Instructional Materials Evaluation - Student Standards Review

Louisiana educators engaged in a professional review of the state's academic standards for English language arts (ELA) and mathematics to ensure they continue to maintain strong expectations for teaching and learning aligned with college and workplace demands. The new ELA and math standards will be effective beginning with the 2016-2017 school year. As part of the Louisiana Department of Education's support for a seamless transition to these new standards, the LDOE identified the major changes of the standards and their potential impact upon criteria used to review instructional materials.

Title: **Mirrors & Windows: Connecting with Literature** Grade: **6-8**

Publisher: **EMC Publishing, LLC** Copyright: **2016**

Overall Rating: **Tier III, Not representing quality**

This English Language Arts review has been examined for the following changes in alignment resulting from the Louisiana Student Standards Review:

- Materials do not contain references to specific authors and texts
- Include citing *relevant* textual evidence beginning in grade 6
- Include an *awareness of audience* when making speeches and delivering presentations

This review remains a Tier 3 rating. As a result of these changes, the following chart identifies the potential impact on specific elements in the current review. The LDOE recommends that district curriculum staff, principals, and teachers take these findings into consideration when using these instructional materials.

Criteria	Currently in the Rubric	Next Steps for Educators
Quality of Texts (Non-Negotiable)	This program currently is reviewed as "Yes" for this criteria because materials provide a collection of texts that build knowledge systematically. Texts are well-crafted and authentic, representing the quality of content, language, and writing produced by experts in various disciplines.	Make sure to review texts in these materials for quality since references to specific texts and Appendix B are no longer included in the standards.
Text-Dependent Questions (Non-Negotiable)	This program currently is reviewed as "No" for these criteria because questions and tasks in the Teacher and Student Edition/s do not support students in meeting grade-specific questions and do not always require students to refer back to the text to support their answers.	Since these materials received a "No" for this indicator, the current weakness will likely remain and should be addressed by adjusting or supplementing with stronger programs.
Speaking and Listening	Not reviewed	

Instructional Materials Evaluation Review for Alignment in ELA Grades K – 12 (IMET)

FULL CURRICULUM
Instructional Materials

The goal for ELA students is that they can read and understand grade-level texts independently, as demonstrated through writing and speaking about those texts. A strong ELA classroom is structured with the below components.

Title: **Mirrors & Windows: Connecting with Literature** Grade: **6-8**

Publisher: **EMC Publishing, LLC** Copyright: **2016**

Overall Rating: **Tier III, Not representing quality**

Tier I, Tier II, Tier III Elements of this review:

STRONG	WEAK
1. Complexity of Texts (Non-Negotiable)	5. Text-Dependent Questions (Non-Negotiable)
2. Quality of Texts (Non-Negotiable)	

Each set of submitted materials was evaluated for alignment with the standards beginning with a review of the indicators for the non-negotiable criteria. If those criteria were met, a review of the other criteria ensued.

Tier 1 ratings received a "Yes" for all Criteria 1-10.
Tier 2 ratings received a "Yes" for all non-negotiable criteria (Foundational Skills (as applicable), Complexity of Texts, Quality of Texts, and Text-Dependent Questions), but at least one "No" for the remaining criteria.
Tier 3 ratings received a "No" for at least one of the non-negotiable criteria.

Click below for complete grade-level reviews:

Grade 6 (Tier 3) Grade 7 (Tier 3) Grade 8 (Tier 3)

The goal for ELA students is that they can read and understand grade-level texts independently, as demonstrated through writing and speaking about those texts. A strong ELA classroom is structured with the below components.

Title: **Mirrors & Windows: Connecting with Literature** Grade: **6**

Publisher: **EMC Publishing, LLC** Copyright: **2016**

Overall Rating: **Tier III, Not representing quality**

Tier I, Tier II, Tier III Elements of this review:

STRONG	WEAK
1. Complexity of Texts (Non-Negotiable)	5. Text-Dependent Questions (Non-Negotiable)
2. Quality of Texts (Non-Negotiable)	

To evaluate each set of submitted materials for alignment with the standards, begin by reviewing Column 2 for the non-negotiable criteria. If there is a "Yes" for all required indicators in Column 2, then the materials receive a "Yes" in Column 1. If there is a "No" for any required indicators in Column 2, then the materials receive a "No" in Column 1. (Note: If materials do not represent a full curricula, then some of Criteria 1 – 10 may not apply.)

Tier 1 ratings receive a "Yes" in Column 1 for Criteria 1 – 10.
Tier 2 ratings receive a "Yes" in Column 1 for all non-negotiable criteria (Foundational Skills (as applicable), Complexity of Texts, Quality of Texts, and Text-Dependent Questions), but at least one "No" in Column 1 for the remaining criteria.
Tier 3 ratings receive a "No" in Column 1 for at least one of the non-negotiable criteria.

CRITERIA	INDICATORS OF SUPERIOR QUALITY	MEETS METRICS (Yes/No)	JUSTIFICATION/ COMMENTS WITH COMMENTS
I. Text Selection			
Tier 1 and 2 Non-Negotiable **1. COMPLEXITY OF TEXTS:** Materials present a progression of complex texts as stated by Reading Standard 10[1]. *(**Note:** In K and 1, Reading Standard 10 refers to read-aloud material, which is typically from grades 2+. Complexity standards for student-read texts are applicable for grades 2+.)* ☒ Yes ☐ No	**REQUIRED** **1a)** In grades 2-12, materials provide texts that are appropriately complex for the identified grade level according to the requirements outlined in the standards. Measures for determining complexity include quantitative and qualitative analysis.[2] Poetry and drama are analyzed only using qualitative measures. In grades K-2, extensive read-aloud texts allow sufficient opportunity for engagement with text more complex than students could read themselves.	**Yes**	Text selections are marked as easy, moderate, or challenging. In the Annotated Teacher's Edition, text selections are accompanied by a text complexity overview including Reading Level, Difficulty Considerations, and Ease Factors. This makes note of both quantitative measures and qualitative factors. For example, on pp. 236 in the Grade 6 TE, Jack London's short story "The King of Mazy May" is noted as having a "Moderate" reading level with a 1220 Lexile. The Lexile band for 6-8 is 925-1185. Though the materials note this text as "Moderate," it is above the complexity outlined in the standards for this grade band. Difficulty Considerations such as "background knowledge and vocabulary" and Ease Factors such as "structure, action, and description" are noted in the materials. Although this particular text is above the grade band, students begin by reading pieces below the grade band (610L) and are supported through the readings until they reach the aforementioned 1220L text.
	REQUIRED **1b)** Texts increase in complexity as materials progress throughout the grade level and across grade bands. Read-aloud texts follow the same trend, although they may have greater variability because listening skills in elementary school generally outpace reading skills.	**Yes**	Mirrors & Windows note that material was designed around the Gradual Release of Responsibility Model (GRRM). This ensures that texts increase in complexity as materials progress.

[1] Grades 3-12 Example: Texts present vocabulary, syntax, text structures, levels of meaning/purpose similar to exemplars in Appendix B.
[2] The process for determining quantitative and qualitative measures is available at http://www.louisianabelieves.com/docs/teacher-toolbox-resources/guide---how-to-determine-text-complexity-grades-k-12.pdf?sfvrsn=5 or the Supplemental Information for Appendix A.

CRITERIA	INDICATORS OF SUPERIOR QUALITY	MEETS METRICS (Yes/No)	JUSTIFICATION/ COMMENTS WITH COMMENTS
Tier 1 and 2 Non-Negotiable **2. QUALITY OF TEXTS:** Texts are of sufficient scope and quality to provide text-centered and integrated learning that is sequenced and scaffolded to advance students toward independent reading of grade level texts and build content knowledge (ELA, social studies, science and technical subjects, and the arts). The quality of texts is high—they support multiple readings for various purposes and exhibit exceptional craft and thought and/or provide useful information. ☒ Yes ☐ No	**REQUIRED** **2a)** 90% of texts provide rich opportunities for students to engage with tasks that allow them to meet the grade-level ELA standards using texts; the texts are well-crafted and authentic, representing the quality of content, language, and writing that is produced by experts in various disciplines (e.g., English language arts, history/social studies, science, technical subjects, and the arts).	**Yes**	90% of texts are worth reading. Texts are well-crafted and authentic, representing the quality of content, language, and writing produced by experts in various disciplines. Materials include short stories by Gary Soto, Ray Bradbury, and Sandra Cisneros, poems by Langston Hughes and William Butler Yeats, and texts from history/social studies, such as a speech by Mahatma Gandhi.
	REQUIRED **2b)** Materials provide a coherent sequence or collection of connected texts that build vocabulary knowledge and knowledge about concepts, themes, and topics through reading, writing, listening and speaking. In grades K-2, the inclusion of read-aloud texts in addition to what students can read themselves ensures that all students can build knowledge about the world through engagement with rich, complex text. These texts as well must form a coherent sequence or collection of connected texts that build vocabulary knowledge and knowledge about concepts, themes, and topics through reading, writing, listening and speaking.	**Yes**	Materials provide a collection of texts that build knowledge systematically. Texts included in each unit are bound by a unifying theme: Unit 1 (Finding a Place in the World); Unit 2 (Meeting Challenges); Unit 3 (Defining Freedom); Unit 4 (Testing Limits); Unit 5 (Expressing Yourself); Unit 6 (Encountering Nature); Unit 7 (Discovering Other Worlds); Unit 8 (Imagining the Fantastic). It should be noted that within units of study, students are only exposed to one genre per unit. For example, Units 1 and 2 are Fiction, Units 3 and 4 are Nonfiction, Units 5 and 6 are Poetry, Unit 7 is Drama, and Unit 8 is Folk Literature. Across the entire grade level, Mirrors & Windows provides a collection of texts that allow students to build knowledge through reading, writing, listening, and speaking.
	REQUIRED **2c)** Within a sequence or collection of texts, specific anchor texts of grade-level complexity, as determined in 1a, are selected for multiple, careful readings throughout the unit of study.	**Yes**	Anchor texts are noted within a collection of texts. These anchor texts include Text-to-Text Connections and were selected for multiple, careful readings so that they can be compared to related informational and literary texts. For example, in grade 6, students read the anchor text

