Instructional Materials Evaluation - Student Standards Review

Louisiana educators engaged in a professional review of the state's academic standards for English language arts (ELA) and mathematics to ensure they continue to maintain strong expectations for teaching and learning aligned with college and workplace demands. The new ELA and math standards will be effective beginning with the 2016-2017 school year. As part of the Louisiana Department of Education's support for a seamless transition to these new standards, the LDOE identified the major changes of the standards and their potential impact upon criteria used to review instructional materials.

Title: **Edgenuity Common Core English Language Arts** Grade: **9-12**

Publisher: **Edgenuity Inc.** Copyright: **2012 - 13**

Overall Rating: **Tier III, Not representing quality**

This English Language Arts review has been examined for the following changes in alignment resulting from the Louisiana Student Standards Review:

- Materials do not contain references to specific authors and texts
- Include citing *relevant* textual evidence beginning in grade 6
- Include an *awareness of audience* when making speeches and delivering presentations

This review remains a Tier 3 rating. As a result of these changes, the following chart identifies the potential impact on specific elements in the current review. The LDOE recommends that district curriculum staff, principals, and teachers take these findings into consideration when using these instructional materials.

Criteria	Currently in the Rubric	Next Steps for Educators
Quality of Texts (Non-Negotiable)	This program currently is reviewed as "No" for this criteria because while all literary texts included are worth reading and are rich in content and craft, informational texts from other disciplines are lacking. There are no identified anchor texts and no evidence that texts are selected for multiple readings.	Since these materials received a "No" for this indicator, the current weakness will likely remain and should be addressed by adjusting or supplementing with stronger programs.
Text-Dependent Questions (Non-Negotiable)	This program currently is reviewed as "No" for these criteria because there is no evidence of students expressing their ideas through written or spoken responses. Rather, all questions appear via end-of-unit, multiple choice, or computer-based format.	Since these materials received a "No" for this indicator, the current weakness will likely remain and should be addressed by adjusting or supplementing with stronger programs.
Speaking and Listening	This program currently is reviewed as "No" for this criteria because there are no speaking and listening components to the curriculum.	Since these materials received a "No" for this indicator, the current weakness will likely remain and should be addressed by adjusting or supplementing with stronger programs.

Instructional Materials Review for CCSS Alignment in ELA Grades 9-12

The goal for ELA students is that they can read and understand grade-level texts independently, as demonstrated through writing and speaking about those texts. A strong ELA classroom is structured with the below components.

Title: **Edgenuity Common Core English Language Arts** **Grade:** **9-12**

Publisher: **Edgenuity Inc.** **Copyright:** **2012-13**

Overall Rating: **Tier III, Not representing quality**

Tier I, Tier II, Tier III elements of this review:

STRONG	WEAK
	Complexity of Texts (Non-Negotiable)
	Quality of Texts (Non-Negotiable)
	Range and Volume of Texts
	Foundational Skills (Non-Negotiable*)
	Text-Dependent Questions (Non-Negotiable)
	Assessment
	Scaffolding and Support
	Writing to Sources
	Speaking and Listening
	Language

Each set of submitted materials was evaluated for alignment with the standards beginning with a review of the indicators for the non-negotiable criteria. If those criteria were met, a review of the other criteria ensued.

Tier 1 ratings received a "Yes" for all Criteria 1-10.
Tier 2 ratings received a "Yes" for all non-negotiable criteria (Foundational Skills (as applicable), Complexity of Texts, Quality of Texts, and Text-Dependent Questions), but at least one "No" for the remaining criteria.
Tier 3 ratings received a "No" for at least one of the non-negotiable criteria.

Click below for complete grade-level reviews:

Grade 9 (Tier 3) Grade 10 (Tier 3)
Grade 11 (Tier 3) Grade 12 (Tier 3)

Instructional Materials Evaluation Tool for Alignment in ELA Grades 3 -12 (IMET)

The goal for ELA students is that they can read and understand grade-level texts independently, as demonstrated through writing and speaking about those texts. A strong ELA classroom is structured with the below components.

Title: **Edgenuity Common Core English Language Arts** **Grade:** **9**

Publisher: **Edgenuity Inc.** **Copyright:** **2012**

Overall Rating: **Tier III, Not representing quality**

Tier I, Tier II, Tier III elements of this review:

STRONG	WEAK
	Complexity of Texts (Non-Negotiable)
	Quality of Texts (Non-Negotiable)
	Range and Volume of Texts
	Foundational Skills (Non-Negotiable*)
	Text-Dependent Questions (Non-Negotiable)
	Assessment
	Scaffolding and Support
	Writing to Sources
	Speaking and Listening
	Language

To evaluate each set of submitted materials for alignment with the standards, begin by reviewing Column 2 for the non-negotiable criteria. If there is a "Yes" for all required indicators in Column 2, then the materials receive a "Yes" in Column 1. If there is a "No" for any required indicators in Column 2, then the materials receive a "No" in Column 1. (Note: If materials do not represent a full curricula, then some of Criteria 1-10 may not apply.)

Tier 1 ratings receive a "Yes" in Column 1 for Criteria 1-10.
Tier 2 ratings receive a "Yes" in Column 1 for all non-negotiable criteria (Foundational Skills (as applicable), Complexity of Texts, Quality of Texts, and Text-Dependent Questions), but at least one "No" in Column 1 for the remaining criteria.
Tier 3 ratings receive a "No" in Column 1 for at least one of the non-negotiable criteria.

CRITERIA	INDICATORS OF SUPERIOR QUALITY	MEETS METRICS (Y/N)	JUSTIFICATION/ COMMENTS
I. Text Selection			
Tier 1 and 2 Non-Negotiable **1. COMPLEXITY OF TEXTS:** Materials present a progression of complex texts as stated by Reading Standard 10[1]. ☐ Yes ☐ No	**REQUIRED** **1a)** Materials provide texts that fall within grade-level complexity bands, indicating that quantitative measures and qualitative analysis[2] were used in selection of texts. Poetry and drama are analyzed only using qualitative measures.	**No**	While some literary pieces do fall within grade level complexity bands, the complexity of many texts is more appropriate for the 6-8 grade band ("A Christmas Memory" 660 L).
	REQUIRED **1b)** Texts for each grade align with the requirements outlined in the standards and with the complexity of exemplars provided in Appendix B.	**No**	While some texts do align with exemplars provided in Appendix B (*The Odyssey*, Homer, "The Gift of the Magi," O. Henry and *Romeo and Juliet*, Shakespeare) informational sources do not align.
	REQUIRED **1c)** Texts increase in complexity as materials progress across grade bands. Read-aloud texts follow the same trend, although they may have greater variability because listening skills in elementary school generally outpace reading skills.	**Yes**	The texts do appear to increase in complexity across the ninth grade level: "The Most Dangerous Game" is not as demanding as *Romeo and Juliet.*
Tier 1 and 2 Non-Negotiable **2. QUALITY OF TEXTS:** Texts are of sufficient scope and quality to provide text-centered and integrated learning that is sequenced and scaffolded to advance students toward independent reading of grade level texts and build content knowledge (ELA, social studies, science and technical subjects, and the arts). The quality of texts is high—they	**REQUIRED** **2a)** 90% of texts are worth reading in the particular grade (i.e., serve an instructional purpose); they are content rich and well crafted, representing the quality of writing that is produced by authorities in the discipline and include texts from history/social studies, science, technical subjects, and the arts.	**No**	While all literary texts included are worth reading and are rich in content and craft, informational texts from other disciplines are lacking.
	REQUIRED **2b)** Materials provide a sequence or collection of texts that build knowledge systematically through reading, writing, listening and speaking about topics or ideas under study.	**No**	There is a profound reliance on direct-instruction (teacher lecture) with very little opportunity for students to build their own knowledge through writing, speaking and reading.

[1] Grades 3-12 Example: Texts present vocabulary, syntax, text structures, levels of meaning/purpose similar to exemplars in Appendix B.
[2] The process for determining quantitative and qualitative measures is described in the Supplement to Appendix A. Grade band conversions for quantitative measures are determined using the chart on page 4 of the document. A description of the criteria for analyzing the qualitative features of the text is located on pages 4-6 of the document.

CRITERIA	INDICATORS OF SUPERIOR QUALITY	MEETS METRICS (Y/N)	JUSTIFICATION/ COMMENTS
I. Text Selection			
support multiple readings for various purposes and exhibit exceptional craft and thought and/or provide useful information. ☐ Yes ■ No	**REQUIRED** **2c)** Within a sequence or collection of texts, specific anchor texts of grade--level complexity are selected for multiple, careful readings.	**No**	There are no identified anchor texts and no evidence that texts are selected for multiple readings.
	2d) Nearly all texts are previously published rather than "commissioned."	**Yes**	All texts are previously published.
3. RANGE AND VOLUME OF TEXTS: Materials reflect the distribution of text types and genres suggested by the standards: Text types and genres generally reflect the definitions provided on page 31 (grades K-5) and page 57 (grades 6-12) of the standards and included in the text of the standards (e.g., RL.2.9, RL.9-10.6, RI.7.7, or RI.11-12.9). ☐ Yes ■ No	**REQUIRED** **3a)** In grades K-12, ELA materials seek a balance in instructional time between 50% literature/ 50% informational texts.	**No**	There is no balance between literary and informational texts. There is an overwhelming amount of fiction, particularly short stories.
	REQUIRED **3b)** Materials include texts of different formats (e.g., print and non-print, including film, art, music, charts, etc.) and lengths.	**No**	Most texts are literary prose, particularly short stories. There are few texts that represent other genres. Those varied texts that do exist are confined to a single unit of study; therefore, there is no diversity within the unit.
	3c) Materials include many informational texts with an informational text structure rather than a narrative structure; grades 6-12 include literary nonfiction.	**No**	The focus on informational text seems to be narrative in structure, and students have little engagement with complex informational text.
	3d) Additional materials increase the opportunity for regular, accountable independent reading of texts that appeal to students' interests to build reading stamina, confidence, motivation, and enjoyment and connect to classroom concepts or topics to develop knowledge.	**No**	There are no suggestions for independent reading.

