

The goal of English language arts is for students to read, understand, and express understanding of complex texts independently. Strong ELA assessments provide opportunities for students to demonstrate they have met this goal with many different types of texts. A combination of formative and summative assessments across the different components of an ELA classroom provides a full picture of student performance in reading, writing, speaking and listening, and language study.



Title: CASE ELA Benchmark Assessments

Grade: 3-5

Publisher: Certica-TE21

Copyright: 2017

Overall Rating: Tier I, Exemplifies quality

Tier I, Tier II, Tier III Elements of this review:

STRONG	WEAK
1. Quality of Texts (Non-negotiable)	
2. Design, Scoring, and Reporting (Non-negotiable)	
3. Text-Dependent Questions and Tasks (Non-negotiable)	
4. Alignment (Non-negotiable)	
5. Range of Texts	
6. Writing to Sources	
7. Speaking and Listening*	
8. Language	

To evaluate instructional materials for alignment with the [standards](#) and determine tiered rating, begin with **Section I: Non-negotiable Criteria**.

- Review the **required**¹ Indicators of Superior Quality for each **Non-negotiable** criterion.
- If there is a “Yes” for all **required** Indicators of Superior Quality, materials receive a “Yes” for that **Non-negotiable** Criterion.
- If there is a “No” for any of the **required** Indicators of Superior Quality, materials receive a “No” for that **Non-negotiable** Criterion.
- Materials must meet **Non-negotiable** Criterion 1 for the review to continue to **Non-negotiable** Criteria 2. Materials must meet Non-negotiable 2 to move on to Non-negotiables 3 and 4.
- Materials must meet all of the **Non-negotiable** in order for the review to continue to Section II.
- If materials receive a “No” for any **Non-negotiable** Criterion, a rating of Tier 3 is assigned, and the review does not continue.

If all Non-negotiable Criteria are met, then continue to **Section II: Additional Criteria of Superior Quality**.

- Review the **required** Indicators of Superior Quality for each criterion.
- If there is a “Yes” for all **required** Indicators of Superior Quality, then the materials receive a “Yes” for the additional criteria.
- If there is a “No” for any **required** Indicator of Superior Quality, then the materials receive a “No” for the additional criteria.

Tier 1 ratings receive a “Yes” for all Non-negotiable Criteria and a “Yes” for each of the Additional Criteria of Superior Quality.

Tier 2 ratings receive a “Yes” for all Non-negotiable Criteria, but at least one “No” for the Additional Criteria of Superior Quality.

Tier 3 ratings receive a “No” for at least one of the Non-negotiable Criteria.

¹ **Required Indicators of Superior Quality** are labeled “**Required**” and shaded yellow. Remaining indicators that are shaded white are included to provide additional information to aid in material selection and do not affect tiered rating.

CRITERIA	INDICATORS OF SUPERIOR QUALITY	MEETS METRICS (YES/NO)	JUSTIFICATION/COMMENTS WITH EXAMPLES
<p>Section I: Non-negotiable Criteria of Superior Quality Materials must meet Non-negotiable Criterion 1 for the review to continue to Non-negotiable Criteria 2. Materials must meet Non-negotiable 2 to move on to Non-negotiables 3 and 4. Materials must meet all of the Non-negotiable Criteria 1-4 in order for the review to continue to Section II.</p>			
<p>Non-negotiable 1. QUALITY OF TEXTS: The test passages and other stimuli are of highest quality —they support multiple readings for various purposes and exhibit exceptional craft and thought and/or provide useful information. Reading passages have the appropriate level of complexity as stated by Reading Standard 10 and Reading Foundational Standard 4.</p> <p><input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Yes <input type="checkbox"/> No</p>	<p>Required 1a) 90% of texts offer rich opportunities for students to demonstrate evidence of meeting grade-level standards. Assessments or item banks include previously published passages and other stimuli for each grade level (commissioned works are allowed, but should not represent the majority of passages); texts exhibit the professional qualities expected of each discipline (e.g., English language arts, history/social studies, science, technical subjects, and the arts).</p>	<p>Yes</p>	<p>At least 90% of texts offer rich opportunities for students to demonstrate evidence of meeting grade-level standards. Assessments include texts that are crafted for authentic, non-instructional purposes and are of publishable quality. For example, in the Grade 3 assessment, an excerpt from the book “The Pick of the Litter” by Bill Wallace, originally published in 2006, is used. In the Grade 4 assessment, “Out of the Antarctic,” an excerpt from “Mr. Popper’s Penguins” published in 1938 is used. On the Grade 5 assessment, “Life in Space,” originally published in 2007, is used for comprehension assessment.</p>
	<p>Required 1b) Texts are appropriately complex for the identified grade level according to the requirements outlined in the standards. Measures for determining complexity include quantitative and qualitative analysis.² Poetry and drama are analyzed only using qualitative measures.</p>	<p>Yes</p>	<p>Texts are appropriately complex for the identified grade level according to the requirements outlined in the standards. For example, on the Grade 3 assessment, students read “On the Court...with Michael Jordan,” which is very complex according to quantitative and qualitative complexity analyses. The text has a Lexile level of 800L and qualitative features that range from</p>

² The process for determining quantitative and qualitative measures is available at <http://www.louisianabelieves.com/docs/teacher-toolbox-resources/guide---how-to-determine-text-complexity-grades-k-12.pdf?sfvrsn=5>.