CRITERIA	INDICATORS OF SUPERIOR QUALITY	MEETS METRICS (Yes/No)	JUSTIFICATION/ COMMENTS WITH COMMENTS
			"In the Fog," a screenplay by Milton Geiger. This is accompanied by a Close Reading Model for teachers to use when reading this text with students. After reading the anchor text, students read and compare an excerpt from William Shakespeare's play "The Fairies' Lullaby" and William Butler Yeats' lyric poem "The Stolen Child."
	2d) 90% of texts are previously published rather than "commissioned."	**Yes**	Nearly all texts are previously published rather than commissioned.
3. RANGE AND VOLUME OF TEXTS: Materials reflect the distribution of text types and genres suggested by the standards: Text types and genres generally reflect the definitions provided on page 31 (grades K-5) and page 57 (grades 6-12) of the standards and included in the text of the standards (e.g., RL.K.9, RI.1.9, RI.2.3, RL.2.9, RL.9-10.6, RI.7.7, or RI.11-12.9). ☐ Yes ☐ No	**REQUIRED** **3a)** In grades K-12, ELA materials seek a balance in instructional time between 50% literature/ 50% informational texts. (Reviewers will consider a balance within units of study as well as across the entire grade level.)	**Not Evaluated**	The section was not evaluated because the non-negotiable criteria were not met.
	REQUIRED **3b)** Materials include texts of different formats (e.g., print and non-print, including film, art, music, charts, etc.) and lengths (e.g. short stories and novels).	**Not Evaluated**	The section was not evaluated because the non-negotiable criteria were not met.
	3c) Materials include many informational texts with an informational text structure rather than a narrative structure. In grades 6-12, materials include literary nonfiction (e.g. speeches, biographies, essays).	**Not Evaluated**	The section was not evaluated because the non-negotiable criteria were not met.
	3d) Additional materials increase the opportunity for regular, accountable independent reading of texts that appeal to students' interests to build reading stamina, confidence, motivation, and enjoyment and connect to classroom concepts or topics to develop knowledge.	**Not Evaluated**	The section was not evaluated because the non-negotiable criteria were not met.
II. Foundational Skills (grades K-5 only)			

CRITERIA	INDICATORS OF SUPERIOR QUALITY	MEETS METRICS (Yes/No)	JUSTIFICATION/ COMMENTS WITH COMMENTS
Tier 1 and 2 Non-Negotiable* **4. FOUNDATIONAL SKILLS:** Materials provide instruction and diagnostic support in concepts of print, phonics, vocabulary, development, syntax, and fluency in a logical and transparent progression. These foundational skills are necessary and central components of an effective, comprehensive reading program designed to develop proficient readers with the capacity to comprehend texts across a range of types and disciplines. ☐ Yes ☐ No *As applicable (e.g., when the scope of the materials is comprehensive and considered a full program)	**REQUIRED *Indicator for grades K-2 only** **4a)** Materials follow a sequence of foundational skills instruction indicated by the standards and beginning on page 17 of Appendix A, while providing abundant opportunities for every student to become proficient in each of the foundational skills.	**N/A**	
	REQUIRED **4b)** In grades K-2, materials include student texts that allow for systematic, regular and frequent practice of foundational skills as they are introduced. In grades 3-5, materials demand knowledge of grade-level phonic patterns and word analysis skills.	**N/A**	
	REQUIRED **4c)** In grades K-2, materials provide instruction and practice in word study including pronunciation, roots, prefixes, suffixes and spelling/sound patterns, as well as decoding of grade-level words by using sound-symbol knowledge and knowledge of syllabication and regular practice in encoding (spelling) the sound symbol relationships of English. In grades 3-5, materials provide instruction and practice in word study including systematic examination of grade-level morphology, decoding of multisyllabic words by using syllabication, and automaticity with grade-level regular and irregular spelling patterns.	**N/A**	
	REQUIRED **4d)** Materials encourage students to use context to confirm or self-correct word recognition and understanding, directing students to reread purposefully to acquire accurate meaning.	**N/A**	
	REQUIRED **4e)** Opportunities are frequently built into the materials that allow for students to achieve reading fluency in oral and silent reading, that is, to read a wide variety of prose and poetry at students' reading level with accuracy, rate appropriate to the text, and expression.	**N/A**	

CRITERIA	INDICATORS OF SUPERIOR QUALITY	MEETS METRICS (Yes/No)	JUSTIFICATION/ COMMENTS WITH COMMENTS
	REQUIRED **4f)** Materials guide students to read grade-level text with purpose and understanding and to make frequent connections between acquisition of foundation skills and making meaning from reading.	**N/A**	
	4g) *Indicator for grades K-2 only Materials provide opportunities for educators to monitor student progress on every aspect of the foundational skills through diagnostic assessments offered at regular intervals. Monitoring must also allow for students to receive regular feedback on their oral reading fluency in the specific areas of appropriate rate, expressiveness and accuracy.	**N/A**	
	4h) Submissions provide abundant and easily implemented materials so teachers can readily provide more time, attention and practice for those students who need it.	**N/A**	
III. Questions and Tasks			
Tier 1 and 2 Non-Negotiable **5. TEXT-DEPENDENT QUESTIONS:** Text-dependent questions and tasks reflect the requirements of Reading Standard 1 by requiring use of textual evidence in support of meeting other grade-specific standards. ☐ Yes ☒ No	**REQUIRED** **5a)** At least 80% of all questions in the materials are text-dependent questions; student ideas are expressed through both written and spoken responses.	**No**	Text-dependent questions are included in both the Annotated Teacher Edition and the Student Edition, as well as the supplemental Common Core Assessment Practice resources. Questions in the Teacher and Student Edition/s do not always require students to refer back to the text to support their answers, even though evidence of text-dependent questions in the Common Core Assessment Practice resource is found more than 80% of time. For example, after reading the short story “Dragon, Dragon," students respond to the following text-dependent questions: "How is this story different from more traditional fairy tales? Compare and contrast the themes in traditional fairy tales with 'Dragon, Dragon.' What is the effect of Gardner's treatment of the story?" Yet, considering all resources, at least 80% of all

CRITERIA	INDICATORS OF SUPERIOR QUALITY	MEETS METRICS (Yes/No)	JUSTIFICATION/ COMMENTS WITH COMMENTS
			questions in the materials are not text-dependent. For example, after reading "Becky and the Wheels and Brakes Boys," in the Student Edition, readers are asked: "How does Becky's mother feel about getting Becky a bike?" This question does not support students in meeting other grade-specific questions.
	REQUIRED **5b)** Coherent sequences of questions and tasks focus students on understanding the text and its illustrations (as applicable), expressing the knowledge students have built about concepts, themes, or ideas presented in the texts, and making connections among the texts in the collection.	**Yes**	Questions are sequenced, asking students to "Find Meaning" in the text and then to "Make Judgments" about the text using examples to support their answers. The questions (Text-to-Text, Analyzing Literature, and Extending Your Understanding) require a response with a higher level of understanding. For example, after reading the poem, "Walrus and the Carpenter" by Lewis Carroll, students answer the following question: "At the end of the poem, the Walrus says he sympathizes with the Oysters. Do you think he truly does? Support your opinion with evidence from the text," "What do you think is funny about the poem? Find two examples," and "Do you think the author's purpose was just to be silly, or do you think he had another purpose? Cite words or details in the poem."
	REQUIRED **5c)** Questions and tasks include the language of the standards, and assess the depth and complexity required by the standards at each grade-level over time to advance and deepen student learning. *(**Note:** not every standard must be assessed with every text.)*	**No**	Questions in the Common Core Assessment Practice resource include the language of the standards. For example, while reading "Abd al-Rahman Ibrahima," a biography by Walter Dean Myers in Unit 4, students answer the following question: "What does Myers's tone regarding the use of slavery suggest about his

CRITERIA	INDICATORS OF SUPERIOR QUALITY	MEETS METRICS (Yes/No)	JUSTIFICATION/ COMMENTS WITH COMMENTS
			purpose?" Yet, questions in the textbook itself do not assess the depth and complexity required by the standards at the sixth grade level most of the time. For example, after reading "The Jacket," students answer the following questions: "What kind of jacket does the narrator want?" and "Why doesn't the narrator tell his mother that he does not want the jacket?"
	REQUIRED **5d)** Questions and tasks support students in examining the language (vocabulary, sentences, and structure) of texts measured by Criteria 1, 2, and 3 to determine meaning; questions and tasks also focus on engaging students with multiple repetitions of words in varied contexts (e.g., reading different texts, completing tasks, engaging in speaking/listening).	**Yes**	Questions in the Common Core Assessment Practice resource support students in examining the language of texts measured by Criteria 1, 2, and 3 to determine meaning. After reading a biography entitled "Jane Addams: Social Reformer," students are asked "What is the meaning of the word exploitation in this sentence from the biography: 'In 1893 Illinois passed a bill banning the exploitation of children in the workplace.'" It should be noted that in the Teacher and Student Edition/s, vocabulary is often defined for students in footnotes or sidebars. "Vicious", "mope", "palsied," and "swooping" are noted vocabulary words in Gary Soto's short story "The Jacket." Still, questions and tasks throughout the material support students in examining the language of texts, so this indicator is met. For example, after reading "The Jacket," students are asked to identify Soto's tone and note specific details and examples of Soto's word choice that contribute to that tone.
6. ASSESSMENT: Materials offer assessment opportunities that genuinely	**REQUIRED** **6a)** Measurement of progress via assessments should include gradual release of supporting scaffolds for students to	**Not Evaluated**	The section was not evaluated because the non-negotiable criteria were not met.

CRITERIA	INDICATORS OF SUPERIOR QUALITY	MEETS METRICS (Yes/No)	JUSTIFICATION/ COMMENTS WITH COMMENTS
measure progress and elicit direct, observable evidence of the degree to which students can independently demonstrate the assessed grade-specific standards with appropriately complex text(s). ☐ Yes ☐ No	measure their independent abilities.		
	REQUIRED **6b)** Aligned rubrics or assessment guidelines (such as scoring guides or student work exemplars) are included and provide sufficient guidance for interpreting student performance.	**Not Evaluated**	The section was not evaluated because the non-negotiable criteria were not met.
	REQUIRED **6c)** Materials use varied modes of assessment, including a range of pre-, formative, summative and self-assessment measures.	**Not Evaluated**	The section was not evaluated because the non-negotiable criteria were not met.
	6d) Materials assess student proficiency using methods that are unbiased and accessible to all students.	**Not Evaluated**	The section was not evaluated because the non-negotiable criteria were not met.
IV. Scaffolding and Support			
7. SCAFFOLDING AND SUPPORT: Materials provide all students, including those who read below grade level, with extensive opportunities and support to encounter and comprehend grade-level complex text as required by the standards. ☐ Yes ☐ No	**REQUIRED** **7a)** Pre-reading activities and suggested approaches to teacher scaffolding are focused and engage students with understanding the text itself. Pre-reading activities should be no more than 10% of time devoted to any reading instruction.	**Not Evaluated**	The section was not evaluated because the non-negotiable criteria were not met.
	REQUIRED **7b)** Materials must have the goal of students gaining full comprehension of complex text (through read-aloud in grades K-1) and do not confuse or substitute mastery of strategies for full comprehension of text; reading strategies support comprehension of specific texts and focus on building knowledge and insight. Texts must not serve as platforms to practice discrete strategies.	**Not Evaluated**	The section was not evaluated because the non-negotiable criteria were not met.
	REQUIRED **7c)** Materials regularly direct teachers to return to focused parts of the text to guide students through rereading,	**Not Evaluated**	The section was not evaluated because the non-negotiable criteria were not met.

