DEPARTMENT of EDUCATION
Louisiana Believes

Instructional Materials Evaluation Tool for Alignment in Social Studies Grades K – 12

FULL CURRICULUM
Instructional Materials

The goal for social studies students is develop a deep, conceptual understanding of the content, as demonstrated through writing and speaking about the content. Strong social studies instruction is built around these priorities.

Content: Students explain how society, the environment, the political and economic landscape, and historical events influence perspectives, values, traditions, and ideas.

To accomplish this, they:

- Use key questions to build understanding of content through multiple sources
- Corroborate sources and evaluate evidence by considering author, occasion, and purpose

Claims: Students develop and express claims through discussions and writing which examine the impact of relationships between ideas, people, and events across time and place.

To accomplish this, they:

- Recognize recurring themes and patterns in history, geography, economics, and civics
- Evaluate the causes and consequences of events and developments

Title: **Cicero Kids** Grade/Course: **K-5**

Publisher: **AKJ Books** Copyright: **2015**

Overall Rating: **Tier III, Not representing quality**

Tier I, Tier II, Tier III Elements of this review:

STRONG	WEAK
	1. Scope and Quality of Content (Non-Negotiable)
	2. Range and Volume of Sources (Non-Negotiable)
	3. Questions and Tasks (Non-Negotiable)

Each set of submitted materials was evaluated for alignment with the standards, beginning with a review of the indicators for the non-negotiable criteria. If those criteria were met, a review of the other criteria ensued.

Tier 1 ratings received a "Yes" for all Criteria 1 – 5.
Tier 2 ratings received a "Yes" for all non-negotiable criteria, but at least one "No" for the remaining criteria.
Tier 3 ratings received a "No for at least one of the non-negotiable criteria.

Click below for complete grade-level reviews:

Grade K (Tier 3) Grade 1 (Tier 3) Grade 2 (Tier 3)
Grade 3 (Tier 3) Grade 4 (Tier 3) Grade 5 (Tier 3)

The goal for social studies students is develop a deep, conceptual understanding of the content, as demonstrated through writing and speaking about the content. Strong social studies instruction is built around these priorities.

Content: Students explain how society, the environment, the political and economic landscape, and historical events influence perspectives, values, traditions, and ideas.

To accomplish this, they:

- Use key questions to build understanding of content through multiple sources
- Corroborate sources and evaluate evidence by considering author, occasion, and purpose

Claims: Students develop and express claims through discussions and writing which examine the impact of relationships between ideas, people, and events across time and place.

To accomplish this, they:

- Recognize recurring themes and patterns in history, geography, economics, and civics
- Evaluate the causes and consequences of events and developments

Title: **Cicero Kids** Grade/Course: **K**

Publisher: **AKJ Books** Copyright: **2015**

Overall Rating: **Tier III, Not representing quality**

Tier I, Tier II, Tier III Elements of this review:

STRONG	WEAK
	1. Scope and Quality of Content (Non-Negotiable)
	2. Range and Volume of Sources (Non-Negotiable)
	3. Questions and Tasks (Non-Negotiable)

To evaluate each set of submitted materials for alignment with the standards, begin by reviewing Column 2 for the non-negotiable criteria. If there is a "Yes" for all required indicators in Column 2, then the materials receive a "Yes" in Column 1. If there is a "No" for any required indicators in Column 2, then the materials receive a "No" in Column 1. (Note: If materials do not represent a full curricula, then some of Criteria 1 – 5 may not apply.)

Tier 1 ratings receive a "Yes" in Column 1 for Criteria 1 – 5.
Tier 2 ratings receive a "Yes" in Column 1 for all non-negotiable criteria, but at least one "No" in Column 1 for the remaining criteria.
Tier 3 ratings receive a "No" in Column 1 for at least one of the non-negotiable criteria.

CRITERIA	INDICATORS OF SUPERIOR QUALITY	MEETS METRICS (Yes/No)	JUSTIFICATION/ COMMENTS WITH EXAMPLES
I. Content			
Tier 1 and 2 Non-Negotiable **1. SCOPE AND QUALITY OF CONTENT:** Materials adequately address the Louisiana's Grade-Level Expectations (GLEs) at sufficient depth, accuracy, and quality to build social studies content knowledge. ☐ Yes ☒ No	**REQUIRED** **1a)** Materials address the content of 90% of the GLEs.	**No**	The materials do not cover 90% of GLEs. There are only five lessons which apply to the K GLEs (i.e., 20%). While GLE K.2.3 is somewhat addressed in one lesson on Thanksgiving, no other local, state, and national holidays are covered using various resources. Similarly, GLE K.3.5 connects through a link to a map of a landform; however, there are no other resources or lessons for a kindergarten student to understand or illustrate a landform without prior exposure to landforms. Although there are links for several GLEs (e.g., K.3.6, K.4, K.5, K.5.2, and K.5.5), no resources were found that are appropriate for kindergarten students who lack prior knowledge of the topics covered in these GLEs.
	1b) Materials provide regular opportunities for students to explore key questions and build knowledge and skills with the social studies content indicated by the GLEs.	**No**	The materials provide opportunities for students to interact with lower level teacher prompting questions, key questions are not explored; and, students are not given the opportunity to build knowledge and skills that are based on social studies content from the GLEs

CRITERIA	INDICATORS OF SUPERIOR QUALITY	MEETS METRICS (Yes/No)	JUSTIFICATION/ COMMENTS WITH EXAMPLES
Tier 1 and 2 Non-Negotiable **2. RANGE AND VOLUME OF SOURCES:** Materials include varied types of primary and secondary sources. ☐ Yes ☒ No	**REQUIRED** **2a)** The main focus of the materials is on primary and secondary sources[1] to develop content knowledge and express claims.	**No**	While some lessons include the use of secondary sources, primary sources are minimal, not varied, and are not the main focus of the lesson. Primary sources include The First Thanksgiving and Christopher Columbus and his Ships. These lessons contain secondary resources such as stories, videos, maps, and charts. In the First Thanksgiving lesson for example, a Mayflower fact sheet is to be completed. In A New Nation there is a slide presention, a story about the Town and Country mouse, art of national symbols, and maps. There were no videos that correspond with kindergarten GLEs and students are expected to interact with poor quality clipart. The main focus of lessons are to provide verbal responses to slide presentations that are facilitated by teacher.
	REQUIRED **2b)** Materials include primary and secondary sources of different types (i.e., print and non-print, including video, audio, art, maps, charts, etc.) and varied lengths.	**No**	Primary sources are not presented within kindergarten lessons. In addition, the sources that are available in the "museum" room at the "sites and sounds" link are not organized by grade; it is therefore unlikely that a Kindergartener would be able to

[1] Primary sources provide first-hand testimony or direct evidence concerning a topic under investigation and are created by witnesses or recorders who experienced the events or conditions being documented. Often these sources are created at the time when the events or conditions are occurring, but primary sources can also include autobiographies, memoirs, and oral histories recorded later. Primary sources are characterized by their content, regardless of whether they are available in original format, in microfilm/microfiche, in digital format, or in published format. (http://www.yale.edu/collections_collaborative/primarysources/primarysources.html) For additional definitions and examples, see also: http://www.princeton.edu/~refdesk/primary2.html and http://www.archives.gov/education/research/history-in-the-raw.html.

CRITERIA	INDICATORS OF SUPERIOR QUALITY	MEETS METRICS (Yes/No)	JUSTIFICATION/ COMMENTS WITH EXAMPLES
			select the correct files. Secondary sources within each lesson include coloring pages, slide presentations, storybooks, maps, and charts.
	2c) Materials focus on both primary and secondary sources from different perspectives to allow opportunities for comparison and contrast, including sourcing[2] and corroboration.[3]	**No**	Secondary sources present a wealth of background information; however, the application of facts and information is missing for the students. There are no opportunities for sourcing or corroboration in the kindergarten lessons
	2d) Materials focus on both primary and secondary sources from different time periods to enable students to make connections within and across time periods, including contextualization.[4]	**No**	Materials from different time periods are available; however, the activities present no opportunity to make any connections. In The First Thanksgiving lesson, the objective is to ask students to learn about true events. However, there are no activities available to support the contextualization of those events.
II. Claims			
Tier 1 and 2 Non-Negotiable **3. QUESTIONS AND TASKS:** Materials offer opportunities to elicit direct, observable evidence of the degree to which students can independently demonstrate	**REQUIRED** **3a)** Questions and tasks focus on engaging students with content in varied contexts (e.g., examining different sources, completing tasks, answering multiple-choice questions, engaging in speaking/listening).	**No**	Many lessons depend on the to teacher to tell students the information and lack an authentic application of the information shared. For example, in the Transcontinental Railroad lesson, the teacher is to tell the students about the penny and Abraham

[2] Sourcing asks students to consider a document's author, occasion, and purpose to determine how those factors influence the content.
[3] Corroboration asks students to determine points where details and evidence across multiple documents agree and disagree.
[4] Contextualization asks students to determine the time and place a document was created and examine how those factors influence the content.

CRITERIA	INDICATORS OF SUPERIOR QUALITY	MEETS METRICS (Yes/No)	JUSTIFICATION/ COMMENTS WITH EXAMPLES
the grade-level expectations with source(s) described in Criteria 2 and genuinely measure how well students are able to make and support claims about social studies content. ☐ Yes ☒ No			Lincoln, show students a slide presentation, then have students color a photo of a train. This lesson has no instruction that ask students to apply any of the information from the topic.
	REQUIRED **3b)** Coherent sequences of source-dependent questions[5] and tasks focus students on building knowledge and skill with content through various texts (primary and secondary sources), classroom research, conversations, etc. and then synthesizing and applying those understandings to recognize recurring themes and evaluate the causes and consequences of events and developments.	**No**	Students have no interaction with primary sources in any of the lessons that are facilitated by the teacher; therefore, sequences of source-dependent questions are not present. While many opportunites are available to do so, the program does not take advantage to utilize them within the lessons. Only one primary source was noted within The First Thanksgiving lesson. The source did not however provide a variety of text for kindergarten students. Therefore, students are unable to focus on building knowledge and skill.
	REQUIRED **3c)** Source-dependent written and oral tasks require students to demonstrate understanding of social studies content and make connections between ideas, people, and events across time and place, recognize recurring themes, and evaluate the causes and consequences of events and developments.	**No**	Only oral tasks are present for Kindergarten. Students are not asked to analyze or demonstrate understanding of connections for major Social Studies GLEs. In addition, the written tasks do not demonstrate understanding of social studies. For example, the objective in The Western Frontier lesson

[5] Source-dependent questions or tasks are those that require students to pull information from a given source(s) to answer the question. Students still pull from prior learning, but the evidentiary support required in the students' responses are dependent upon the source(s).