CRITERIA	INDICATORS OF SUPERIOR QUALITY	MEETS METRICS (YES/NO)	JUSTIFICATION/COMMENTS WITH EXAMPLES
			<p>moderately to very complex. Specifically, the purpose demands are moderately complex as the author’s purpose is implied rather than explicitly stated. While the language features are largely explicit and easy to understand, there is some complex language which is supported through an included glossary sidebar. The knowledge demands for this text are very complex and specific to college basketball, and knowledge about the basics of basketball would be necessary to have an understanding of this passage. On the Grade 4 assessment, students read “Bats: The Coolest Mammals on Earth.” This text has a Lexile level of 960L and qualitative features that are very complex. The purpose is subtle, but easy to identify upon the context or source. The text is written in a question and answer format, and text features are used to enhance student understanding. For example, pictures with captions are used as well as inserts with words and definitions. The language features are moderately complex with explicit and easy to understand language, but with some academic language and complex concepts included. The knowledge demands for this text are very complex and rely heavily on knowledge about bats. On</p>

CRITERIA	INDICATORS OF SUPERIOR QUALITY	MEETS METRICS (YES/NO)	JUSTIFICATION/COMMENTS WITH EXAMPLES
			<p>the Grade 5 assessment students read “The Five Castaways” which has a Lexile level of 1000L and qualitative features that are moderately complex. The meaning of the text is clear, but may be conveyed with some subtlety. The text structure is clear and easy to understand and only slightly complex. The language demands of the text are clear and easy to understand, and sentences are simple. “Waggy had learned his lessons well” is an example of the moderately complex language demands of this text. The knowledge demands of this text are moderately complex and discuss ideas that are common to most readers.</p>
	<p>Required 1c) Nearly all texts are placed within the grade band indicated by the quantitative analysis (as applicable). Rare exceptions (in which the qualitative measure has taken precedence over the quantitative measures and placed the text outside the grade band) are usually reserved for literary texts in the upper grades.</p>	<p>Yes</p>	<p>Nearly all texts are placed within the grade band indicated by the quantitative analysis. For example, the text “Selling Timothy Titus” found in the Grade 3 assessment has a Lexile level of 590 falling within the Lexile range 420-820L and is appropriate for grade band 2-3. The identified Lexile range for grade band 4–5 is 740-1010L. Seven of the eight assessment texts are within the identified Lexile range. “Ling-Ling and Hsing Hsing” has a Lexile of 960L; “A Syrup Can Mother” has a Lexile of 800L; “The Animals’ Ball Game” has a Lexile of 800L; “Life in Space” has a Lexile of 810L;</p>

CRITERIA	INDICATORS OF SUPERIOR QUALITY	MEETS METRICS (YES/NO)	JUSTIFICATION/COMMENTS WITH EXAMPLES
	<p>Required 1d) Provides paired or multiple texts for students to demonstrate mastery of standards which require students to make connections among texts; when research simulation tasks are included on an assessment, the set of texts includes at least two texts--one of which is an anchor text--and represents a variety of texts and text lengths.</p>	<p>Yes</p>	<p>and “The Five Castaways” has a Lexile of 1000L.</p> <p>Assessments provide paired or multiple texts for students to demonstrate mastery of standards which require students to make connections among texts. For example, on the Grade 3 assessment, students read the texts “Pick of the Litter” and “Selling Timothy Titus.” Students are then asked: “Which two sentences show how Tom from ‘Pick of the Litter’ and Caroline from ‘Selling Timothy Titus’ are similar?” on Item 23. On the Grade 4 assessment, students read “A Syrup Can for Mother” and “Out of the Antarctic,” two texts that share a common theme of the unexpected joy a pet can bring to a family. Students respond to the following writing prompt: “Based on the passages from ‘A Syrup Can Mother’ and ‘Out of the Antarctic,’ compare and contrast the fathers in the passages.” On the Grade 5 assessment, students read the two texts “The Animals’ Ball Game” and “The Five Castaways” which are paired around a theme of helping others in need. Students write to compare and contrast the characters in the two texts, citing evidence from both passages.</p>

CRITERIA	INDICATORS OF SUPERIOR QUALITY	MEETS METRICS (YES/NO)	JUSTIFICATION/COMMENTS WITH EXAMPLES
	<p>1e) In a set of reading assessments, texts increase in complexity as materials progress throughout the grade level and across grade bands. Read-aloud texts follow the same trend, although they may have greater variability because listening skills in elementary school generally outpace reading skills.</p>	<p>Yes</p>	<p>In a set of reading assessments, texts increase in complexity as materials progress throughout the grade level and across grade bands. For example, the Grade 3 assessment begins with “Pick of the Litter” by Bill Wallace, which has a Lexile of 630L and has moderately complex qualitative features. The assessment ends with “On the Court With Michael Jordan” which has a Lexile of 800L and very complex qualitative features. The Grade 4 assessment begins with “Ling-Ling and Hsing-Hsing” which has a Lexile of 940L and qualitative features of moderate complexity. The assessment ends with “Bats: The Coolest Mammals on Earth” which has a Lexile of 960L and qualitative features that are very complex. The Grade 5 assessment begins with “Life in Space” which has a Lexile of 810 and qualitative features of moderate complexity. By the end of the assessment, students read “How Animals Think,” which has a Lexile of 1040L and has very complex qualitative features.</p>
<p>Non-negotiable 2. DESIGN, SCORING, AND REPORTING: Assessments genuinely measure progress and elicit direct, observable evidence of the degree</p>	<p>Required 2a) Assessments incorporate performance tasks, which allow students to respond to a set of texts through reading and writing. Student scores are based on their performance with texts, tasks, and a combination of standards with texts, rather than isolated standards.</p>	<p>Yes</p>	<p>Assessments incorporate performance tasks which allow students to respond to a set of texts through reading and writing. Each grade level assessment includes at least one Writing Task and one Constructed Response where students read and</p>