CRITERIA	INDICATORS OF SUPERIOR QUALITY	MEETS METRICS (Y/N)	JUSTIFICATION/ COMMENTS
II. Foundational Skills (grades 3-5 only)			
Tier 1 and 2 Non-Negotiable* **4. FOUNDATIONAL SKILLS:** Materials provide instruction and diagnostic support in concepts of print, phonics, vocabulary, development, syntax, and fluency in a logical and transparent progression. These foundational skills are necessary and central components of an effective, comprehensive reading program designed to develop proficient readers with the capacity to comprehend texts across a range of types and disciplines. ☐ Yes ☐ No *As applicable (e.g., when the scope of the materials is comprehensive and considered a full program)	**REQUIRED** **4a)** Materials demand knowledge of grade-level phonic patterns and word analysis skills.		Not applicable.
	REQUIRED **4b)** Materials encourage students to use context to confirm or self-correct word recognition and understanding, directing students to reread purposefully to acquire accurate meaning.		Not applicable.
	REQUIRED **4c)** Materials provide instruction and practice in word study, including systematic examination of grade-level morphology, decoding of multisyllabic words by using syllabication, and automaticity with grade-level regular and irregular spelling patterns.		Not applicable.
	REQUIRED **4d)** Opportunities are frequently built into the materials that allow for students to achieve reading fluency in oral and silent reading, that is, to read on-level prose and poetry with accuracy, rate appropriate to the text, and expression.		Not applicable.
	REQUIRED **4e)** Materials guide students to read grade-level text with purpose and understanding.		Not applicable.

CRITERIA	INDICATORS OF SUPERIOR QUALITY	MEETS METRICS (Y/N)	JUSTIFICATION/ COMMENTS
III. Questions and Tasks			
Non-Negotiable 5. TEXT-DEPENDENT QUESTIONS: Text-dependent questions and tasks reflect the requirements of Reading Standard 1 by requiring use of textual evidence in support of meeting other grade-specific standards. ☐ Yes ■ No	**REQUIRED** **5a)** At least 80% of all questions in the materials are text-dependent questions; student ideas are expressed through both written and spoken responses.	**No**	There are few text-dependent questions for the reading selections, but they are weak. Questions are predominately literal. There is no evidence of students expressing their ideas through written or spoken responses. Rather, all questions appear via end-of-unit, multiple-choice, computer-based format.
	REQUIRED **5b)** Coherent sequences of text-dependent questions elicit sustained attention to the text and its illustrations (as applicable), its impact (including the building of knowledge), and its connection to other texts.	**No**	The included questions are not sequenced to sustain attention to the texts. There are no connections to other texts.
	REQUIRED **5c)** Questions include the language of the standards, and assess the depth and complexity required by the standards at each grade-level over time to advance and deepen student learning. *(**Note:** not every standard must be assessed with every text.)*	**No**	The questions do not utilize the language of the standards.
	5d) Questions and tasks often begin with comprehension of the text before focusing on interpretation or evaluation.	**No**	The practice questions included do not move from comprehension to analysis. There are almost no evaluation tasks.
	5e) Questions support students in unpacking the academic language (vocabulary and syntax) prevalent in complex texts to determine meaning from texts and in learning new vocabulary from reading.	**Yes**	The vocabulary questions included extracted sentences from the text and ask students to use a variety of strategies to discern literal and figurative meaning and origin.
6. ASSESSMENT: Materials offer assessment opportunities that genuinely measure progress and elicit direct, observable evidence of the degree to which students can independently demonstrate the assessed grade-specific standards with appropriately complex text(s). ☐ Yes ■ No	**REQUIRED** **6a)** Measurement of progress via assessments should include gradual release of supporting scaffolds for students to measure their independent abilities.	**No**	There are short multiple-choice quizzes after each text. These do not provide any scaffolding for students. Furthermore, these questions are predominately literal.
	REQUIRED **6b)** Aligned rubrics or assessment guidelines (such as scoring guides or student work exemplars) are included and provide sufficient guidance for interpreting student performance.	**No**	Quizzes have correct answers listed for instructors, but not enough guidance to interpret student performance.
	REQUIRED **6c)** Materials use varied modes of assessment, including a range of pre-, formative, summative and self-assessment measures.	**No**	Students complete short multiple-choice quizzes with a few short-answer questions and occasional writing prompts that are

CRITERIA	INDICATORS OF SUPERIOR QUALITY	MEETS METRICS (Y/N)	JUSTIFICATION/ COMMENTS
III. Questions and Tasks			
			unrelated to the text under consideration.
	6d) Materials assess student proficiency using methods that are unbiased and accessible to all students.	**No**	Many items assess lecture and prior knowledge rather than the text of study.

CRITERIA	INDICATORS OF SUPERIOR QUALITY	MEETS METRICS (Y/N)	JUSTIFICATION/ COMMENTS
IV. Scaffolding and Support			
7. SCAFFOLDING AND SUPPORT: Materials provide all students, including those who read below grade level, with extensive opportunities and support to encounter and comprehend grade-level complex text as required by the standards. ☐ Yes ■ No	**REQUIRED** **7a)** Pre-reading activities and suggested approaches to teacher scaffolding are focused and engage students with understanding the text itself. Pre-reading activities should be no more than 10% of time devoted to any reading instruction.	**No**	Pre-reading activities include PowerPoint lectures with a preponderance of front loading about the text. The time devoted to these activities is far more than 10%. There are no supports or scaffolds built into the actual instruction with the text. All reading is done independently through a third-party internet site.
	REQUIRED **7b)** Materials do not confuse or substitute mastery of strategies for full comprehension of text; reading strategies support comprehension of specific texts and focus on building knowledge and insight. Texts must not serve as platforms to practice discrete strategies.	**No**	Full comprehension of text is not assessed. Strategies are the only focus of the units of study. There is no building of knowledge or insight. The texts of the unit have been selected to showcase textual elements or strategies.
	REQUIRED **7c)** Materials regularly direct teachers to return to focused parts of the text to guide students through rereading, discussion and writing about the ideas, events, and information found there.	**No**	Students engage with the text only once. There is no guidance for rereading, discussion, or connection to writing.
	REQUIRED **7d)** The materials are easy to use and cleanly laid out for students and teachers. Each page of the submission adds to student learning rather than distracts from it. The reading selections are centrally located within the materials and obviously the center of focus.	**Yes**	The materials are all live links from third-party websites. They are easy to access, provided the links remain active.

CRITERIA	INDICATORS OF SUPERIOR QUALITY	MEETS METRICS (Y/N)	JUSTIFICATION/ COMMENTS
	7e) Appropriate suggestions and materials are provided for supporting varying student needs at the unit and lesson level (e.g., alternate teaching approaches, pacing, instructional delivery options, suggestions for addressing common student difficulties to meet standards, remediation strategies or suggestions for supporting texts, suggestions for more advanced texts for extension, etc.).	**No**	There are no suggestions made for varying and supporting student learning. There are no pacing guides, etc. There is a teacher's resource page but it merely provides links to discussion boards and surveys.
	7f) The content can be reasonably completed within a regular school year and the pacing of content allows for maximum student understanding. The materials provide guidance about the amount of time a task might reasonably take.	**Yes**	There are ten units; however, the content would not require a full year to complete. Additional instruction would probably be required to fill time constraints of a traditional yearlong schedule.

CRITERIA	INDICATORS OF SUPERIOR QUALITY	MEETS METRICS (Y/N)	JUSTIFICATION/ COMMENTS
V. Writing to Sources and Research			
8. WRITING TO SOURCES: The majority of written tasks are text-dependent and reflect the writing genres named in the standards. ☐ Yes ■ No	**REQUIRED** **8a)** A vast majority of written tasks at all grade levels require students to analyze and synthesize sources, as well as to present careful analysis, well-defended claims and clear information, drawing on textual evidence and to support valid inferences from text.	**No**	There are few tasks that require students to analyze and synthesize sources. There is no mention of claims and textual evidence in any of the prompts. For example, students are asked: "In what ways do you relate to the narrator of this story?" No further instruction is given in the prompt.
	REQUIRED **8b)** Materials include multiple writing tasks aligned to the three modes of writing (opinion/argumentative, informative, narrative) as well as blended modes (i.e., analytical writing); narrative prompts decrease in number and increase in being based on text(s) as student progress through the grades, e.g., narrative description (text-based, chronological writing) rather than imaginative narratives.	**No**	Writing addresses multiple modes but prompts do not meet the rigor of the standards. For example, students are asked to finish a paragraph when provided a topic sentence Writings do not require textual evidence or literary analysis.
	REQUIRED **8c)** Writing opportunities for students are prominent and varied in length and time demands (e.g., notes, summaries, short-answer responses, formal essays, on-demand and process writing, etc.).	**Yes**	There are many opportunities for writing within the sets of "practice" questions. They seem to be varied in length; however, the tasks/prompts often lack in rigor.
	REQUIRED **8d)** Materials build in opportunities for connections and alignment between writing, speaking and listening, reading, and the language standards. For example, students read a text, work collaboratively to develop a plan for analyzing or emulating the text, write a response, and then share their writing with a peer who reviews the writing against using a peer review checklist.	**No**	Alignment between writing, speaking, listening, reading, and language standards does not exist.
	8e) Materials engage students in many short research projects annually to develop the expertise needed to conduct research independently.	**No**	Only one writing prompt is related to research.

CRITERIA	INDICATORS OF SUPERIOR QUALITY	MEETS METRICS (Y/N)	JUSTIFICATION/ COMMENTS
VI. Speaking and Listening			
9. SPEAKING AND LISTENING: Oral tasks must be text-dependent and materials for speaking and listening must reflect true communication skills required for college and career readiness. ☐ Yes ■ No	**REQUIRED** **9a)** Texts used in speaking and listening questions and tasks must meet the criteria for complexity, range, and quality of texts (Criteria 1, 2, and 3).	**No**	There are no speaking and listening components to the curriculum.
	REQUIRED **9b)** Materials demand that students engage effectively in a range of conversations and collaborations by expressing well-supported ideas clearly and probing ideas under discussion by building on others' ideas.	**No**	There are no speaking and listening components to the curriculum.
	REQUIRED **9c)** Materials build in frequent opportunities for connections and alignment between speaking and listening, reading, writing, and the language standards. Examples: Materials build in frequent opportunities for discussion about texts and, through directions and modeling, encourage students to use academic language and grade-appropriate oral language conventions; materials require students to gather and use evidence to orally present findings from research.	**No**	There are no speaking and listening components to the curriculum.
	9d) Materials develop active listening skills, such as taking notes on main ideas, asking relevant questions, and elaborating on remarks of others.	**Yes**	As most of the curriculum requires students to listen attentively to lecture, note taking would be reinforced. However, because all lectures are recorded, there would not be opportunity for asking questions or elaborating on remarks of others.