CRITERIA	INDICATORS OF SUPERIOR QUALITY	MEETS METRICS (Yes/No)	JUSTIFICATION/ COMMENTS WITH EXAMPLES
			is for students to understand maps and compasses. The assessment however only tests student knowledge of vocabulary. Oral tasks in this lesson have the teacher explaining information to the students; and there is only one opportunity for modeling, with limited independent practice for students to master the objective(s).
	3d) Materials use varied modes of assessment, including a range of pre-, formative, summative and self-assessment measures that are unbiased and accessible to all students.	**No**	Most assessments are summative with no self- assessment measures included. Additionally, the summative assessments do not apply to the actual content of the lesson. For example, in the lesson U.S. Symbols a summative assessment is based upon students recording information about someone who is important to them, because symbols are important to people. While this may be a good connection to make, it should not be the way to assess whether or not students understand the US symbols.
	3e) Aligned rubrics or assessment guidelines (such as scoring guides or student work exemplars) are included and provide sufficient guidance for interpreting student performance.	**Yes**	Rubrics are present for each unit for various forms of assessment.
4. RESPONSE TO SOURCES: Materials provide frequent opportunities for students to engage in discussions (both formal and informal) around the content and then express their	**REQUIRED** **4a)** Materials provide regular opportunities for students through discussions to develop claims about social studies content identified in the GLEs.	**Not Evaluated**	This section was not evaluated because the non-negotiable criteria were not met.
	REQUIRED **4b)** Writing opportunities for students occur on a regular	**Not Evaluated**	This section was not evaluated because the

CRITERIA	INDICATORS OF SUPERIOR QUALITY	MEETS METRICS (Yes/No)	JUSTIFICATION/ COMMENTS WITH EXAMPLES
understanding of the content through the development and support of claims in writing. ☐ Yes ☐ No	basis and are varied in length and time demands (e.g., notes, summaries, short-answer responses, whole-class shared writing/formal essays, on-demand and process writing, etc.).		non-negotiable criteria were not met.
	REQUIRED for **grades 3-12 only** **4c)** A vast majority of written tasks require students to present well-defended claims and clear information, providing evidence to support valid inferences from sources to explain how society, the environment, the political and economic landscape, and historical events influence perspectives, values, traditions, and ideas.	**Not Evaluated**	This section was not evaluated because the non-negotiable criteria were not met.
	REQUIRED **4d)** Materials provide frequent opportunities for students to conduct shared (grades K-2) or short research projects to develop the expertise needed to conduct research independently.	**Not Evaluated**	This section was not evaluated because the non-negotiable criteria were not met.
	4e) Materials build students' active listening skills, such as taking notes on main ideas, asking relevant questions, and elaborating on remarks of others to develop understanding of topics, sources, and tasks.	**Not Evaluated**	This section was not evaluated because the non-negotiable criteria were not met.
III. Scaffolding and Support			
5. SCAFFOLDING AND SUPPORT: Materials provide all students with extensive opportunities and support to explore key questions using multiple sources to make claims about social studies content.	**REQUIRED** **5a)** Activities and suggested approaches guide teachers on how to scaffold instruction for students to build understanding of the content.	**Not Evaluated**	This section was not evaluated because the non-negotiable criteria were not met.
	REQUIRED **5b)** The materials are easy to use and well organized for students and teachers.	**Not Evaluated**	This section was not evaluated because the non-negotiable criteria were not met.

CRITERIA	INDICATORS OF SUPERIOR QUALITY	MEETS METRICS (Yes/No)	JUSTIFICATION/ COMMENTS WITH EXAMPLES
☐ Yes ☐ No	**5c)** Appropriate suggestions and materials are provided for supporting varying student needs at the unit and lesson level (e.g., alternate teaching approaches, pacing, instructional delivery options, suggestions for addressing common student difficulties to meet standards, etc.).	**Not Evaluated**	This section was not evaluated because the non-negotiable criteria were not met.
	5d) The content can be reasonably completed within a regular school year and the pacing of content allows for maximum student understanding. The materials provide guidance about the amount of time a task might reasonably take.	**Not Evaluated**	This section was not evaluated because the non-negotiable criteria were not met.

FINAL EVALUATION
Tier 1 ratings receive a "Yes" in Column 1 for Criteria 1 – 5.
Tier 2 ratings receive a "Yes" in Column 1 for all non-negotiable criteria, but at least one "No" in Column 1 for the remaining criteria.
Tier 3 ratings receive a "No" in Column 1 for at least one of the non-negotiable criteria.

Compile the results for Sections I-VII to make a final decision for the material under review.

Section	Criteria	Yes/No	Final Justification/Comments
I: Content	1. Scope and Quality of Content **(Non-Negotiable)**	**No**	Materials do not address 90% of the current state GLEs.
	2. Range and Volume of Sources **(Non-Negotiable)**	**No**	Primary sources and secondary sources are not the main focus of instruction.
II: Claims	3. Questions and Tasks **(Non-Negotiable)**	**No**	Many questions and tasks require the teacher to provide responses for students. Tasks that require the application of information are minimal.
	4. Response to Sources	**Not Evaluated**	This section was not evaluated because the non-negotiable criteria were not met.
III: Scaffolding and Support	5. Scaffolding and Support	**Not Evaluated**	This section was not evaluated because the non-negotiable criteria were not met.

FINAL DECISION FOR THIS MATERIAL: **Tier III, Not representing quality**

The goal for social studies students is develop a deep, conceptual understanding of the content, as demonstrated through writing and speaking about the content. Strong social studies instruction is built around these priorities.

Content: Students explain how society, the environment, the political and economic landscape, and historical events influence perspectives, values, traditions, and ideas.

To accomplish this, they:

- Use key questions to build understanding of content through multiple sources
- Corroborate sources and evaluate evidence by considering author, occasion, and purpose

Claims: Students develop and express claims through discussions and writing which examine the impact of relationships between ideas, people, and events across time and place.

To accomplish this, they:

- Recognize recurring themes and patterns in history, geography, economics, and civics
- Evaluate the causes and consequences of events and developments

Title: **Cicero Kids** Grade/Course: **1**

Publisher: **AKJ Books** Copyright: **2015**

Overall Rating: **Tier III, Not representing quality**

Tier I, Tier II, Tier III Elements of this review:

STRONG	WEAK
	1. Scope and Quality of Content (Non-Negotiable)
	2. Range and Volume of Sources (Non-Negotiable)
	3. Questions and Tasks (Non-Negotiable)

To evaluate each set of submitted materials for alignment with the standards, begin by reviewing Column 2 for the non-negotiable criteria. If there is a "Yes" for all required indicators in Column 2, then the materials receive a "Yes" in Column 1. If there is a "No" for any required indicators in Column 2, then the materials receive a "No" in Column 1. (Note: If materials do not represent a full curricula, then some of Criteria 1 – 5 may not apply.)

Tier 1 ratings receive a "Yes" in Column 1 for Criteria 1 – 5.
Tier 2 ratings receive a "Yes" in Column 1 for all non-negotiable criteria, but at least one "No" in Column 1 for the remaining criteria.
Tier 3 ratings receive a "No" in Column 1 for at least one of the non-negotiable criteria.

CRITERIA	INDICATORS OF SUPERIOR QUALITY	MEETS METRICS (Yes/No)	JUSTIFICATION/ COMMENTS WITH EXAMPLES
I. Content			
Tier 1 and 2 Non-Negotiable **1. SCOPE AND QUALITY OF CONTENT:** Materials adequately address the Louisiana's Grade-Level Expectations (GLEs) at sufficient depth, accuracy, and quality to build social studies content knowledge. ☐ Yes ☒ No	**REQUIRED** **1a)** Materials address the content of 90% of the GLEs.	**No**	The materials do not address 90% of the GLEs. There are only two of the 19 lessons, which directly apply to the first grade GLEs (10.5%.) In addition, some material may be inappropriate for first grade. For example, in the lesson The New Nation, children discuss amputation during the American Revolution. This is not listed as a standard applicable to first grade.
	1b) Materials provide regular opportunities for students to explore key questions and build knowledge and skills with the social studies content indicated by the GLEs.	**No**	The materials provide opportunities for students to interact with lower level teacher prompting questions. Key questions are not explored and students are not given the opportunities to build knowledge and skills based on the social studies content from the GLEs
Tier 1 and 2 Non-Negotiable **2. RANGE AND VOLUME OF SOURCES:** Materials include varied types of primary and secondary sources. ☐ Yes ☒ No	**REQUIRED** **2a)** The main focus of the materials is on primary and secondary sources[6] to develop content knowledge and express claims.	**No**	Primary sources are not varied or the main focus for first grade. Although there are some varied secondary sources, primary sources are minimal. For example, there are stories, videos, maps, and charts for various lessons, but there are also some videos that do not correspond with first grade

[6] Primary sources provide first-hand testimony or direct evidence concerning a topic under investigation and are created by witnesses or recorders who experienced the events or conditions being documented. Often these sources are created at the time when the events or conditions are occurring, but primary sources can also include autobiographies, memoirs, and oral histories recorded later. Primary sources are characterized by their content, regardless of whether they are available in original format, in microfilm/microfiche, in digital format, or in published format. (http://www.yale.edu/collections_collaborative/primarysources/primarysources.html) For additional definitions and examples, see also: http://www.princeton.edu/~refdesk/primary2.html and http://www.archives.gov/education/research/history-in-the-raw.html.

CRITERIA	INDICATORS OF SUPERIOR QUALITY	MEETS METRICS (Yes/No)	JUSTIFICATION/ COMMENTS WITH EXAMPLES
			standards. In addition, students are expected to interact with poor quality clipart. The focus of most lessons is student verbal response to slide presentations that are facilitated by the teacher. Such an approach does not help develop content knowledge at a deeper level.
	REQUIRED **2b)** Materials include primary and secondary sources of different types (i.e., print and non-print, including video, audio, art, maps, charts, etc.) and varied lengths.	**No**	Primary sources are not presented within the first grade lessons. In addition, the sources available in the "museum" room at the "sites and sounds" link are not organized by grade; it is therefore unlikely that a first grader would be able to select the correct files.
	2c) Materials focus on both primary and secondary sources from different perspectives to allow opportunities for comparison and contrast, including sourcing[7] and corroboration.[8]	**No**	Secondary sources present a wealth of background information; however, the application of these facts is missing for the students. There are no opportunities for sourcing or corroboration in the first grade lessons
	2d) Materials focus on both primary and secondary sources from different time periods to enable students to make connections within and across time periods, including contextualization.[9]	**No**	Materials from different time periods are available; however, the activities present no opportunity to make any connections. For example, in The Western Frontier lesson there are only secondary sources available.