CRITERIA	INDICATORS OF SUPERIOR QUALITY	MEETS METRICS (YES/NO)	JUSTIFICATION/COMMENTS WITH EXAMPLES
<p>to which students can independently demonstrate the assessed grade-specific standards with appropriately complex text(s).</p> <p><input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Yes <input type="checkbox"/> No</p>			<p>respond to texts. For example, on the Grade 3 assessment, students read “On the Court with...Michael Jordan” and then complete the following writing task, “Write an essay that explains how Michael Jordan was able to overcome challenges to become a starting player on the team. Use evidence from the passage to support your response.” Then, the assessment states, “Based on the passage from ‘On the Court with...Michael Jordan,’ explain the challenges that Michael Jordan faced during his first year on the basketball team.” On the Grade 4 assessment, students read “Ling-Ling and Hsing-Hsing” and then complete the following writing task, “Write an essay explaining the impact that the gift of the two giant pandas had on the United States. Use evidence from the passage to support your response.” On the Grade 5 assessment, students read “Life in Space” and then complete a writing task explaining why life is challenging or easy for the astronauts. Students are instructed to use evidence from the passage to support their response.</p>
	<p>Required 2b) Aligned rubrics or assessment guidelines (such as scoring guides or student work exemplars) are included and provide sufficient guidance for interpreting student performance.</p>	<p>Yes</p>	<p>Aligned rubrics or assessment guidelines are included and provide sufficient guidance for interpreting student performance. The Louisiana Grades 3–5</p>

CRITERIA	INDICATORS OF SUPERIOR QUALITY	MEETS METRICS (YES/NO)	JUSTIFICATION/COMMENTS WITH EXAMPLES
			Language Arts Writing Prompt Rubric is included with the materials for scoring the constructed response of the assessments. However, student work exemplars are not included.
	2c) A variety of assessments for different uses are included (e.g., pre-, formative, summative and self-assessment measures).	No	A variety of assessments for different uses are not included. The submitted assessments include a comprehensive benchmark for Grades 3–5. Guidance is provided noting that 3 benchmark assessments would be provided for the school year and are intended for use as summative assessments.
	2d) Materials assess student proficiency using methods that are unbiased and accessible to all students.	Yes	Materials assess student proficiency using methods that are unbiased and accessible to all students. The Louisiana Grades 3–5 Writing Prompt Scoring Rubric is included for assessing student proficiency. The rubric is unbiased and is aligned to the Louisiana Student Standards. The rubric includes descriptions for fully meeting, mostly meeting, somewhat meeting, and minimally meeting expectations in a variety of categories. Rubric guidance is provided in comprehension, development, reasoning, organization, and use of language. For example, a student earns 0 points for Knowledge of Language Conventions if “The student response does not demonstrate command of the

CRITERIA	INDICATORS OF SUPERIOR QUALITY	MEETS METRICS (YES/NO)	JUSTIFICATION/COMMENTS WITH EXAMPLES
			<p>conventions of standard English at the appropriate level of complexity. Frequent and varied errors in mechanics, grammar, and usage impede understanding.”</p> <p>Students can earn a 4 for Reading Comprehension and Written Expression for a response that “demonstrates full comprehension of ideas stated explicitly and/or inferentially by providing an accurate analysis; addresses the prompt and provides effective development of the topic that is consistently appropriate to the task, purpose, and audience; uses clear reasoning supported by relevant text-based evidence in the development of the topic; is effectively organized with clear and coherent writing; uses language effectively to clarify ideas.”</p>
	<p>2e) Assessment results are analyzed by major claims and sub-claims that indicate integration of knowledge or trends in student performance over time instead of reporting performance on individual standards or assessment items.</p>	<p>N/A</p>	<p>Due to the inability to run action reports, it is not evident that assessment results are analyzed by major claims and subclaims. Reports available on the website include “Standards Summary by Item Report,” “Response Distribution Report,” “By Standard Report,” and “Student Performance Report.”</p>
	<p>2f) Assessment results are clearly communicated for the purpose of determining areas of weakness based on indicator 3e and provide actionable information which leads to clear next steps for how to address student weaknesses instructionally.</p>	<p>N/A</p>	<p>Due to the inability to run action reports, it is not evident that assessment results are clearly communicated for the purpose of determining areas of weakness based on</p>