CRITERIA	INDICATORS OF SUPERIOR QUALITY	MEETS METRICS (Y/N)	JUSTIFICATION/ COMMENTS
VII. Language			
10. LANGUAGE: Materials must adequately address the Language standards for the grade, including through unpacking the vocabulary and syntax of text(s) (indicator 5e) as models of language use. ☐ Yes ■ No	**REQUIRED** **10a)** Materials address the grammar and language conventions specified by the Language standards at each grade level and build on those standards that build from previous grade levels, as indicated by pages 30 and 56 of the standards.	**No**	The grammar lessons are disjointed and not focused on the standards. In one unit there is a focus on word-study and in the next, fragments.
	REQUIRED **10b)** Materials expect students to confront their own error patterns in usage and conventions (oral and written) and correct them.	**Yes**	Students, sometimes, go through revising process, but this is not included in every writing "lesson" and is not representative of the necessary frequency or rigor.
	REQUIRED **10c)** Materials encourage students to examine the language of texts (vocabulary, sentences, structure) and model their own writing after texts they are listening to or reading as a way to develop more complex sentence structure and language usage.	**No**	Students do not use texts to model their own writing.
	REQUIRED **10d)** Materials build in frequent opportunities for connections and alignment between the language standards, writing, reading, and speaking and listening. For example, through directions and modeling, materials encourage students to use grade-appropriate language conventions when speaking and writing about texts.	**No**	Alignment between writing, speaking, listening, reading, and language standards does not exist.
	10e) Materials provide real-world activities for student practice with natural language (e.g. mock interviews, presentations).	**No**	There are limited real-world activities.

Tier 1 ratings receive a "Yes" in Column 1 for Criteria 1-10.
Tier 2 ratings receive a "Yes" in Column 1 for all non-negotiable criteria (Foundational Skills (as applicable), Complexity of Texts, Quality of Texts, and Text-Dependent Questions), but at least one "No" in Column 1 for the remaining criteria.
Tier 3 ratings receive a "No" in Column 1 for at least one of the non-negotiable criteria.

FINAL EVALUATION			
Compile the results for Sections I-VII to make a final decision for the material under review.			
Section	**Criteria**	**Y/N**	**Final Justification/Comments**
I: Text Selection	1. Complexity of Texts **(Non-Negotiable)**	**No**	Literary texts do align to the complexity level of exemplars from Appendix B; however, there is no evidence of method.
	2. Quality of Texts **(Non-Negotiable)**	**No**	While literary texts are of the appropriate complexity level, there is no building of knowledge across units or the year.
	3. Range and Volume of Texts	**No**	There is no balance between literary and informational sources.
II: Foundational Skills	4. Foundational Skills **(Non-Negotiable*)**		
III: Text-Dependent Questions and Tasks	5. Text-Dependent Questions **(Non-Negotiable)**	**No**	There are few text dependent questions embedded in the text resources.
	6. Assessment	**No**	Assessment is limited and usually focuses on information gained from lecture rather than actual engagement with the text.
IV: Scaffolding and Support	7. Scaffolding and Support	**No**	There are no supports or scaffolds built into the actual instruction with the text.
V: Writing to Sources and Research	8. Writing to Sources	**No**	Writing prompts are often skill based and do not require students to analyze sources or claims.
VI: Speaking and Listening	9. Speaking and Listening	**No**	There are no speaking and listening components to the curriculum.
VII: Language	10. Language	**No**	Grammar lessons do not align to the standards for the grade band.
FINAL DECISION FOR THIS MATERIAL: Tier III, Not representing quality			

*As applicable (e.g., when the scope of the materials is comprehensive and considered a full program)

Instructional Materials Evaluation Tool for Alignment in ELA Grades 3 -12 (IMET)

The goal for ELA students is that they can read and understand grade-level texts independently, as demonstrated through writing and speaking about those texts. A strong ELA classroom is structured with the below components.

Title: **Edgenuity Common Core English Language Arts** **Grade:** **10**

Publisher: **Edgenuity Inc.** **Copyright:** **2012**

Overall Rating: **Tier III, Not representing quality**

Tier I, Tier II, Tier III elements of this review:

STRONG	WEAK
	Complexity of Texts (Non-negotiable)
	Quality of Texts(Non-negotiable)
	Range and Volume of Texts (Non-negotiable)
	Foundational Skills (Non-negotiable)
	Text-Dependent Questions
	Assessment
	Scaffolding and Support
	Writing to Sources
	Speaking and Listening

To evaluate each set of submitted materials for alignment with the standards, begin by reviewing Column 2 for the non-negotiable criteria. If there is a "Yes" for all required indicators in Column 2, then the materials receive a "Yes" in Column 1. If there is a "No" for any required indicators in Column 2, then the materials receive a "No" in Column 1. (Note: If materials do not represent a full curricula, then some of Criteria 1-10 may not apply.)

Tier 1 ratings receive a "Yes" in Column 1 for Criteria 1-10.
Tier 2 ratings receive a "Yes" in Column 1 for all non-negotiable criteria (Foundational Skills (as applicable), Complexity of Texts, Quality of Texts, and Text-Dependent Questions), but at least one "No" in Column 1 for the remaining criteria.
Tier 3 ratings receive a "No" in Column 1 for at least one of the non-negotiable criteria.

CRITERIA	INDICATORS OF SUPERIOR QUALITY	MEETS METRICS (Y/N)	JUSTIFICATION/ COMMENTS
I. Text Selection			
Tier 1 and 2 Non-Negotiable **1. COMPLEXITY OF TEXTS:** Materials present a progression of complex texts as stated by Reading Standard 10[1]. ☐ Yes ☐ No	**REQUIRED** **1a)** Materials exhibit concrete evidence that research-based quantitative measures as well as qualitative analysis[2] have been used in selection of texts. Rare exceptions (in which the qualitative measure trumps the quantitative measure and places the text outside the grade band) are usually reserved for literary texts in the upper grades. Poetry and drama are analyzed only using qualitative measures.	**No**	While most literary pieces do fall with grade level complexity bands, there is no evidence of how text-complexity was determined.
	REQUIRED **1b)** Texts for each grade align with the requirements outlined in the standards and with the complexity of exemplars provided in Appendix B.	**No**	While some literary texts do align with exemplars provided in Appendix B, (*"Antigone",* Sophocles, *Metamorphoses*, Ovid, and *"Julius Caesar",* Shakespeare) informational sources do not align.
	REQUIRED **1c)** Texts increase in complexity as materials progress across grade bands. Read-aloud texts follow the same trend, although they may have greater variability because listening skills in elementary school generally outpace reading skills.	**Yes**	Most of the texts do appear to increase in complexity across the grade level. "The Bet" in unit one is not as challenging as "Marriage Is a Private Affair" and "Subha" at the end of the course. Many of the texts Lexile range are not available.
Tier 1 and 2 Non-Negotiable **2. QUALITY OF TEXTS:** Texts are of sufficient scope and quality to provide text-centered and integrated learning that is sequenced and scaffolded to advance students toward independent	**REQUIRED** **2a)** 90% of texts are worth reading in the particular grade (i.e., serve an instructional purpose); they are content rich and well crafted, representing the quality of writing that is produced by authorities in the discipline and include texts from history/social studies, science, technical subjects, and the arts.	**No**	While all literary texts included are worth reading and are rich in content and craft, informational texts from other disciplines are lacking.

[1] Grades 3-12 Example: Texts present vocabulary, syntax, text structures, levels of meaning/purpose similar to exemplars in Appendix B.
[2] The process for determining quantitative and qualitative measures is described in the Supplement to Appendix A. Grade band conversions for quantitative measures are determined using the chart on page 4 of the document. A description of the criteria for analyzing the qualitative features of the text is located on pages 4-6 of the document.

CRITERIA	INDICATORS OF SUPERIOR QUALITY	MEETS METRICS (Y/N)	JUSTIFICATION/ COMMENTS
I. Text Selection			
reading of grade level texts and build content knowledge (ELA, social studies, science and technical subjects, and the arts). The quality of texts is high—they support multiple readings for various purposes and exhibit exceptional craft and thought and/or provide useful information. ☐ Yes ■ No	**REQUIRED** **2b)** Materials provide a sequence or collection of texts that build knowledge systematically through reading, writing, listening and speaking about topics or ideas under study.	**No**	The collection of texts does not build knowledge systematically. There is a profound reliance on direct-instruction (teacher lecture) with very little opportunity for students to build their own knowledge through writing, speaking and reading.
	REQUIRED **2c)** Within a sequence or collection of texts, specific anchor texts of grade-level complexity are selected for multiple, careful readings.	**No**	There are no identified anchor texts and no evidence that texts are selected for multiple readings.
	2d) Nearly all texts are previously published rather than "commissioned."	**Yes**	All texts are previously published.
3. RANGE AND VOLUME OF TEXTS: Materials reflect the distribution of text types and genres suggested by the standards: Text types and genres generally reflect the definitions provided on page 31 (grades K-5) and page 57 (grades 6-12) of the standards and included in the text of the standards (e.g., RL.2.9, RL.9-10.6, RI.7.7, or RI.11-12.9). ☐ Yes ■ No	**REQUIRED** **3a)** In grades K-12, ELA materials seek a balance in instructional time between 50% literature/ 50% informational texts.	**No**	There is no balance between literary and informational texts. There is an overwhelming amount of fiction, particularly short stories.
	REQUIRED **3b)** Materials include texts of different formats (e.g., print and non-print, including film, art, music, charts, etc.) and lengths.	**No**	Most texts are literary prose, particularly short stories. There are few texts that represent other genres. Those varied texts that do exist are confined to a single unit of study; therefore, there is no diversity within the unit.
	3c) Materials include many informational texts with an informational text structure rather than a narrative structure; grades 6-12 include literary nonfiction.	**No**	The focus on informational text seems to be narrative in structure, and students have little engagement with complex informational text.
	3d) Additional materials increase the opportunity for regular, accountable independent reading of texts that appeal to students' interests to build reading stamina, confidence, motivation, and enjoyment and connect to classroom concepts or topics to develop knowledge.	**No**	There are no suggestions for independent reading.

CRITERIA	INDICATORS OF SUPERIOR QUALITY	MEETS METRICS (Y/N)	JUSTIFICATION/ COMMENTS
II. Foundational Skills (grades 3-5 only)			
Tier 1 and 2 Non-Negotiable* **4. FOUNDATIONAL SKILLS:** Materials provide instruction and diagnostic support in concepts of print, phonics, vocabulary, development, syntax, and fluency in a logical and transparent progression. These foundational skills are necessary and central components of an effective, comprehensive reading program designed to develop proficient readers with the capacity to comprehend texts across a range of types and disciplines. ☐ Yes ☐ No *As applicable (e.g., when the scope of the materials is comprehensive and considered a full program)	**REQUIRED** **4a)** Materials demand knowledge of grade-level phonic patterns and word analysis skills.		Not applicable.
	REQUIRED **4b)** Materials encourage students to use context to confirm or self-correct word recognition and understanding, directing students to reread purposefully to acquire accurate meaning.		Not applicable.
	REQUIRED **4c)** Materials provide instruction and practice in word study, including systematic examination of grade-level morphology, decoding of multisyllabic words by using syllabication, and automaticity with grade-level regular and irregular spelling patterns.		Not applicable.
	REQUIRED **4d)** Opportunities are frequently built into the materials that allow for students to achieve reading fluency in oral and silent reading, that is, to read on-level prose and poetry with accuracy, rate appropriate to the text, and expression.		Not applicable.
	REQUIRED **4e)** Materials guide students to read grade-level text with purpose and understanding.		Not applicable.

