Instructional Materials Evaluation - Student Standards Review

Louisiana educators engaged in a professional review of the state's academic standards for English language arts (ELA) and mathematics to ensure they continue to maintain strong expectations for teaching and learning aligned with college and workplace demands. The new ELA and math standards will be effective beginning with the 2016-2017 school year. As part of the Louisiana Department of Education's support for a seamless transition to these new standards, the LDOE identified the major changes of the standards and their potential impact upon criteria used to review instructional materials.

Title: **Mirrors & Windows: Connecting with Literature** Grade: **9-12**

Publisher: **EMC Publishing, LLC** Copyright: **2016**

Overall Rating: **Tier III, Not representing quality**

This English Language Arts review has been examined for the following changes in alignment resulting from the Louisiana Student Standards Review:

- Materials do not contain references to specific authors and texts
- Include citing *relevant* textual evidence beginning in grade 6
- Include an *awareness of audience* when making speeches and delivering presentations

This review remains a Tier 3 rating. As a result of these changes, the following chart identifies the potential impact on specific elements in the current review. The LDOE recommends that district curriculum staff, principals, and teachers take these findings into consideration when using these instructional materials.

Criteria	Currently in the Rubric	Next Steps for Educators
Quality of Texts (Non-Negotiable)	This program currently is reviewed as "No" for this criteria because while anchor texts are identified in each unit, there are no clear indicators as to how close reading of these anchor texts is supported by other texts in the unit.	Since these materials received a "No" for this indicator, the current weakness will likely remain and should be addressed by adjusting or supplementing with stronger programs.
Text-Dependent Questions (Non-Negotiable)	This program currently is reviewed as "No" for this criteria in grades 9-11 because questions provided are low level and primarily focus on student comprehension. There is no evidence that questions build upon one another allowing students to be able to express knowledge about more complex concepts, themes, or ideas presented in the text. This program currently is reviewed as a "Yes" for this criteria in grade 12 because questions require students to refer back to the text for evidence and build through the five levels of questioning.	Since these materials received a "No" for this indicator in grades 9-11, the current weakness will likely remain and should be addressed by adjusting or supplementing with stronger programs. Make sure to revise questions and tasks to require students in grade 12 to cite relevant textual evidence to support their ideas.
Speaking and Listening	This section was not evaluated because the non-negotiable criterion were not met.	

DEPARTMENT of EDUCATION
Louisiana Believes

Instructional Materials Evaluation Review for Alignment in ELA Grades K – 12 (IMET)

FULL CURRICULUM
Instructional Materials

The goal for ELA students is that they can read and understand grade-level texts independently, as demonstrated through writing and speaking about those texts. A strong ELA classroom is structured with the below components.

Title: **Mirrors & Windows: Connecting with Literature** Grade: **9-12**

Publisher: **EMC Publishing, LLC** Copyright: **2016**

Overall Rating: **Tier III, Not representing quality**

Tier I, Tier II, Tier III Elements of this review:

STRONG	WEAK
1. Complexity of Texts (Non-Negotiable)	2. Quality of Texts (Non-Negotiable)
	5. Text-Dependent Questions (Non-Negotiable) *
	* Strong at Grade 12

Each set of submitted materials was evaluated for alignment with the standards beginning with a review of the indicators for the non-negotiable criteria. If those criteria were met, a review of the other criteria ensued.

Tier 1 ratings received a "Yes" for all Criteria 1-10.
Tier 2 ratings received a "Yes" for all non-negotiable criteria (Foundational Skills (as applicable), Complexity of Texts, Quality of Texts, and Text-Dependent Questions), but at least one "No" for the remaining criteria.
Tier 3 ratings received a "No" for at least one of the non-negotiable criteria.

Click below for complete grade-level reviews:

Grade 9 (Tier 3) Grade 10 (Tier 3) Grade 11 (Tier 3) Grade 12 (Tier 3)

The goal for ELA students is that they can read and understand grade-level texts independently, as demonstrated through writing and speaking about those texts. A strong ELA classroom is structured with the below components.

Title: **Mirrors & Windows: Connecting with Literature** Grade: **9**

Publisher: **EMC Publishing, LLC** Copyright: **2016**

Overall Rating: **Tier III, Not representing quality**

Tier I, Tier II, Tier III Elements of this review:

STRONG	WEAK
1. Complexity of Texts (Non-Negotiable)	2. Quality of Texts (Non-Negotiable)
	5. Text-Dependent Questions (Non-Negotiable)

To evaluate each set of submitted materials for alignment with the standards, begin by reviewing Column 2 for the non-negotiable criteria. If there is a "Yes" for all required indicators in Column 2, then the materials receive a "Yes" in Column 1. If there is a "No" for any required indicators in Column 2, then the materials receive a "No" in Column 1. (Note: If materials do not represent a full curricula, then some of Criteria 1 – 10 may not apply.)

Tier 1 ratings receive a "Yes" in Column 1 for Criteria 1 – 10.
Tier 2 ratings receive a "Yes" in Column 1 for all non-negotiable criteria (Foundational Skills (as applicable), Complexity of Texts, Quality of Texts, and Text-Dependent Questions), but at least one "No" in Column 1 for the remaining criteria.
Tier 3 ratings receive a "No" in Column 1 for at least one of the non-negotiable criteria.