CRITERIA	INDICATORS OF SUPERIOR QUALITY	MEETS METRICS (YES/NO)	JUSTIFICATION/COMMENTS WITH EXAMPLES
			indicator 2e and for providing actionable information which leads to clear next steps for how to address student weaknesses instructionally. The online resources provide teachers with a dashboard for assessment analytics; however, there is no evidence of actionable information and clear next steps provided to teachers based on the results.
<p>Non-negotiable 3. TEXT-DEPENDENT QUESTIONS AND TASKS: Items are text-dependent, reflecting the expectations of Reading Standard 1; they require students to use the text to find or infer the answers and use textual evidence as support for meeting the expectations of other grade-level standards.</p> <p><input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Yes <input type="checkbox"/> No</p>	<p>Required 3a) Nearly all of the questions on assessments or in an item bank are text dependent.³</p>	<p>Yes</p>	<p>Nearly all of the questions on assessments or in an item bank are text dependent. For example, on the Grade 5 assessment, 42 of the 48 selected response questions are text dependent. Students are tasked with answering questions about theme, purpose, character, and setting of the texts they are reading, as well as vocabulary as it is used in context. For example, on the Grade 3 assessment, students read “Pick of the Litter.” Following reading, questions include “What is the lesson of the passage?” and “How do paragraphs 2–8 help the reader to understand the passage?” Students must also complete a constructed response explaining “why Tom wants to take Tad home and Grandpa does not like the idea.” On the Grade 5 assessment, after reading “How Animals Think,” an item states “Based on</p>

³ Text-dependent questions require close reading and analysis of the text(s); they can be answered correctly without prior knowledge, and they are linked to a text (i.e., not “stand alone”).

CRITERIA	INDICATORS OF SUPERIOR QUALITY	MEETS METRICS (YES/NO)	JUSTIFICATION/COMMENTS WITH EXAMPLES
	<p>Required 3b) A large majority of items on a reading assessment reflects the requirements of Reading Standard 1 by requiring students to directly select or provide evidence from the text to support their answers to questions which measure other grade-level standards. No items assess Reading Standard 1 in isolation.</p>	<p>Yes</p>	<p>paragraphs 2–4, what can be learned about Wilhelm von Osten’s ideas about animals?”</p> <p>A large majority of items on the reading assessments reflect the requirements of Reading Standard 1 by requiring students to directly select or provide evidence from the text to support their answers to questions which measure other grade-level standards. For example, on the Grade 3 assessment, Item 15 asks students to identify the evidence used to support their answer for question 14. On the Grade 4 assessment, Item 2 asks students to choose three quotations which support their answer to part A. In the Grade 5 assessment, Item 11 asks students to identify quotes from the passage that support their previous answer.</p>
	<p>3c) Assessments or item banks contain a variety of types of test questions and tasks, including, when possible, technology-enhanced and constructed-response formats, to approach the texts in ways uniquely appropriate to each text.</p>	<p>Yes</p>	<p>Assessments or item banks contain a variety of types of test questions and tasks to approach the texts in ways uniquely appropriate to each text. Several item types are evidenced in all of the assessments including multi-part evidence-based selected response items, multiple select items, prose constructed response items, and selected response questions. Technology enhanced item examples are provided through the sample questions on the webpage. On the Grade 3 assessment,</p>

CRITERIA	INDICATORS OF SUPERIOR QUALITY	MEETS METRICS (YES/NO)	JUSTIFICATION/COMMENTS WITH EXAMPLES
			<p>students complete the multiple select item “Which two quotations from the passage best support the answer in Part A?” The question requires that students use information from both sources to identify the correct meaning of the sentence provided in the previous question. On the Grade 5 assessment, students respond to the prose constructed response prompt: “Based on the passage from ‘How Animals Think,’ explain how Clever Hans knew the answers to the questions that people asked him. Use details from the passage to support your explanation.”</p>
<p>Non-negotiable 4. ALIGNMENT: Items reflect the rigor and cognitive complexity demanded by the standards; they assess the depth and breadth of the standards at each grade level.</p> <p><input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Yes <input type="checkbox"/> No</p>	<p>Required 4a) Items on an assessment and in an item bank focus on key ideas (concepts, themes, perspectives, topics, etc.) of the text, rather than superficial or peripheral concepts.</p>	<p>Yes</p>	<p>Items on an assessment and in an item bank focus on key ideas of the text. Assessment questions are designed to assess students' overall expression of understanding complex text rather than superficial concepts. On the Grade 3 assessment, after reading “The Pick of the Litter,” questions include “What is the lesson of the passage?” and “How do Tom’s feelings affect his actions in paragraphs 22–29?” On the Grade 4 assessment, questions include “Based on her actions in the passage, which choice describes the mother?” and “Which quotation from the passage best supports the answer to Part A?” On the Grade 5 assessment, students</p>

CRITERIA	INDICATORS OF SUPERIOR QUALITY	MEETS METRICS (YES/NO)	JUSTIFICATION/COMMENTS WITH EXAMPLES
			<p>read two texts and answer the question, “How do the passages ‘The Animals’ Ball Game’ and ‘The Five Castaways’ compare in their approaches to the topic of participating in group activities?” This question is followed by one in which students chose a theme found in both passages. Additionally, students write a constructed response, comparing the ideas of helping others across two texts.</p>
	<p>Required 4b) Questions on an assessment or in an item bank assess the depth and complexity required by the standards and are sufficiently complex to align to more than one standard at each grade-level over time to advance and deepen student learning. <i>(Note: Not every standard must be assessed with every text.)</i></p>	<p>Yes</p>	<p>Questions on an assessment or in an item bank assess the depth and complexity required by the standards and are sufficiently complex to align to more than one standard at each grade-level over time. After reading “Selling Timothy Titus” on the Grade 3 assessment, questions include “What is the lesson of the passage?” (RI.3.2) and “How did Caroline’s mother change from the beginning to the end of the passage?” (RI.3.3). On the Grade 4 assessment, students read “Ling-Ling and Hsing-Hsing” and then answer “Which choice provides a summary of the passage?” (RI.4.2). Students must also select the three quotations from the passage that best support the answer, meeting the requirements of RI.4.1. Students are also asked “What overall text structure is used in the passage?” (RI.4.5).</p>