CRITERIA	INDICATORS OF SUPERIOR QUALITY	MEETS METRICS (Y/N)	JUSTIFICATION/ COMMENTS
III. Questions and Tasks			
Non-Negotiable 5. TEXT-DEPENDENT QUESTIONS: Text-dependent questions and tasks reflect the requirements of Reading Standard 1 by requiring use of textual evidence in support of meeting other grade-specific standards. ☐ Yes ■ No	**REQUIRED** **5a)** At least 80% of all questions in the materials are text-dependent questions; student ideas are expressed through both written and spoken responses.	**No**	There are few text-dependent questions for the reading selections, but they are weak. Questions are predominately literal. There is no evidence of students expressing their ideas through written or spoken responses. Rather, all questions appear via end-of-unit, multiple-choice, computer-based format.
	REQUIRED **5b)** Coherent sequences of text-dependent questions elicit sustained attention to the text and its illustrations (as applicable), its impact (including the building of knowledge), and its connection to other texts.	**No**	The included questions are not sequenced to sustain attention to the texts. There are no connections to other texts.
	REQUIRED **5c)** Questions include the language of the standards, and assess the depth and complexity required by the standards at each grade-level over time to advance and deepen student learning. *(**Note:** not every standard must be assessed with every text.)*	**No**	The questions do not utilize the language of the standards.
	5d) Questions and tasks often begin with comprehension of the text before focusing on interpretation or evaluation.	**No**	The practice questions included do not move from comprehension to analysis. There are almost no evaluation tasks.
	5e) Questions support students in unpacking the academic language (vocabulary and syntax) prevalent in complex texts to determine meaning from texts and in learning new vocabulary from reading.	**Yes**	The vocabulary questions included extracted sentences from the text and ask students to use a variety of strategies to discern literal and figurative meaning and origin.
6. ASSESSMENT: Materials offer assessment opportunities that genuinely measure progress and elicit direct, observable evidence of the degree to which students can independently demonstrate the assessed grade-specific standards with appropriately complex text(s). ☐ Yes ■ No	**REQUIRED** **6a)** Measurement of progress via assessments should include gradual release of supporting scaffolds for students to measure their independent abilities.	**No**	There are short multiple-choice quizzes after each text. These do not provide any scaffolding for students. Furthermore, these questions are predominately literal.
	REQUIRED **6b)** Aligned rubrics or assessment guidelines (such as scoring guides or student work exemplars) are included and provide sufficient guidance for interpreting student performance.	**No**	Quizzes have correct answers listed for instructors, but not enough guidance to interpret student performance.
	REQUIRED	**No**	Students complete short multiple-choice

CRITERIA	INDICATORS OF SUPERIOR QUALITY	MEETS METRICS (Y/N)	JUSTIFICATION/ COMMENTS
III. Questions and Tasks			
	6c) Materials use varied modes of assessment, including a range of pre-, formative, summative and self-assessment measures.		quizzes with few short-answer questions and occasional writing prompts that are unrelated to the text under consideration. Many items assess lecture and prior knowledge rather than the text of study.
	6d) Materials assess student proficiency using methods that are unbiased and accessible to all students.	**No**	

CRITERIA	INDICATORS OF SUPERIOR QUALITY	MEETS METRICS (Y/N)	JUSTIFICATION/ COMMENTS
IV. Scaffolding and Support			
7. SCAFFOLDING AND SUPPORT: Materials provide all students, including those who read below grade level, with extensive opportunities and support to encounter and comprehend grade-level complex text as required by the standards. ☐ Yes ■ No	**REQUIRED** **7a)** Pre-reading activities and suggested approaches to teacher scaffolding are focused and engage students with understanding the text itself. Pre-reading activities should be no more than 10% of time devoted to any reading instruction.	**No**	Pre-reading activities include Power Point lectures with a preponderance of front loading about the text. The time devoted to these activities is far more than 10%. There are no supports or scaffolds built into the actual instruction with the text. All reading is done independently through a third-party internet site.
	REQUIRED **7b)** Materials do not confuse or substitute mastery of strategies for full comprehension of text; reading strategies support comprehension of specific texts and focus on building knowledge and insight. Texts must not serve as platforms to practice discrete strategies.	**No**	Full comprehension of text is not assessed. Strategies are the only focus of the units of study. There is no building of knowledge or insight. The texts of the unit have been selected to showcase textual elements or strategies.
	REQUIRED **7c)** Materials regularly direct teachers to return to focused parts of the text to guide students through rereading, discussion and writing about the ideas, events, and information found there.	**No**	Students engage with the text only once. There is no guidance for rereading, discussion, or connection to writing.
	REQUIRED **7d)** The materials are easy to use and cleanly laid out for students and teachers. Each page of the submission adds to student learning rather than distracts from it. The reading selections are centrally located within the materials and obviously the center of focus.	**Yes**	The materials are all live links from third-party websites. They are easy to access, provided the links remain active.
	7e) Appropriate suggestions and materials are provided for supporting varying student needs at the unit and lesson level (e.g., alternate teaching approaches, pacing, instructional delivery options, suggestions for addressing common student difficulties to meet standards, remediation strategies or suggestions for supporting texts, suggestions for more advanced texts for extension, etc.).	**No**	There are no suggestions made for varying and supporting student learning. There are no pacing guides, etc. There is a teacher's resource page, but it merely provides links to discussion boards and surveys.
	7f) The content can be reasonably completed within a regular school year and the pacing of content allows for maximum student understanding. The materials provide guidance about the amount of time a task might reasonably take.	**Yes**	There are ten units; however the content would not require a full year to complete. Additional instruction would probably be required to fill time constraints of a traditional yearlong schedule.

CRITERIA	INDICATORS OF SUPERIOR QUALITY	MEETS METRICS (Y/N)	JUSTIFICATION/ COMMENTS
V. Writing to Sources and Research			
8. WRITING TO SOURCES: The majority of written tasks are text-dependent and reflect the writing genres named in the standards. ☐ Yes ■ No	**REQUIRED** **8a)** A vast majority of written tasks at all grade levels require students to analyze and synthesize sources, as well as to present careful analysis, well-defended claims and clear information, drawing on textual evidence and to support valid inferences from text.	**No**	There are few tasks that require students to analyze and synthesize sources. There is no mention of claims and textual evidence in any of the prompts. For example, students are asked: "In what ways do you relate to the narrator of this story?" No further instruction is given in the prompt.
	REQUIRED **8b)** Materials include multiple writing tasks aligned to the three modes of writing (opinion/argumentative, informative, narrative) as well as blended modes (i.e., analytical writing); narrative prompts decrease in number and increase in being based on text(s) as student progress through the grades, e.g., narrative description (text-based, chronological writing) rather than imaginative narratives.	**No**	Writing addresses multiple modes but prompts do not meet the rigor of the standards. For example, students are asked to finish a paragraph when provided a topic sentence. Writings do not require textual evidence or literary analysis.
	REQUIRED **8c)** Writing opportunities for students are prominent and varied in length and time demands (e.g., notes, summaries, short-answer responses, formal essays, on-demand and process writing, etc.).	**Yes**	There are many opportunities for writing within the sets of "practice" questions. They seem to be varied in length; however, the task/prompts often lack in rigor.
	REQUIRED **8d)** Materials build in opportunities for connections and alignment between writing, speaking and listening, reading, and the language standards. For example, students read a text, work collaboratively to develop a plan for analyzing or emulating the text, write a response, and then share their writing with a peer who reviews the writing against using a peer review checklist.	**No**	Alignment between writing, speaking, listening, reading and language standards does not exist.
	8e) Materials engage students in many short research projects annually to develop the expertise needed to conduct research independently.	**No**	Only one writing prompt is related to research

CRITERIA	INDICATORS OF SUPERIOR QUALITY	MEETS METRICS (Y/N)	JUSTIFICATION/ COMMENTS
VI. Speaking and Listening			
9. SPEAKING AND LISTENING: Oral tasks must be text-dependent and materials for speaking and listening must reflect true communication skills required for college and career readiness. ☐ Yes ■ No	**REQUIRED** **9a)** Texts used in speaking and listening questions and tasks must meet the criteria for complexity, range, and quality of texts (Criteria 1, 2, and 3).	**No**	There are no speaking and listening components to the curriculum.
	REQUIRED **9b)** Materials demand that students engage effectively in a range of conversations and collaborations by expressing well-supported ideas clearly and probing ideas under discussion by building on others' ideas.	**No**	There are no speaking and listening components to the curriculum.
	REQUIRED **9c)** Materials build in frequent opportunities for connections and alignment between speaking and listening, reading, writing, and the language standards. Examples: Materials build in frequent opportunities for discussion about texts and, through directions and modeling, encourage students to use academic language and grade-appropriate oral language conventions; materials require students to gather and use evidence to orally present findings from research.	**No**	There are no speaking and listening components to the curriculum.
	9d) Materials develop active listening skills, such as taking notes on main ideas, asking relevant questions, and elaborating on remarks of others.	**Yes**	As most of the curriculum requires students to listen attentively to lecture, note taking would be reinforced. However, because all lectures are recorded, there would not be opportunity for asking questions or elaborating on remarks of others.

CRITERIA	INDICATORS OF SUPERIOR QUALITY	MEETS METRICS (Y/N)	JUSTIFICATION/ COMMENTS
VII. Language			
10. LANGUAGE: Materials must adequately address the Language standards for the grade, including through unpacking the vocabulary and syntax of text(s) (indicator 5e) as models of language use. ☐ Yes ■ No	**REQUIRED** **10a)** Materials address the grammar and language conventions specified by the Language standards at each grade level and build on those standards that build from previous grade levels, as indicated by pages 30 and 56 of the standards.	**No**	The grammar lessons are disjointed and not focused on the standards. In one unit there is a focus on word-study and in the next, fragments.
	REQUIRED **10b)** Materials expect students to confront their own error patterns in usage and conventions (oral and written) and correct them.	**Yes**	Students, sometimes, go through revising process, but this is not included in every writing "lesson" and is not representative of the necessary frequency or rigor.
	REQUIRED **10c)** Materials encourage students to examine the language of texts (vocabulary, sentences, structure) and model their own writing after texts they are listening to or reading as a way to develop more complex sentence structure and language usage.	**No**	Students do not use texts to model their own writing.
	REQUIRED **10d)** Materials build in frequent opportunities for connections and alignment between the language standards, writing, reading, and speaking and listening. For example, through directions and modeling, materials encourage students to use grade-appropriate language conventions when speaking and writing about texts.	**No**	Alignment between writing, speaking, listening, reading, and language standards does not exist.
	10e) Materials provide real-world activities for student practice with natural language (e.g. mock interviews, presentations).	**No**	There are limited real-world activities.