CRITERIA	INDICATORS OF SUPERIOR QUALITY	MEETS METRICS (Yes/No)	JUSTIFICATION/ COMMENTS WITH COMMENTS
	discussion and writing about the ideas, events, and information found there.		
	REQUIRED **7d)** The materials are easy to use and cleanly laid out for students and teachers. The reading selections are centrally located within the materials and obviously the center of focus.	**Not Evaluated**	The section was not evaluated because the non-negotiable criteria were not met.
	7e) Appropriate suggestions and materials are provided for supporting varying student needs at the unit and lesson level (e.g., alternate teaching approaches, pacing, instructional delivery options, suggestions for addressing common student difficulties to meet standards, remediation strategies or suggestions for supporting texts, suggestions for more advanced texts for extension, etc.).	**Not Evaluated**	The section was not evaluated because the non-negotiable criteria were not met.
	7f) The content can be reasonably completed within a regular school year and the pacing of content allows for maximum student understanding. The materials provide guidance about the amount of time a task might reasonably take.	**Not Evaluated**	The section was not evaluated because the non-negotiable criteria were not met.
V. Writing to Sources and Research			
8. WRITING TO SOURCES: The majority of written tasks are text-dependent and reflect the writing genres named in the standards.	**REQUIRED *Indicator for grades 3-12 only** **8a)** A vast majority of written tasks at all grade levels require students to demonstrate the knowledge they built through the analysis and synthesis of texts, and present well--defended claims and clear information, drawing on textual evidence to support valid inferences from text.	**Not Evaluated**	The section was not evaluated because the non-negotiable criteria were not met.

CRITERIA	INDICATORS OF SUPERIOR QUALITY	MEETS METRICS (Yes/No)	JUSTIFICATION/ COMMENTS WITH COMMENTS
☐ Yes ☐ No	**REQUIRED** **8b)** Materials include multiple writing tasks aligned to the three modes of writing (opinion/argumentative, informative, narrative) as outlined by the standards at each grade level. In grades 3-12, tasks included blended modes (i.e., analytical writing); narrative prompts decrease in number and increase in being based on text(s) as student progress through the grades, e.g., narrative description (text-based, chronological writing) rather than imaginative narratives.	**Not Evaluated**	The section was not evaluated because the non-negotiable criteria were not met.
	REQUIRED **8c)** Writing opportunities for students are prominent and varied in length and time demands (e.g., notes, summaries, short-answer responses, whole-class shared writing/formal essays, on-demand and process writing, etc.).	**Not Evaluated**	The section was not evaluated because the non-negotiable criteria were not met.
	REQUIRED **8d)** Materials build in opportunities for connections between writing, speaking and listening, reading, and the language standards. For example, in grade 1, students listen to a text being read, work collaboratively to develop a plan for writing, write independently filling out an answer frame, and then share their writing with a peer who reviews the writing against a word wall to ensure high frequency words are spelled correctly. For example, in grade 6, students read a text, work collaboratively to develop a plan for analyzing or emulating the text, write a response, and then share their writing with a peer who reviews the writing against using a peer review checklist.	**Not Evaluated**	The section was not evaluated because the non-negotiable criteria were not met.
	REQUIRED *Indicator for grades K-2 only **8e)** Submissions address grade-level foundation standards that require students in the early grades to know their letters, phonetic conventions, sentence structures, and spelling.	**Not Evaluated**	The section was not evaluated because the non-negotiable criteria were not met.

CRITERIA	INDICATORS OF SUPERIOR QUALITY	MEETS METRICS (Yes/No)	JUSTIFICATION/ COMMENTS WITH COMMENTS
	8f) *Indicator for grades K-2 only Materials provide opportunities for educators to monitor student progress in the development of these foundational skills and respond to the needs of individual students. This monitoring should include attention to invented spelling as appropriate for its diagnostic value.	**Not Evaluated**	The section was not evaluated because the non-negotiable criteria were not met.
	8g) Materials engage students in many shared (grades K-2) or short research projects annually to develop the expertise needed to conduct research independently.	**Not Evaluated**	The section was not evaluated because the non-negotiable criteria were not met.
VI. Speaking and Listening			
9. SPEAKING AND LISTENING: Oral tasks must be text-dependent and materials for speaking and listening must reflect true communication skills required for college and career readiness. ☐ Yes ☐ No	**REQUIRED** **9a)** Speaking and listening questions and tasks use the texts measured by Criteria 1, 2, and 3.	**Not Evaluated**	The section was not evaluated because the non-negotiable criteria were not met.
	REQUIRED **9b)** Materials demand that students engage effectively (as determined by grade-level standards) in a range of conversations and collaborations with peers about texts.	**Not Evaluated**	The section was not evaluated because the non-negotiable criteria were not met.
	REQUIRED **9c)** Materials build in frequent opportunities for connections between speaking and listening, reading, writing, and the language standards. For example, in grades K-12, materials build in frequent opportunities for discussion about texts and, through directions and modeling, encourage students to use academic language and grade-appropriate oral language conventions. In grades 3-12, materials require students to gather and use evidence to orally present findings from research.	**Not Evaluated**	The section was not evaluated because the non-negotiable criteria were not met.
	9d) Materials develop active listening skills, such as taking notes on main ideas, asking relevant questions, and elaborating on remarks of others to develop understanding of complex texts and tasks.	**Not Evaluated**	The section was not evaluated because the non-negotiable criteria were not met.

CRITERIA	INDICATORS OF SUPERIOR QUALITY	MEETS METRICS (Yes/No)	JUSTIFICATION/ COMMENTS WITH COMMENTS
VII. Language			
10. LANGUAGE: Materials must adequately address the Language standards for the grade, including through unpacking the vocabulary and syntax of text(s) (indicator 5e) as models of language use. ☐ Yes ☐ No	**REQUIRED** **10a)** Materials address the grammar and language conventions specified by the Language standards at each grade level and build on those standards that build from previous grade levels, as indicated by pages 30 and 56 of the standards.	**Not Evaluated**	The section was not evaluated because the non-negotiable criteria were not met.
	REQUIRED **10b)** Materials create opportunities for students to discover accurate usage patterns, compare them to their own (oral and written), and develop proficiency in usage and language conventions.	**Not Evaluated**	The section was not evaluated because the non-negotiable criteria were not met.
	REQUIRED **10c)** Selected vocabulary focuses on words critical to the meaning of the texts included in Criteria 1, 2, and 3. Materials also require students to model their own writing after texts measured by Criteria 1, 2, and 3 as a way to develop more complex sentence structure and language usage.	**Not Evaluated**	The section was not evaluated because the non-negotiable criteria were not met.
	REQUIRED **10d)** Vocabulary study emphasizes advancing depth of word knowledge through determining word meaning and relationships among words (e.g., concept- and thematically-related words, word families, etc.).	**Not Evaluated**	The section was not evaluated because the non-negotiable criteria were not met.
	REQUIRED **10e)** Materials build in frequent opportunities for connections between the language standards, writing, reading, and speaking and listening. For example, through directions and modeling, materials encourage students to use grade-appropriate language conventions when speaking and writing about texts.	**Not Evaluated**	The section was not evaluated because the non-negotiable criteria were not met.
	10f) Materials provide real-world activities for student practice with natural language (e.g. mock interviews, presentations).	**Not Evaluated**	The section was not evaluated because the non-negotiable criteria were not met.

CRITERIA	INDICATORS OF SUPERIOR QUALITY	MEETS METRICS (Yes/No)	JUSTIFICATION/ COMMENTS WITH COMMENTS
FINAL EVALUATION ***Tier 1 ratings*** receive a "Yes" in Column 1 for Criteria 1 – 10. ***Tier 2 ratings*** receive a "Yes" in Column 1 for all non-negotiable criteria (Foundational Skills (as applicable), Complexity of Texts, Quality of Texts, and Text-Dependent Questions), but at least one "No" in Column 1 for the remaining criteria. ***Tier 3 ratings*** receive a "No" in Column 1 for at least one of the non-negotiable criteria.			
Compile the results for Sections I-VII to make a final decision for the material under review.			
Section	**Criteria**	**Yes/No**	**Final Justification/Comments**
I: Text Selection	1. Complexity of Texts **(Non-Negotiable)**	**Yes**	In the Annotated Teacher's Edition, text selections are accompanied by a text complexity overview including Reading Level, Difficulty Considerations, and Ease Factors. This makes note of both quantitative measures and qualitative factors.
	2. Quality of Texts **(Non-Negotiable)**	**Yes**	Pieces are well-crafted, high-quality, and previously published. Specific anchor texts are selected for multiple, careful readings within the units. These anchor texts include Text-to-Text Connections so that students may compare these texts to related informational and literary texts.
	3. Range and Volume of Texts	**Not Evaluated**	The section was not evaluated because the non-negotiable criteria were not met.
II: Foundational Skills	4. Foundational Skills **(Non-Negotiable*)**	**N/A**	
III: Text-Dependent Questions and Tasks	5. Text-Dependent Questions **(Non-Negotiable)**	**No**	While the majority of questions and tasks are text-dependent, questions and tasks in the textbook itself do not always assess the depth and complexity required by the standards. Questions and tasks found in the supplemental Common Core Assessment Practice resource do.
	6. Assessment	**Not Evaluated**	The section was not evaluated because the non-negotiable criteria were not met.

CRITERIA	INDICATORS OF SUPERIOR QUALITY	MEETS METRICS (Yes/No)	JUSTIFICATION/ COMMENTS WITH COMMENTS
IV: Scaffolding and Support	7. Scaffolding and Support	**Not Evaluated**	The section was not evaluated because the non-negotiable criteria were not met.
V: Writing to Sources and Research	8. Writing to Sources	**Not Evaluated**	The section was not evaluated because the non-negotiable criteria were not met.
VI: Speaking and Listening	9. Speaking and Listening	**Not Evaluated**	The section was not evaluated because the non-negotiable criteria were not met.
VII: Language	10. Language	**Not Evaluated**	The section was not evaluated because the non-negotiable criteria were not met.
FINAL DECISION FOR THIS MATERIAL: **Tier III, Not representing quality**			

*As applicable (e.g., when the scope of the materials is comprehensive and considered a full program)

The goal for ELA students is that they can read and understand grade-level texts independently, as demonstrated through writing and speaking about those texts. A strong ELA classroom is structured with the below components.

Title: **Mirrors & Windows: Connecting with Literature** Grade: **7**

Publisher: **EMC Publishing, LLC** Copyright: **2016**

Overall Rating: **Tier III, Not representing quality**

Tier I, Tier II, Tier III Elements of this review:

STRONG	WEAK
1. Complexity of Texts (Non-Negotiable)	5. Text-Dependent Questions (Non-Negotiable)
2. Quality of Texts (Non-Negotiable)	

To evaluate each set of submitted materials for alignment with the standards, begin by reviewing Column 2 for the non-negotiable criteria. If there is a "Yes" for all required indicators in Column 2, then the materials receive a "Yes" in Column 1. If there is a "No" for any required indicators in Column 2, then the materials receive a "No" in Column 1. (Note: If materials do not represent a full curricula, then some of Criteria 1 – 10 may not apply.)

Tier 1 ratings receive a "Yes" in Column 1 for Criteria 1 – 10.
Tier 2 ratings receive a "Yes" in Column 1 for all non-negotiable criteria (Foundational Skills (as applicable), Complexity of Texts, Quality of Texts, and Text-Dependent Questions), but at least one "No" in Column 1 for the remaining criteria.
Tier 3 ratings receive a "No" in Column 1 for at least one of the non-negotiable criteria.