[7] Sourcing asks students to consider a document's author, occasion, and purpose to determine how those factors influence the content.
[8] Corroboration asks students to determine points where details and evidence across multiple documents agree and disagree.
[9] Contextualization asks students to determine the time and place a document was created and examine how those factors influence the content.

CRITERIA	INDICATORS OF SUPERIOR QUALITY	MEETS METRICS (Yes/No)	JUSTIFICATION/ COMMENTS WITH EXAMPLES
			In first grade, there is only one primary source found within the lessons: Explorers and the New World Settlement.
II. Claims			
Tier 1 and 2 Non-Negotiable **3. QUESTIONS AND TASKS:** Materials offer opportunities to elicit direct, observable evidence of the degree to which students can independently demonstrate the grade-level expectations with source(s) described in Criteria 2 and genuinely measure how well students are able to make and support claims about social studies content. ☐ Yes ☒ No	**REQUIRED** **3a)** Questions and tasks focus on engaging students with content in varied contexts (e.g., examining different sources, completing tasks, answering multiple-choice questions, engaging in speaking/listening).	**No**	Many lessons depend on the teacher to tell the students information and lack an authentic application of that information. For example, in the Who were the 49ers lesson the teacher tells the students about the California Gold Rush (which is not a first grade GLE) and then has students participate in a cut and paste activity to showcase their understanding of the topic. The lesson does not have the students transfer any relevant information from the topic given.
	REQUIRED **3b)** Coherent sequences of source-dependent questions[10] and tasks focus students on building knowledge and skill with content through various texts (primary and secondary sources), classroom research, conversations, etc. and then synthesizing and applying those understandings to recognize recurring themes and evaluate the causes and consequences of events and developments.	**No**	Students experience limited interaction with primary sources in lessons that are facilitated by the teacher; therefore, sequences of source-dependent questions are not present. While many opportunites are available, the program does not utilize them. The lessons for first grade provide no coherent sequence to recognize recurring themes because of limited primary sources.
	REQUIRED **3c)** Source-dependent written and oral tasks require	**No**	Most activities within the first grade lessons,

[10] Source-dependent questions or tasks are those that require students to pull information from a given source(s) to answer the question. Students still pull from prior learning, but the evidentiary support required in the students' responses are dependent upon the source(s).

CRITERIA	INDICATORS OF SUPERIOR QUALITY	MEETS METRICS (Yes/No)	JUSTIFICATION/ COMMENTS WITH EXAMPLES
	students to demonstrate understanding of social studies content and make connections between ideas, people, and events across time and place, recognize recurring themes, and evaluate the causes and consequences of events and developments.		Explorers and the New world Settlement, ask students to color, paste and cut. These activities do not allow students to make connections and are not dependent upon sources since there are very few sources made accessible to this age group.
	3d) Materials use varied modes of assessment, including a range of pre-, formative, summative and self-assessment measures that are unbiased and accessible to all students.	**No**	Most assessments are summative with no self- assessment measures included. Additionally, most summative assessments do not apply to the actual content of the lessons. These assessments include worksheets or coloring sheets for the review of the material presented. There are limited pre- and formative assessments included.
	3e) Aligned rubrics or assessment guidelines (such as scoring guides or student work exemplars) are included and provide sufficient guidance for interpreting student performance.	**Yes**	Rubrics are present for each unit for various forms of assessment.
4. RESPONSE TO SOURCES: Materials provide frequent opportunities for students to engage in discussions (both formal and informal) around the content and then express their understanding of the content through the development and support of claims in writing.	**REQUIRED** **4a)** Materials provide regular opportunities for students through discussions to develop claims about social studies content identified in the GLEs.	**Not Evaluated**	This section was not evaluated because the non-negotiable criteria were not met.
	REQUIRED **4b)** Writing opportunities for students occur on a regular basis and are varied in length and time demands (e.g., notes, summaries, short-answer responses, whole-class shared writing/formal essays, on-demand and process writing, etc.).	**Not Evaluated**	This section was not evaluated because the non-negotiable criteria were not met.
☐ Yes ☐ No	**REQUIRED** for **grades 3-12 only** **4c)** A vast majority of written tasks require students to present well-defended claims and clear information, providing evidence to support valid inferences from sources	**N/A**	

CRITERIA	INDICATORS OF SUPERIOR QUALITY	MEETS METRICS (Yes/No)	JUSTIFICATION/ COMMENTS WITH EXAMPLES
	to explain how society, the environment, the political and economic landscape, and historical events influence perspectives, values, traditions, and ideas.		
	REQUIRED **4d)** Materials provide frequent opportunities for students to conduct shared (grades K-2) or short research projects to develop the expertise needed to conduct research independently.	**Not Evaluated**	This section was not evaluated because the non-negotiable criteria were not met.
	4e) Materials build students' active listening skills, such as taking notes on main ideas, asking relevant questions, and elaborating on remarks of others to develop understanding of topics, sources, and tasks.	**Not Evaluated**	This section was not evaluated because the non-negotiable criteria were not met.
III. Scaffolding and Support			
5. SCAFFOLDING AND SUPPORT: Materials provide all students with extensive opportunities and support to explore key questions using multiple sources to make claims about social studies content. ☐ Yes ☐ No	**REQUIRED** **5a)** Activities and suggested approaches guide teachers on how to scaffold instruction for students to build understanding of the content.	**Not Evaluated**	This section was not evaluated because the non-negotiable criteria were not met.
	REQUIRED **5b)** The materials are easy to use and well organized for students and teachers.	**Not Evaluated**	This section was not evaluated because the non-negotiable criteria were not met.
	5c) Appropriate suggestions and materials are provided for supporting varying student needs at the unit and lesson level (e.g., alternate teaching approaches, pacing, instructional delivery options, suggestions for addressing common student difficulties to meet standards, etc.).	**Not Evaluated**	This section was not evaluated because the non-negotiable criteria were not met.
	5d) The content can be reasonably completed within a regular school year and the pacing of content allows for maximum student understanding. The materials provide guidance about the amount of time a task might reasonably take.	**Not Evaluated**	This section was not evaluated because the non-negotiable criteria were not met.

CRITERIA	INDICATORS OF SUPERIOR QUALITY	MEETS METRICS (Yes/No)	JUSTIFICATION/ COMMENTS WITH EXAMPLES
FINAL EVALUATION ***Tier 1 ratings*** receive a "Yes" in Column 1 for Criteria 1 – 5. ***Tier 2 ratings*** receive a "Yes" in Column 1 for all non-negotiable criteria, but at least one "No" in Column 1 for the remaining criteria. ***Tier 3 ratings*** receive a "No" in Column 1 for at least one of the non-negotiable criteria.			
Compile the results for Sections I-VII to make a final decision for the material under review.			
Section	**Criteria**	**Yes/No**	**Final Justification/Comments**
I: Content	1. Scope and Quality of Content **(Non-Negotiable)**	**No**	Materials do not address 90% of the current state GLEs.
	2. Range and Volume of Sources **(Non-Negotiable)**	**No**	Primary sources are limited for first grade. While there are many sources available in the museum room at the sites and sounds link, but these are not organized for students by grade.
II: Claims	3. Questions and Tasks **(Non-Negotiable)**	**No**	Students experience limited interaction with primary sources in the lessons. Sequences of source-dependent questions are not present.The lessons provide no coherent sequence to recognize recurring themes because of limited primary sources. Most assessments are summative.
	4. Response to Sources	**Not Evaluated**	This section was not evaluated because the non-negotiable criteria were not met.
III: Scaffolding and Support	5. Scaffolding and Support	**Not Evaluated**	This section was not evaluated because the non-negotiable criteria were not met.
FINAL DECISION FOR THIS MATERIAL: **Tier III, Not representing quality**			

The goal for social studies students is develop a deep, conceptual understanding of the content, as demonstrated through writing and speaking about the content. Strong social studies instruction is built around these priorities.

Content: Students explain how society, the environment, the political and economic landscape, and historical events influence perspectives, values, traditions, and ideas.

To accomplish this, they:

- Use key questions to build understanding of content through multiple sources
- Corroborate sources and evaluate evidence by considering author, occasion, and purpose

Claims: Students develop and express claims through discussions and writing which examine the impact of relationships between ideas, people, and events across time and place.

To accomplish this, they:

- Recognize recurring themes and patterns in history, geography, economics, and civics
- Evaluate the causes and consequences of events and developments

Title: **Cicero Kids** Grade/Course: **2**

Publisher: **AKJ Books** Copyright: **2015**

Overall Rating: **Tier III, Not representing quality**

Tier I, Tier II, Tier III Elements of this review:

STRONG	WEAK
	1. Scope and Quality of Content (Non-Negotiable)
	2. Range and Volume of Sources (Non-Negotiable)
	3. Questions and Tasks (Non-Negotiable)

To evaluate each set of submitted materials for alignment with the standards, begin by reviewing Column 2 for the non-negotiable criteria. If there is a "Yes" for all required indicators in Column 2, then the materials receive a "Yes" in Column 1. If there is a "No" for any required indicators in Column 2, then the materials receive a "No" in Column 1. (Note: If materials do not represent a full curricula, then some of Criteria 1 – 5 may not apply.)

Tier 1 ratings receive a "Yes" in Column 1 for Criteria 1 – 5.
Tier 2 ratings receive a "Yes" in Column 1 for all non-negotiable criteria, but at least one "No" in Column 1 for the remaining criteria.
Tier 3 ratings receive a "No" in Column 1 for at least one of the non-negotiable criteria.