Tier 1 ratings receive a "Yes" in Column 1 for Criteria 1-10.
Tier 2 ratings receive a "Yes" in Column 1 for all non-negotiable criteria (Foundational Skills (as applicable), Complexity of Texts, Quality of Texts, and Text-Dependent Questions), but at least one "No" in Column 1 for the remaining criteria.
Tier 3 ratings receive a "No" in Column 1 for at least one of the non-negotiable criteria.

FINAL EVALUATION			
Compile the results for Sections I-VII to make a final decision for the material under review.			
Section	**Criteria**	**Y/N**	**Final Justification/Comments**
I: Text Selection	1. Complexity of Texts **(Non-Negotiable)**	**No**	Literary texts do align to the complexity level of exemplars from Appendix B; however, there is no evidence of method.
	2. Quality of Texts **(Non-Negotiable)**	**No**	While literary texts are of the appropriate complexity level, there is no building of knowledge across units or the year.
	3. Range and Volume of Texts	**No**	There is no balance between literary and informational sources.
II: Foundational Skills	4. Foundational Skills **(Non-Negotiable*)**		
III: Text-Dependent Questions and Tasks	5. Text-Dependent Questions **(Non-Negotiable)**	**No**	There are few text dependent questions embedded in the text resources.
	6. Assessment	**No**	Assessment is limited and usually focuses on information gained from lecture rather than actual engagement with the text.
IV: Scaffolding and Support	7. Scaffolding and Support	**No**	There are no supports or scaffolds built into the actual instruction with the text.
V: Writing to Sources and Research	8. Writing to Sources	**No**	Writing prompts are often skill based and do not require students to analyze sources or claims.
VI: Speaking and Listening	9. Speaking and Listening	**No**	There are no speaking and listening components to the curriculum.
VII: Language	10. Language	**No**	Grammar lessons do not align to the standards for the grade band.
FINAL DECISION FOR THIS MATERIAL: <u>Tier III, Not representing quality</u>			

*As applicable (e.g., when the scope of the materials is comprehensive and considered a full program)

Instructional Materials Evaluation Tool for Alignment in ELA Grades 3 -12 (IMET)

The goal for ELA students is that they can read and understand grade-level texts independently, as demonstrated through writing and speaking about those texts. A strong ELA classroom is structured with the below components.

Title: **Edgenuity Common Core English Language Arts** **Grade:** **11**

Publisher: **Edgenuity Inc.** **Copyright:** **2013**

Overall Rating: **Tier III, Not representing quality**

Tier I, Tier II, Tier III elements of this review:

STRONG	WEAK
	Complexity of Texts (Non-Negotiable)
	Quality of Texts (Non-Negotiable)
	Range and Volume of Texts
	Foundational Skills (Non-Negotiable*)
	Text-Dependent Questions (Non-Negotiable)
	Assessment
	Scaffolding and Support
	Writing to Sources
	Speaking and Listening
	Language

To evaluate each set of submitted materials for alignment with the standards, begin by reviewing Column 2 for the non-negotiable criteria. If there is a "Yes" for all required indicators in Column 2, then the materials receive a "Yes" in Column 1. If there is a "No" for any required indicators in Column 2, then the materials receive a "No" in Column 1. (Note: If materials do not represent a full curricula, then some of Criteria 1-10 may not apply.)

Tier 1 ratings receive a "Yes" in Column 1 for Criteria 1-10.
Tier 2 ratings receive a "Yes" in Column 1 for all non-negotiable criteria (Foundational Skills (as applicable), Complexity of Texts, Quality of Texts, and Text-Dependent Questions), but at least one "No" in Column 1 for the remaining criteria.
Tier 3 ratings receive a "No" in Column 1 for at least one of the non-negotiable criteria.

CRITERIA	INDICATORS OF SUPERIOR QUALITY	MEETS METRICS (Y/N)	JUSTIFICATION/ COMMENTS
I. Text Selection			
Tier 1 and 2 Non-Negotiable **1. COMPLEXITY OF TEXTS:** Materials present a progression of complex texts as stated by Reading Standard 10[1]. ☐ Yes ☐ No	**REQUIRED** **1a)** Materials provide texts that fall within grade-level complexity bands, indicating that quantitative measures and qualitative analysis[2] were used in selection of texts. Poetry and drama are analyzed only using qualitative measures.	**No**	While most literary pieces do fall with grade level complexity bands, many of the informational texts do not meet the appropriate complexity level.
	REQUIRED **1b)** Texts for each grade align with the requirements outlined in the standards and with the complexity of exemplars provided in Appendix B.	**No**	While some texts do align with exemplars provided in Appendix B, informational sources do not align.
	REQUIRED **1c)** Texts increase in complexity as materials progress across grade bands. Read-aloud texts follow the same trend, although they may have greater variability because listening skills in elementary school generally outpace reading skills.	**No**	Texts do not increase in complexity across units or the course of the year.
Tier 1 and 2 Non-Negotiable **2. QUALITY OF TEXTS:** Texts are of sufficient scope and quality to provide text-centered and integrated learning that is sequenced and scaffolded to advance students toward independent reading of grade level texts and build content knowledge (ELA, social studies, science and technical subjects, and the arts). The quality of texts is high—they support multiple readings for various	**REQUIRED** **2a)** 90% of texts are worth reading in the particular grade (i.e., serve an instructional purpose); they are content rich and well crafted, representing the quality of writing that is produced by authorities in the discipline and include texts from history/social studies, science, technical subjects, and the arts.	**No**	While all literary texts included are worth reading and are rich in content and craft; informational texts from other disciplines are lacking.
	REQUIRED **2b)** Materials provide a sequence or collection of texts that build knowledge systematically through reading, writing, listening and speaking about topics or ideas under study.	**No**	There is no clear building of knowledge across units or the year. Texts appear to be stand-alone instruction with most of the focus on building knowledge from teacher lecture rather than students' experience with text.

[1] Grades 3-12 Example: Texts present vocabulary, syntax, text structures, levels of meaning/purpose similar to exemplars in Appendix B.
[2] The process for determining quantitative and qualitative measures is described in the Supplement to Appendix A. Grade band conversions for quantitative measures are determined using the chart on page 4 of the document. A description of the criteria for analyzing the qualitative features of the text is located on pages 4-6 of the document.

CRITERIA	INDICATORS OF SUPERIOR QUALITY	MEETS METRICS (Y/N)	JUSTIFICATION/ COMMENTS
I. Text Selection			
purposes and exhibit exceptional craft and thought and/or provide useful information. ☐ Yes ■ No	**REQUIRED** **2c)** Within a sequence or collection of texts, specific anchor texts of grade--level complexity are selected for multiple, careful readings.	**No**	Anchor texts are not identified. Most units have only one text, and students do not complete multiple, careful readings to increase understanding.
	2d) Nearly all texts are previously published rather than "commissioned."	**Yes**	All texts are previously published.
3. RANGE AND VOLUME OF TEXTS: Materials reflect the distribution of text types and genres suggested by the standards: Text types and genres generally reflect the definitions provided on page 31 (grades K-5) and page 57 (grades 6-12) of the standards and included in the text of the standards (e.g., RL.2.9, RL.9-10.6, RI.7.7, or RI.11-12.9). ☐ Yes ■ No	**REQUIRED** **3a)** In grades K-12, ELA materials seek a balance in instructional time between 50% literature/ 50% informational texts.	**No**	There is no balance between literary and informational texts.
	REQUIRED **3b)** Materials include texts of different formats (e.g., print and non-print, including film, art, music, charts, etc.) and lengths.	**No**	Most texts are literary prose or poetry. There are no other formats of text.
	3c) Materials include many informational texts with an informational text structure rather than a narrative structure; grades 6-12 include literary nonfiction.	**No**	The focus on informational text seems to be narrative in structure, and students have little engagement with complex informational text.
	3d) Additional materials increase the opportunity for regular, accountable independent reading of texts that appeal to students' interests to build reading stamina, confidence, motivation, and enjoyment and connect to classroom concepts or topics to develop knowledge.	**No**	There are no suggestions for independent reading.

CRITERIA	INDICATORS OF SUPERIOR QUALITY	MEETS METRICS (Y/N)	JUSTIFICATION/ COMMENTS
II. Foundational Skills (grades 3-5 only)			
Tier 1 and 2 Non-Negotiable* **4. FOUNDATIONAL SKILLS:** Materials provide instruction and diagnostic support in concepts of print, phonics, vocabulary, development, syntax, and fluency in a logical and transparent progression. These foundational skills are necessary and central components of an effective, comprehensive reading program designed to develop proficient readers with the capacity to comprehend texts across a range of types and disciplines. ☐ Yes ☐ No *As applicable (e.g., when the scope of the materials is comprehensive and considered a full program)	**REQUIRED** **4a)** Materials demand knowledge of grade-level phonic patterns and word analysis skills.		Not applicable.
	REQUIRED **4b)** Materials encourage students to use context to confirm or self-correct word recognition and understanding, directing students to reread purposefully to acquire accurate meaning.		Not applicable.
	REQUIRED **4c)** Materials provide instruction and practice in word study, including systematic examination of grade-level morphology, decoding of multisyllabic words by using syllabication, and automaticity with grade-level regular and irregular spelling patterns.		Not applicable.
	REQUIRED **4d)** Opportunities are frequently built into the materials that allow for students to achieve reading fluency in oral and silent reading, that is, to read on-level prose and poetry with accuracy, rate appropriate to the text, and expression.		Not applicable.
	REQUIRED **4e)** Materials guide students to read grade-level text with purpose and understanding.		Not applicable.