CRITERIA	INDICATORS OF SUPERIOR QUALITY	MEETS METRICS (Yes/No)	JUSTIFICATION/ COMMENTS WITH COMMENTS
I. Text Selection			
Tier 1 and 2 Non-Negotiable **1. COMPLEXITY OF TEXTS:** Materials present a progression of complex texts as stated by Reading Standard 10[3]. *(**Note:** In K and 1, Reading Standard 10 refers to read-aloud material, which is typically from grades 2+. Complexity standards for student-read texts are applicable for grades 2+.)* ☒ Yes ☐ No	**REQUIRED** **1a)** In grades 2-12, materials provide texts that are appropriately complex for the identified grade level according to the requirements outlined in the standards. Measures for determining complexity include quantitative and qualitative analysis.[4] Poetry and drama are analyzed only using qualitative measures. In grades K-2, extensive read-aloud texts allow sufficient opportunity for engagement with text more complex than students could read themselves.	**Yes**	Text selections are marked as easy, moderate, or challenging. In the Annotated Teacher's Edition, text selections are accompanied by a text complexity overview including Reading Level, Difficulty Considerations, and Ease Factors. This makes note of both quantitative measures and qualitative factors. For example, on page 111 in the Grade 7 TE, Joan Aiken's short story "The Serial Garden" is noted as having a "Challenging" reading level with a 910 Lexile. The materials further note Difficulty Considerations such as "length" and "vocabulary" and Ease Factors such as "opening lines." Though this Lexile is just below the noted grade-band (925-1185L), students read this early in the year (Unit I) and are exposed to more complex texts as both the unit and year progresses. For example, "Madame C.J. Walker," a biography by Jim Haskins in Unit III has a 1100 Lexile. This is further noted in 1b. Furthermore, on page 356 in the Grade 7 TE, James Thurber's personal essay "The Night the Bed Fell" is noted as having a "Moderate" reading level with a 1150 Lexile. The materials further note Difficulty Considerations such as "vocabulary" and "organization" and Ease Factors such as "humor." Although this particular text is at the high end of the grade band, it is noted in the Unit Scope and Sequence that students have been supported through guided reading before reading this one independently.

[3] Grades 3-12 Example: Texts present vocabulary, syntax, text structures, levels of meaning/purpose similar to exemplars in Appendix B.
[4] The process for determining quantitative and qualitative measures is available at http://www.louisianabelieves.com/docs/teacher-toolbox-resources/guide---how-to-determine-text-complexity-grades-k-12.pdf?sfvrsn=5 or the Supplemental Information for Appendix A.

CRITERIA	INDICATORS OF SUPERIOR QUALITY	MEETS METRICS (Yes/No)	JUSTIFICATION/ COMMENTS WITH COMMENTS
	REQUIRED **1b)** Texts increase in complexity as materials progress throughout the grade level and across grade bands. Read-aloud texts follow the same trend, although they may have greater variability because listening skills in elementary school generally outpace reading skills.	**Yes**	Mirrors & Windows note that material was designed around the Gradual Release of Responsibility Model (GRRM). This ensures that texts increase in complexity both within units and across the year-long curriculum. A progression of complexity within units and throughout the grade level is noted most of the time. For example, "Hollywood and the Pits" by Cherylene Lee in Unit II has a 910 Lexile. Later in Unit II, students read Borden Deal's short story "Antaeus" (990 Lexile). Moreover, "Madame C.J. Walker," a biography by Jim Haskins in Unit III has a 1100 Lexile.
Tier 1 and 2 Non-Negotiable **2. QUALITY OF TEXTS:** Texts are of sufficient scope and quality to provide text-centered and integrated learning that is sequenced and scaffolded to advance students toward independent reading of grade level texts and build content knowledge (ELA, social studies, science and technical subjects, and the arts). The quality of texts is high—they support multiple readings for various purposes and exhibit exceptional craft and thought and/or provide useful	**REQUIRED** **2a)** 90% of texts provide rich opportunities for students to engage with tasks that allow them to meet the grade-level ELA standards using texts; the texts are well-crafted and authentic, representing the quality of content, language, and writing that is produced by experts in various disciplines (e.g., English language arts, history/social studies, science, technical subjects, and the arts).	**Yes**	90% of texts are worth reading. Texts are well-crafted and authentic, representing the quality of content, language, and writing produced by experts in various disciplines. Materials include short stories by Toni Cade Bambara, Rudyard Kipling, Ray Bradbury, Gary Soto, and O. Henry, poems by Henry Wadsworth Longfellow, Robert Frost, Edna St. Vincent Millay, Langston Hughes, and Emily Dickinson, and texts from history/social studies, science, and the arts, such as a letter and speech by Queen Elizabeth, an editorial by Arthur Ashe, and an essay by John James Audubon.
	REQUIRED **2b)** Materials provide a coherent sequence or collection of	**Yes**	Materials provide a collection of texts that build knowledge systematically. Texts included in each unit

CRITERIA	INDICATORS OF SUPERIOR QUALITY	MEETS METRICS (Yes/No)	JUSTIFICATION/ COMMENTS WITH COMMENTS
information. ☒ Yes ☐ No	connected texts that build vocabulary knowledge and knowledge about concepts, themes, and topics through reading, writing, listening and speaking. In grades K-2, the inclusion of read-aloud texts in addition to what students can read themselves ensures that all students can build knowledge about the world through engagement with rich, complex text. These texts as well must form a coherent sequence or collection of connected texts that build vocabulary knowledge and knowledge about concepts, themes, and topics through reading, writing, listening and speaking.		are bound by a unifying theme: Unit 1 (Meeting the Unexpected); Unit 2 (Learning Values); Unit 3 (Experiencing the World); Unit 4 (Responding to Nature); Unit 5 (Appreciating Life); Unit 6 (Searching Beneath the Surface); Unit 7 (Facing Challenges); Unit 8 (Seeking Wisdom). It should be noted that within units of study, students are only exposed to one genre per unit. For example, Units 1 and 2 are Fiction, Units 3 and 4 are Nonfiction, Units 5 and 6 are Poetry, Unit 7 is Drama, and Unit 8 is Folk Literature. Across the entire grade level, Mirrors & Windows provides a collection of texts that allow students to build knowledge through reading, writing, listening, and speaking.
	REQUIRED **2c)** Within a sequence or collection of texts, specific anchor texts of grade-level complexity, as determined in 1a, are selected for multiple, careful readings throughout the unit of study.	**Yes**	Anchor texts are noted within a collection of texts. These anchor texts include Text-to-Text Connections and were selected for multiple, careful readings so that they can be compared to related informational and literary texts. For example, in grade 7, students read the anchor text “Amigo Brothers,” a short story by Piri Thomas. After reading the anchor text, students read an excerpt from Walter Dean Myers' biography of Muhammad Ali and are asked to compare Myers' description of a boxing match to Thomas' fictional depiction of a boxing match between Felix and Antonio in "Amigo Brothers."
	2d) 90% of texts are previously published rather than “commissioned.”	**Yes**	Nearly all texts are previously published rather than commissioned.

CRITERIA	INDICATORS OF SUPERIOR QUALITY	MEETS METRICS (Yes/No)	JUSTIFICATION/ COMMENTS WITH COMMENTS
3. RANGE AND VOLUME OF TEXTS: Materials reflect the distribution of text types and genres suggested by the standards: Text types and genres generally reflect the definitions provided on page 31 (grades K-5) and page 57 (grades 6-12) of the standards and included in the text of the standards (e.g., RL.K.9, RI.1.9, RI.2.3, RL.2.9, RL.9-10.6, RI.7.7, or RI.11-12.9). ☐ Yes ☐ No	**REQUIRED** **3a)** In grades K-12, ELA materials seek a balance in instructional time between 50% literature/ 50% informational texts. (Reviewers will consider a balance within units of study as well as across the entire grade level.)	**Not Evaluated**	The section was not evaluated because the non-negotiable criteria were not met.
	REQUIRED **3b)** Materials include texts of different formats (e.g., print and non-print, including film, art, music, charts, etc.) and lengths (e.g. short stories and novels).	**Not Evaluated**	The section was not evaluated because the non-negotiable criteria were not met.
	3c) Materials include many informational texts with an informational text structure rather than a narrative structure. In grades 6-12, materials include literary nonfiction (e.g. speeches, biographies, essays).	**Not Evaluated**	The section was not evaluated because the non-negotiable criteria were not met.
	3d) Additional materials increase the opportunity for regular, accountable independent reading of texts that appeal to students' interests to build reading stamina, confidence, motivation, and enjoyment and connect to classroom concepts or topics to develop knowledge.	**Not Evaluated**	The section was not evaluated because the non-negotiable criteria were not met.
II. Foundational Skills (grades K-5 only)			
Tier 1 and 2 Non-Negotiable* **4. FOUNDATIONAL SKILLS:** Materials provide instruction and diagnostic support in concepts of print, phonics, vocabulary, development, syntax, and fluency in a logical and transparent progression. These foundational skills are necessary and central components of an effective, comprehensive reading program designed to develop proficient readers with the capacity to	**REQUIRED *Indicator for grades K-2 only** **4a)** Materials follow a sequence of foundational skills instruction indicated by the standards and beginning on page 17 of Appendix A, while providing abundant opportunities for every student to become proficient in each of the foundational skills.	**N/A**	
	REQUIRED **4b)** In grades K-2, materials include student texts that allow for systematic, regular and frequent practice of foundational skills as they are introduced. In grades 3-5, materials demand knowledge of grade-level phonic patterns and word analysis skills.	**N/A**	

CRITERIA	INDICATORS OF SUPERIOR QUALITY	MEETS METRICS (Yes/No)	JUSTIFICATION/ COMMENTS WITH COMMENTS
comprehend texts across a range of types and disciplines. ☐ Yes ☐ No *As applicable (e.g., when the scope of the materials is comprehensive and considered a full program)	**REQUIRED** **4c)** In grades K-2, materials provide instruction and practice in word study including pronunciation, roots, prefixes, suffixes and spelling/sound patterns, as well as decoding of grade-level words by using sound-symbol knowledge and knowledge of syllabication and regular practice in encoding (spelling) the sound symbol relationships of English. In grades 3-5, materials provide instruction and practice in word study including systematic examination of grade-level morphology, decoding of multisyllabic words by using syllabication, and automaticity with grade-level regular and irregular spelling patterns.	**N/A**	
	REQUIRED **4d)** Materials encourage students to use context to confirm or self-correct word recognition and understanding, directing students to reread purposefully to acquire accurate meaning.	**N/A**	
	REQUIRED **4e)** Opportunities are frequently built into the materials that allow for students to achieve reading fluency in oral and silent reading, that is, to read a wide variety of prose and poetry at students' reading level with accuracy, rate appropriate to the text, and expression.	**N/A**	
	REQUIRED **4f)** Materials guide students to read grade-level text with purpose and understanding and to make frequent connections between acquisition of foundation skills and making meaning from reading.	**N/A**	
	4g) *Indicator for grades K-2 only Materials provide opportunities for educators to monitor student progress on every aspect of the foundational skills through diagnostic assessments offered at regular intervals. Monitoring must also allow for students to receive regular feedback on their oral reading fluency in the specific areas of appropriate rate, expressiveness and accuracy.	**N/A**	

