAMPLES
support of claims in writing. ☐ Yes ☐ No	writing/formal essays, on-demand and process writing, etc.).		
	REQUIRED for **grades 3-12 only** **4c)** A vast majority of written tasks require students to present well-defended claims and clear information, providing evidence to support valid inferences from sources to explain how society, the environment, the political and economic landscape, and historical events influence perspectives, values, traditions, and ideas.	**Not Evaluated**	This section was not evaluated because the non-negotiable criteria were not met.
	REQUIRED **4d)** Materials provide frequent opportunities for students to conduct shared (grades K-2) or short research projects to develop the expertise needed to conduct research independently.	**Not Evaluated**	This section was not evaluated because the non-negotiable criteria were not met.
	4e) Materials build students' active listening skills, such as taking notes on main ideas, asking relevant questions, and elaborating on remarks of others to develop understanding of topics, sources, and tasks.	**Not Evaluated**	This section was not evaluated because the non-negotiable criteria were not met.
III. Scaffolding and Support			
5. SCAFFOLDING AND SUPPORT: Materials provide all students with extensive opportunities and support to explore key questions using multiple sources to make claims about social studies content. ☐ Yes ☐ No	**REQUIRED** **5a)** Activities and suggested approaches guide teachers on how to scaffold instruction for students to build understanding of the content.	**Not Evaluated**	This section was not evaluated because the non-negotiable criteria were not met.
	REQUIRED **5b)** The materials are easy to use and well organized for students and teachers.	**Not Evaluated**	This section was not evaluated because the non-negotiable criteria were not met.

CRITERIA	INDICATORS OF SUPERIOR QUALITY	MEETS METRICS (Yes/No)	JUSTIFICATION/ COMMENTS WITH EXAMPLES
	5c) Appropriate suggestions and materials are provided for supporting varying student needs at the unit and lesson level (e.g., alternate teaching approaches, pacing, instructional delivery options, suggestions for addressing common student difficulties to meet standards, etc.).	**Not Evaluated**	This section was not evaluated because the non-negotiable criteria were not met.
	5d) The content can be reasonably completed within a regular school year and the pacing of content allows for maximum student understanding. The materials provide guidance about the amount of time a task might reasonably take.	**Not Evaluated**	This section was not evaluated because the non-negotiable criteria were not met.

FINAL EVALUATION
Tier 1 ratings receive a "Yes" in Column 1 for Criteria 1 – 5.
Tier 2 ratings receive a "Yes" in Column 1 for all non-negotiable criteria, but at least one "No" in Column 1 for the remaining criteria.
Tier 3 ratings receive a "No" in Column 1 for at least one of the non-negotiable criteria.

Compile the results for Sections I-VII to make a final decision for the material under review.

Section	Criteria	Yes/No	Final Justification/Comments
I: Content	1. Scope and Quality of Content **(Non-Negotiable)**	**No**	Only 34% of the 2011 Louisiana History 8th grade GLEs are addressed.
	2. Range and Volume of Sources **(Non-Negotiable)**	**No**	The textbook primarily relies on a traditional narrative for teaching the content, but has a large selection of curated primary and secondary sources for optional use by the teacher.
II: Claims	3. Questions and Tasks **(Non-Negotiable)**	**Yes**	There is a wide variety of source-dependent activities that build student understanding of each topic and make connections across time and place. The textbook falls short in terms of assessment with no end-of-lesson assessment and lack of standardized test preparation materials

CRITERIA	INDICATORS OF SUPERIOR QUALITY	MEETS METRICS (Yes/No)	JUSTIFICATION/ COMMENTS WITH EXAMPLES
	4. Response to Sources	**Not Evaluated**	Not evaluated since non-negotiable criteria was not met.
III: Scaffolding and Support	5. Scaffolding and Support	**Not Evaluated**	Not evaluated since non-negotiable criteria was not met.
FINAL DECISION FOR THIS MATERIAL: **Tier III, Not representing quality**			

Appendix I.

Publisher Response

The publisher had no response.

Appendix II.

Public Comments

There were no public comments submitted.