CRITERIA	INDICATORS OF SUPERIOR QUALITY	MEETS METRICS (YES/NO)	JUSTIFICATION/COMMENTS WITH EXAMPLES
			<p>An example of questions that require students to integrate knowledge is evidenced in the Grade 5 assessment when students are asked “Which two quotations from the passages best support the answer to Part A? Choose one quotation from ‘The Animals’ Ball Game’ and one quotation from ‘The Five Castaways.’”</p>
	<p>Required 4c) Vocabulary items on assessments and in an item bank assess words essential to the central meaning and purpose of the text, focusing on determining word meaning based on context and relationships/connections to other words (i.e., synonyms, antonyms, Greek and Latin roots, shades of meaning/connotation, how words contribute to tone); questions and tasks also support students in examining the language (sentences and structure) of texts measured by Criteria 1 and 5.</p>	<p>Yes</p>	<p>Vocabulary items on assessments and in an item bank assess words essential to the central meaning and purpose of the text. On the Grade 3 assessment, students are asked “What is the meaning of doleful as it is used in paragraph 15?” The purpose behind the selection of the word is to focus on character development and understand actions of the character in the story. On the Grade 4 assessment, after reading “A Syrup Can for Mother,” students answer “What does the word coop mean as it is used in paragraphs 20 and 22?” Students use context to determine the meaning, as the word has multiple meanings. On the Grade 5 assessment, students are asked “What does the word despair mean as it is used in paragraph 2?” The understanding of despair is essential for students’ understanding of Lena’s character in that moment.</p>

CRITERIA	INDICATORS OF SUPERIOR QUALITY	MEETS METRICS (YES/NO)	JUSTIFICATION/COMMENTS WITH EXAMPLES
	<p>4d) Sets of questions for given text(s) are coherently sequenced to assess whether students are able to read, understand, and express their understanding of the language, topics, themes, and ideas of grade-level, complex texts and illustrations (as applicable) and elicit sustained attention to the text and its connection to other texts, where appropriate.</p>	<p>Yes</p>	<p>Sets of questions for given texts are coherently sequenced to assess whether students are able to read, understand, and express their understanding of the language, topics, themes, and ideas of grade-level, complex texts and illustrations. On the Grade 3 assessment, an item states, “Which quotation from the passage describes what is shown in the illustration?” requiring students to make connections between the text and the illustration for understanding. On the Grade 4 assessment, students answer “How do the images of the pandas help the reader better understand the passage?” In the Grade 5 Assessment, students analyze a character when they answer, “What can the reader infer about Lena based on her actions in the passage?”</p>
<p>Section II: Additional Criteria of Superior Quality</p>			
<p>5. RANGE OF TEXTS: Texts used on reading assessments or in an item bank reflect the distribution of text types and genres suggested by the standards (e.g., RL.K.9, RL.1.5, RI.1.9, RL.2.4, RI.2.3, RL.3.2, RL.3.5, RI.4.3, RL.5.7, RI.7.7, RL.8.9, RI.9-10.9, RI.11-12.8, RI.11-12.9, and RL.10/RI.10 across grade levels).</p>	<p>Required 5a) In grades 3-12, passages on ELA assessments or in an item bank represent a balance between literary and informational texts. In grades 6-12, the inclusion of historical and scientific texts might shift the balance toward more informational texts.</p>	<p>Yes</p>	<p>Passages on ELA assessments or in an item bank represent a balance between literary and informational texts. There are five passages on each assessment. Three of the passages are informational and two are literary on each of the three grade level assessments. For example, the Grade 3 assessment includes the fiction texts “Pick of the Litter” and “Selling Timothy Titus.” The nonfiction passages are “The Water in</p>

CRITERIA	INDICATORS OF SUPERIOR QUALITY	MEETS METRICS (YES/NO)	JUSTIFICATION/COMMENTS WITH EXAMPLES
<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Yes <input type="checkbox"/> No			<p>Your Backyard,” “Wonders of Water,” and “On the Court With Michael Jordan.” Similarly, the Grade 4 assessment includes the nonfiction texts “Ling-Ling and Hsing-Hsing,” “Bats: The Coolest Mammals on Earth,” and “Pallid Bat.” The fictional passages included are “A Syrup Can for Mother” and “Out of the Antarctic.”</p>
	<p>5b) Assessments or item banks include print and non-print texts of different formats (e.g. a range of video, artwork, audio, charts, etc.) and lengths.</p>	<p>Yes</p>	<p>Assessments or item banks include print and non-print texts of different formats and lengths. Comprehensive assessments are in print format, and online access to online passages and items that include technology enhanced items are provided. Video and audio formats were not evidenced, but artwork and charts were included in some of the assessment items. For example, on the Grade 3 assessment, the passage “The Water in Your Backyard” includes a chart with glossary terms; a picture of Lake Billy Chinook, Oregon; and a picture that shows how many rivers feed into the Rio de la Plata Estuary in South American with labels on each of the bodies of water. The labeled picture is to the left of the explanation of an estuary to help students understand the passage and term. However, all of the texts included on the print format are approximately 2 pages long.</p>