CRITERIA	INDICATORS OF SUPERIOR QUALITY	MEETS METRICS (Yes/No)	JUSTIFICATION/ COMMENTS WITH EXAMPLES
I. Content			
Tier 1 and 2 Non-Negotiable **1. SCOPE AND QUALITY OF CONTENT:** Materials adequately address the Louisiana's Grade-Level Expectations (GLEs) at sufficient depth, accuracy, and quality to build social studies content knowledge. ☐ Yes ☒ No	**REQUIRED** **1a)** Materials address the content of 90% of the GLEs.	**No**	The materials do not address 90% of GLEs. There are only five of the 19 lessons, which loosely apply to the 2nd grade GLEs (i.e., 26.3%). The materials via program interface are not grade appropriate for second grade. Some materials are classified as second grade; however, they may actually cover other grade level standards. For example, the Greek Gods and Goddesses lesson available does not apply to any second grade standard.
	1b) Materials provide regular opportunities for students to explore key questions and build knowledge and skills with the social studies content indicated by the GLEs.	**No**	These materials provide opportunities for students to interact with lower level teacher prompting questions. Key questions are not explored and students are not given the opportunities to build knowledge and skills based on the social studies content from the GLEs
Tier 1 and 2 Non-Negotiable **2. RANGE AND VOLUME OF SOURCES:** Materials include varied types of primary and secondary sources.	**REQUIRED** **2a)** The main focus of the materials is on primary and secondary sources[11] to develop content knowledge and express claims.	**No**	Primary sources are minimal, not varied, nor are they the main focus of the lessons. There are some varied secondary sources, but students are expected to interact with poor quality clipart. Most lessons have the main

[11] Primary sources provide first-hand testimony or direct evidence concerning a topic under investigation and are created by witnesses or recorders who experienced the events or conditions being documented. Often these sources are created at the time when the events or conditions are occurring, but primary sources can also include autobiographies, memoirs, and oral histories recorded later. Primary sources are characterized by their content, regardless of whether they are available in original format, in microfilm/microfiche, in digital format, or in published format. (http://www.yale.edu/collections_collaborative/primarysources/primarysources.html) For additional definitions and examples, see also: http://www.princeton.edu/~refdesk/primary2.html and http://www.archives.gov/education/research/history-in-the-raw.html.

CRITERIA	INDICATORS OF SUPERIOR QUALITY	MEETS METRICS (Yes/No)	JUSTIFICATION/ COMMENTS WITH EXAMPLES
☐ Yes ☒ No			focus on verbal responses to slide presentations that are facilitated by the teacher (which does not develop content knowledge at a deeper level).
	REQUIRED **2b)** Materials include primary and secondary sources of different types (i.e., print and non-print, including video, audio, art, maps, charts, etc.) and varied lengths.	**Yes**	An adequate variety of sources are provided for teachers and students. These sources provide teachers an opportunity to build content knowledge at their discretion. In the unit A New Nation, instruction for the lesson Declaration of Independence, is accompanied with the historical document. Sources are located in Reader's Corner, Map Corner, and Background Information section. The Sights and Sounds section, offers audio clips, photographs, and videos to be used with each unit. Students can watch a video on Benjamin Franklin or George Washington while learning about those notable persons of history. Although there are a variety of sources available, students would benefit from a format that was organized by grade level or in a more meaningful way.

CRITERIA	INDICATORS OF SUPERIOR QUALITY	MEETS METRICS (Yes/No)	JUSTIFICATION/ COMMENTS WITH EXAMPLES
	2c) Materials focus on both primary and secondary sources from different perspectives to allow opportunities for comparison and contrast, including sourcing[12] and corroboration.[13]	**No**	While materials present a wealth of background information, the authentic application of these facts is missing for the students. Materials were found that do allow students the opportunity to compare and contrast in second grade.
	2d) Materials focus on both primary and secondary sources from different time periods to enable students to make connections within and across time periods, including contextualization.[14]	**No**	Materials are present from different time periods; however, students are not given the opportunity to make authentic meaningful connections with the activities. For example, in the Child Labor lesson students are asked to draw a picture of what they learned from the lesson. However, they have not been shown any time period primary source from that topic. In addition, a slide presentation to be shown for this lesson was not available (i.e., linked).
II. Claims			
Tier 1 and 2 Non-Negotiable **3. QUESTIONS AND TASKS:** Materials offer opportunities to elicit direct, observable evidence of the degree to which students can independently demonstrate the grade-level expectations with source(s) described in Criteria 2	**REQUIRED** **3a)** Questions and tasks focus on engaging students with content in varied contexts (e.g., examining different sources, completing tasks, answering multiple-choice questions, engaging in speaking/listening).	**No**	Many lessons focus on the teacher telling the students information, and lack an actual application of the information given. In the lesson A Growing Country, the teacher gives has students complete a crossword puzzle to introduce the lesson. The activity does not require the transfer of any relevant

[12] Sourcing asks students to consider a document's author, occasion, and purpose to determine how those factors influence the content.
[13] Corroboration asks students to determine points where details and evidence across multiple documents agree and disagree.
[14] Contextualization asks students to determine the time and place a document was created and examine how those factors influence the content.

CRITERIA	INDICATORS OF SUPERIOR QUALITY	MEETS METRICS (Yes/No)	JUSTIFICATION/ COMMENTS WITH EXAMPLES
and genuinely measure how well students are able to make and support claims about social studies content. ☐ Yes ☒ No			information from the topic. The lesson then has students participate in activities which do not relate to the topic at all (e.g., a word association activity and having the students make a collage to represent the statue of liberty) and without benefit of seeing any primary source(s).
	REQUIRED **3b)** Coherent sequences of source-dependent questions[15] and tasks focus students on building knowledge and skill with content through various texts (primary and secondary sources), classroom research, conversations, etc. and then synthesizing and applying those understandings to recognize recurring themes and evaluate the causes and consequences of events and developments.	**No**	Students have limited interaction with primary sources in any lesson; therefore, sequences of source-dependent questions are not present. While many opportunites to do so are available, the program does not utilize them.The lessons provide no coherent sequence to recognize recurring themes because of limited primary sources.
	REQUIRED **3c)** Source-dependent written and oral tasks require students to demonstrate understanding of social studies content and make connections between ideas, people, and events across time and place, recognize recurring themes, and evaluate the causes and consequences of events and developments.	**No**	Second grade has minimal source dependent written and oral tasks. In addition, these represent lower level tasks which do not require students to make connections in order to demonstrate true understanding of the social studies content.
	3d) Materials use varied modes of assessment, including a range of pre-, formative, summative and self-assessment measures that are unbiased and accessible to all students.	**No**	There are limited pre-and formative assessments included; most are summative with no self- assessment measures included. In addition, most summative assessments do not apply to the actual content of the lesson.

[15] Source-dependent questions or tasks are those that require students to pull information from a given source(s) to answer the question. Students still pull from prior learning, but the evidentiary support required in the students' responses are dependent upon the source(s).

CRITERIA	INDICATORS OF SUPERIOR QUALITY	MEETS METRICS (Yes/No)	JUSTIFICATION/ COMMENTS WITH EXAMPLES
			Assessments include worksheets and coloring sheets for the review of the material presented. The second grade lesson, The Louisiana Purchase, has a summative assessment where students are to complete a vocabulary root word worksheet (which contains words that are not appropriate for second grade) to demonstrate their understanding of a lesson focused on ways the United States formed. Cross curricular lessons must make the connections meaningful and pertain to the overall social studies topic; in this lesson the connection is not made.
	3e) Aligned rubrics or assessment guidelines (such as scoring guides or student work exemplars) are included and provide sufficient guidance for interpreting student performance.	**Yes**	Rubrics are present for each unit for various forms of assessment.
4. RESPONSE TO SOURCES: Materials provide frequent opportunities for students to engage in discussions (both formal and informal) around the content and then express their understanding of the content through the development and support of claims in writing.	**REQUIRED** **4a)** Materials provide regular opportunities for students through discussions to develop claims about social studies content identified in the GLEs.	**Not Evaluated**	This section was not evaluated because the non-negotiable criteria were not met.
	REQUIRED **4b)** Writing opportunities for students occur on a regular basis and are varied in length and time demands (e.g., notes, summaries, short-answer responses, whole-class shared writing/formal essays, on-demand and process writing, etc.).	**Not Evaluated**	This section was not evaluated because the non-negotiable criteria were not met.
☐ Yes ☐ No	**REQUIRED** for **grades 3-12 only** **4c)** A vast majority of written tasks require students to present well-defended claims and clear information, providing evidence to support valid inferences from sources to explain how society, the environment, the political and	**N/A**	

CRITERIA	INDICATORS OF SUPERIOR QUALITY	MEETS METRICS (Yes/No)	JUSTIFICATION/ COMMENTS WITH EXAMPLES
	economic landscape, and historical events influence perspectives, values, traditions, and ideas.		
	REQUIRED **4d)** Materials provide frequent opportunities for students to conduct shared (grades K-2) or short research projects to develop the expertise needed to conduct research independently.	**Not Evaluated**	This section was not evaluated because the non-negotiable criteria were not met.
	4e) Materials build students' active listening skills, such as taking notes on main ideas, asking relevant questions, and elaborating on remarks of others to develop understanding of topics, sources, and tasks.	**Not Evaluated**	This section was not evaluated because the non-negotiable criteria were not met.
III. Scaffolding and Support			
5. SCAFFOLDING AND SUPPORT: Materials provide all students with extensive opportunities and support to explore key questions using multiple sources to make claims about social studies content. ☐ Yes ☐ No	**REQUIRED** **5a)** Activities and suggested approaches guide teachers on how to scaffold instruction for students to build understanding of the content.	**Not Evaluated**	This section was not evaluated because the non-negotiable criteria were not met.
	REQUIRED **5b)** The materials are easy to use and well organized for students and teachers.	**Not Evaluated**	This section was not evaluated because the non-negotiable criteria were not met.
	5c) Appropriate suggestions and materials are provided for supporting varying student needs at the unit and lesson level (e.g., alternate teaching approaches, pacing, instructional delivery options, suggestions for addressing common student difficulties to meet standards, etc.).	**Not Evaluated**	This section was not evaluated because the non-negotiable criteria were not met.
	5d) The content can be reasonably completed within a regular school year and the pacing of content allows for maximum student understanding. The materials provide guidance about the amount of time a task might reasonably take.	**Not Evaluated**	This section was not evaluated because the non-negotiable criteria were not met.

CRITERIA	INDICATORS OF SUPERIOR QUALITY	MEETS METRICS (Yes/No)	JUSTIFICATION/ COMMENTS WITH EXAMPLES
FINAL EVALUATION ***Tier 1 ratings*** receive a "Yes" in Column 1 for Criteria 1 – 5. ***Tier 2 ratings*** receive a "Yes" in Column 1 for all non-negotiable criteria, but at least one "No" in Column 1 for the remaining criteria. ***Tier 3 ratings*** receive a "No" in Column 1 for at least one of the non-negotiable criteria.			
Compile the results for Sections I-VII to make a final decision for the material under review.			
Section	**Criteria**	**Yes/No**	**Final Justification/Comments**
I: Content	1. Scope and Quality of Content **(Non-Negotiable)**	**No**	Materials do not address 90% of the current state GLEs.
	2. Range and Volume of Sources **(Non-Negotiable)**	**No**	Different types of primary and secondary sources from different time periods are provided for second grade; however, activities that enable students to make meaningful connections with them are lacking.
II: Claims	3. Questions and Tasks **(Non-Negotiable)**	**No**	Many lessons depend on the teacher to tell students information and lack an actual application of the information given. Students do not interact with primary sources in any of the lessons that are facilitated by the teacher; therefore, there are no sequences of source-dependent questions or tasks. Students are not asked to analyze or demonstrate their understanding of connections for major Social Studies GLEs.
	4. Response to Sources	**Not Evaluated**	This section was not evaluated because the non-negotiable criteria were not met.
III: Scaffolding and Support	5. Scaffolding and Support	**Not Evaluated**	This section was not evaluated because the non-negotiable criteria were not met.
FINAL DECISION FOR THIS MATERIAL: **Tier III, Not representing quality**			

The goal for social studies students is develop a deep, conceptual understanding of the content, as demonstrated through writing and speaking about the content. Strong social studies instruction is built around these priorities.