CRITERIA	INDICATORS OF SUPERIOR QUALITY	MEETS METRICS (Yes/No)	JUSTIFICATION/ COMMENTS WITH COMMENTS
	4h) Submissions provide abundant and easily implemented materials so teachers can readily provide more time, attention and practice for those students who need it.	**N/A**	
III. Questions and Tasks			
Tier 1 and 2 Non-Negotiable **5. TEXT-DEPENDENT QUESTIONS:** Text-dependent questions and tasks reflect the requirements of Reading Standard 1 by requiring use of textual evidence in support of meeting other grade-specific standards. ☐ Yes ☒ No	**REQUIRED** **5a)** At least 80% of all questions in the materials are text-dependent questions; student ideas are expressed through both written and spoken responses.	**No**	Text-dependent questions are included in both the Annotated Teacher Edition and the Student Edition as well as the supplemental Common Core Assessment Practice resources. Even thougth evidence of text-dependent questions in the Common Core Asessment Practice resource is found more than 80% of the time, this indicator is not met because questions in the Teacher and Student Edition/s do not require students to refer back to the text to support their answers at least 80% of the time. For example, in the Unit 3 Assessment "Rome: The Eternal City" found in the Common Core Assesment Practice resource, students are asked "What is the author's purpose for writing this text; Which sentence from the article best supports your answer?" Questions like these are found throughout the noted resource. Yet, considering all resources, at least 80% of all questions in the materials are not text-dependent. For example, after reading Elizabeth I, a biography, students are asked, "Why do you think people were impressed with Elizabeth's grand processions?" This question does not support students in meeting other grade-specific questions -- further, students could answer this question without having read the text.
	REQUIRED **5b)** Coherent sequences of questions and tasks focus	**No**	Questions in both the Teacher and Student Edition/s are noted as first asking students to "Find Meaning" in

CRITERIA	INDICATORS OF SUPERIOR QUALITY	MEETS METRICS (Yes/No)	JUSTIFICATION/ COMMENTS WITH COMMENTS
	students on understanding the text and its illustrations (as applicable), expressing the knowledge students have built about concepts, themes, or ideas presented in the texts, and making connections among the texts in the collection.		the text and then to "Make Judgments" about the text using examples to support their answers. A writing task typically follows. Still, questions are not sequenced. Instead questions focused on disjointed ideas that do not sequence together to a coherent whole.
	REQUIRED **5c)** Questions and tasks include the language of the standards, and assess the depth and complexity required by the standards at each grade-level over time to advance and deepen student learning. *(**Note:** not every standard must be assessed with every text.)*	**No**	Questions in the Common Core Assessment Practice resource include the language of the standards and assess the depth and complexity required by the standards at least 80% of the time. Questions in the Teacher and Student Edition/s do not. Questions found in these materials are often divided into two categories "Find Meaning" and "Make Judgements." Examples of "Find Meaning" questions include: "Why do the men abandon their ship?" and "What was the first challenge that faced them?" Basic comprehension questions like these constitute more than half of the questions asked in the seventh-grade textbooks. An example of a "Make Judgement" question set is "What does Shackleton do after the first day and a half on foot?" followed by "What does this suggest about his qualities as a leader?" These questions would be stronger if students were asked to identify specific parts of the text that related to the question.
	REQUIRED **5d)** Questions and tasks support students in examining the language (vocabulary, sentences, and structure) of texts measured by Criteria 1, 2, and 3 to determine meaning; questions and tasks also focus on engaging students with	**No**	Questions in the Common Core Assessment Pratice resource support students in examining the language of texts measured by Criteria 1, 2, and 3 to determine meaning.

CRITERIA	INDICATORS OF SUPERIOR QUALITY	MEETS METRICS (Yes/No)	JUSTIFICATION/ COMMENTS WITH COMMENTS
	multiple repetitions of words in varied contexts (e.g., reading different texts, completing tasks, engaging in speaking/listening).		In the seventh-grade Student and Teacher Edition/s, however, vocabulary study is isolated to each text rather than a development across texts. Students are not asked to define vocabulary words in context. Rather, students are provided with definitions of challenging words in the footnotes of the texts. Additionally, students are not asked to practice the use of newly-learned vocabulary in writing or speaking tasks after reading.
6. ASSESSMENT: Materials offer assessment opportunities that genuinely measure progress and elicit direct, observable evidence of the degree to which students can independently demonstrate the assessed grade-specific standards with appropriately complex text(s). ☐ Yes ☐ No	**REQUIRED** **6a)** Measurement of progress via assessments should include gradual release of supporting scaffolds for students to measure their independent abilities.	**Not Evaluated**	The section was not evaluated because the non-negotiable criteria were not met.
	REQUIRED **6b)** Aligned rubrics or assessment guidelines (such as scoring guides or student work exemplars) are included and provide sufficient guidance for interpreting student performance.	**Not Evaluated**	The section was not evaluated because the non-negotiable criteria were not met.
	REQUIRED **6c)** Materials use varied modes of assessment, including a range of pre-, formative, summative and self-assessment measures.	**Not Evaluated**	The section was not evaluated because the non-negotiable criteria were not met.
	6d) Materials assess student proficiency using methods that are unbiased and accessible to all students.	**Not Evaluated**	The section was not evaluated because the non-negotiable criteria were not met.
IV. Scaffolding and Support			
7. SCAFFOLDING AND SUPPORT: Materials provide all students, including those who read below	**REQUIRED** **7a)** Pre-reading activities and suggested approaches to teacher scaffolding are focused and engage students with	**Not Evaluated**	The section was not evaluated because the non-negotiable criteria were not met.

CRITERIA	INDICATORS OF SUPERIOR QUALITY	MEETS METRICS (Yes/No)	JUSTIFICATION/ COMMENTS WITH COMMENTS
grade level, with extensive opportunities and support to encounter and comprehend grade-level complex text as required by the standards. ☐ Yes ☐ No	understanding the text itself. Pre-reading activities should be no more than 10% of time devoted to any reading instruction.		
	REQUIRED **7b)** Materials must have the goal of students gaining full comprehension of complex text (through read-aloud in grades K-1) and do not confuse or substitute mastery of strategies for full comprehension of text; reading strategies support comprehension of specific texts and focus on building knowledge and insight. Texts must not serve as platforms to practice discrete strategies.	**Not Evaluated**	The section was not evaluated because the non-negotiable criteria were not met.
	REQUIRED **7c)** Materials regularly direct teachers to return to focused parts of the text to guide students through rereading, discussion and writing about the ideas, events, and information found there.	**Not Evaluated**	The section was not evaluated because the non-negotiable criteria were not met.
	REQUIRED **7d)** The materials are easy to use and cleanly laid out for students and teachers. The reading selections are centrally located within the materials and obviously the center of focus.	**Not Evaluated**	The section was not evaluated because the non-negotiable criteria were not met.
	7e) Appropriate suggestions and materials are provided for supporting varying student needs at the unit and lesson level (e.g., alternate teaching approaches, pacing, instructional delivery options, suggestions for addressing common student difficulties to meet standards, remediation strategies or suggestions for supporting texts, suggestions for more advanced texts for extension, etc.).	**Not Evaluated**	The section was not evaluated because the non-negotiable criteria were not met.

CRITERIA	INDICATORS OF SUPERIOR QUALITY	MEETS METRICS (Yes/No)	JUSTIFICATION/ COMMENTS WITH COMMENTS
	7f) The content can be reasonably completed within a regular school year and the pacing of content allows for maximum student understanding. The materials provide guidance about the amount of time a task might reasonably take.	**Not Evaluated**	The section was not evaluated because the non-negotiable criteria were not met.
V. Writing to Sources and Research			
8. WRITING TO SOURCES: The majority of written tasks are text-dependent and reflect the writing genres named in the standards. ☐ Yes ☐ No	**REQUIRED *Indicator for grades 3-12 only** **8a)** A vast majority of written tasks at all grade levels require students to demonstrate the knowledge they built through the analysis and synthesis of texts, and present well--defended claims and clear information, drawing on textual evidence to support valid inferences from text.	**Not Evaluated**	The section was not evaluated because the non-negotiable criteria were not met.
	REQUIRED **8b)** Materials include multiple writing tasks aligned to the three modes of writing (opinion/argumentative, informative, narrative) as outlined by the standards at each grade level. In grades 3-12, tasks included blended modes (i.e., analytical writing); narrative prompts decrease in number and increase in being based on text(s) as student progress through the grades, e.g., narrative description (text-based, chronological writing) rather than imaginative narratives.	**Not Evaluated**	The section was not evaluated because the non-negotiable criteria were not met.
	REQUIRED **8c)** Writing opportunities for students are prominent and varied in length and time demands (e.g., notes, summaries, short-answer responses, whole-class shared writing/formal essays, on-demand and process writing, etc.).	**Not Evaluated**	The section was not evaluated because the non-negotiable criteria were not met.
	REQUIRED **8d)** Materials build in opportunities for connections between writing, speaking and listening, reading, and the language standards. For example, in grade 1, students listen to a text being read, work collaboratively to develop a plan for writing, write independently filling out an answer frame, and then share their writing with a peer who reviews the writing	**Not Evaluated**	The section was not evaluated because the non-negotiable criteria were not met.

CRITERIA	INDICATORS OF SUPERIOR QUALITY	MEETS METRICS (Yes/No)	JUSTIFICATION/ COMMENTS WITH COMMENTS
	against a word wall to ensure high frequency words are spelled correctly. For example, in grade 6, students read a text, work collaboratively to develop a plan for analyzing or emulating the text, write a response, and then share their writing with a peer who reviews the writing against using a peer review checklist.		
	REQUIRED *Indicator for grades K-2 only **8e)** Submissions address grade-level foundation standards that require students in the early grades to know their letters, phonetic conventions, sentence structures, and spelling.	**Not Evaluated**	The section was not evaluated because the non-negotiable criteria were not met.
	8f) *Indicator for grades K-2 only Materials provide opportunities for educators to monitor student progress in the development of these foundational skills and respond to the needs of individual students. This monitoring should include attention to invented spelling as appropriate for its diagnostic value.	**Not Evaluated**	The section was not evaluated because the non-negotiable criteria were not met.
	8g) Materials engage students in many shared (grades K-2) or short research projects annually to develop the expertise needed to conduct research independently.	**Not Evaluated**	The section was not evaluated because the non-negotiable criteria were not met.
VI. Speaking and Listening			
9. SPEAKING AND LISTENING: Oral tasks must be text-dependent and materials for speaking and listening must reflect true communication skills required for college and career readiness. ☐ Yes ☐ No	**REQUIRED** **9a)** Speaking and listening questions and tasks use the texts measured by Criteria 1, 2, and 3.	**Not Evaluated**	The section was not evaluated because the non-negotiable criteria were not met.
	REQUIRED **9b)** Materials demand that students engage effectively (as determined by grade-level standards) in a range of conversations and collaborations with peers about texts.	**Not Evaluated**	The section was not evaluated because the non-negotiable criteria were not met.
	REQUIRED **9c)** Materials build in frequent opportunities for connections between speaking and listening, reading, writing, and the language standards. For example, in grades K-12, materials build in frequent opportunities for discussion about texts and, through directions and modeling, encourage students to use	**Not Evaluated**	The section was not evaluated because the non-negotiable criteria were not met.