CRITERIA	INDICATORS OF SUPERIOR QUALITY	MEETS METRICS (Y/N)	JUSTIFICATION/ COMMENTS
III. Questions and Tasks			
Non-Negotiable 5. TEXT-DEPENDENT QUESTIONS: Text-dependent questions and tasks reflect the requirements of Reading Standard 1 by requiring use of textual evidence in support of meeting other grade-specific standards. ☐ Yes ☒ No	**REQUIRED** **5a)** At least 80% of all questions in the materials are text-dependent questions; student ideas are expressed through both written and spoken responses.	**No**	Questions for instruction and engagement with the text are available in digital form, but are limited in number. There is no evidence of students expressing their ideas through written or spoken responses. Rather, all questions appear via end-of-unit, multiple-choice, computer-based format.
	REQUIRED **5b)** Coherent sequences of text-dependent questions elicit sustained attention to the text and its illustrations (as applicable), its impact (including the building of knowledge), and its connection to other texts.	**No**	Although materials provide some digital questions prompting student attention to the text and its impact, connections to other texts are not made.
	REQUIRED **5c)** Questions include the language of the standards, and assess the depth and complexity required by the standards at each grade-level over time to advance and deepen student learning. *(**Note:** not every standard must be assessed with every text.)*	**No**	Quiz questions and text questions include the language of the standards and mimic PARCC prototypes. For example, after reading *The Declaration of Independence,* students are prompted to "Check the **three** statements that help Jefferson advance his argument for why the colonies should break free" and asked "Jefferson delays mentioning the American colonies until late in the introduction. How does this delay affect his argument? Check the **two** best answers."
	5d) Questions and tasks often begin with comprehension of the text before focusing on interpretation or evaluation.	**No**	The practice questions included do not move from comprehension to analysis. There are almost no evaluation tasks.
	5e) Questions support students in unpacking the academic language (vocabulary and syntax) prevalent in complex texts to determine meaning from texts and in learning new vocabulary from reading.	**No**	While vocabulary activities were included in the materials, there is not enough evidence that students are supported in unpacking new, complex vocabulary while reading. There are a few, isolated "word choice" activities

CRITERIA	INDICATORS OF SUPERIOR QUALITY	MEETS METRICS (Y/N)	JUSTIFICATION/ COMMENTS
III. Questions and Tasks			
6. ASSESSMENT: Materials offer assessment opportunities that genuinely measure progress and elicit direct, observable evidence of the degree to which students can independently demonstrate the assessed grade-specific standards with appropriately complex text(s). ☐ Yes ■ No	**REQUIRED** **6a)** Measurement of progress via assessments should include gradual release of supporting scaffolds for students to measure their independent abilities.	**No**	There are short quizzes after each text. These do not provide any scaffolding for students.
	REQUIRED **6b)** Aligned rubrics or assessment guidelines (such as scoring guides or student work exemplars) are included and provide sufficient guidance for interpreting student performance.	**No**	Quizzes have correct answers listed for instructors, but not enough guidance to interpret student performance.
	REQUIRED **6c)** Materials use varied modes of assessment, including a range of pre-, formative, summative and self-assessment measures.	**No**	Students complete short multiple choice quizzes and occasional writing prompts that are unrelated to the text under consideration.
	6d) Materials assess student proficiency using methods that are unbiased and accessible to all students.	**No**	Many items assess lecture and prior knowledge rather than the text under consideration.

CRITERIA	INDICATORS OF SUPERIOR QUALITY	MEETS METRICS (Y/N)	JUSTIFICATION/ COMMENTS
IV. Scaffolding and Support			
7. SCAFFOLDING AND SUPPORT: Materials provide all students, including those who read below grade level, with extensive opportunities and support to encounter and comprehend grade-level complex text as required by the standards. ☐ Yes ■ No	**REQUIRED** **7a)** Pre-reading activities and suggested approaches to teacher scaffolding are focused and engage students with understanding the text itself. Pre-reading activities should be no more than 10% of time devoted to any reading instruction.	**No**	Pre-reading activities include PowerPoint lectures with a majority of front loading about the text. There are no supports or scaffolds built into the actual instruction with the text. All reading is done independently through a third-party internet site.
	REQUIRED **7b)** Materials do not confuse or substitute mastery of strategies for full comprehension of text; reading strategies support comprehension of specific texts and focus on building knowledge and insight. Texts must not serve as platforms to practice discrete strategies.	**No**	Full comprehension of text is not assessed. Strategies are the sole focus of some of the included texts.

CRITERIA	INDICATORS OF SUPERIOR QUALITY	MEETS METRICS (Y/N)	JUSTIFICATION/ COMMENTS
	REQUIRED **7c)** Materials regularly direct teachers to return to focused parts of the text to guide students through rereading, discussion and writing about the ideas, events, and information found there.	**No**	Students engage with the text only once. There is no guidance for rereading, discussion, or connection to writing.
	REQUIRED **7d)** The materials are easy to use and cleanly laid out for students and teachers. Each page of the submission adds to student learning rather than distracts from it. The reading selections are centrally located within the materials and obviously the center of focus.	**Yes**	The materials are all live links from third-party websites. They are easy to access, provided the links remain active.
	7e) Appropriate suggestions and materials are provided for supporting varying student needs at the unit and lesson level (e.g., alternate teaching approaches, pacing, instructional delivery options, suggestions for addressing common student difficulties to meet standards, remediation strategies or suggestions for supporting texts, suggestions for more advanced texts for extension, etc.).	**No**	Varying supports and alternate approaches are not suggested.
	7f) The content can be reasonably completed within a regular school year and the pacing of content allows for maximum student understanding. The materials provide guidance about the amount of time a task might reasonably take.	**Yes**	The content would not require a full year to complete. Additional instruction would probably be required to fill time constraints of a traditional year-long schedule.

CRITERIA	INDICATORS OF SUPERIOR QUALITY	MEETS METRICS (Y/N)	JUSTIFICATION/ COMMENTS
V. Writing to Sources and Research			
8. WRITING TO SOURCES: The majority of written tasks are text-dependent and reflect the writing genres named in the standards. ☐ Yes ☒ No	**REQUIRED** **8a)** A vast majority of written tasks at all grade levels require students to analyze and synthesize sources, as well as to present careful analysis, well-defended claims and clear information, drawing on textual evidence and to support valid inferences from text.	**No**	Writing prompts are often skill based and do not require students to analyze sources or claims. For example, one prompt says "People define wisdom in a variety of ways. How would you define it?"
	REQUIRED **8b)** Materials include multiple writing tasks aligned to the three modes of writing (opinion/argumentative, informative, narrative) as well as blended modes (i.e., analytical writing); narrative prompts decrease in number and increase in being based on text(s) as student progress through the grades, e.g., narrative description (text-based, chronological writing) rather than imaginative narratives.	**No**	Writing addresses multiple modes but prompts do not meet the rigor of the standards. For example students are asked to identify the skills most needed by an individual to be successful at work. Writings do not require textual evidence or literary analysis.
	REQUIRED **8c)** Writing opportunities for students are prominent and varied in length and time demands (e.g., notes, summaries, short-answer responses, formal essays, on-demand and process writing, etc.).	**No**	Writing prompts are limited to once per unit rather than embedded in instruction.
	REQUIRED **8d)** Materials build in opportunities for connections and alignment between writing, speaking and listening, reading, and the language standards. For example, students read a text, work collaboratively to develop a plan for analyzing or emulating the text, write a response, and then share their writing with a peer who reviews the writing against using a peer review checklist.	**No**	Alignment between writing, speaking and listening, reading, and language standards does not exist.
	8e) Materials engage students in many short research projects annually to develop the expertise needed to conduct research independently.	**No**	Only one writing prompt is related to research.

CRITERIA	INDICATORS OF SUPERIOR QUALITY	MEETS METRICS (Y/N)	JUSTIFICATION/ COMMENTS
VI. Speaking and Listening			
9. SPEAKING AND LISTENING: Oral tasks must be text-dependent and materials for speaking and listening must reflect true communication skills required for college and career readiness. ☐ Yes ■ No	**REQUIRED** **9a)** Texts used in speaking and listening questions and tasks must meet the criteria for complexity, range, and quality of texts (Criteria 1, 2, and 3).	**No**	There are no speaking and listening components to the curriculum.
	REQUIRED **9b)** Materials demand that students engage effectively in a range of conversations and collaborations by expressing well-supported ideas clearly and probing ideas under discussion by building on others' ideas.	**No**	There are no speaking and listening components to the curriculum.
	REQUIRED **9c)** Materials build in frequent opportunities for connections and alignment between speaking and listening, reading, writing, and the language standards. Examples: Materials build in frequent opportunities for discussion about texts and, through directions and modeling, encourage students to use academic language and grade-appropriate oral language conventions; materials require students to gather and use evidence to orally present findings from research.	**No**	There are no speaking and listening components to the curriculum.
	9d) Materials develop active listening skills, such as taking notes on main ideas, asking relevant questions, and elaborating on remarks of others.	**Yes**	As most of the curriculum requires students to listen attentively to lecture, note taking would be reinforced. However, because all lecture is recorded, there would not be opportunity for asking questions or elaborating on remarks of others.

CRITERIA	INDICATORS OF SUPERIOR QUALITY	MEETS METRICS (Y/N)	JUSTIFICATION/ COMMENTS
VII. Language			
10. LANGUAGE: Materials must adequately address the Language standards for the grade, including through unpacking the vocabulary and syntax of text(s) (indicator 5e) as models of language use. ☐ Yes ■ No	**REQUIRED** **10a)** Materials address the grammar and language conventions specified by the Language standards at each grade level and build on those standards that build from previous grade levels, as indicated by pages 30 and 56 of the standards.	**No**	Grammar lessons do not align to the standards for the grade band. Students complete narrative reading on grammar such as what are the uses of different end punctuation marks, what is the difference between denotation and connotation of a word, and reading a list of commonly misspelled words. Grammar is not addressed in context.
	REQUIRED **10b)** Materials expect students to confront their own error patterns in usage and conventions (oral and written) and correct them.	**No**	Students do not confront their own errors in writing.
	REQUIRED **10c)** Materials encourage students to examine the language of texts (vocabulary, sentences, structure) and model their own writing after texts they are listening to or reading as a way to develop more complex sentence structure and language usage.	**No**	Students do not use texts to model their own writing.
	REQUIRED **10d)** Materials build in frequent opportunities for connections and alignment between the language standards, writing, reading, and speaking and listening. For example, through directions and modeling, materials encourage students to use grade-appropriate language conventions when speaking and writing about texts.	**No**	Alignment between writing, speaking and listening, reading, and language standards does not exist.
	10e) Materials provide real-world activities for student practice with natural language (e.g. mock interviews, presentations).	**No**	There are limited real-world activities.

Tier 1 ratings receive a "Yes" in Column 1 for Criteria 1-10.
Tier 2 ratings receive a "Yes" in Column 1 for all non-negotiable criteria (Foundational Skills (as applicable), Complexity of Texts, Quality of Texts, and Text-Dependent Questions), but at least one "No" in Column 1 for the remaining criteria.
Tier 3 ratings receive a "No" in Column 1 for at least one of the non-negotiable criteria.