Content: Students explain how society, the environment, the political and economic landscape, and historical events influence perspectives, values, traditions, and ideas.

To accomplish this, they:

- Use key questions to build understanding of content through multiple sources
- Corroborate sources and evaluate evidence by considering author, occasion, and purpose

Claims: Students develop and express claims through discussions and writing which examine the impact of relationships between ideas, people, and events across time and place.

To accomplish this, they:

- Recognize recurring themes and patterns in history, geography, economics, and civics
- Evaluate the causes and consequences of events and developments

Title: **Cicero Kids** Grade/Course: **3**

Publisher: **AKJ Books** Copyright: **2015**

Overall Rating: **Tier III, Not representing quality**

Tier I, Tier II, Tier III Elements of this review:

STRONG	WEAK
	1. Scope and Quality of Content (Non-Negotiable)
	2. Range and Volume of Sources (Non-Negotiable)
	3. Questions and Tasks (Non-Negotiable)

To evaluate each set of submitted materials for alignment with the standards, begin by reviewing Column 2 for the non-negotiable criteria. If there is a "Yes" for all required indicators in Column 2, then the materials receive a "Yes" in Column 1. If there is a "No" for any required indicators in Column 2, then the materials receive a "No" in Column 1. (Note: If materials do not represent a full curricula, then some of Criteria 1 – 5 may not apply.)

Tier 1 ratings receive a "Yes" in Column 1 for Criteria 1 – 5.
Tier 2 ratings receive a "Yes" in Column 1 for all non-negotiable criteria, but at least one "No" in Column 1 for the remaining criteria.
Tier 3 ratings receive a "No" in Column 1 for at least one of the non-negotiable criteria.

CRITERIA	INDICATORS OF SUPERIOR QUALITY	MEETS METRICS (Yes/No)	JUSTIFICATION/ COMMENTS WITH EXAMPLES
I. Content			
Tier 1 and 2 Non-Negotiable **1. SCOPE AND QUALITY OF CONTENT:** Materials adequately address the Louisiana's Grade-Level Expectations (GLEs) at sufficient depth, accuracy, and quality to build social studies content knowledge. ☐ Yes ☒ No	**REQUIRED** **1a)** Materials address the content of 90% of the GLEs.	**No**	The materials do not address 90% of the GLEs. The text covers 13 out of 45 GLEs.
	1b) Materials provide regular opportunities for students to explore key questions and build knowledge and skills with the social studies content indicated by the GLEs.	**No**	The materials focus primarily on the history of the United States as a nation and not the state of Louisiana.
Tier 1 and 2 Non-Negotiable **2. RANGE AND VOLUME OF SOURCES:** Materials include varied types of primary and secondary sources. ☐ Yes ☒ No	**REQUIRED** **2a)** The main focus of the materials is on primary and secondary sources[16] to develop content knowledge and express claims.	**No**	While there are activities that allow for interaction with a primary source (e.g., Poetry in the Civil War Room and New Nation Room, Photo in A Growing Country Room 5) these are designed as isolated activities and are not the main focus of the materials or lessons. Primary sources are presented as an additional resource, rather than the core piece for instruction.
	REQUIRED **2b)** Materials include primary and secondary sources of different types (i.e., print and non-print, including video, audio, art, maps, charts, etc.) and varied lengths.	**No**	There are various types of primary and secondary source materials that can be found throughout the different rooms (e.g., in the Readers Corner, informational texts,

[16] Primary sources provide first-hand testimony or direct evidence concerning a topic under investigation and are created by witnesses or recorders who experienced the events or conditions being documented. Often these sources are created at the time when the events or conditions are occurring, but primary sources can also include autobiographies, memoirs, and oral histories recorded later. Primary sources are characterized by their content, regardless of whether they are available in original format, in microfilm/microfiche, in digital format, or in published format. (http://www.yale.edu/collections_collaborative/primarysources/primarysources.html) For additional definitions and examples, see also: http://www.princeton.edu/~refdesk/primary2.html and http://www.archives.gov/education/research/history-in-the-raw.html.

CRITERIA	INDICATORS OF SUPERIOR QUALITY	MEETS METRICS (Yes/No)	JUSTIFICATION/ COMMENTS WITH EXAMPLES
			poems, plays, primary source obituaries, diary excerpts, and biographies). In the Map Drawer room both historical activities and outlines can be found. However, the sources do not pair with the content bands and grade level expectations. When reading about historical figures, content is included that is not related to the standards.
	2c) Materials focus on both primary and secondary sources from different perspectives to allow opportunities for comparison and contrast, including sourcing[17] and corroboration.[18]	**No**	Additional materials that are not included as a primary and secondary source grant students an opportunity to examine historical events from more than one perspective. While perspectives are clearly displayed, the content is not Louisiana-specific at this grade level.
	2d) Materials focus on both primary and secondary sources from different time periods to enable students to make connections within and across time periods, including contextualization.[19]	**No**	Each set of primary and secondary sources reflect that of the "room" or time period in which it is located , but they are not aligned with Louisiana- specific content.
II. Claims			
Tier 1 and 2 Non-Negotiable **3. QUESTIONS AND TASKS:** Materials offer opportunities to elicit direct, observable evidence of the degree to which students	**REQUIRED** **3a)** Questions and tasks focus on engaging students with content in varied contexts (e.g., examining different sources, completing tasks, answering multiple-choice questions, engaging in speaking/listening).	**Yes**	There are some opportunities for students to write and perform speeches that can be applied through the various units and lessons. For example, The Western Frontier Room, Write a SPEECH, provides a lesson on

[17] Sourcing asks students to consider a document's author, occasion, and purpose to determine how those factors influence the content.
[18] Corroboration asks students to determine points where details and evidence across multiple documents agree and disagree.
[19] Contextualization asks students to determine the time and place a document was created and examine how those factors influence the content.

CRITERIA	INDICATORS OF SUPERIOR QUALITY	MEETS METRICS (Yes/No)	JUSTIFICATION/ COMMENTS WITH EXAMPLES
can independently demonstrate the grade-level expectations with source(s) described in Criteria 2 and genuinely measure how well students are able to make and support claims about social studies content. ☐ Yes ☒ No			speech writing and presentations. Rubrics are included. Students are also able to gain knowledge through trading cards, reading comprehension, and word works activities. Another example of this can be found in The Civil War Room which includes an activity that asks students to create a newspaper article about the assassination of Abraham Lincoln.
	REQUIRED **3b)** Coherent sequences of source-dependent questions[20] and tasks focus students on building knowledge and skill with content through various texts (primary and secondary sources), classroom research, conversations, etc. and then synthesizing and applying those understandings to recognize recurring themes and evaluate the causes and consequences of events and developments.	**No**	Questions and tasks are focused on the materials provided. However, they are not source-dependent and do not help to build content knowledge for this grade-level.
	REQUIRED **3c)** Source-dependent written and oral tasks require students to demonstrate understanding of social studies content and make connections between ideas, people, and events across time and place, recognize recurring themes, and evaluate the causes and consequences of events and developments.	**No**	While there are some variations in primary and secondary sources, there are infrequent opportunities for students to make connections between people and events across time and place (one example was found within the American Indians unit allowed compare/ contrast of present day to Early Native American societies). There is no evidence to support that students are able to connect the "rooms" which stand for

[20] Source-dependent questions or tasks are those that require students to pull information from a given source(s) to answer the question. Students still pull from prior learning, but the evidentiary support required in the students' responses are dependent upon the source(s).

CRITERIA	INDICATORS OF SUPERIOR QUALITY	MEETS METRICS (Yes/No)	JUSTIFICATION/ COMMENTS WITH EXAMPLES
			different time periods in history. For example, students are not provided with the opportunity to evaluate the Columbus Exchange and the Slave Act, which are major moments of history when discussing slavery in the United States.
	3d) Materials use varied modes of assessment, including a range of pre-, formative, summative and self-assessment measures that are unbiased and accessible to all students.	**Yes**	Materials do include various assessment tools for teachers to gauge learning before, during, or after instruction.
	3e) Aligned rubrics or assessment guidelines (such as scoring guides or student work exemplars) are included and provide sufficient guidance for interpreting student performance.	**Yes**	Rubrics for different tasks are included with each lesson. In the New Nation room a teacher has access to scoring rubrics including: oral presentation, research paper, timeline task, multimedia, and collaboration. Each lesson includes a blank template to allow the teacher autonomy in the rubric creating process.
4. RESPONSE TO SOURCES: Materials provide frequent opportunities for students to engage in discussions (both formal and informal) around the content and then express their understanding of the content through the development and support of claims in writing.	**REQUIRED** **4a)** Materials provide regular opportunities for students through discussions to develop claims about social studies content identified in the GLEs.	**Not Evaluated**	This section was not evaluated because the non-negotiable criteria were not met.
	REQUIRED **4b)** Writing opportunities for students occur on a regular basis and are varied in length and time demands (e.g., notes, summaries, short-answer responses, whole-class shared writing/formal essays, on-demand and process writing, etc.).	**Not Evaluated**	This section was not evaluated because the non-negotiable criteria were not met.
☐ Yes ☐ No	**REQUIRED** for **grades 3-12 only** **4c)** A vast majority of written tasks require students to present well-defended claims and clear information,	**Not Evaluated**	This section was not evaluated because the non-negotiable criteria were not met.