CRITERIA	INDICATORS OF SUPERIOR QUALITY	MEETS METRICS (Yes/No)	JUSTIFICATION/ COMMENTS WITH COMMENTS
I. Text Selection			
Tier 1 and 2 Non-Negotiable **1. COMPLEXITY OF TEXTS:** Materials present a progression of complex texts as stated by Reading Standard 10[1]. *(**Note:** In K and 1, Reading Standard 10 refers to read-aloud material, which is typically from grades 2+. Complexity standards for student-read texts are applicable for grades 2+.)* ☒ Yes ☐ No	**REQUIRED** **1a)** In grades 2-12, materials provide texts that are appropriately complex for the identified grade level according to the requirements outlined in the standards. Measures for determining complexity include quantitative and qualitative analysis.[2] Poetry and drama are analyzed only using qualitative measures. In grades K-2, extensive read-aloud texts allow sufficient opportunity for engagement with text more complex than students could read themselves.	**Yes**	Texts are classified as easy, moderate, or challenging. Descriptors of each level are provided in the Teacher Edition to justify alignment to text complexity bands. For example, on page 901 the Teacher Edition identifies "The Censors" as a moderatly challenging text with a Lexile level of 1170. The publsih provides further justification of the descriptor by noting that the "Difficulty Considerations: Irony, unfamiliar setting, unfamiliar concepts" and, " East Factor: Length".
	REQUIRED **1b)** Texts increase in complexity as materials progress throughout the grade level and across grade bands. Read-aloud texts follow the same trend, although they may have greater variability because listening skills in elementary school generally outpace reading skills.	**Yes**	Texts are aligned with complexity requirements for this grade level. For example, In unit one, students read "The Most Dangerous Game" which has a Lexile level of 690 and is rated moderate but as students progress through unit three, they read "442nd Regimental Combat Team" which has a Lexile level of 1030 and is rated moderate. By the end of the year, students are reading "Cyclops Myth Spurred by "One-Eyed" Fossils?" which has a Lexile level of 1260 and is rated challenging. This demonstrates an increase in text complexity as the materials progress.
Tier 1 and 2 Non-Negotiable **2. QUALITY OF TEXTS:** Texts are of sufficient scope and quality to provide text-centered	**REQUIRED** **2a)** 90% of texts provide rich opportunities for students to engage with tasks that allow them to meet the grade-level ELA standards using texts; the texts are well-crafted and	**Yes**	At least 90% of the text are content rich and include various topics. For example, "Glory and Hope" a speech with a world history connection and "When it Comes to Pesticides, Birds are Sitting Ducks," a science

[1] Grades 3-12 Example: Texts present vocabulary, syntax, text structures, levels of meaning/purpose similar to exemplars in Appendix B.
[2] The process for determining quantitative and qualitative measures is available at http://www.louisianabelieves.com/docs/teacher-toolbox-resources/guide---how-to-determine-text-complexity-grades-k-12.pdf?sfvrsn=5 or the Supplemental Information for Appendix A.

CRITERIA	INDICATORS OF SUPERIOR QUALITY	MEETS METRICS (Yes/No)	JUSTIFICATION/ COMMENTS WITH COMMENTS
and integrated learning that is sequenced and scaffolded to advance students toward independent reading of grade level texts and build content knowledge (ELA, social studies, science and technical subjects, and the arts). The quality of texts is high—they support multiple readings for various purposes and exhibit exceptional craft and thought and/or provide useful information. ☐ Yes ☒ No	authentic, representing the quality of content, language, and writing that is produced by experts in various disciplines (e.g., English language arts, history/social studies, science, technical subjects, and the arts).		connection.
	REQUIRED **2b)** Materials provide a coherent sequence or collection of connected texts that build vocabulary knowledge and knowledge about concepts, themes, and topics through reading, writing, listening and speaking. In grades K-2, the inclusion of read-aloud texts in addition to what students can read themselves ensures that all students can build knowledge about the world through engagement with rich, complex text. These texts as well must form a coherent sequence or collection of connected texts that build vocabulary knowledge and knowledge about concepts, themes, and topics through reading, writing, listening and speaking.	**Yes**	The collection of texts builds knowledge systematically by establishing six units. The units consist of: Short stories, Nonfiction, Poetry, Drama, Folk Literataure and Reading Independently.
	REQUIRED **2c)** Within a sequence or collection of texts, specific anchor texts of grade-level complexity, as determined in 1a, are selected for multiple, careful readings throughout the unit of study.	**No**	While anchor texts are identified in each unit, there are no clear indicators as to how close reading of these anchor texts is supported by other texts in the unit.
	2d) 90% of texts are previously published rather than "commissioned."	**Yes**	Almost all works appear to be previously published, and many of the informational texts are primary documents or analytical essays about literature.
3. RANGE AND VOLUME OF TEXTS: Materials reflect the distribution of text types and genres suggested by the standards: Text types and genres generally reflect the definitions provided on page 31 (grades K-5) and page 57	**REQUIRED** **3a)** In grades K-12, ELA materials seek a balance in instructional time between 50% literature/ 50% informational texts. (Reviewers will consider a balance within units of study as well as across the entire grade level.)	**Not Evaluated**	This section was not evaluated because the non-negotiable criteria were not met.
	REQUIRED **3b)** Materials include texts of different formats (e.g., print and non-print, including film, art, music, charts, etc.) and	**Not Evaluated**	This section was not evaluated because the non-negotiable criteria were not met.

CRITERIA	INDICATORS OF SUPERIOR QUALITY	MEETS METRICS (Yes/No)	JUSTIFICATION/ COMMENTS WITH COMMENTS
(grades 6-12) of the standards and included in the text of the standards (e.g., RL.K.9, RI.1.9, RI.2.3, RL.2.9, RL.9-10.6, RI.7.7, or RI.11-12.9). ☐ Yes ☐ No	lengths (e.g. short stories and novels).		
	3c) Materials include many informational texts with an informational text structure rather than a narrative structure. In grades 6-12, materials include literary nonfiction (e.g. speeches, biographies, essays).	**Not Evaluated**	This section was not evaluated because the non-negotiable criteria were not met.
	3d) Additional materials increase the opportunity for regular, accountable independent reading of texts that appeal to students' interests to build reading stamina, confidence, motivation, and enjoyment and connect to classroom concepts or topics to develop knowledge.	**Not Evaluated**	This section was not evaluated because the non-negotiable criteria were not met.
II. Foundational Skills (grades K-5 only)			
Tier 1 and 2 Non-Negotiable* **4. FOUNDATIONAL SKILLS:** Materials provide instruction and diagnostic support in concepts of print, phonics, vocabulary, development, syntax, and fluency in a logical and transparent progression. These foundational skills are necessary and central components of an effective, comprehensive reading program designed to develop proficient readers with the capacity to comprehend texts across a range of types and disciplines. ☐ Yes ☐ No *As applicable (e.g., when the	**REQUIRED *Indicator for grades K-2 only** **4a)** Materials follow a sequence of foundational skills instruction indicated by the standards and beginning on page 17 of Appendix A, while providing abundant opportunities for every student to become proficient in each of the foundational skills.	**N/A**	
	REQUIRED **4b)** In grades K-2, materials include student texts that allow for systematic, regular and frequent practice of foundational skills as they are introduced. In grades 3-5, materials demand knowledge of grade-level phonic patterns and word analysis skills.	**N/A**	
	REQUIRED **4c)** In grades K-2, materials provide instruction and practice in word study including pronunciation, roots, prefixes, suffixes and spelling/sound patterns, as well as decoding of grade-level words by using sound-symbol knowledge and knowledge of syllabication and regular practice in encoding (spelling) the sound symbol relationships of English.	**N/A**	