CRITERIA	INDICATORS OF SUPERIOR QUALITY	MEETS METRICS (Yes/No)	JUSTIFICATION/ COMMENTS WITH COMMENTS
	academic language and grade-appropriate oral language conventions. In grades 3-12, materials require students to gather and use evidence to orally present findings from research.		
	9d) Materials develop active listening skills, such as taking notes on main ideas, asking relevant questions, and elaborating on remarks of others to develop understanding of complex texts and tasks.	**Not Evaluated**	The section was not evaluated because the non-negotiable criteria were not met.
VII. Language			
10. LANGUAGE: Materials must adequately address the Language standards for the grade, including through unpacking the vocabulary and syntax of text(s) (indicator 5e) as models of language use. ☐ Yes ☐ No	**REQUIRED** **10a)** Materials address the grammar and language conventions specified by the Language standards at each grade level and build on those standards that build from previous grade levels, as indicated by pages 30 and 56 of the standards.	**Not Evaluated**	The section was not evaluated because the non-negotiable criteria were not met.
	REQUIRED **10b)** Materials create opportunities for students to discover accurate usage patterns, compare them to their own (oral and written), and develop proficiency in usage and language conventions.	**Not Evaluated**	The section was not evaluated because the non-negotiable criteria were not met.
	REQUIRED **10c)** Selected vocabulary focuses on words critical to the meaning of the texts included in Criteria 1, 2, and 3. Materials also require students to model their own writing after texts measured by Criteria 1, 2, and 3 as a way to develop more complex sentence structure and language usage.	**Not Evaluated**	The section was not evaluated because the non-negotiable criteria were not met.
	REQUIRED **10d)** Vocabulary study emphasizes advancing depth of word knowledge through determining word meaning and relationships among words (e.g., concept- and thematically-related words, word families, etc.).	**Not Evaluated**	The section was not evaluated because the non-negotiable criteria were not met.
	REQUIRED **10e)** Materials build in frequent opportunities for connections between the language standards, writing, reading, and speaking and listening. For example, through	**Not Evaluated**	The section was not evaluated because the non-negotiable criteria were not met.

CRITERIA	INDICATORS OF SUPERIOR QUALITY	MEETS METRICS (Yes/No)	JUSTIFICATION/ COMMENTS WITH COMMENTS
	directions and modeling, materials encourage students to use grade-appropriate language conventions when speaking and writing about texts.		
	10f) Materials provide real-world activities for student practice with natural language (e.g. mock interviews, presentations).	**Not Evaluated**	The section was not evaluated because the non-negotiable criteria were not met.

FINAL EVALUATION
Tier 1 ratings receive a "Yes" in Column 1 for Criteria 1 – 10.
Tier 2 ratings receive a "Yes" in Column 1 for all non-negotiable criteria (Foundational Skills (as applicable), Complexity of Texts, Quality of Texts, and Text-Dependent Questions), but at least one "No" in Column 1 for the remaining criteria.
Tier 3 ratings receive a "No" in Column 1 for at least one of the non-negotiable criteria.

Compile the results for Sections I-VII to make a final decision for the material under review.

Section	Criteria	Yes/No	Final Justification/Comments
I: Text Selection	1. Complexity of Texts **(Non-Negotiable)**	**Yes**	In the Annotated Teacher's Edition, text selections are accompanied by a text complexity overview including Reading Level, Difficulty Considerations, and Ease Factors. This makes note of both quantitative measures and qualitative factors.
	2. Quality of Texts **(Non-Negotiable)**	**Yes**	Pieces are well-crafted, high-quality, and previously published. Specific anchor texts are selected for multiple, careful readings within the units. These anchor texts include Text-to-Text Connections so that students may compare these texts to related informational and literary texts.
	3. Range and Volume of Texts	**Not Evaluated**	The section was not evaluated because the non-negotiable criteria were not met.
II: Foundational Skills	4. Foundational Skills **(Non-Negotiable*)**	**N/A**	
III: Text-Dependent Questions and Tasks	5. Text-Dependent Questions **(Non-Negotiable)**	**No**	While the majority of questions and tasks are text-dependent, questions and tasks in the textbook itself

CRITERIA	INDICATORS OF SUPERIOR QUALITY	MEETS METRICS (Yes/No)	JUSTIFICATION/ COMMENTS WITH COMMENTS
			do not always assess the depth and complexity required by the standards. Questions and tasks found in the supplemental Common Core Assessment Practice resource do.
	6. Assessment	**Not Evaluated**	The section was not evaluated because the non-negotiable criteria were not met.
IV: Scaffolding and Support	7. Scaffolding and Support	**Not Evaluated**	The section was not evaluated because the non-negotiable criteria were not met.
V: Writing to Sources and Research	8. Writing to Sources	**Not Evaluated**	The section was not evaluated because the non-negotiable criteria were not met.
VI: Speaking and Listening	9. Speaking and Listening	**Not Evaluated**	The section was not evaluated because the non-negotiable criteria were not met.
VII: Language	10. Language	**Not Evaluated**	The section was not evaluated because the non-negotiable criteria were not met.
FINAL DECISION FOR THIS MATERIAL: **Tier III, Not representing quality**			

*As applicable (e.g., when the scope of the materials is comprehensive and considered a full program)

The goal for ELA students is that they can read and understand grade-level texts independently, as demonstrated through writing and speaking about those texts. A strong ELA classroom is structured with the below components.

Title: **Mirrors & Windows: Connecting with Literature** Grade: **8**

Publisher: **EMC Publishing, LLC** Copyright: **2016**

Overall Rating: **Tier III, Not representing quality**

Tier I, Tier II, Tier III Elements of this review:

STRONG	WEAK
1. Complexity of Texts (Non-Negotiable)	5. Text-Dependent Questions (Non-Negotiable)
2. Quality of Texts (Non-Negotiable)	

To evaluate each set of submitted materials for alignment with the standards, begin by reviewing Column 2 for the non-negotiable criteria. If there is a "Yes" for all required indicators in Column 2, then the materials receive a "Yes" in Column 1. If there is a "No" for any required indicators in Column 2, then the materials receive a "No" in Column 1. (Note: If materials do not represent a full curricula, then some of Criteria 1 – 10 may not apply.)

Tier 1 ratings receive a "Yes" in Column 1 for Criteria 1 – 10.
Tier 2 ratings receive a "Yes" in Column 1 for all non-negotiable criteria (Foundational Skills (as applicable), Complexity of Texts, Quality of Texts, and Text-Dependent Questions), but at least one "No" in Column 1 for the remaining criteria.
Tier 3 ratings receive a "No" in Column 1 for at least one of the non-negotiable criteria.

CRITERIA	INDICATORS OF SUPERIOR QUALITY	MEETS METRICS (Yes/No)	JUSTIFICATION/ COMMENTS WITH COMMENTS
I. Text Selection			
Tier 1 and 2 Non-Negotiable **1. COMPLEXITY OF TEXTS:** Materials present a progression of complex texts as stated by Reading Standard 10[5]. *(**Note:** In K and 1, Reading Standard 10 refers to read-aloud material, which is typically from grades 2+. Complexity standards for student-read texts are applicable for grades 2+.)* ☒ Yes ☐ No	**REQUIRED** **1a)** In grades 2-12, materials provide texts that are appropriately complex for the identified grade level according to the requirements outlined in the standards. Measures for determining complexity include quantitative and qualitative analysis.[6] Poetry and drama are analyzed only using qualitative measures. In grades K-2, extensive read-aloud texts allow sufficient opportunity for engagement with text more complex than students could read themselves.	**Yes**	Text selections are marked as easy, moderate, or challenging. In the Annotated Teacher's Edition, text selections are accompanied by a text complexity overview including Reading Level, Difficulty Considerations, and Ease Factors. These make note of both quantitative measures and qualitative factors. For example, on page 19 in the Grade 8 TE, Walter Dean Myers' short story "The Treasure of Lemon Brown" is noted as having an "Easy" reading level with a 760 Lexile. The materials further note Difficulty Considerations such as "length" and Ease Factors such as "suspense and vivid description." Though this Lexile is below the grade-band, students read this early in the year (Unit I) and are exposed to more complex texts as both the unit and year progresses. Later in Unit I, students read Garrison Keillor's short story "Gary Keillor" (1020 Lexile) and Cynthia Rylant's short story "Checkouts" (1360 Lexile). This is further noted in 1b.
	REQUIRED **1b)** Texts increase in complexity as materials progress throughout the grade level and across grade bands. Read-aloud texts follow the same trend, although they may have greater variability because listening skills in elementary school generally outpace reading skills.	**Yes**	Mirrors & Windows note that material was designed around the Gradual Release of Responsibility Model (GRRM). This ensures that texts increase in complexity as materials progress. A progression of complexity within units and throughout the grade level is noted. For example, "The Drummer Boy of Shiloh" by Ray Bradbury in Unit 1 has a 970 Lexile. Later in Unit I, students read Garrison Keillor's short story "Gary Keillor" (1020 Lexile) and

[5] Grades 3-12 Example: Texts present vocabulary, syntax, text structures, levels of meaning/purpose similar to exemplars in Appendix B.
[6] The process for determining quantitative and qualitative measures is available at http://www.louisianabelieves.com/docs/teacher-toolbox-resources/guide---how-to-determine-text-complexity-grades-k-12.pdf?sfvrsn=5 or the Supplemental Information for Appendix A.

CRITERIA	INDICATORS OF SUPERIOR QUALITY	MEETS METRICS (Yes/No)	JUSTIFICATION/ COMMENTS WITH COMMENTS
			Cynthia Rylant's short story "Checkouts" (1360 Lexile).
Tier 1 and 2 Non-Negotiable **2. QUALITY OF TEXTS:** Texts are of sufficient scope and quality to provide text-centered and integrated learning that is sequenced and scaffolded to advance students toward independent reading of grade level texts and build content knowledge (ELA, social studies, science and technical subjects, and the arts). The quality of texts is high—they support multiple readings for various purposes and exhibit exceptional craft and thought and/or provide useful information. ☒ Yes ☐ No	**REQUIRED** **2a)** 90% of texts provide rich opportunities for students to engage with tasks that allow them to meet the grade-level ELA standards using texts; the texts are well-crafted and authentic, representing the quality of content, language, and writing that is produced by experts in various disciplines (e.g., English language arts, history/social studies, science, technical subjects, and the arts).	**Yes**	90% of texts are worth reading. Texts are well-crafted and authentic, representing the quality of content, language, and writing produced by experts in various disciplines. Materials include short stories by Walter Dean Myers, Shirley Jackson, O.Henry, Daniel Keyes, and Virgina Hamilton, poems by T.S. Eliot, Naomi Shihab Nye, Amy Lowell, E.E. Cummings, Gary Soto, and Emma Lazarus, and texts from history/social studies, such as excerpt from Shelby Foote's "Echoes of Shiloh" and Nelson Mandela's speech "Our Struggle is Against All Forms of Racism."
	REQUIRED **2b)** Materials provide a coherent sequence or collection of connected texts that build vocabulary knowledge and knowledge about concepts, themes, and topics through reading, writing, listening and speaking. In grades K-2, the inclusion of read-aloud texts in addition to what students can read themselves ensures that all students can build knowledge about the world through engagement with rich, complex text. These texts as well must form a coherent sequence or collection of connected texts that build vocabulary knowledge and knowledge about concepts, themes, and topics through reading, writing, listening and speaking.	**Yes**	Materials provide a collection of texts that build knowledge systematically. Texts included in each unit are bound by a unifying theme: Unit 1 (Finding Ourselves); Unit 2 (Differing Perspectives); Unit 3 (Looking Back); Unit 4 (Expanding Horizons); Unit 5 (Living With Words); Unit 6 (Reaching Out); Unit 7 (Meeting Dangers); Unit 8 (Recalling Heroes). It should be noted that within units of study, students are only exposed to one genre per unit. For example, Units 1 and 2 are Fiction, Units 3 and 4 are Nonfiction, Units 5 and 6 are Poetry, Unit 7 is Drama, and Unit 8 is Folk Literature. Across the entire grade level, Mirrors & Windows provides a collection of texts that allow students to build knowledge through reading, writing, listening, and speaking.