CRITERIA	INDICATORS OF SUPERIOR QUALITY	MEETS METRICS (YES/NO)	JUSTIFICATION/COMMENTS WITH EXAMPLES
	<p>5c) Assessments or item banks include informational texts with an informational text structure rather than a narrative structure; grades 3-12 include literary nonfiction.</p>	<p>Yes</p>	<p>Assessments or item banks include informational texts with an informational text structure. There are 3 informational texts on each assessment. Of the three, two have an informational text structure and one is literary nonfiction. For example, on the Grade 4 assessment, “Bats: The Coolest Mammals on Earth” and “Pallid Bat” have an informational text structure. “Ling-Ling” and “Hsing-Hsing” have a literary nonfiction structure. An example of a literary nonfiction is found in the Grade 3 assessment text “On the Court With...Michael Jordan.” An example of informational text structure is found in the Grade 5 assessment text “Life in Space.”</p>
<p>6. WRITING TO SOURCES: The majority of writing prompts and tasks are text-dependent and reflect the writing genres named in the standards.</p> <p><input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Yes <input type="checkbox"/> No</p>	<p>Required</p> <p>6a) A vast majority of written tasks at all grade levels require students to analyze and synthesize sources, as well as to present careful analyses, well-defended claims and clear information, drawing on textual evidence to support valid inferences from text.</p>	<p>Yes</p>	<p>A vast majority of written tasks at all grade levels require students to analyze and synthesize sources, as well as to present careful analyses, well-defended claims and clear information, drawing on textual evidence to support valid inferences from text. Students are required to write extended responses on each assessment, as well as analyze paired passages. For example, the Grade 4 assessment states, “You have read the passage ‘Ling-Ling and Hsing-Hsing’ in which the authors describe a gift that China gave the United States. Write an essay explaining the impact that</p>

CRITERIA	INDICATORS OF SUPERIOR QUALITY	MEETS METRICS (YES/NO)	JUSTIFICATION/COMMENTS WITH EXAMPLES
			<p>the gift of the two giant pandas had on the United States. Use evidence from the passage to support your response.” On the Grade 5 assessment, students are asked “Based on paragraphs 2-4, what can be learned about Wilhelm von Osten’s ideas about animals?” Students must then select two quotations from the passage that best support their answer.</p>
	<p>Required 6b) Assessments include multiple writing tasks with varied lengths (e.g., notes, charts, summaries, short-answer responses, essays, etc.) and time demands as outlined in standard 10.</p>	<p>Yes</p>	<p>Assessments include multiple writing tasks with varied lengths and time demands. Each assessment asks students to complete multiple writing tasks. For example, on the Grade 3 assessment, students are asked to “Write an essay that explains how Michael Jordan was able to overcome challenges to become a starting player on the team. Use evidence from the passage to support your response.” The Grade 4 assessment states, “Based on the passages from ‘A Syrup Can for Mother’ and ‘Out of the Antarctic,’ compare and contrast the fathers in the passages. How are the fathers similar and different? Use details from the passages to support your explanation.” In addition, the Grade 5 assessment includes the prompt “In your opinion, is life on the International Space Station challenging for astronauts? Write an essay that explains why life is</p>

CRITERIA	INDICATORS OF SUPERIOR QUALITY	MEETS METRICS (YES/NO)	JUSTIFICATION/COMMENTS WITH EXAMPLES
			challenging or easy for the astronauts. Use evidence from the passage to support your response.” The assessment also includes the constructed response question: “Based on the passage from ‘How Animals Think,’ explain how Clever Hans knew the answer to the question that people asked him. Use details from the passage to support your explanation.”
	<p>6c) Assessments include more than one mode of writing (opinion/argumentative, informative, narrative) or blended mode (i.e., analytical writing).</p>	<p>Yes</p>	<p>Assessments include more than one mode of writing or blended mode. On the Grade 3 assessment, students are asked to “Explain why Tom wants to take Tad home and why Grandpa does not like that idea” based on the passage. On the Grade 4 assessment, students write an opinion and answer the prompt “In your opinion, was it a good idea for Admiral Drake to give Mr. Popper a penguin as a gift?” On the Grade 5 assessment, students compare two texts. The assessment asks students to “Write an essay comparing and contrasting how the birds in ‘The Animals’ Ball Game’ and Lena in ‘The Five Castaways’ help others in need.”</p>
	<p>6d) In later grades, narrative prompts decrease in number and increase in being based on text(s), e.g., narrative description (text-based, chronological writing) rather than imaginative narratives.</p>	<p>Yes</p>	<p>Narrative prompts decrease in number and increase in being based on texts rather than imaginative narratives. Of the 10 writing tasks included on the 3–5 band, there are none based on imaginative narratives. All</p>

CRITERIA	INDICATORS OF SUPERIOR QUALITY	MEETS METRICS (YES/NO)	JUSTIFICATION/COMMENTS WITH EXAMPLES
			<p>ten of the tasks are based on texts. For instance, on the Grade 4 assessment, a writing prompt states, “In your opinion, was it a good idea for Admiral Drake to give Mr. Popper a penguin as a gift? Write an essay explaining why Admiral Drake’s gift was a good idea or a poor idea. Use evidence from the passage to support your response.” Similarly in the Grade 3 assessment, students are asked to “Write an essay that explains your opinion of how Tom handles this problem.” The expectation is to use evidence from the text or to use their understanding of the text to answer a question in writing. It asks students to “explain how Clever Hans knew the answers to the questions that people asked him” based on the text.</p>
<p>7. SPEAKING AND LISTENING: * Items assessing speaking and listening must be text-dependent and reflect true communication skills required for college and career readiness.</p> <p><input type="checkbox"/> Yes <input type="checkbox"/> No</p> <p>*Applicable if speaking and listening is included on the assessment.</p>	<p>Required</p> <p>7a) Speaking and listening assessments use texts and other stimuli measured by Criteria 1 and 5.</p> <p>7b) Assessments measure students’ ability to gather and use evidence to orally present findings from research and express well-supported ideas clearly; effective engagement includes using appropriate, grade-level academic language (including vocabulary and syntax).</p> <p>7c) Items assessing listening permit the evaluation of active listening skills, such as taking notes on main ideas, asking relevant questions, and probing ideas under discussion by building and elaborating on remarks of others.</p>	<p>N/A</p> <p>N/A</p> <p>N/A</p>	