FINAL EVALUATION			
Compile the results for Sections I-VII to make a final decision for the material under review.			
Section	**Criteria**	**Y/N**	**Final Justification/Comments**
I: Text Selection	1. Complexity of Texts **(Non-Negotiable)**	**No**	Literary texts do align to the complexity level of exemplars from Appendix B; however, informational texts do not.
	2. Quality of Texts **(Non-Negotiable)**	**No**	While literary texts are of the appropriate complexity level, there is no building of knowledge across units or the year.
	3. Range and Volume of Texts	**No**	There is no balance between literary and informational sources.
II: Foundational Skills	4. Foundational Skills **(Non-Negotiable*)**		
III: Text-Dependent Questions and Tasks	5. Text-Dependent Questions **(Non-Negotiable)**	**No**	There are no text dependent questions embedded in the text resources.
	6. Assessment	**No**	Assessment is limited and usually focuses on information gained from lecture rather than actual engagement with the text.
IV: Scaffolding and Support	7. Scaffolding and Support	**No**	There are no supports or scaffolds built into the actual instruction with the text.
V: Writing to Sources and Research	8. Writing to Sources	**No**	Writing prompts are often skill based and do not require students to analyze sources or claims.
VI: Speaking and Listening	9. Speaking and Listening	**No**	There are no speaking and listening components to the curriculum.
VII: Language	10. Language	**No**	Grammar lessons do not align to the standards for the grade band.
FINAL DECISION FOR THIS MATERIAL: Tier III, Not representing quality			

*As applicable (e.g., when the scope of the materials is comprehensive and considered a full program)

Instructional Materials Evaluation Tool for Alignment in ELA Grades 3 -12 (IMET)

The goal for ELA students is that they can read and understand grade-level texts independently, as demonstrated through writing and speaking about those texts. A strong ELA classroom is structured with the below components.

Title: **Edgenuity Common Core English Language Arts** **Grade:** **12**

Publisher: **Edgenuity Inc.** **Copyright:** **2012**

Overall Rating: **Tier III, Not representing quality**

Tier I, Tier II, Tier III elements of this review:

STRONG	WEAK
	Complexity of Texts (Non-Negotiable)
	Quality of Texts (Non-Negotiable)
	Range and Volume of Texts
	Foundational Skills (Non-Negotiable*)
	Text-Dependent Questions (Non-Negotiable)
	Assessment
	Scaffolding and Support
	Writing to Sources
	Speaking and Listening
	Language

To evaluate each set of submitted materials for alignment with the standards, begin by reviewing Column 2 for the non-negotiable criteria. If there is a "Yes" for all required indicators in Column 2, then the materials receive a "Yes" in Column 1. If there is a "No" for any required indicators in Column 2, then the materials receive a "No" in Column 1. (Note: If materials do not represent a full curricula, then some of Criteria 1-10 may not apply.)

Tier 1 ratings receive a "Yes" in Column 1 for Criteria 1-10.
Tier 2 ratings receive a "Yes" in Column 1 for all non-negotiable criteria (Foundational Skills (as applicable), Complexity of Texts, Quality of Texts, and Text-Dependent Questions), but at least one "No" in Column 1 for the remaining criteria.
Tier 3 ratings receive a "No" in Column 1 for at least one of the non-negotiable criteria.

CRITERIA	INDICATORS OF SUPERIOR QUALITY	MEETS METRICS (Y/N)	JUSTIFICATION/ COMMENTS
I. Text Selection			
Tier 1 and 2 Non-Negotiable **1. COMPLEXITY OF TEXTS:** Materials present a progression of complex texts as stated by Reading Standard 10[1]. ☐ Yes ■ No	**REQUIRED** **1a)** Materials provide texts that fall within grade-level complexity bands, indicating that quantitative measures and qualitative analysis[2] were used in selection of texts. Poetry and drama are analyzed only using qualitative measures.	**No**	While most literary pieces do fall with grade level complexity bands, many of the informational texts do not meet the appropriate complexity level. For example "Weather and the Mind" has an approximate Lexile level of 1020, well below the 11-12 grade band.
	REQUIRED **1b)** Texts for each grade align with the requirements outlined in the standards and with the complexity of exemplars provided in Appendix B.	**No**	While some texts do align with exemplars provided in Appendix B, informational sources do not align. *Macbeth* is an Appendix B literary text exemplar for grades 9-10, but it is a 12th grade text in these materials.
	REQUIRED **1c)** Texts increase in complexity as materials progress across grade bands. Read-aloud texts follow the same trend, although they may have greater variability because listening skills in elementary school generally outpace reading skills.	**No**	Texts do not increase in complexity across units or the course of the year, but rather follow the chronology of British Literature augmented by units on World Literature and Communication.
Tier 1 and 2 Non-Negotiable **2. QUALITY OF TEXTS:** Texts are of sufficient scope and quality to provide text-centered and integrated learning that is sequenced and scaffolded to advance students toward independent reading of grade level texts and build content knowledge (ELA, social studies, science	**REQUIRED** **2a)** 90% of texts are worth reading in the particular grade (i.e., serve an instructional purpose); they are content rich and well crafted, representing the quality of writing that is produced by authorities in the discipline and include texts from history/social studies, science, technical subjects, and the arts.	**No**	While all literary texts included are worth reading and are rich in content and craft; informational texts from other disciplines are lacking.
	REQUIRED **2b)** Materials provide a sequence or collection of texts that build knowledge systematically through reading, writing, listening and speaking about topics or	**No**	There is no clear building of knowledge across units or the year. Texts appear to be stand-alone instruction with most of

[1] Grades 3-12 Example: Texts present vocabulary, syntax, text structures, levels of meaning/purpose similar to exemplars in Appendix B.
[2] The process for determining quantitative and qualitative measures is described in the Supplement to Appendix A. Grade band conversions for quantitative measures are determined using the chart on page 4 of the document. A description of the criteria for analyzing the qualitative features of the text is located on pages 4-6 of the document.

CRITERIA	INDICATORS OF SUPERIOR QUALITY	MEETS METRICS (Y/N)	JUSTIFICATION/ COMMENTS
I. Text Selection			
and technical subjects, and the arts). The quality of texts is high—they support multiple readings for various purposes and exhibit exceptional craft and thought and/or provide useful information. ☐ Yes ■ No	ideas under study.		the focus on building knowledge from teacher lecture rather than student engagement with text.
	REQUIRED **2c)** Within a sequence or collection of texts, specific anchor texts of grade--level complexity are selected for multiple, careful readings.	**No**	Anchor texts are not identified. Most units have only one text, and students do not complete multiple, careful readings to increase understanding.
	2d) Nearly all texts are previously published rather than "commissioned."	**Yes**	All texts are previously published.
3. RANGE AND VOLUME OF TEXTS: Materials reflect the distribution of text types and genres suggested by the standards: Text types and genres generally reflect the definitions provided on page 31 (grades K-5) and page 57 (grades 6-12) of the standards and included in the text of the standards (e.g., RL.2.9, RL.9-10.6, RI.7.7, or RI.11-12.9). ☐ Yes ■ No	**REQUIRED** **3a)** In grades K-12, ELA materials seek a balance in instructional time between 50% literature/ 50% informational texts.	**No**	There is no balance between literary and informational texts. There are approximately 36 literary texts and only 12 informational texts, with the majority of informational texts being narrative in nature.
	REQUIRED **3b)** Materials include texts of different formats (e.g., print and non-print, including film, art, music, charts, etc.) and lengths.	**No**	Most texts are literary prose or poetry. There are no other formats of text.
	3c) Materials include many informational texts with an informational text structure rather than a narrative structure; grades 6-12 include literary nonfiction.	**No**	The focus on informational text seems to be narrative in structure, and students have little engagement with complex informational text.
	3d) Additional materials increase the opportunity for regular, accountable independent reading of texts that appeal to students' interests to build reading stamina, confidence, motivation, and enjoyment and connect to classroom concepts or topics to develop knowledge.	**No**	There are no suggestions for independent reading.

CRITERIA	INDICATORS OF SUPERIOR QUALITY	MEETS METRICS (Y/N)	JUSTIFICATION/ COMMENTS
II. Foundational Skills (grades 3-5 only)			
Tier 1 and 2 Non-Negotiable* **4. FOUNDATIONAL SKILLS:** Materials provide instruction and diagnostic support in concepts of print, phonics, vocabulary, development, syntax, and fluency in a logical and transparent progression. These foundational skills are necessary and central components of an effective, comprehensive reading program designed to develop proficient readers with the capacity to comprehend texts across a range of types and disciplines. ☐ Yes ☐ No *As applicable (e.g., when the scope of the materials is comprehensive and considered a full program)	**REQUIRED** **4a)** Materials demand knowledge of grade-level phonic patterns and word analysis skills.		
	REQUIRED **4b)** Materials encourage students to use context to confirm or self-correct word recognition and understanding, directing students to reread purposefully to acquire accurate meaning.		
	REQUIRED **4c)** Materials provide instruction and practice in word study, including systematic examination of grade-level morphology, decoding of multisyllabic words by using syllabication, and automaticity with grade-level regular and irregular spelling patterns.		
	REQUIRED **4d)** Opportunities are frequently built into the materials that allow for students to achieve reading fluency in oral and silent reading, that is, to read on-level prose and poetry with accuracy, rate appropriate to the text, and expression.		
	REQUIRED **4e)** Materials guide students to read grade-level text with purpose and understanding.		

CRITERIA	INDICATORS OF SUPERIOR QUALITY	MEETS METRICS (Y/N)	JUSTIFICATION/ COMMENTS
III. Questions and Tasks			
Non-Negotiable 5. TEXT-DEPENDENT QUESTIONS: Text-dependent questions and tasks reflect the requirements of Reading Standard 1 by requiring use of textual evidence in support of meeting other grade-specific standards. ☐ Yes ☐ No	**REQUIRED** **5a)** At least 80% of all questions in the materials are text-dependent questions; student ideas are expressed through both written and spoken responses.	**No**	Questions for instruction and engagement with the text (i.e. "online content questions") are not included in the instructional resources. Students read all text from independent internet sites.
	REQUIRED **5b)** Coherent sequences of text-dependent questions elicit sustained attention to the text and its illustrations (as applicable), its impact (including the building of knowledge), and its connection to other texts.	**No**	There are no questions to build sequencing around. Other grade levels have an assignment attached to the texts, but the texts at 12th grade are stand alone with the comment, "This lesson has no online content questions."
	REQUIRED **5c)** Questions include the language of the standards, and assess the depth and complexity required by the standards at each grade-level over time to advance and deepen student learning. ***(Note:** not every standard must be assessed with every text.)*	**No**	There are no questions to utilize the language of the standards. Other grade levels have an assignment attached to the texts, but the texts at 12th grade are stand alone with the comment, "This lesson has no online content questions."
	5d) Questions and tasks often begin with comprehension of the text before focusing on interpretation or evaluation.	**No**	There are no comprehension, interpretation or evaluation questions as students read text. Other grade levels have an assignment attached to the texts, but the texts at 12th grade are stand alone with the comment, "This lesson has no online content questions."
	5e) Questions support students in unpacking the academic language (vocabulary and syntax) prevalent in complex texts to determine meaning from texts and in learning new vocabulary from reading.	**No**	There are no questions related to vocabulary.
6. ASSESSMENT: Materials offer assessment opportunities that genuinely measure progress and elicit direct, observable evidence of the degree to which students can independently demonstrate the assessed grade-	**REQUIRED** **6a)** Measurement of progress via assessments should include gradual release of supporting scaffolds for students to measure their independent abilities.	**No**	There are short quizzes after each text. These do not provide any scaffolding for students.
	REQUIRED **6b)** Aligned rubrics or assessment guidelines (such as scoring guides or student work exemplars) are included and provide sufficient guidance for	**No**	Quizzes have correct answers listed for instructors, but not enough guidance to

CRITERIA	INDICATORS OF SUPERIOR QUALITY	MEETS METRICS (Y/N)	JUSTIFICATION/ COMMENTS
III. Questions and Tasks			
specific standards with appropriately complex text(s). ☐ Yes ■ No	interpreting student performance.		interpret student performance.
	REQUIRED **6c)** Materials use varied modes of assessment, including a range of pre-, formative, summative and self-assessment measures.	**No**	Students complete short multiple choice quizzes and occasional writing prompts that are unrelated to the text under consideration.
	6d) Materials assess student proficiency using methods that are unbiased and accessible to all students.	**No**	Many items assess lecture and prior knowledge rather than the text under consideration.