CRITERIA	INDICATORS OF SUPERIOR QUALITY	MEETS METRICS (Yes/No)	JUSTIFICATION/ COMMENTS WITH EXAMPLES
	providing evidence to support valid inferences from sources to explain how society, the environment, the political and economic landscape, and historical events influence perspectives, values, traditions, and ideas.		
	REQUIRED **4d)** Materials provide frequent opportunities for students to conduct shared (grades K-2) or short research projects to develop the expertise needed to conduct research independently.	**Not Evaluated**	This section was not evaluated because the non-negotiable criteria were not met.
	4e) Materials build students' active listening skills, such as taking notes on main ideas, asking relevant questions, and elaborating on remarks of others to develop understanding of topics, sources, and tasks.	**Not Evaluated**	This section was not evaluated because the non-negotiable criteria were not met.
III. Scaffolding and Support			
5. SCAFFOLDING AND SUPPORT: Materials provide all students with extensive opportunities and support to explore key questions using multiple sources to make claims about social studies content. ☐ Yes ☐ No	**REQUIRED** **5a)** Activities and suggested approaches guide teachers on how to scaffold instruction for students to build understanding of the content.	**Not Evaluated**	This section was not evaluated because the non-negotiable criteria were not met.
	REQUIRED **5b)** The materials are easy to use and well organized for students and teachers.	**Not Evaluated**	This section was not evaluated because the non-negotiable criteria were not met.
	5c) Appropriate suggestions and materials are provided for supporting varying student needs at the unit and lesson level (e.g., alternate teaching approaches, pacing, instructional delivery options, suggestions for addressing common student difficulties to meet standards, etc.).	**Not Evaluated**	This section was not evaluated because the non-negotiable criteria were not met.

CRITERIA	INDICATORS OF SUPERIOR QUALITY	MEETS METRICS (Yes/No)	JUSTIFICATION/ COMMENTS WITH EXAMPLES
	5d) The content can be reasonably completed within a regular school year and the pacing of content allows for maximum student understanding. The materials provide guidance about the amount of time a task might reasonably take.	**Not Evaluated**	This section was not evaluated because the non-negotiable criteria were not met.

FINAL EVALUATION
Tier 1 ratings receive a "Yes" in Column 1 for Criteria 1 – 5.
Tier 2 ratings receive a "Yes" in Column 1 for all non-negotiable criteria, but at least one "No" in Column 1 for the remaining criteria.
Tier 3 ratings receive a "No" in Column 1 for at least one of the non-negotiable criteria.

Compile the results for Sections I-VII to make a final decision for the material under review.

Section	Criteria	Yes/No	Final Justification/Comments
I: Content	1. Scope and Quality of Content **(Non-Negotiable)**	**No**	Materials do not address 90% of the GLEs for third grade.
	2. Range and Volume of Sources **(Non-Negotiable)**	**No**	Although primary and secondary sources are provided, they are not the main focus of instruction.
II: Claims	3. Questions and Tasks **(Non-Negotiable)**	**No**	Tasks and questions do not provide opportunities for students to make connections between sources, to reoccuring themes, or to time periods.
	4. Response to Sources	**Not Evaluated**	This section was not evaluated because the non-negotiable criteria were not met.
III: Scaffolding and Support	5. Scaffolding and Support	**Not Evaluated**	This section was not evaluated because the non-negotiable criteria were not met.

FINAL DECISION FOR THIS MATERIAL: **Tier III, Not representing quality**

The goal for social studies students is develop a deep, conceptual understanding of the content, as demonstrated through writing and speaking about the content. Strong social studies instruction is built around these priorities.

Content: Students explain how society, the environment, the political and economic landscape, and historical events influence perspectives, values, traditions, and ideas.

To accomplish this, they:

- Use key questions to build understanding of content through multiple sources
- Corroborate sources and evaluate evidence by considering author, occasion, and purpose

Claims: Students develop and express claims through discussions and writing which examine the impact of relationships between ideas, people, and events across time and place.

To accomplish this, they:

- Recognize recurring themes and patterns in history, geography, economics, and civics
- Evaluate the causes and consequences of events and developments

Title: **Cicero Kids** Grade/Course: **4**

Publisher: **AKJ Books** Copyright: **2015**

Overall Rating: **Tier III, Not representing quality**

Tier I, Tier II, Tier III Elements of this review:

STRONG	WEAK
	1. Scope and Quality of Content (Non-Negotiable)
	2. Range and Volume of Sources (Non-Negotiable)
	3. Questions and Tasks (Non-Negotiable)

To evaluate each set of submitted materials for alignment with the standards, begin by reviewing Column 2 for the non-negotiable criteria. If there is a "Yes" for all required indicators in Column 2, then the materials receive a "Yes" in Column 1. If there is a "No" for any required indicators in Column 2, then the materials receive a "No" in Column 1. (Note: If materials do not represent a full curricula, then some of Criteria 1 – 5 may not apply.)

Tier 1 ratings receive a "Yes" in Column 1 for Criteria 1 – 5.
Tier 2 ratings receive a "Yes" in Column 1 for all non-negotiable criteria, but at least one "No" in Column 1 for the remaining criteria.
Tier 3 ratings receive a "No" in Column 1 for at least one of the non-negotiable criteria.

CRITERIA	INDICATORS OF SUPERIOR QUALITY	MEETS METRICS (Yes/No)	JUSTIFICATION/ COMMENTS WITH EXAMPLES
I. Content			
Tier 1 and 2 Non-Negotiable **1. SCOPE AND QUALITY OF CONTENT:** Materials adequately address the Louisiana's Grade-Level Expectations (GLEs) at sufficient depth, accuracy, and quality to build social studies content knowledge. ☐ Yes ☒ No	**REQUIRED** **1a)** Materials address the content of 90% of the GLEs.	**No**	The materials do not address 90% of the GLEs. The materials and instruction for Standard 9- Fundamental Economic Concepts are not present at all and only 24 out of 34 GLEs are addressed.
	1b) Materials provide regular opportunities for students to explore key questions and build knowledge and skills with the social studies content indicated by the GLEs.	**Yes**	With the materials provided and GLEs that are addressed, students do have opportunities to explore and build knowledge. In lesson 4.4.1, students must construct timelines of historical events; in this section there are 12 different opportunities available to provide students with ways to build their knowledge and skills with this one standard.
Tier 1 and 2 Non-Negotiable **2. RANGE AND VOLUME OF SOURCES:** Materials include varied types of primary and secondary sources. ☐ Yes ☒ No	**REQUIRED** **2a)** The main focus of the materials is on primary and secondary sources[21] to develop content knowledge and express claims.	**No**	Primary and secondary sources are located in one folder and included in each room. However, they are not the main focus of the lessons. Primary sources are treated as an additional resource rather than as the core piece for instruction.
	REQUIRED **2b)** Materials include primary and secondary sources of different types (i.e., print and non-print, including video,	**Yes**	Each room has a primary sources folder located in the Reader's Corner. This folder

[21] Primary sources provide first-hand testimony or direct evidence concerning a topic under investigation and are created by witnesses or recorders who experienced the events or conditions being documented. Often these sources are created at the time when the events or conditions are occurring, but primary sources can also include autobiographies, memoirs, and oral histories recorded later. Primary sources are characterized by their content, regardless of whether they are available in original format, in microfilm/microfiche, in digital format, or in published format. (http://www.yale.edu/collections_collaborative/primarysources/primarysources.html) For additional definitions and examples, see also: http://www.princeton.edu/~refdesk/primary2.html and http://www.archives.gov/education/research/history-in-the-raw.html.

CRITERIA	INDICATORS OF SUPERIOR QUALITY	MEETS METRICS (Yes/No)	JUSTIFICATION/ COMMENTS WITH EXAMPLES
	audio, art, maps, charts, etc.) and varied lengths.		contains a variety of sources such maps, quotes, diary excerpts, and obituaries. In the Explorers and New World Settlements lessons, primary sources such as An Account of the First Thanksgiving, The Salem Witch Trials, and Letter to the King and Queen of Spain can be found. Each room also has a Map Corner which allows students to access different types of maps and activities. Videos can also be utilized which can be found in Background Information folder in the Teacher's Resources or Sights and Sounds.
	2c) Materials focus on both primary and secondary sources from different perspectives to allow opportunities for comparison and contrast, including sourcing[22] and corroboration.[23]	**Yes**	Materials that are included in primary and secondary sources grant students an opportunity to examine historical events from more than one perspective. Included in the teacher's resources are binary or tertiary paideia. With this, students are able to examine in a snapshot different cultures of that particular time. Students are also able to use this secondary source as a means to compare and contrast cultures.
	2d) Materials focus on both primary and secondary sources from different time periods to enable students to make	**No**	Primary and secondary sources used in A New Nation: Declaration of Independence,

[22] Sourcing asks students to consider a document's author, occasion, and purpose to determine how those factors influence the content.
[23] Corroboration asks students to determine points where details and evidence across multiple documents agree and disagree.

CRITERIA	INDICATORS OF SUPERIOR QUALITY	MEETS METRICS (Yes/No)	JUSTIFICATION/ COMMENTS WITH EXAMPLES
	connections within and across time periods, including contextualization.[24]		The Civil War Room: NY Times Article, and in A Growing Country: Suffrage are not offered from different time periods within the same lesson, thus limiting student ability to make connections across time and to contextualize the information.
II. Claims			
Tier 1 and 2 Non-Negotiable **3. QUESTIONS AND TASKS:** Materials offer opportunities to elicit direct, observable evidence of the degree to which students can independently demonstrate the grade-level expectations with source(s) described in Criteria 2 and genuinely measure how well students are able to make and support claims about social studies content. ☐ Yes ☒ No	**REQUIRED** **3a)** Questions and tasks focus on engaging students with content in varied contexts (e.g., examining different sources, completing tasks, answering multiple-choice questions, engaging in speaking/listening).	**Yes**	A variety of questions and tasks enable students to create answer response questions as well as participate in creating hands on projects. For example, in The Western Frontier room one activity asks students to create a fictional journal based on experiences pioneers may have had traveling the Oregon Trail. In the Cotton is King lesson, students are expected to verbalize the synthesizing of the effects of the cotton gin, that led to the increase of slaves and the eventual start of war.
	REQUIRED **3b)** Coherent sequences of source-dependent questions[25] and tasks focus students on building knowledge and skill with content through various texts (primary and secondary sources), classroom research, conversations, etc. and then synthesizing and applying those understandings to recognize recurring themes and evaluate the causes and consequences	**No**	Source dependent questions are minimal. In the Western Frontier room the lesson titled Northern Industry provides teachers with a quote from Thomas Jefferson made to James Madison that students must discuss, but there are no primary sources connected to

[24] Contextualization asks students to determine the time and place a document was created and examine how those factors influence the content.

[25] Source-dependent questions or tasks are those that require students to pull information from a given source(s) to answer the question. Students still pull from prior learning, but the evidentiary support required in the students' responses are dependent upon the source(s).