CRITERIA	INDICATORS OF SUPERIOR QUALITY	MEETS METRICS (YES/NO)	JUSTIFICATION/COMMENTS WITH EXAMPLES
<p>8. LANGUAGE: Items adequately address the Language standards for the grade, including through unpacking the vocabulary and syntax of text(s).</p> <p><input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Yes <input type="checkbox"/> No</p>	<p>Required 8a) The majority of language points on the assessments are obtained from test questions specifically designed to assess language as part of an integrated task or in relation to a text, or the points are obtained from scores on student writing.</p>	<p>Yes</p>	<p>The majority of language points on the assessments are obtained from test questions specifically designed to assess language as part of an integrated task or in relation to a text, or the points are obtained from scores on student writing. There are no questions on the assessments specifically designed to assess language. All language assessments are done through student writing. The writing rubric contains the component language and conventions in which a student earns a 3 if “The student response demonstrates full command of the conventions of standard English at an appropriate level of complexity. There may be a few minor errors in mechanics, grammar, and usage, but meaning is clear.”</p>
	<p>Required 8b) Questions and tasks address common student errors and the grammar and language conventions specified by the Language standards at each grade level.</p>	<p>Yes</p>	<p>Questions and tasks address common student errors and the grammar and language conventions specified by the Language standards at each grade level. Language assessments are embedded into writing tasks and are not asked as stand-alone questions. In the Grade 3 assessment, students are asked to form an opinion based on their reading and “write an essay that explains your opinion of how Tom handles this problem” which aligns with Grade 3 expectations outlined on the LDOE writing progressions. The Grade 5</p>

CRITERIA	INDICATORS OF SUPERIOR QUALITY	MEETS METRICS (YES/NO)	JUSTIFICATION/COMMENTS WITH EXAMPLES
			assessment asks students to compare and contrast two texts which involves organization and writing skills that align with Grade 5 standards.
	<p>Required 8c) Questions and tasks focus on conventions most important for college and career readiness that build from previous grade levels.</p>	Yes	<p>Questions and tasks focus on conventions most important for college and career readiness that build from previous grade levels. Language standards require students to “demonstrate command of the standard English grammar and usage when writing or speaking.” This is assessed through the writing rubric which states, “The student response demonstrates full command of the conventions of standard English at an appropriate level of complexity. There may be a few minor errors in mechanics, grammar, and usage, but meaning is clear.” The tasks required include forming an opinion, comparing and contrasting, and writing an explanation.</p>
	<p>8d) A majority of items assessing conventions and writing strategies reflect actual practice to the extent possible (i.e., they mirror authentic editing or revision, writing, etc.).</p>	Yes	<p>The majority of items assessing conventions and writing strategies reflect actual practice to the extent possible. Students have the opportunity to revise and edit their work before submission of the assessment. They write to support claims and explain ideas. For example, on the Grade 4 assessment, students “write an essay explaining the impact that the gift of the two giant pandas had on the United</p>

CRITERIA	INDICATORS OF SUPERIOR QUALITY	MEETS METRICS (YES/NO)	JUSTIFICATION/COMMENTS WITH EXAMPLES
			States.” The Grade 3 assessment requires students to “write an essay that explains your opinion of how Tom handles this problem.” The Grade 5 assessment asks students to write an essay comparing and contrasting characters in two different texts help others in need. At the end of each assessment, students are prompted to review their answers.
<p>FINAL EVALUATION <i>Tier 1 ratings</i> receive a “Yes” for all Non-negotiable Criteria and a “Yes” for each of the Additional Criteria of Superior Quality. <i>Tier 2 ratings</i> receive a “Yes” for all Non-negotiable Criteria, but at least one “No” for the Additional Criteria of Superior Quality. <i>Tier 3 ratings</i> receive a “No” for at least one of the Non-negotiable Criteria.</p>			
Compile the results for Sections I-VII to make a final decision for the material under review.			
Section	Criteria	Yes/No	Final Justification/Comments
I: Non-negotiable Criteria of Superior Quality⁴	1. Quality of Texts	Yes	At least 90% of texts offer rich opportunities for students to demonstrate evidence of meeting grade-level standards. Assessments provide texts that are appropriately complex for the identified grade level according to the requirements outlined in the standards. Nearly all texts are placed within the grade band indicated by the quantitative analysis. Assessments provide paired or multiple texts for students to demonstrate mastery of standards which require students to make connections among texts. In a set of

⁴ Must score a “Yes” for all Non-negotiable Criteria to receive a Tier I or Tier II rating.