CRITERIA	INDICATORS OF SUPERIOR QUALITY	MEETS METRICS (Yes/No)	JUSTIFICATION/ COMMENTS WITH COMMENTS
	REQUIRED **2c)** Within a sequence or collection of texts, specific anchor texts of grade-level complexity, as determined in 1a, are selected for multiple, careful readings throughout the unit of study.	**Yes**	Anchor texts are noted within a collection of texts. These anchor texts include Text-to-Text Connections and were selected for multiple, careful readings so that they can be compared to related informational and literary texts. For example, in grade 8, students read the anchor text "The Drummer Boy of Shiloh," a short story by Ray Bradbury. After reading the anchor text, students read and an excerpt from Shelby Foote's "Echoes from Shiloh" and are asked to "compare and contrast the difference between each author's methods of describing the volume of men involved in the battle."
	2d) 90% of texts are previously published rather than "commissioned."	**Yes**	Nearly all texts are previously published rather than commissioned.
3. RANGE AND VOLUME OF TEXTS: Materials reflect the distribution of text types and genres suggested by the standards: Text types and genres generally reflect the definitions provided on page 31 (grades K-5) and page 57 (grades 6-12) of the standards and included in the text of the standards (e.g., RL.K.9, RI.1.9, RI.2.3, RL.2.9, RL.9-10.6, RI.7.7, or RI.11-12.9).	**REQUIRED** **3a)** In grades K-12, ELA materials seek a balance in instructional time between 50% literature/ 50% informational texts. (Reviewers will consider a balance within units of study as well as across the entire grade level.)	**Not Evaluated**	This section was not evaluated because the non-negotiable criteria were not met.
	REQUIRED **3b)** Materials include texts of different formats (e.g., print and non-print, including film, art, music, charts, etc.) and lengths (e.g. short stories and novels).	**Not Evaluated**	This section was not evaluated because the non-negotiable criteria were not met.
	3c) Materials include many informational texts with an informational text structure rather than a narrative structure. In grades 6-12, materials include literary nonfiction (e.g. speeches, biographies, essays).	**Not Evaluated**	This section was not evaluated because the non-negotiable criteria were not met.

CRITERIA	INDICATORS OF SUPERIOR QUALITY	MEETS METRICS (Yes/No)	JUSTIFICATION/ COMMENTS WITH COMMENTS
☐ Yes ☐ No	**3d)** Additional materials increase the opportunity for regular, accountable independent reading of texts that appeal to students' interests to build reading stamina, confidence, motivation, and enjoyment and connect to classroom concepts or topics to develop knowledge.	**Not Evaluated**	This section was not evaluated because the non-negotiable criteria were not met.
II. Foundational Skills (grades K-5 only)			
Tier 1 and 2 Non-Negotiable* **4. FOUNDATIONAL SKILLS:** Materials provide instruction and diagnostic support in concepts of print, phonics, vocabulary, development, syntax, and fluency in a logical and transparent progression. These foundational skills are necessary and central components of an effective, comprehensive reading program designed to develop proficient readers with the capacity to comprehend texts across a range of types and disciplines. ☐ Yes ☐ No *As applicable (e.g., when the scope of the materials is comprehensive and considered a full program)	**REQUIRED *Indicator for grades K-2 only** **4a)** Materials follow a sequence of foundational skills instruction indicated by the standards and beginning on page 17 of Appendix A, while providing abundant opportunities for every student to become proficient in each of the foundational skills.	**N/A**	
	REQUIRED **4b)** In grades K-2, materials include student texts that allow for systematic, regular and frequent practice of foundational skills as they are introduced. In grades 3-5, materials demand knowledge of grade-level phonic patterns and word analysis skills.	**N/A**	
	REQUIRED **4c)** In grades K-2, materials provide instruction and practice in word study including pronunciation, roots, prefixes, suffixes and spelling/sound patterns, as well as decoding of grade-level words by using sound-symbol knowledge and knowledge of syllabication and regular practice in encoding (spelling) the sound symbol relationships of English. In grades 3-5, materials provide instruction and practice in word study including systematic examination of grade-level morphology, decoding of multisyllabic words by using syllabication, and automaticity with grade-level regular and irregular spelling patterns.	**N/A**	
	REQUIRED **4d)** Materials encourage students to use context to confirm	**N/A**	

CRITERIA	INDICATORS OF SUPERIOR QUALITY	MEETS METRICS (Yes/No)	JUSTIFICATION/ COMMENTS WITH COMMENTS
	or self-correct word recognition and understanding, directing students to reread purposefully to acquire accurate meaning.		
	REQUIRED **4e)** Opportunities are frequently built into the materials that allow for students to achieve reading fluency in oral and silent reading, that is, to read a wide variety of prose and poetry at students' reading level with accuracy, rate appropriate to the text, and expression.	**N/A**	
	REQUIRED **4f)** Materials guide students to read grade-level text with purpose and understanding and to make frequent connections between acquisition of foundation skills and making meaning from reading.	**N/A**	
	4g) *Indicator for grades K-2 only Materials provide opportunities for educators to monitor student progress on every aspect of the foundational skills through diagnostic assessments offered at regular intervals. Monitoring must also allow for students to receive regular feedback on their oral reading fluency in the specific areas of appropriate rate, expressiveness and accuracy.	**N/A**	
	4h) Submissions provide abundant and easily implemented materials so teachers can readily provide more time, attention and practice for those students who need it.	**N/A**	
III. Questions and Tasks			
Tier 1 and 2 Non-Negotiable **5. TEXT-DEPENDENT QUESTIONS:** Text-dependent questions and tasks reflect the requirements of Reading Standard 1 by requiring use of textual evidence in support of meeting other grade-specific standards.	**REQUIRED** **5a)** At least 80% of all questions in the materials are text-dependent questions; student ideas are expressed through both written and spoken responses.	**No**	Text-dependent questions are included in both the Annotated Teacher Edition and the Student Edition as well as the supplemental Common Core Assessment Practice resources. Even though evidence of text-dependent questions in the Common Core Assessment Practice resource is found more than 80% of time, questions and tasks in the Teacher and Student Edition/s do not support students in meeting other grade-specific questions and do not always require students to refer back to the text to support their answers, so this indicator is not

CRITERIA	INDICATORS OF SUPERIOR QUALITY	MEETS METRICS (Yes/No)	JUSTIFICATION/ COMMENTS WITH COMMENTS
☐ Yes ☒ No			met. For example, writing tasks often ask students to "write a new scene for this story." Students are not, for example, directed to mimic the author's style or tone. As questions like these are found throughout the Teacher and Student Edition/s, this indicator is not met.
	REQUIRED **5b)** Coherent sequences of questions and tasks focus students on understanding the text and its illustrations (as applicable), expressing the knowledge students have built about concepts, themes, or ideas presented in the texts, and making connections among the texts in the collection.	**No**	Questions in both the Teacher and Student Edition/s are noted as first asking students to "Find Meaning" in the text and then to "Make Judgments" about the text using examples to support their answers. A writing task typically follows. However, questions do not appear sequenced, nor do they appear to build on each other throughout the unit so that students are given the opportunity to make connections among the texts in a collection/unit.
	REQUIRED **5c)** Questions and tasks include the language of the standards, and assess the depth and complexity required by the standards at each grade-level over time to advance and deepen student learning. *(**Note:** not every standard must be assessed with every text.)*	**No**	Questions in the Common Core Assessment Practice resource include the language of the standards and assess the depth and complexity required by the standards at least 80% of the time. Questions in the Teacher and Student Edition/s do not. Questions found in these materials are often divided into two categories "Find Meaning" and "Make Judgements." For example, after reading Gary Soto's short story "Born Worker," students are asked "What does Joses parents do for a living?" and "What was Jose like as a child?" The associated writing task for this piece is also

CRITERIA	INDICATORS OF SUPERIOR QUALITY	MEETS METRICS (Yes/No)	JUSTIFICATION/ COMMENTS WITH COMMENTS
			weak, asking students to "write a new scene for this story." These questions do not include the language of the standards, and because questions like these are found throughout the Teacher and Student Edition/s, this indicator is not met.
	REQUIRED **5d)** Questions and tasks support students in examining the language (vocabulary, sentences, and structure) of texts measured by Criteria 1, 2, and 3 to determine meaning; questions and tasks also focus on engaging students with multiple repetitions of words in varied contexts (e.g., reading different texts, completing tasks, engaging in speaking/listening).	**Yes**	Questions in the Common Core Assessment Pratice resource support students in examining the language of texts measured by Criteria 1, 2, and 3 to determine meaning. After reading "Jim Thorpe: An Exceptional Life," students are asked "What is the meaning of the word grueling as it is used in this sentence from the fourth paragraph: 'He earned gold medals in the grueling pentathalon and decathalon contests, which demand skill in five and ten separate events, respectively.'" In a Part B to this question, students are asked to identify the phrase in the paragraph that gives the best clue to the meaning they chose. It should be noted that in the Teacher and Student Edition/s, vocabulary is often defined for students in footnotes or sidebars. Still, questions and tasks throughout the material support students in examining the language of texts, so this indicator is met.
6. ASSESSMENT: Materials offer assessment opportunities that genuinely measure progress and elicit direct, observable evidence of	**REQUIRED** **6a)** Measurement of progress via assessments should include gradual release of supporting scaffolds for students to measure their independent abilities.	**Not Evaluated**	This section was not evaluated because the non-negotiable criteria were not met.