CRITERIA	INDICATORS OF SUPERIOR QUALITY	MEETS METRICS (Yes/No)	JUSTIFICATION/ COMMENTS WITH COMMENTS
scope of the materials is comprehensive and considered a full program)	In grades 3-5, materials provide instruction and practice in word study including systematic examination of grade-level morphology, decoding of multisyllabic words by using syllabication, and automaticity with grade-level regular and irregular spelling patterns.		
	REQUIRED **4d)** Materials encourage students to use context to confirm or self-correct word recognition and understanding, directing students to reread purposefully to acquire accurate meaning.	**N/A**	
	REQUIRED **4e)** Opportunities are frequently built into the materials that allow for students to achieve reading fluency in oral and silent reading, that is, to read a wide variety of prose and poetry at students' reading level with accuracy, rate appropriate to the text, and expression.	**N/A**	
	REQUIRED **4f)** Materials guide students to read grade-level text with purpose and understanding and to make frequent connections between acquisition of foundation skills and making meaning from reading.	**N/A**	
	4g) *Indicator for grades K-2 only Materials provide opportunities for educators to monitor student progress on every aspect of the foundational skills through diagnostic assessments offered at regular intervals. Monitoring must also allow for students to receive regular feedback on their oral reading fluency in the specific areas of appropriate rate, expressiveness and accuracy.	**N/A**	
	4h) Submissions provide abundant and easily implemented materials so teachers can readily provide more time, attention and practice for those students who need it.	**N/A**	
III. Questions and Tasks			
Tier 1 and 2 Non-Negotiable **5. TEXT-DEPENDENT QUESTIONS:** Text-dependent questions and	**REQUIRED** **5a)** At least 80% of all questions in the materials are text-dependent questions; student ideas are expressed through both written and spoken responses.	**Yes**	The Teachers Edition provides text dependent questions that teachers are to ask as they read complex text. For example, while reading "The Odysseus" students are asked, "How woul this story be

CRITERIA	INDICATORS OF SUPERIOR QUALITY	MEETS METRICS (Yes/No)	JUSTIFICATION/ COMMENTS WITH COMMENTS
tasks reflect the requirements of Reading Standard 1 by requiring use of textual evidence in support of meeting other grade-specific standards. ☐ Yes ☒ No			different without the interference of the gods?" and "What does the goddess Circe do to Odysseus's men?" Furthermore, after each selection there are two categories of questions, "Refer to Text" and "Reason with Text." The "Refer to Text" questions are text dependent. For example, after reading "Cyclops Myth Spurred by "One-Eyed" Fossils?" students are asked, "Identify what suggestion is made regarding fossils and acient myths." However, questions under "Reason with Text" are not text dependent. For example, following the same text, students are asked "Think of other historic monsters and mysteries. Explain where these might have originated." So, while some of the questions in the materials provided are in need of revision, 80% of questions are text-dependent.
	REQUIRED **5b)** Coherent sequences of questions and tasks focus students on understanding the text and its illustrations (as applicable), expressing the knowledge students have built about concepts, themes, or ideas presented in the texts, and making connections among the texts in the collection.	**No**	Questions provided are low level and primarily focus on student comprehension. There is no evidence that questions build upon one another allowing students to be able to express knowledge about more complex concepts, themes or ideas that are presented in the text. For example, the questions provided for the text "The Teacher Who Changed My Life" include, " Why would the idea of hobbies and clubs make no sense to the young Nicholas Cage?", "Identify the writing topic Miss Hurd assigns Gage."
	REQUIRED **5c)** Questions and tasks include the language of the standards, and assess the depth and complexity required by the standards at each grade-level over time to advance and deepen student learning. *(**Note:** not every standard must be assessed with every text.)*	**No**	As noted earlier, the vast majority of questions are low level comprehension questions or text-to-self or text-to-world connections. Questions that do address the standards lack the complexity and sophitication that the standards require. For example, on page 218 students are asked, "Explain the controlling idea of the author's purpose in writing this memoir." While the reading standard two does address central idea, the

CRITERIA	INDICATORS OF SUPERIOR QUALITY	MEETS METRICS (Yes/No)	JUSTIFICATION/ COMMENTS WITH COMMENTS
			standard requires that students, "determine a theme or central idea of a text and analyze in detail its development over the course of the text, including how it emerges and is shaped and refined by specific details…" The questions the publishers have provided will require revisions in order to meet the demands of the standards.
	REQUIRED **5d)** Questions and tasks support students in examining the language (vocabulary, sentences, and structure) of texts measured by Criteria 1, 2, and 3 to determine meaning; questions and tasks also focus on engaging students with multiple repetitions of words in varied contexts (e.g., reading different texts, completing tasks, engaging in speaking/listening).	**No**	There is no evidence of students examining the language of the texts provided. While the Teacher Edition does make note of using context clues as a reading strategy, the instruction and level of analysis required does not meet the demands of the standards. Furthermore, there is no evidence of students closely examining craft and structure.
6. ASSESSMENT: Materials offer assessment opportunities that genuinely measure progress and elicit direct, observable evidence of the degree to which students can independently demonstrate the assessed grade-specific standards with appropriately complex text(s). ☐ Yes ☐ No	**REQUIRED** **6a)** Measurement of progress via assessments should include gradual release of supporting scaffolds for students to measure their independent abilities.	**Not Evaluated**	This section was not evaluated because the non-negotiable criteria were not met.
	REQUIRED **6b)** Aligned rubrics or assessment guidelines (such as scoring guides or student work exemplars) are included and provide sufficient guidance for interpreting student performance.	**Not Evaluated**	This section was not evaluated because the non-negotiable criteria were not met.
	REQUIRED **6c)** Materials use varied modes of assessment, including a range of pre-, formative, summative and self-assessment measures.	**Not Evaluated**	This section was not evaluated because the non-negotiable criteria were not met.
	6d) Materials assess student proficiency using methods that are unbiased and accessible to all students.	**Not Evaluated**	This section was not evaluated because the non-negotiable criteria were not met.