CRITERIA	INDICATORS OF SUPERIOR QUALITY	MEETS METRICS (YES/NO)	JUSTIFICATION/COMMENTS WITH EXAMPLES
			reading assessments, texts increase in complexity as materials progress throughout the grade level and across grade bands.
	2. Design, Scoring, and Reporting	Yes	Assessments incorporate performance tasks, which allow students to respond to a set of texts through reading and writing. Aligned rubrics or assessment guidelines are included and provide sufficient guidance for interpreting student performance. However, a variety of assessments for different uses are not included. Materials assess student proficiency using methods that are unbiased and accessible to all students. Due to the inability to run action reports, it is not evident that assessment results are analyzed by major claims and subclaims. Due to the inability to run action reports, it is not evident that assessment results are clearly communicated for the purpose of determining areas of weakness based on indicator 2e and for providing actionable information which leads to clear next steps for how to address student weaknesses instructionally.
	3. Text-Dependent Questions and Tasks	Yes	Nearly all of the questions on assessments or in an item bank are text dependent. Assessments or item banks contain a variety of types of test questions and tasks

CRITERIA	INDICATORS OF SUPERIOR QUALITY	MEETS METRICS (YES/NO)	JUSTIFICATION/COMMENTS WITH EXAMPLES
			to approach the texts in ways uniquely appropriate to each text. A large majority of items on a reading assessment reflect the requirements of Reading Standard 1 by requiring students to directly select or provide evidence from the text to support their answers to questions which measure other grade-level standards.
	4. Alignment	Yes	Items on an assessment and in an item bank focus on key ideas of the text. Questions on an assessment or in an item bank assess the depth and complexity required by the standards and are sufficiently complex to align to more than one standard at each grade-level over time. Vocabulary items on assessments and in an item bank assess words essential to the central meaning and purpose of the text. Sets of questions for given text(s) are coherently sequenced to assess whether students are able to read, understand, and express their understanding of the language, topics, themes, and ideas of grade-level, complex texts, and illustrations.
II: Additional Criteria of Superior Quality ⁵	5. Range of Texts	Yes	Passages on ELA assessments or in an item bank represent a balance between literary and informational texts. Assessments or item banks include print and non-print

⁵ Must score a “Yes” for all Additional Criteria of Superior Quality to receive a Tier I rating.

CRITERIA	INDICATORS OF SUPERIOR QUALITY	MEETS METRICS (YES/NO)	JUSTIFICATION/COMMENTS WITH EXAMPLES
			texts of different formats and lengths. Assessments or item banks include informational texts with an informational text structure.
	6. Writing to Sources	Yes	A vast majority of written tasks at all grade levels require students to analyze and synthesize sources, as well as to present careful analyses, well-defended claims, and clear information, drawing on textual evidence to support valid inferences from text. Assessments include multiple writing tasks with varied lengths and time demands. Assessments include more than one mode of writing or blended mode. Narrative prompts decrease in number and increase in being based on texts rather than imaginative narratives.
	7. Speaking and Listening*	N/A	
	8. Language	Yes	The majority of language points on the assessments are obtained from test questions specifically designed to assess language as part of an integrated task or in relation to a text, or the points are obtained from scores on student writing. Questions and tasks address common student errors and the grammar and language conventions specified by the Language standards at each grade level. Questions and tasks focus on conventions most important for college and career

CRITERIA	INDICATORS OF SUPERIOR QUALITY	MEETS METRICS (YES/NO)	JUSTIFICATION/COMMENTS WITH EXAMPLES
			readiness that build from previous grade levels. The majority of items assessing conventions and writing strategies reflect actual practice to the extent possible.
FINAL DECISION FOR THIS MATERIAL: <u>Tier I, Exemplifies quality</u>			

*As applicable

Instructional materials are one of the most important tools educators use in the classroom to enhance student learning. It is critical that they fully align to state standards—what students are expected to learn and be able to do at the end of each grade level or course—and are high quality if they are to provide meaningful instructional support.

The Louisiana Department of Education is committed to ensuring that every student has access to high-quality instructional materials. In Louisiana all districts are able to purchase instructional materials that are best for their local communities since those closest to students are best positioned to decide which instructional materials are appropriate for their district and classrooms. To support local school districts in making their own local, high-quality decisions, the Louisiana Department of Education leads online reviews of instructional materials.

Instructional materials are reviewed by a committee of Louisiana educators. Teacher Leader Advisors (TLAs) are a group of exceptional educators from across Louisiana who play an influential role in raising expectations for students and supporting the success of teachers. Teacher Leader Advisors use their robust knowledge of teaching and learning to review instructional materials.

The [2019-2020 Teacher Leader Advisors](#) are selected from across the state and represent the following parishes and school systems: Ascension, Beauregard, Bossier, Caddo, Calcasieu, Caldwell, City of Monroe, Desoto, East Baton Rouge, Einstein Charter Schools, Iberia, Jefferson, Jefferson Davis, KIPP New Orleans, Lafayette, Lafourche, Lincoln, Livingston, LSU Lab School, Orleans, Orleans/Lusher Charter School, Ouachita, Plaquemines, Pointe Coupee, Rapides, Richland, RSD Choice Foundation, St. John the Baptist, St. Charles, St. James, St. Landry, St. Mary, St. Tammany, Tangipahoa, Vermillion, Vernon, West Baton Rouge, West Feliciana, and Zachary. This review represents the work of current classroom teachers with experience in grades K-8.

Appendix I.

Publisher Response

The publisher had no response.

Appendix II.

Public Comments

There were no public comments submitted.