CRITERIA	INDICATORS OF SUPERIOR QUALITY	MEETS METRICS (Yes/No)	JUSTIFICATION/ COMMENTS WITH COMMENTS
the degree to which students can independently demonstrate the assessed grade-specific standards with appropriately complex text(s). ☐ Yes ☐ No	**REQUIRED** **6b)** Aligned rubrics or assessment guidelines (such as scoring guides or student work exemplars) are included and provide sufficient guidance for interpreting student performance.	**Not Evaluated**	This section was not evaluated because the non-negotiable criteria were not met.
	REQUIRED **6c)** Materials use varied modes of assessment, including a range of pre-, formative, summative and self-assessment measures.	**Not Evaluated**	This section was not evaluated because the non-negotiable criteria were not met.
	6d) Materials assess student proficiency using methods that are unbiased and accessible to all students.	**Not Evaluated**	This section was not evaluated because the non-negotiable criteria were not met.
IV. Scaffolding and Support			
7. SCAFFOLDING AND SUPPORT: Materials provide all students, including those who read below grade level, with extensive opportunities and support to encounter and comprehend grade-level complex text as required by the standards. ☐ Yes ☐ No	**REQUIRED** **7a)** Pre-reading activities and suggested approaches to teacher scaffolding are focused and engage students with understanding the text itself. Pre-reading activities should be no more than 10% of time devoted to any reading instruction.	**Not Evaluated**	This section was not evaluated because the non-negotiable criteria were not met.
	REQUIRED **7b)** Materials must have the goal of students gaining full comprehension of complex text (through read-aloud in grades K-1) and do not confuse or substitute mastery of strategies for full comprehension of text; reading strategies support comprehension of specific texts and focus on building knowledge and insight. Texts must not serve as platforms to practice discrete strategies.	**Not Evaluated**	This section was not evaluated because the non-negotiable criteria were not met.
	REQUIRED **7c)** Materials regularly direct teachers to return to focused parts of the text to guide students through rereading, discussion and writing about the ideas, events, and information found there.	**Not Evaluated**	This section was not evaluated because the non-negotiable criteria were not met.

CRITERIA	INDICATORS OF SUPERIOR QUALITY	MEETS METRICS (Yes/No)	JUSTIFICATION/ COMMENTS WITH COMMENTS
	REQUIRED **7d)** The materials are easy to use and cleanly laid out for students and teachers. The reading selections are centrally located within the materials and obviously the center of focus.	**Not Evaluated**	This section was not evaluated because the non-negotiable criteria were not met.
	7e) Appropriate suggestions and materials are provided for supporting varying student needs at the unit and lesson level (e.g., alternate teaching approaches, pacing, instructional delivery options, suggestions for addressing common student difficulties to meet standards, remediation strategies or suggestions for supporting texts, suggestions for more advanced texts for extension, etc.).	**Not Evaluated**	This section was not evaluated because the non-negotiable criteria were not met.
	7f) The content can be reasonably completed within a regular school year and the pacing of content allows for maximum student understanding. The materials provide guidance about the amount of time a task might reasonably take.	**Not Evaluated**	This section was not evaluated because the non-negotiable criteria were not met.
V. Writing to Sources and Research			
8. WRITING TO SOURCES: The majority of written tasks are text-dependent and reflect the writing genres named in the standards.	**REQUIRED *Indicator for grades 3-12 only** **8a)** A vast majority of written tasks at all grade levels require students to demonstrate the knowledge they built through the analysis and synthesis of texts, and present well--defended claims and clear information, drawing on textual evidence to support valid inferences from text.	**Not Evaluated**	This section was not evaluated because the non-negotiable criteria were not met.

CRITERIA	INDICATORS OF SUPERIOR QUALITY	MEETS METRICS (Yes/No)	JUSTIFICATION/ COMMENTS WITH COMMENTS
☐ Yes ☐ No	**REQUIRED** **8b)** Materials include multiple writing tasks aligned to the three modes of writing (opinion/argumentative, informative, narrative) as outlined by the standards at each grade level. In grades 3-12, tasks included blended modes (i.e., analytical writing); narrative prompts decrease in number and increase in being based on text(s) as student progress through the grades, e.g., narrative description (text-based, chronological writing) rather than imaginative narratives.	**Not Evaluated**	This section was not evaluated because the non-negotiable criteria were not met.
	REQUIRED **8c)** Writing opportunities for students are prominent and varied in length and time demands (e.g., notes, summaries, short-answer responses, whole-class shared writing/formal essays, on-demand and process writing, etc.).	**Not Evaluated**	This section was not evaluated because the non-negotiable criteria were not met.
	REQUIRED **8d)** Materials build in opportunities for connections between writing, speaking and listening, reading, and the language standards. For example, in grade 1, students listen to a text being read, work collaboratively to develop a plan for writing, write independently filling out an answer frame, and then share their writing with a peer who reviews the writing against a word wall to ensure high frequency words are spelled correctly. For example, in grade 6, students read a text, work collaboratively to develop a plan for analyzing or emulating the text, write a response, and then share their writing with a peer who reviews the writing against using a peer review checklist.	**Not Evaluated**	This section was not evaluated because the non-negotiable criteria were not met.
	REQUIRED *Indicator for grades K-2 only **8e)** Submissions address grade-level foundation standards that require students in the early grades to know their letters, phonetic conventions, sentence structures, and spelling.	**Not Evaluated**	This section was not evaluated because the non-negotiable criteria were not met.

CRITERIA	INDICATORS OF SUPERIOR QUALITY	MEETS METRICS (Yes/No)	JUSTIFICATION/ COMMENTS WITH COMMENTS
	8f) *Indicator for grades K-2 only Materials provide opportunities for educators to monitor student progress in the development of these foundational skills and respond to the needs of individual students. This monitoring should include attention to invented spelling as appropriate for its diagnostic value.	**Not Evaluated**	This section was not evaluated because the non-negotiable criteria were not met.
	8g) Materials engage students in many shared (grades K-2) or short research projects annually to develop the expertise needed to conduct research independently.	**Not Evaluated**	This section was not evaluated because the non-negotiable criteria were not met.
VI. Speaking and Listening			
9. SPEAKING AND LISTENING: Oral tasks must be text-dependent and materials for speaking and listening must reflect true communication skills required for college and career readiness. ☐ Yes ☐ No	**REQUIRED** **9a)** Speaking and listening questions and tasks use the texts measured by Criteria 1, 2, and 3.	**Not Evaluated**	This section was not evaluated because the non-negotiable criteria were not met.
	REQUIRED **9b)** Materials demand that students engage effectively (as determined by grade-level standards) in a range of conversations and collaborations with peers about texts.	**Not Evaluated**	This section was not evaluated because the non-negotiable criteria were not met.
	REQUIRED **9c)** Materials build in frequent opportunities for connections between speaking and listening, reading, writing, and the language standards. For example, in grades K-12, materials build in frequent opportunities for discussion about texts and, through directions and modeling, encourage students to use academic language and grade-appropriate oral language conventions. In grades 3-12, materials require students to gather and use evidence to orally present findings from research.	**Not Evaluated**	This section was not evaluated because the non-negotiable criteria were not met.
	9d) Materials develop active listening skills, such as taking notes on main ideas, asking relevant questions, and elaborating on remarks of others to develop understanding of complex texts and tasks.	**Not Evaluated**	This section was not evaluated because the non-negotiable criteria were not met.

CRITERIA	INDICATORS OF SUPERIOR QUALITY	MEETS METRICS (Yes/No)	JUSTIFICATION/ COMMENTS WITH COMMENTS
VII. Language			
10. LANGUAGE: Materials must adequately address the Language standards for the grade, including through unpacking the vocabulary and syntax of text(s) (indicator 5e) as models of language use. ☐ Yes ☐ No	**REQUIRED** **10a)** Materials address the grammar and language conventions specified by the Language standards at each grade level and build on those standards that build from previous grade levels, as indicated by pages 30 and 56 of the standards.	**Not Evaluated**	This section was not evaluated because the non-negotiable criteria were not met.
	REQUIRED **10b)** Materials create opportunities for students to discover accurate usage patterns, compare them to their own (oral and written), and develop proficiency in usage and language conventions.	**Not Evaluated**	This section was not evaluated because the non-negotiable criteria were not met.
	REQUIRED **10c)** Selected vocabulary focuses on words critical to the meaning of the texts included in Criteria 1, 2, and 3. Materials also require students to model their own writing after texts measured by Criteria 1, 2, and 3 as a way to develop more complex sentence structure and language usage.	**Not Evaluated**	This section was not evaluated because the non-negotiable criteria were not met.
	REQUIRED **10d)** Vocabulary study emphasizes advancing depth of word knowledge through determining word meaning and relationships among words (e.g., concept- and thematically-related words, word families, etc.).	**Not Evaluated**	This section was not evaluated because the non-negotiable criteria were not met.
	REQUIRED **10e)** Materials build in frequent opportunities for connections between the language standards, writing, reading, and speaking and listening. For example, through directions and modeling, materials encourage students to use grade-appropriate language conventions when speaking and writing about texts.	**Not Evaluated**	This section was not evaluated because the non-negotiable criteria were not met.
	10f) Materials provide real-world activities for student practice with natural language (e.g. mock interviews, presentations).	**Not Evaluated**	This section was not evaluated because the non-negotiable criteria were not met.

CRITERIA	INDICATORS OF SUPERIOR QUALITY	MEETS METRICS (Yes/No)	JUSTIFICATION/ COMMENTS WITH COMMENTS
FINAL EVALUATION ***Tier 1 ratings*** receive a "Yes" in Column 1 for Criteria 1 – 10. ***Tier 2 ratings*** receive a "Yes" in Column 1 for all non-negotiable criteria (Foundational Skills (as applicable), Complexity of Texts, Quality of Texts, and Text-Dependent Questions), but at least one "No" in Column 1 for the remaining criteria. ***Tier 3 ratings*** receive a "No" in Column 1 for at least one of the non-negotiable criteria.			
Compile the results for Sections I-VII to make a final decision for the material under review.			
Section	**Criteria**	**Yes/No**	**Final Justification/Comments**
I: Text Selection	1. Complexity of Texts **(Non-Negotiable)**	**Yes**	In the Annotated Teacher's Edition, text selections are accompanied by a text complexity overview including Reading Level, Difficulty Considerations, and Ease Factors. This makes note of both quantitative measures and qualitative factors.
	2. Quality of Texts **(Non-Negotiable)**	**Yes**	Pieces are well-crafted, high-quality, and previously published. Specific anchor texts are selected for multiple, careful readings within the units. These anchor texts include Text-to-Text Connections so that students may compare these texts to related informational and literary texts.
	3. Range and Volume of Texts	**Not Evaluated**	This section was not evaluated because the non-negotiable criteria were not met.
II: Foundational Skills	4. Foundational Skills **(Non-Negotiable*)**	**N/A**	
III: Text-Dependent Questions and Tasks	5. Text-Dependent Questions **(Non-Negotiable)**	**No**	While the majority of questions and tasks are text-dependent, questions and tasks in the textbook itself do not always assess the depth and complexity required by the standards. Questions and tasks found in the supplemental Common Core Assessment Practice resource do.
	6. Assessment	**Not Evaluated**	This section was not evaluated because the non-negotiable criteria were not met.
IV: Scaffolding and Support	7. Scaffolding and Support	**Not Evaluated**	This section was not evaluated because the non-negotiable criteria were not met.

CRITERIA	INDICATORS OF SUPERIOR QUALITY	MEETS METRICS (Yes/No)	JUSTIFICATION/ COMMENTS WITH COMMENTS
V: Writing to Sources and Research	8. Writing to Sources	**Not Evaluated**	This section was not evaluated because the non-negotiable criteria were not met.
VI: Speaking and Listening	9. Speaking and Listening	**Not Evaluated**	This section was not evaluated because the non-negotiable criteria were not met.
VII: Language	10. Language	**Not Evaluated**	This section was not evaluated because the non-negotiable criteria were not met.
FINAL DECISION FOR THIS MATERIAL: **Tier III, Not representing quality**			

*As applicable (e.g., when the scope of the materials is comprehensive and considered a full program)