CRITERIA	INDICATORS OF SUPERIOR QUALITY	MEETS METRICS (Yes/No)	JUSTIFICATION/ COMMENTS WITH COMMENTS
IV. Scaffolding and Support			
7. SCAFFOLDING AND SUPPORT: Materials provide all students, including those who read below grade level, with extensive opportunities and support to encounter and comprehend grade-level complex text as required by the standards. ☐ Yes ☐ No	**REQUIRED** **7a)** Pre-reading activities and suggested approaches to teacher scaffolding are focused and engage students with understanding the text itself. Pre-reading activities should be no more than 10% of time devoted to any reading instruction.	**Not Evaluated**	This section was not evaluated because the non-negotiable criteria were not met.
	REQUIRED **7b)** Materials must have the goal of students gaining full comprehension of complex text (through read-aloud in grades K-1) and do not confuse or substitute mastery of strategies for full comprehension of text; reading strategies support comprehension of specific texts and focus on building knowledge and insight. Texts must not serve as platforms to practice discrete strategies.	**Not Evaluated**	This section was not evaluated because the non-negotiable criteria were not met.
	REQUIRED **7c)** Materials regularly direct teachers to return to focused parts of the text to guide students through rereading, discussion and writing about the ideas, events, and information found there.	**Not Evaluated**	This section was not evaluated because the non-negotiable criteria were not met.
	REQUIRED **7d)** The materials are easy to use and cleanly laid out for students and teachers. The reading selections are centrally located within the materials and obviously the center of focus.	**Not Evaluated**	This section was not evaluated because the non-negotiable criteria were not met.
	7e) Appropriate suggestions and materials are provided for supporting varying student needs at the unit and lesson level (e.g., alternate teaching approaches, pacing, instructional delivery options, suggestions for addressing common student difficulties to meet standards, remediation strategies or suggestions for supporting texts, suggestions for more	**Not Evaluated**	This section was not evaluated because the non-negotiable criteria were not met.

CRITERIA	INDICATORS OF SUPERIOR QUALITY	MEETS METRICS (Yes/No)	JUSTIFICATION/ COMMENTS WITH COMMENTS
	advanced texts for extension, etc.).		
	7f) The content can be reasonably completed within a regular school year and the pacing of content allows for maximum student understanding. The materials provide guidance about the amount of time a task might reasonably take.	**Not Evaluated**	This section was not evaluated because the non-negotiable criteria were not met.
V. Writing to Sources and Research			
8. WRITING TO SOURCES: The majority of written tasks are text-dependent and reflect the writing genres named in the standards. ☐ Yes ☐ No	**REQUIRED *Indicator for grades 3-12 only** **8a)** A vast majority of written tasks at all grade levels require students to demonstrate the knowledge they built through the analysis and synthesis of texts, and present well--defended claims and clear information, drawing on textual evidence to support valid inferences from text.	**Not Evaluated**	This section was not evaluated because the non-negotiable criteria were not met.
	REQUIRED **8b)** Materials include multiple writing tasks aligned to the three modes of writing (opinion/argumentative, informative, narrative) as outlined by the standards at each grade level. In grades 3-12, tasks included blended modes (i.e., analytical writing); narrative prompts decrease in number and increase in being based on text(s) as student progress through the grades, e.g., narrative description (text-based, chronological writing) rather than imaginative narratives.	**Not Evaluated**	This section was not evaluated because the non-negotiable criteria were not met.
	REQUIRED **8c)** Writing opportunities for students are prominent and varied in length and time demands (e.g., notes, summaries, short-answer responses, whole-class shared writing/formal essays, on-demand and process writing, etc.).	**Not Evaluated**	This section was not evaluated because the non-negotiable criteria were not met.
	REQUIRED **8d)** Materials build in opportunities for connections between writing, speaking and listening, reading, and the language standards. For example, in grade 1, students listen to a text being read, work collaboratively to develop a plan for writing,	**Not Evaluated**	This section was not evaluated because the non-negotiable criteria were not met.

CRITERIA	INDICATORS OF SUPERIOR QUALITY	MEETS METRICS (Yes/No)	JUSTIFICATION/ COMMENTS WITH COMMENTS
	write independently filling out an answer frame, and then share their writing with a peer who reviews the writing against a word wall to ensure high frequency words are spelled correctly. For example, in grade 6, students read a text, work collaboratively to develop a plan for analyzing or emulating the text, write a response, and then share their writing with a peer who reviews the writing against using a peer review checklist.		
	REQUIRED *Indicator for grades K-2 only **8e)** Submissions address grade-level foundation standards that require students in the early grades to know their letters, phonetic conventions, sentence structures, and spelling.	**Not Evaluated**	This section was not evaluated because the non-negotiable criteria were not met.
	8f) *Indicator for grades K-2 only Materials provide opportunities for educators to monitor student progress in the development of these foundational skills and respond to the needs of individual students. This monitoring should include attention to invented spelling as appropriate for its diagnostic value.	**Not Evaluated**	This section was not evaluated because the non-negotiable criteria were not met.
	8g) Materials engage students in many shared (grades K-2) or short research projects annually to develop the expertise needed to conduct research independently.	**Not Evaluated**	This section was not evaluated because the non-negotiable criteria were not met.
VI. Speaking and Listening			
9. SPEAKING AND LISTENING: Oral tasks must be text-dependent and materials for speaking and listening must reflect true communication skills required for college and career readiness. ☐ Yes ☐ No	**REQUIRED** **9a)** Speaking and listening questions and tasks use the texts measured by Criteria 1, 2, and 3.	**Not Evaluated**	This section was not evaluated because the non-negotiable criteria were not met.
	REQUIRED **9b)** Materials demand that students engage effectively (as determined by grade-level standards) in a range of conversations and collaborations with peers about texts.	**Not Evaluated**	This section was not evaluated because the non-negotiable criteria were not met.
	REQUIRED **9c)** Materials build in frequent opportunities for connections between speaking and listening, reading, writing, and the language standards. For example, in grades K-12, materials	**Not Evaluated**	This section was not evaluated because the non-negotiable criteria were not met.