CRITERIA	INDICATORS OF SUPERIOR QUALITY	MEETS METRICS (Yes/No)	JUSTIFICATION/ COMMENTS WITH EXAMPLES
	of events and developments.		this lesson that would provide students with an opportunity to delve deeper into this lesson. Because of the information that is shared during teacher instruction concerning this quote, students would be able to answer the questions with out needing a source at all.
	REQUIRED **3c)** Source-dependent written and oral tasks require students to demonstrate understanding of social studies content and make connections between ideas, people, and events across time and place, recognize recurring themes, and evaluate the causes and consequences of events and developments.	**No**	Because the primary and secondary sources are not the mainfocus of the instruction, when and if included, they serves as an addition to instruction. There is no link or reference to them throughout the different rooms (i.e., as they may have a significance in a different time period as well).
	3d) Materials use varied modes of assessment, including a range of pre-, formative, summative and self-assessment measures that are unbiased and accessible to all students.	**Yes**	Materials include assessment tools for teachers to gauge learning before, during, or after instruction. At the end of each lesson plan for example, assessment options are included which can be used as a formative assessment. Activities, such as research papers are given, which could be considered as a summative assessment.
	3e) Aligned rubrics or assessment guidelines (such as scoring guides or student work exemplars) are included and provide sufficient guidance for interpreting student performance.	**Yes**	Each Unit has rubrics that are included that provide sufficient guidance for interpreting student performance. They include: multimedia, oral, research paper, timeline, collaboration, and a blank template.

CRITERIA	INDICATORS OF SUPERIOR QUALITY	MEETS METRICS (Yes/No)	JUSTIFICATION/ COMMENTS WITH EXAMPLES
4. RESPONSE TO SOURCES: Materials provide frequent opportunities for students to engage in discussions (both formal and informal) around the content and then express their understanding of the content through the development and support of claims in writing. ☐ Yes ☐ No	**REQUIRED** **4a)** Materials provide regular opportunities for students through discussions to develop claims about social studies content identified in the GLEs.	**Not Evaluated**	This section was not evaluated because the non-negotiable criteria were not met.
	REQUIRED **4b)** Writing opportunities for students occur on a regular basis and are varied in length and time demands (e.g., notes, summaries, short-answer responses, whole-class shared writing/formal essays, on-demand and process writing, etc.).	**Not Evaluated**	This section was not evaluated because the non-negotiable criteria were not met.
	REQUIRED for **grades 3-12 only** **4c)** A vast majority of written tasks require students to present well-defended claims and clear information, providing evidence to support valid inferences from sources to explain how society, the environment, the political and economic landscape, and historical events influence perspectives, values, traditions, and ideas.	**Not Evaluated**	This section was not evaluated because the non-negotiable criteria were not met.
	REQUIRED **4d)** Materials provide frequent opportunities for students to conduct shared (grades K-2) or short research projects to develop the expertise needed to conduct research independently.	**Not Evaluated**	This section was not evaluated because the non-negotiable criteria were not met.
	4e) Materials build students' active listening skills, such as taking notes on main ideas, asking relevant questions, and elaborating on remarks of others to develop understanding of topics, sources, and tasks.	**Not Evaluated**	This section was not evaluated because the non-negotiable criteria were not met.
III. Scaffolding and Support			
5. SCAFFOLDING AND SUPPORT: Materials provide all students with extensive opportunities and support to explore key questions	**REQUIRED** **5a)** Activities and suggested approaches guide teachers on how to scaffold instruction for students to build understanding of the content.	**Not Evaluated**	This section was not evaluated because the non-negotiable criteria were not met.

CRITERIA	INDICATORS OF SUPERIOR QUALITY	MEETS METRICS (Yes/No)	JUSTIFICATION/ COMMENTS WITH EXAMPLES
using multiple sources to make claims about social studies content. ☐ Yes ☐ No	**REQUIRED** **5b)** The materials are easy to use and well organized for students and teachers.	**Not Evaluated**	This section was not evaluated because the non-negotiable criteria were not met.
	5c) Appropriate suggestions and materials are provided for supporting varying student needs at the unit and lesson level (e.g., alternate teaching approaches, pacing, instructional delivery options, suggestions for addressing common student difficulties to meet standards, etc.).	**Not Evaluated**	This section was not evaluated because the non-negotiable criteria were not met.
	5d) The content can be reasonably completed within a regular school year and the pacing of content allows for maximum student understanding. The materials provide guidance about the amount of time a task might reasonably take.	**Not Evaluated**	This section was not evaluated because the non-negotiable criteria were not met.

FINAL EVALUATION
Tier 1 ratings receive a "Yes" in Column 1 for Criteria 1 – 5.
Tier 2 ratings receive a "Yes" in Column 1 for all non-negotiable criteria, but at least one "No" in Column 1 for the remaining criteria.
Tier 3 ratings receive a "No" in Column 1 for at least one of the non-negotiable criteria.

Compile the results for Sections I-VII to make a final decision for the material under review.

Section	Criteria	Yes/No	Final Justification/Comments
I: Content	1. Scope and Quality of Content **(Non-Negotiable)**	**No**	The materials do not address 90% of the current state GLEs.
	2. Range and Volume of Sources **(Non-Negotiable)**	**No**	Although there are abundant primary and secondary sources provided, they are not the main focus of lessons.
II: Claims	3. Questions and Tasks **(Non-Negotiable)**	**No**	The materials include a variety of tasks and activities that will engage students, and are unbiased and accessible to all students. However, there are no source-dependent questions or tasks that allow students to

CRITERIA	INDICATORS OF SUPERIOR QUALITY	MEETS METRICS (Yes/No)	JUSTIFICATION/ COMMENTS WITH EXAMPLES
			make connections and contextualize the information presented.
	4. Response to Sources	**Not Evaluated**	This section was not evaluated because the non-negotiable criteria were not met.
III: Scaffolding and Support	5. Scaffolding and Support	**Not Evaluated**	This section was not evaluated because the non-negotiable criteria were not met.
FINAL DECISION FOR THIS MATERIAL: **Tier III, Not representing quality**			

The goal for social studies students is develop a deep, conceptual understanding of the content, as demonstrated through writing and speaking about the content. Strong social studies instruction is built around these priorities.

Content: Students explain how society, the environment, the political and economic landscape, and historical events influence perspectives, values, traditions, and ideas.

To accomplish this, they:

- Use key questions to build understanding of content through multiple sources
- Corroborate sources and evaluate evidence by considering author, occasion, and purpose

Claims: Students develop and express claims through discussions and writing which examine the impact of relationships between ideas, people, and events across time and place.

To accomplish this, they:

- Recognize recurring themes and patterns in history, geography, economics, and civics
- Evaluate the causes and consequences of events and developments

Title: **Cicero Kids** Grade/Course: **5**

Publisher: **AKJ Books** Copyright: **2015**

Overall Rating: **Tier III, Not representing quality**

Tier I, Tier II, Tier III Elements of this review:

STRONG	WEAK
	1. Scope and Quality of Content (Non-Negotiable)
	2. Range and Volume of Sources (Non-Negotiable)
	3. Questions and Tasks (Non-Negotiable)

To evaluate each set of submitted materials for alignment with the standards, begin by reviewing Column 2 for the non-negotiable criteria. If there is a "Yes" for all required indicators in Column 2, then the materials receive a "Yes" in Column 1. If there is a "No" for any required indicators in Column 2, then the materials receive a "No" in Column 1. (Note: If materials do not represent a full curricula, then some of Criteria 1 – 5 may not apply.)

Tier 1 ratings receive a "Yes" in Column 1 for Criteria 1 – 5.
Tier 2 ratings receive a "Yes" in Column 1 for all non-negotiable criteria, but at least one "No" in Column 1 for the remaining criteria.
Tier 3 ratings receive a "No" in Column 1 for at least one of the non-negotiable criteria.

CRITERIA	INDICATORS OF SUPERIOR QUALITY	MEETS METRICS (Yes/No)	JUSTIFICATION/ COMMENTS WITH EXAMPLES
I. Content			
Tier 1 and 2 Non-Negotiable **1. SCOPE AND QUALITY OF CONTENT:** Materials adequately address the Louisiana's Grade-Level Expectations (GLEs) at sufficient depth, accuracy, and quality to build social studies content knowledge. ☐ Yes ☒ No	**REQUIRED** **1a)** Materials address the content of 90% of the GLEs.	**No**	The materials do not address 90% of the GLEs. Only 67% of the GLEs were adequately met. GLE 5.1.2 is not addressed. Alignment to GLEs was found to lack sufficient depth and quality to meet the requirements of the indicator. For example, standard 5.1.1 requires students to be able to create a timeline of historical events from pre-Columbian civilizations to 1763. While timelines are provided for students to use as references in other lessons, they are not student-created or the focus of the lesson. Timelines are not provided in any pre-Columbian lesson. In addition, GLE 5.3.2 requires students to describe cooperation and conflict among Native Americans, Europeans, and Africans. There are opportunities for students to read about cooperation among European and Native Americans (e.g., Jamestown Settlements and The Baptism of Pocahontas), but these articles are part of an assignment providing historical content knowledge and do not provide lessons with an appropriate level of questioning that would allow students to synthesize that cooperation is taking place. Attempts to show cooperation among Africans living in the New World are lacking. Finally, Standard 4, Geography skills that align to GLEs 5.4.1 and 5.4.2 are not present.

CRITERIA	INDICATORS OF SUPERIOR QUALITY	MEETS METRICS (Yes/No)	JUSTIFICATION/ COMMENTS WITH EXAMPLES
			While there are many beautiful maps, map skills and variety are not addressed. Students must be able to recognize and differentiate between a variety of maps (e.g., political, climate, physical, topographical, etc…).
	1b) Materials provide regular opportunities for students to explore key questions and build knowledge and skills with the social studies content indicated by the GLEs.	**Yes**	Standards listed are supported with multiple materials. In most cases there are multiple opportunities to address a standard. For standard 5.1.3, over 80 exemplars were available.
Tier 1 and 2 Non-Negotiable **2. RANGE AND VOLUME OF SOURCES:** Materials include varied types of primary and secondary sources. ☐ Yes ☒ No	**REQUIRED** **2a)** The main focus of the materials is on primary and secondary sources[26] to develop content knowledge and express claims.	**No**	Although there is an abundance of primary and secondary sources available throughout the rooms of the museum, they are not the main focus of the lessons. Sources are treated as an additional resource rather than as the core piece for instruction. The vendor provides lessons focused on the use of primary sources, sights and sounds, audio, picture gallery, and a video section per unit. Examples include the comparison between the Mayflower Compact,

[26] Primary sources provide first-hand testimony or direct evidence concerning a topic under investigation and are created by witnesses or recorders who experienced the events or conditions being documented. Often these sources are created at the time when the events or conditions are occurring, but primary sources can also include autobiographies, memoirs, and oral histories recorded later. Primary sources are characterized by their content, regardless of whether they are available in original format, in microfilm/microfiche, in digital format, or in published format. (http://www.yale.edu/collections_collaborative/primarysources/primarysources.html) For additional definitions and examples, see also: http://www.princeton.edu/~refdesk/primary2.html and http://www.archives.gov/education/research/history-in-the-raw.html.