CRITERIA	INDICATORS OF SUPERIOR QUALITY	MEETS METRICS (Y/N)	JUSTIFICATION/ COMMENTS
IV. Scaffolding and Support			
7. SCAFFOLDING AND SUPPORT: Materials provide all students, including those who read below grade level, with extensive opportunities and support to encounter and comprehend grade-level complex text as required by the standards. ☐ Yes ■ No	**REQUIRED** **7a)** Pre-reading activities and suggested approaches to teacher scaffolding are focused and engage students with understanding the text itself. Pre-reading activities should be no more than 10% of time devoted to any reading instruction.	**No**	Pre-reading activities include PowerPoint lectures with a majority of front loading about the text. There are no supports or scaffolds built into the actual instruction with the text. All reading is done independently through a third-party internet site.
	REQUIRED **7b)** Materials do not confuse or substitute mastery of strategies for full comprehension of text; reading strategies support comprehension of specific texts and focus on building knowledge and insight. Texts must not serve as platforms to practice discrete strategies.	**No**	Full comprehension of text is not assessed. Strategies are the sole focus of some of the included texts.
	REQUIRED **7c)** Materials regularly direct teachers to return to focused parts of the text to guide students through rereading, discussion and writing about the ideas, events, and information found there.	**No**	Students engage with the text only once. There is no guidance for rereading, discussion, or connection to writing.
	REQUIRED **7d)** The materials are easy to use and cleanly laid out for students and teachers. Each page of the submission adds to student learning rather than distracts from it. The reading selections are centrally	**Yes**	The materials are all live links from third-party websites. They are easy to access, provided the links remain active.

CRITERIA	INDICATORS OF SUPERIOR QUALITY	MEETS METRICS (Y/N)	JUSTIFICATION/ COMMENTS
	located within the materials and obviously the center of focus.		
	7e) Appropriate suggestions and materials are provided for supporting varying student needs at the unit and lesson level (e.g., alternate teaching approaches, pacing, instructional delivery options, suggestions for addressing common student difficulties to meet standards, remediation strategies or suggestions for supporting texts, suggestions for more advanced texts for extension, etc.).	**No**	Varying supports and alternate approaches are not suggested.
	7f) The content can be reasonably completed within a regular school year and the pacing of content allows for maximum student understanding. The materials provide guidance about the amount of time a task might reasonably take.	**Yes**	The content would not require a full year to complete. Additional instruction would probably be required to fill time constraints of a traditional year-long schedule.

CRITERIA	INDICATORS OF SUPERIOR QUALITY	MEETS METRICS (Y/N)	JUSTIFICATION/ COMMENTS
V. Writing to Sources and Research			
8. WRITING TO SOURCES: The majority of written tasks are text-dependent and reflect the writing genres named in the standards. ☐ Yes ☒ No	**REQUIRED** **8a)** A vast majority of written tasks at all grade levels require students to analyze and synthesize sources, as well as to present careful analysis, well-defended claims and clear information, drawing on textual evidence and to support valid inferences from text.	**No**	Writing prompts are often skill based and do not require students to analyze sources or claims. For example, one prompt says "People define wisdom in a variety of ways. How would you define it?"
	REQUIRED **8b)** Materials include multiple writing tasks aligned to the three modes of writing (opinion/argumentative, informative, narrative) as well as blended modes (i.e., analytical writing); narrative prompts decrease in number and increase in being based on text(s) as student progress through the grades, e.g., narrative description (text-based, chronological writing) rather than imaginative narratives.	**No**	Writing addresses multiple modes but prompts do not meet the rigor of the standards. For example students are asked to identify the skills most needed by an individual to be successful at work. Writings do not require textual evidence or literary analysis.
	REQUIRED **8c)** Writing opportunities for students are prominent and varied in length and time demands (e.g., notes, summaries, short-answer responses, formal essays, on-demand and process writing, etc.).	**No**	Writing prompts are limited to once per unit rather than embedded in instruction.
	REQUIRED **8d)** Materials build in opportunities for connections and alignment between writing, speaking and listening, reading, and the language standards. For example, students read a text, work collaboratively to develop a plan for analyzing or emulating the text, write a response, and then share their writing with a peer who reviews the writing against using a peer review checklist.	**No**	Alignment between writing, speaking and listening, reading, and language standards does not exist.
	8e) Materials engage students in many short research projects annually to develop the expertise needed to conduct research independently.	**No**	Only one writing prompt is related to research.

CRITERIA	INDICATORS OF SUPERIOR QUALITY	MEETS METRICS (Y/N)	JUSTIFICATION/ COMMENTS
VI. Speaking and Listening			
9. SPEAKING AND LISTENING: Oral tasks must be text-dependent and materials for speaking and listening must reflect true communication skills required for college and career readiness. ☐ Yes ■ No	**REQUIRED** **9a)** Texts used in speaking and listening questions and tasks must meet the criteria for complexity, range, and quality of texts (Criteria 1, 2, and 3).	**No**	There are no speaking and listening components to the curriculum.
	REQUIRED **9b)** Materials demand that students engage effectively in a range of conversations and collaborations by expressing well-supported ideas clearly and probing ideas under discussion by building on others' ideas.	**No**	There are no speaking and listening components to the curriculum.
	REQUIRED **9c)** Materials build in frequent opportunities for connections and alignment between speaking and listening, reading, writing, and the language standards. Examples: Materials build in frequent opportunities for discussion about texts and, through directions and modeling, encourage students to use academic language and grade-appropriate oral language conventions; materials require students to gather and use evidence to orally present findings from research.	**No**	There are no speaking and listening components to the curriculum.
	9d) Materials develop active listening skills, such as taking notes on main ideas, asking relevant questions, and elaborating on remarks of others.	**Yes**	As most of the curriculum requires students to listen attentively to lecture, note taking would be reinforced. However, because all lecture is recorded, there would not be opportunity for asking questions or elaborating on remarks of others.

CRITERIA	INDICATORS OF SUPERIOR QUALITY	MEETS METRICS (Y/N)	JUSTIFICATION/ COMMENTS
VII. Language			
10. LANGUAGE: Materials must adequately address the Language standards for the grade, including through unpacking the vocabulary and syntax of text(s) (indicator 5e) as models of language use. ☐ Yes ■ No	**REQUIRED** **10a)** Materials address the grammar and language conventions specified by the Language standards at each grade level and build on those standards that build from previous grade levels, as indicated by pages 30 and 56 of the standards.	**No**	Grammar lessons do not align to the standards for the grade band. Students complete narrative reading on grammar such as what are the uses of different end punctuation marks, what is the difference between denotation and connotation of a word, and reading a list of commonly misspelled words. Grammar is not addressed in context.
	REQUIRED **10b)** Materials expect students to confront their own error patterns in usage and conventions (oral and written) and correct them.	**No**	Students do not confront their own errors in writing.
	REQUIRED **10c)** Materials encourage students to examine the language of texts (vocabulary, sentences, structure) and model their own writing after texts they are listening to or reading as a way to develop more complex sentence structure and language usage.	**No**	Students do not use texts to model their own writing.
	REQUIRED **10d)** Materials build in frequent opportunities for connections and alignment between the language standards, writing, reading, and speaking and listening. For example, through directions and modeling, materials encourage students to use grade-appropriate language conventions when speaking and writing about texts.	**No**	Alignment between writing, speaking and listening, reading, and language standards does not exist.
	10e) Materials provide real-world activities for student practice with natural language (e.g. mock interviews, presentations).	**No**	There are limited real-world activities.

Tier 1 ratings receive a "Yes" in Column 1 for Criteria 1-10.
Tier 2 ratings receive a "Yes" in Column 1 for all non-negotiable criteria (Foundational Skills (as applicable), Complexity of Texts, Quality of Texts, and Text-Dependent Questions), but at least one "No" in Column 1 for the remaining criteria.
Tier 3 ratings receive a "No" in Column 1 for at least one of the non-negotiable criteria.

FINAL EVALUATION			
Compile the results for Sections I-VII to make a final decision for the material under review.			
Section	**Criteria**	**Y/N**	**Final Justification/Comments**
I: Text Selection	1. Complexity of Texts **(Non-Negotiable)**	**No**	Literary texts do align to the complexity level of exemplars from Appendix B; however, informational texts do not.
	2. Quality of Texts **(Non-Negotiable)**	**No**	While literary texts are of the appropriate complexity level, there is no building of knowledge across units or the year.
	3. Range and Volume of Texts	**No**	There is no balance between literary and informational sources.
II: Foundational Skills	4. Foundational Skills **(Non-Negotiable*)**		
III: Text-Dependent Questions and Tasks	5. Text-Dependent Questions **(Non-Negotiable)**	**No**	There are no text dependent questions embedded in the text resources.
	6. Assessment	**No**	Assessment is limited and usually focuses on information gained from lecture rather than actual engagement with the text.
IV: Scaffolding and Support	7. Scaffolding and Support	**No**	There are no supports or scaffolds built into the actual instruction with the text.
V: Writing to Sources and Research	8. Writing to Sources	**No**	Writing prompts are often skill based and do not require students to analyze sources or claims.
VI: Speaking and Listening	9. Speaking and Listening	**No**	There are no speaking and listening components to the curriculum.
VII: Language	10. Language	**No**	Grammar lessons do not align to the standards for the grade band.
FINAL DECISION FOR THIS MATERIAL: Tier III, Not representing quality			

*As applicable (e.g., when the scope of the materials is comprehensive and considered a full program)