CRITERIA	INDICATORS OF SUPERIOR QUALITY	MEETS METRICS (Yes/No)	JUSTIFICATION/ COMMENTS WITH COMMENTS
	build in frequent opportunities for discussion about texts and, through directions and modeling, encourage students to use academic language and grade-appropriate oral language conventions. In grades 3-12, materials require students to gather and use evidence to orally present findings from research.		
	9d) Materials develop active listening skills, such as taking notes on main ideas, asking relevant questions, and elaborating on remarks of others to develop understanding of complex texts and tasks.	**Not Evaluated**	This section was not evaluated because the non-negotiable criteria were not met.
VII. Language			
10. LANGUAGE: Materials must adequately address the Language standards for the grade, including through unpacking the vocabulary and syntax of text(s) (indicator 5e) as models of language use. ☐ Yes ☐ No	**REQUIRED** **10a)** Materials address the grammar and language conventions specified by the Language standards at each grade level and build on those standards that build from previous grade levels, as indicated by pages 30 and 56 of the standards.	**Not Evaluated**	This section was not evaluated because the non-negotiable criteria were not met.
	REQUIRED **10b)** Materials create opportunities for students to discover accurate usage patterns, compare them to their own (oral and written), and develop proficiency in usage and language conventions.	**Not Evaluated**	This section was not evaluated because the non-negotiable criteria were not met.
	REQUIRED **10c)** Selected vocabulary focuses on words critical to the meaning of the texts included in Criteria 1, 2, and 3. Materials also require students to model their own writing after texts measured by Criteria 1, 2, and 3 as a way to develop more complex sentence structure and language usage.	**Not Evaluated**	This section was not evaluated because the non-negotiable criteria were not met.
	REQUIRED **10d)** Vocabulary study emphasizes advancing depth of word knowledge through determining word meaning and relationships among words (e.g., concept- and thematically-related words, word families, etc.).	**Not Evaluated**	This section was not evaluated because the non-negotiable criteria were not met.
	REQUIRED **10e)** Materials build in frequent opportunities for	**Not Evaluated**	This section was not evaluated because the non-negotiable criteria were not met.

CRITERIA	INDICATORS OF SUPERIOR QUALITY	MEETS METRICS (Yes/No)	JUSTIFICATION/ COMMENTS WITH COMMENTS
	connections between the language standards, writing, reading, and speaking and listening. For example, through directions and modeling, materials encourage students to use grade-appropriate language conventions when speaking and writing about texts.		
	10f) Materials provide real-world activities for student practice with natural language (e.g. mock interviews, presentations).	**Not Evaluated**	This section was not evaluated because the non-negotiable criteria were not met.

FINAL EVALUATION
Tier 1 ratings receive a "Yes" in Column 1 for Criteria 1 – 10.
Tier 2 ratings receive a "Yes" in Column 1 for all non-negotiable criteria (Foundational Skills (as applicable), Complexity of Texts, Quality of Texts, and Text-Dependent Questions), but at least one "No" in Column 1 for the remaining criteria.
Tier 3 ratings receive a "No" in Column 1 for at least one of the non-negotiable criteria.

Compile the results for Sections I-VII to make a final decision for the material under review.

Section	Criteria	Yes/No	Final Justification/Comments
I: Text Selection	1. Complexity of Texts **(Non-Negotiable)**	**Yes**	Texts are at the appropriate complexity level, and justification for placement as easy, moderate, or challenging is provided in Teacher Edition.
	2. Quality of Texts **(Non-Negotiable)**	**No**	Anchor texts are identified but are not developed as meaningful texts within the unit. Anchor texts are not reread for close understanding and are not connected to other supporting texts in unit.
	3. Range and Volume of Texts	**Not Evaluated**	This section was not evaluated because the non-negotiable criteria were not met.
II: Foundational Skills	4. Foundational Skills **(Non-Negotiable*)**	**N/A**	
III: Text-Dependent Questions and Tasks	5. Text-Dependent Questions **(Non-Negotiable)**	**No**	Although many of the questions provided are text-dependent, the questions provided do not meet the rigor or complexity of the standards. .

CRITERIA	INDICATORS OF SUPERIOR QUALITY	MEETS METRICS (Yes/No)	JUSTIFICATION/ COMMENTS WITH COMMENTS
	6. Assessment	**Not Evaluated**	This section was not evaluated because the non-negotiable criteria were not met.
IV: Scaffolding and Support	7. Scaffolding and Support	**Not Evaluated**	This section was not evaluated because the non-negotiable criteria were not met.
V: Writing to Sources and Research	8. Writing to Sources	**Not Evaluated**	This section was not evaluated because the non-negotiable criteria were not met.
VI: Speaking and Listening	9. Speaking and Listening	**Not Evaluated**	This section was not evaluated because the non-negotiable criteria were not met.
VII: Language	10. Language	**Not Evaluated**	This section was not evaluated because the non-negotiable criteria were not met.
FINAL DECISION FOR THIS MATERIAL: **Tier III, Not representing quality**			

*As applicable (e.g., when the scope of the materials is comprehensive and considered a full program)

The goal for ELA students is that they can read and understand grade-level texts independently, as demonstrated through writing and speaking about those texts. A strong ELA classroom is structured with the below components.