CRITERIA	INDICATORS OF SUPERIOR QUALITY	MEETS METRICS (Yes/No)	JUSTIFICATION/ COMMENTS WITH EXAMPLES
			Declaration of Independence and U.S. Constitution. There is also a lesson that allows the comparison of the Union and Confederate constitutions and requires students to write a persuasive essay using evidence. Additionally, The Western Frontier Room has a lesson on the Missouri Compromise. There is also a lesson focused on the American Bill of Rights and Petition of Rights, 1628, located in A New Nation Room. Also provided for each unit are ample secondary sources are- (reader's corner) hiSTORIES with informational texts, plays, and poems, McGuffey's stories.
	REQUIRED **2b)** Materials include primary and secondary sources of different types (i.e., print and non-print, including video, audio, art, maps, charts, etc.) and varied lengths.	**Yes**	Each room has a primary sources folder located in the Reader's Corner, which provides informational texts, poems, plays, primary source obituaries, historical documents, and biographies. Also Included are map drawers, which allow students to access different maps and activities. Providing historical activities and outlines, Sights and Sounds section, features period-era songs, art analysis, images of events, people and architecture, interviews and videos. In the Explorers and New World Settlements, primary sources such as Abraham Lincoln's First Inaugural Address, Quotes Between Separation of States, and Letter to Mrs. Bixby can be found. Videos

CRITERIA	INDICATORS OF SUPERIOR QUALITY	MEETS METRICS (Yes/No)	JUSTIFICATION/ COMMENTS WITH EXAMPLES
			can be found in the Background Information folder and can be utilized to anchor or support lessons.
	2c) Materials focus on both primary and secondary sources from different perspectives to allow opportunities for comparison and contrast, including sourcing[27] and corroboration.[28]	**Yes**	The materials included in the primary and secondary sources folder grant students an opportunity to examine historical events from more than one perspective. Included in the teacher's resources are binary or tertiary paideia. With this, students are able to examine in a snapshot the different cultures of that particular time. Students are also able to use this secondary source as a means to compare and contrast cultural perspectives, which allow the students opportunities for corroboration or comparing and contrasting.
	2d) Materials focus on both primary and secondary sources from different time periods to enable students to make connections within and across time periods, including contextualization.[29]	**Yes**	The primary and secondary sources provided in each room are correlated to the theme or time period. For example, in the Growing Country room, students can access quotes from the Industralization Era, Progressive Era, and World War 1 Era. Through lesson activities and questioning, students are able to reflect on the event that were influential in each time period.

[27] Sourcing asks students to consider a document's author, occasion, and purpose to determine how those factors influence the content.
[28] Corroboration asks students to determine points where details and evidence across multiple documents agree and disagree.
[29] Contextualization asks students to determine the time and place a document was created and examine how those factors influence the content.

II. Claims			
Tier 1 and 2 Non-Negotiable **3. QUESTIONS AND TASKS:** Materials offer opportunities to elicit direct, observable evidence of the degree to which students can independently demonstrate the grade-level expectations with source(s) described in Criteria 2 and genuinely measure how well students are able to make and support claims about social studies content. ☐ Yes ☒ No	**REQUIRED** **3a)** Questions and tasks focus on engaging students with content in varied contexts (e.g., examining different sources, completing tasks, answering multiple-choice questions, engaging in speaking/listening).	**Yes**	There are multiple opportunities within each room for students to discuss, answer questions, compare different sources, debate, act out historical events, or write an essay. Students are also able to gain knowledge through trading cards, readings with multiple choice and short answer questions, and word works activities. Questions and tasks given to students are of a sufficient variety. Students can create answer response questions as well as participate in creating hands on projects. An example of this can be found in The Civil War Room which includes an activity that asks students to create a newspaper article about the assassination of Abraham Lincoln.
	REQUIRED **3b)** Coherent sequences of source-dependent questions[30] and tasks focus students on building knowledge and skill with content through various texts (primary and secondary sources), classroom research, conversations, etc. and then synthesizing and applying those understandings to recognize recurring themes and evaluate the causes and consequences of events and developments.	**Yes**	The students are provided with source-dependent questions in the sights and sounds section through videos, audio and pictures, in which students are asked to cite evidence in their answers. Extensions and supplemental material provide additional opportunities to synthesize and apply understandings. For example, students are asked to synthesize and apply their understandings in the Mayflower Compact lesson with the objective of comparing the Mayflower Compact to the Declaration of

[30] Source-dependent questions or tasks are those that require students to pull information from a given source(s) to answer the question. Students still pull from prior learning, but the evidentiary support required in the students' responses are dependent upon the source(s).

CRITERIA	INDICATORS OF SUPERIOR QUALITY	MEETS METRICS (Yes/No)	JUSTIFICATION/ COMMENTS WITH EXAMPLES
			Independence. They are also asked to examine pros and cons of the documents and understand how this led to the Declaration of Independence.
	REQUIRED **3c)** Source-dependent written and oral tasks require students to demonstrate understanding of social studies content and make connections between ideas, people, and events across time and place, recognize recurring themes, and evaluate the causes and consequences of events and developments.	**No**	Although materials allow students to move across the history of the United States, there is no evidence to support that students are able to connect the "rooms" which stand for different time periods in history. For example, students are not provided with the opportunity to evaluate the slave trade in the Columbian Exchange and the Slave Act, which are major moments of history when discussing slavery in the United States.
	3d) Materials use varied modes of assessment, including a range of pre-, formative, summative and self-assessment measures that are unbiased and accessible to all students.	**No**	Pre-assessments, formative, and summative assessments were not evident. Assessments were authentic in the form of presentations, projects, timelines and essays, but did not allow for a summative assessment to guage the student's mastery of the GLEs.
	3e) Aligned rubrics or assessment guidelines (such as scoring guides or student work exemplars) are included and provide sufficient guidance for interpreting student performance.	**Yes**	Rubrics were present for each assessment and lesson plan. These could also be located in teacher resources section for every room.
4. RESPONSE TO SOURCES: Materials provide frequent opportunities for students to engage in discussions (both	**REQUIRED** **4a)** Materials provide regular opportunities for students through discussions to develop claims about social studies content identified in the GLEs.	**Not Evaluated**	This section was not evaluated because the non-negotiable criteria were not met.

CRITERIA	INDICATORS OF SUPERIOR QUALITY	MEETS METRICS (Yes/No)	JUSTIFICATION/ COMMENTS WITH EXAMPLES
formal and informal) around the content and then express their understanding of the content through the development and support of claims in writing. ☐ Yes ☐ No	**REQUIRED** **4b)** Writing opportunities for students occur on a regular basis and are varied in length and time demands (e.g., notes, summaries, short-answer responses, whole-class shared writing/formal essays, on-demand and process writing, etc.).	**Not Evaluated**	This section was not evaluated because the non-negotiable criteria were not met.
	REQUIRED for **grades 3-12 only** **4c)** A vast majority of written tasks require students to present well-defended claims and clear information, providing evidence to support valid inferences from sources to explain how society, the environment, the political and economic landscape, and historical events influence perspectives, values, traditions, and ideas.	**Not Evaluated**	This section was not evaluated because the non-negotiable criteria were not met.
	REQUIRED **4d)** Materials provide frequent opportunities for students to conduct shared (grades K-2) or short research projects to develop the expertise needed to conduct research independently.	**Not Evaluated**	This section was not evaluated because the non-negotiable criteria were not met.
	4e) Materials build students' active listening skills, such as taking notes on main ideas, asking relevant questions, and elaborating on remarks of others to develop understanding of topics, sources, and tasks.	**Not Evaluated**	This section was not evaluated because the non-negotiable criteria were not met.
III. Scaffolding and Support			
5. SCAFFOLDING AND SUPPORT: Materials provide all students with extensive opportunities and support to explore key questions using multiple sources to make claims about social studies content.	**REQUIRED** **5a)** Activities and suggested approaches guide teachers on how to scaffold instruction for students to build understanding of the content.	**Not Evaluated**	This section was not evaluated because the non-negotiable criteria were not met.
	REQUIRED **5b)** The materials are easy to use and well organized for students and teachers.	**Not Evaluated**	This section was not evaluated because the non-negotiable criteria were not met.

CRITERIA	INDICATORS OF SUPERIOR QUALITY	MEETS METRICS (Yes/No)	JUSTIFICATION/ COMMENTS WITH EXAMPLES
☐ Yes ☐ No	**5c)** Appropriate suggestions and materials are provided for supporting varying student needs at the unit and lesson level (e.g., alternate teaching approaches, pacing, instructional delivery options, suggestions for addressing common student difficulties to meet standards, etc.).	**Not Evaluated**	This section was not evaluated because the non-negotiable criteria were not met.
	5d) The content can be reasonably completed within a regular school year and the pacing of content allows for maximum student understanding. The materials provide guidance about the amount of time a task might reasonably take.	**Not Evaluated**	This section was not evaluated because the non-negotiable criteria were not met.

FINAL EVALUATION
Tier 1 ratings receive a "Yes" in Column 1 for Criteria 1 – 5.
Tier 2 ratings receive a "Yes" in Column 1 for all non-negotiable criteria, but at least one "No" in Column 1 for the remaining criteria.
Tier 3 ratings receive a "No" in Column 1 for at least one of the non-negotiable criteria.

Compile the results for Sections I-VII to make a final decision for the material under review.

Section	Criteria	Yes/No	Final Justification/Comments
I: Content	1. Scope and Quality of Content **(Non-Negotiable)**	**No**	The materials do not address 90% of the current state GLEs with depth, focus, or accuracy.
	2. Range and Volume of Sources **(Non-Negotiable)**	**No**	Although there are abundant primary and secondary sources provided, they are not the main focus of lessons.
II: Claims	3. Questions and Tasks **(Non-Negotiable)**	**No**	Questions and tasks are not of sufficient level to allow students to synthesize the information and make connections.
	4. Response to Sources	**Not Evaluated**	This section was not evaluated because the non-negotiable criteria were not met.

CRITERIA	INDICATORS OF SUPERIOR QUALITY	MEETS METRICS (Yes/No)	JUSTIFICATION/ COMMENTS WITH EXAMPLES
III: Scaffolding and Support	5. Scaffolding and Support	**Not Evaluated**	This section was not evaluated because the non-negotiable criteria were not met.
FINAL DECISION FOR THIS MATERIAL: **Tier III, Not representing quality**			

Appendix I.

Publisher Response

The publisher had no response.

Appendix II.

Public Comments

There were no public comments submitted.