Title: **Mirrors & Windows: Connecting with Literature** Grade: **10**

Publisher: **EMC Publishing, LLC** Copyright: **2016**

Overall Rating: **Tier III, Not representing quality**

Tier I, Tier II, Tier III Elements of this review:

STRONG	WEAK
1. Complexity of Texts (Non-Negotiable)	2. Quality of Texts (Non-Negotiable)
	5. Text-Dependent Questions (Non-Negotiable)

To evaluate each set of submitted materials for alignment with the standards, begin by reviewing Column 2 for the non-negotiable criteria. If there is a "Yes" for all required indicators in Column 2, then the materials receive a "Yes" in Column 1. If there is a "No" for any required indicators in Column 2, then the materials receive a "No" in Column 1. (Note: If materials do not represent a full curricula, then some of Criteria 1 – 10 may not apply.)

Tier 1 ratings receive a "Yes" in Column 1 for Criteria 1 – 10.
Tier 2 ratings receive a "Yes" in Column 1 for all non-negotiable criteria (Foundational Skills (as applicable), Complexity of Texts, Quality of Texts, and Text-Dependent Questions), but at least one "No" in Column 1 for the remaining criteria.
Tier 3 ratings receive a "No" in Column 1 for at least one of the non-negotiable criteria.

CRITERIA	INDICATORS OF SUPERIOR QUALITY	MEETS METRICS (Yes/No)	JUSTIFICATION/ COMMENTS WITH COMMENTS
I. Text Selection			
Tier 1 and 2 Non-Negotiable **1. COMPLEXITY OF TEXTS:** Materials present a progression of complex texts as stated by Reading Standard 10[3]. *(**Note:** In K and 1, Reading Standard 10 refers to read-aloud material, which is typically from grades 2+. Complexity standards for student-read texts are applicable for grades 2+.)* ☒ Yes ☐ No	**REQUIRED** **1a)** In grades 2-12, materials provide texts that are appropriately complex for the identified grade level according to the requirements outlined in the standards. Measures for determining complexity include quantitative and qualitative analysis.[4] Poetry and drama are analyzed only using qualitative measures. In grades K-2, extensive read-aloud texts allow sufficient opportunity for engagement with text more complex than students could read themselves.	**Yes**	Texts are classified as easy, moderate, or challenging. Descriptors of each level are provided in the Teacher Edition to justify alignment to text complexity bands.
	REQUIRED **1b)** Texts increase in complexity as materials progress throughout the grade level and across grade bands. Read-aloud texts follow the same trend, although they may have greater variability because listening skills in elementary school generally outpace reading skills.	**Yes**	Texts are aligned with complexity requirements for this grade level and are identified exemplars in the table of contents. Examples are: Unit One, "The Open Window" which has a lexile score of 850; Unit Four, "Antigone", which has a lexile score of 940 " and in Unite Five "The Ingenious Hidalgo Don Quixote", which has a lexile score of 1500. Texts also increase in complexity across grade bands.
Tier 1 and 2 Non-Negotiable **2. QUALITY OF TEXTS:** Texts are of sufficient scope and quality to provide text-centered and integrated learning that is sequenced and scaffolded to advance students toward independent reading of grade level texts and build content knowledge (ELA, social studies,	**REQUIRED** **2a)** 90% of texts provide rich opportunities for students to engage with tasks that allow them to meet the grade-level ELA standards using texts; the texts are well-crafted and authentic, representing the quality of content, language, and writing that is produced by experts in various disciplines (e.g., English language arts, history/social studies, science, technical subjects, and the arts).	**Yes**	At least 90% of the texts are worth reading. All of the text are content rich and include various topics. For example, "Getting it Right at Ground Zero" and "We Heard It Before We saw Anything" about a Tsunami.
	REQUIRED **2b)** Materials provide a coherent sequence or collection of	**Yes**	The collection of texts builds knowledge systematically by establishing six units. The units consist of: Short

[3] Grades 3-12 Example: Texts present vocabulary, syntax, text structures, levels of meaning/purpose similar to exemplars in Appendix B.
[4] The process for determining quantitative and qualitative measures is available at http://www.louisianabelieves.com/docs/teacher-toolbox-resources/guide---how-to-determine-text-complexity-grades-k-12.pdf?sfvrsn=5 or the Supplemental Information for Appendix A.

CRITERIA	INDICATORS OF SUPERIOR QUALITY	MEETS METRICS (Yes/No)	JUSTIFICATION/ COMMENTS WITH COMMENTS
science and technical subjects, and the arts). The quality of texts is high—they support multiple readings for various purposes and exhibit exceptional craft and thought and/or provide useful information. ☐ Yes ☒ No	connected texts that build vocabulary knowledge and knowledge about concepts, themes, and topics through reading, writing, listening and speaking. In grades K-2, the inclusion of read-aloud texts in addition to what students can read themselves ensures that all students can build knowledge about the world through engagement with rich, complex text. These texts as well must form a coherent sequence or collection of connected texts that build vocabulary knowledge and knowledge about concepts, themes, and topics through reading, writing, listening and speaking.		stories, Nonfiction, Poetry, Drama, Folk Literataure and Reading Independently.
	REQUIRED **2c)** Within a sequence or collection of texts, specific anchor texts of grade-level complexity, as determined in 1a, are selected for multiple, careful readings throughout the unit of study.	**No**	While anchor texts are identified in each unit, there are no clear indicators as to how close reading of these anchor texts is supported by other texts in the unit.
	2d) 90% of texts are previously published rather than "commissioned."	**Yes**	Almost all works appear to be previously published and many of the informational texts are primary documents or analytical essays about literature.
3. RANGE AND VOLUME OF TEXTS: Materials reflect the distribution of text types and genres suggested by the standards: Text types and genres generally reflect the definitions provided on page 31 (grades K-5) and page 57 (grades 6-12) of the standards and included in the text of the standards (e.g., RL.K.9, RI.1.9, RI.2.3, RL.2.9, RL.9-10.6, RI.7.7, or RI.11-12.9).	**REQUIRED** **3a)** In grades K-12, ELA materials seek a balance in instructional time between 50% literature/ 50% informational texts. (Reviewers will consider a balance within units of study as well as across the entire grade level.)	**Not Evaluated**	This section was not evaluated because the non-negotiable criteria were not met.
	REQUIRED **3b)** Materials include texts of different formats (e.g., print and non-print, including film, art, music, charts, etc.) and lengths (e.g. short stories and novels).	**Not Evaluated**	This section was not evaluated because the non-negotiable criteria were not met.
	3c) Materials include many informational texts with an informational text structure rather than a narrative structure. In grades 6-12, materials include literary nonfiction (e.g. speeches, biographies, essays).	**Not Evaluated**	This section was not evaluated because the non-negotiable criteria were not met.

CRITERIA	INDICATORS OF SUPERIOR QUALITY	MEETS METRICS (Yes/No)	JUSTIFICATION/ COMMENTS WITH COMMENTS
☐ Yes ☐ No	**3d)** Additional materials increase the opportunity for regular, accountable independent reading of texts that appeal to students' interests to build reading stamina, confidence, motivation, and enjoyment and connect to classroom concepts or topics to develop knowledge.	**Not Evaluated**	This section was not evaluated because the non-negotiable criteria were not met.
II. Foundational Skills (grades K-5 only)			
Tier 1 and 2 Non-Negotiable* **4. FOUNDATIONAL SKILLS:** Materials provide instruction and diagnostic support in concepts of print, phonics, vocabulary, development, syntax, and fluency in a logical and transparent progression. These foundational skills are necessary and central components of an effective, comprehensive reading program designed to develop proficient readers with the capacity to comprehend texts across a range of types and disciplines. ☐ Yes ☐ No *As applicable (e.g., when the scope of the materials is comprehensive and considered a full program)	**REQUIRED *Indicator for grades K-2 only** **4a)** Materials follow a sequence of foundational skills instruction indicated by the standards and beginning on page 17 of Appendix A, while providing abundant opportunities for every student to become proficient in each of the foundational skills.	**N/A**	
	REQUIRED **4b)** In grades K-2, materials include student texts that allow for systematic, regular and frequent practice of foundational skills as they are introduced. In grades 3-5, materials demand knowledge of grade-level phonic patterns and word analysis skills.	**N/A**	
	REQUIRED **4c)** In grades K-2, materials provide instruction and practice in word study including pronunciation, roots, prefixes, suffixes and spelling/sound patterns, as well as decoding of grade-level words by using sound-symbol knowledge and knowledge of syllabication and regular practice in encoding (spelling) the sound symbol relationships of English. In grades 3-5, materials provide instruction and practice in word study including systematic examination of grade-level morphology, decoding of multisyllabic words by using syllabication, and automaticity with grade-level regular and irregular spelling patterns.	**N/A**	
	REQUIRED **4d)** Materials encourage students to use context to confirm	**N/A**	

CRITERIA	INDICATORS OF SUPERIOR QUALITY	MEETS METRICS (Yes/No)	JUSTIFICATION/ COMMENTS WITH COMMENTS
	or self-correct word recognition and understanding, directing students to reread purposefully to acquire accurate meaning.		
	REQUIRED **4e)** Opportunities are frequently built into the materials that allow for students to achieve reading fluency in oral and silent reading, that is, to read a wide variety of prose and poetry at students' reading level with accuracy, rate appropriate to the text, and expression.	**N/A**	
	REQUIRED **4f)** Materials guide students to read grade-level text with purpose and understanding and to make frequent connections between acquisition of foundation skills and making meaning from reading.	**N/A**	
	4g) *Indicator for grades K-2 only Materials provide opportunities for educators to monitor student progress on every aspect of the foundational skills through diagnostic assessments offered at regular intervals. Monitoring must also allow for students to receive regular feedback on their oral reading fluency in the specific areas of appropriate rate, expressiveness and accuracy.	**N/A**	
	4h) Submissions provide abundant and easily implemented materials so teachers can readily provide more time, attention and practice for those students who need it.	**N/A**	
III. Questions and Tasks			
Tier 1 and 2 Non-Negotiable **5. TEXT-DEPENDENT QUESTIONS:** Text-dependent questions and tasks reflect the requirements of Reading Standard 1 by requiring use of textual evidence in support of meeting other grade-specific standards.	**REQUIRED** **5a)** At least 80% of all questions in the materials are text-dependent questions; student ideas are expressed through both written and spoken responses.	**Yes**	80% of questions are text-dependent. Question stems often point students back to re-read portions of text. For example, in the "Iroquois Constitution" students answer questions like "Identify all the references to nature in the Iroquois Constituion. What do these descriptions reveal about the Iroquois people's relationship with nature?" Another examples is in the text "A Journey Through Texas", one of the questions students will answer is "Find examples from the text that show why Cabeza de Vaca might have believed stories about advanced civilization and wealth."

CRITERIA	INDICATORS OF SUPERIOR QUALITY	MEETS METRICS (Yes/No)	JUSTIFICATION/ COMMENTS WITH COMMENTS
☐ Yes ☒ No			
	REQUIRED **5b)** Coherent sequences of questions and tasks focus students on understanding the text and its illustrations (as applicable), expressing the knowledge students have built about concepts, themes, or ideas presented in the texts, and making connections among the texts in the collection.	**Yes**	The sequence of questions elicit sustained attention to the text by driving the student back to the text itself. The essay question in "The Monkey's Paw" ask about irony and ask the learner to write about irony using excerpts from the short story. "Through the Tunnel/Death of a Young Son by Drowning", ask about the authors use of symbols. Each texts has an essay questions which expresses the knowledge students have built about concepts, themes, or ideas presented in the text.
	REQUIRED **5c)** Questions and tasks include the language of the standards, and assess the depth and complexity required by the standards at each grade-level over time to advance and deepen student learning. *(**Note:** not every standard must be assessed with every text.)*	**No**	No, while the standards do address the first three reading standards of the Common Core, I do not see evidence of questions requiring that students analyze craft and structure nor do I see questions that address the Integration standards.
	REQUIRED **5d)** Questions and tasks support students in examining the language (vocabulary, sentences, and structure) of texts measured by Criteria 1, 2, and 3 to determine meaning; questions and tasks also focus on engaging students with multiple repetitions of words in varied contexts (e.g., reading different texts, completing tasks, engaging in speaking/listening).	**Yes**	End of text questions do focus on unpacking academic language. For example in unit two, questions ask students "In the excerpts from Walden, what does the word earnest mean?"
6. ASSESSMENT: Materials offer assessment opportunities that genuinely measure progress and elicit direct, observable evidence of	**REQUIRED** **6a)** Measurement of progress via assessments should include gradual release of supporting scaffolds for students to measure their independent abilities.	**Not Evaluated**	This section was not evaluated because the non-negotiable criteria were not met.

CRITERIA	INDICATORS OF SUPERIOR QUALITY	MEETS METRICS (Yes/No)	JUSTIFICATION/ COMMENTS WITH COMMENTS
the degree to which students can independently demonstrate the assessed grade-specific standards with appropriately complex text(s). ☐ Yes ☐ No	**REQUIRED** **6b)** Aligned rubrics or assessment guidelines (such as scoring guides or student work exemplars) are included and provide sufficient guidance for interpreting student performance.	**Not Evaluated**	This section was not evaluated because the non-negotiable criteria were not met.
	REQUIRED **6c)** Materials use varied modes of assessment, including a range of pre-, formative, summative and self-assessment measures.	**Not Evaluated**	This section was not evaluated because the non-negotiable criteria were not met.
	6d) Materials assess student proficiency using methods that are unbiased and accessible to all students.	**Not Evaluated**	This section was not evaluated because the non-negotiable criteria were not met.
IV. Scaffolding and Support			
7. SCAFFOLDING AND SUPPORT: Materials provide all students, including those who read below grade level, with extensive opportunities and support to encounter and comprehend grade-level complex text as required by the standards. ☐ Yes ☐ No	**REQUIRED** **7a)** Pre-reading activities and suggested approaches to teacher scaffolding are focused and engage students with understanding the text itself. Pre-reading activities should be no more than 10% of time devoted to any reading instruction.	**Not Evaluated**	This section was not evaluated because the non-negotiable criteria were not met.
	REQUIRED **7b)** Materials must have the goal of students gaining full comprehension of complex text (through read-aloud in grades K-1) and do not confuse or substitute mastery of strategies for full comprehension of text; reading strategies support comprehension of specific texts and focus on building knowledge and insight. Texts must not serve as platforms to practice discrete strategies.	**Not Evaluated**	This section was not evaluated because the non-negotiable criteria were not met.
	REQUIRED **7c)** Materials regularly direct teachers to return to focused parts of the text to guide students through rereading, discussion and writing about the ideas, events, and information found there.	**Not Evaluated**	This section was not evaluated because the non-negotiable criteria were not met.

CRITERIA	INDICATORS OF SUPERIOR QUALITY	MEETS METRICS (Yes/No)	JUSTIFICATION/ COMMENTS WITH COMMENTS
	REQUIRED **7d)** The materials are easy to use and cleanly laid out for students and teachers. The reading selections are centrally located within the materials and obviously the center of focus.	**Not Evaluated**	This section was not evaluated because the non-negotiable criteria were not met.
	7e) Appropriate suggestions and materials are provided for supporting varying student needs at the unit and lesson level (e.g., alternate teaching approaches, pacing, instructional delivery options, suggestions for addressing common student difficulties to meet standards, remediation strategies or suggestions for supporting texts, suggestions for more advanced texts for extension, etc.).	**Not Evaluated**	This section was not evaluated because the non-negotiable criteria were not met.
	7f) The content can be reasonably completed within a regular school year and the pacing of content allows for maximum student understanding. The materials provide guidance about the amount of time a task might reasonably take.	**Not Evaluated**	This section was not evaluated because the non-negotiable criteria were not met.
V. Writing to Sources and Research			
8. WRITING TO SOURCES: The majority of written tasks are text-dependent and reflect the writing genres named in the standards.	**REQUIRED *Indicator for grades 3-12 only** **8a)** A vast majority of written tasks at all grade levels require students to demonstrate the knowledge they built through the analysis and synthesis of texts, and present well--defended claims and clear information, drawing on textual evidence to support valid inferences from text.	**Not Evaluated**	This section was not evaluated because the non-negotiable criteria were not met.

CRITERIA	INDICATORS OF SUPERIOR QUALITY	MEETS METRICS (Yes/No)	JUSTIFICATION/ COMMENTS WITH COMMENTS
☐ Yes ☐ No	**REQUIRED** **8b)** Materials include multiple writing tasks aligned to the three modes of writing (opinion/argumentative, informative, narrative) as outlined by the standards at each grade level. In grades 3-12, tasks included blended modes (i.e., analytical writing); narrative prompts decrease in number and increase in being based on text(s) as student progress through the grades, e.g., narrative description (text-based, chronological writing) rather than imaginative narratives.	**Not Evaluated**	This section was not evaluated because the non-negotiable criteria were not met.
	REQUIRED **8c)** Writing opportunities for students are prominent and varied in length and time demands (e.g., notes, summaries, short-answer responses, whole-class shared writing/formal essays, on-demand and process writing, etc.).	**Not Evaluated**	This section was not evaluated because the non-negotiable criteria were not met.
	REQUIRED **8d)** Materials build in opportunities for connections between writing, speaking and listening, reading, and the language standards. For example, in grade 1, students listen to a text being read, work collaboratively to develop a plan for writing, write independently filling out an answer frame, and then share their writing with a peer who reviews the writing against a word wall to ensure high frequency words are spelled correctly. For example, in grade 6, students read a text, work collaboratively to develop a plan for analyzing or emulating the text, write a response, and then share their writing with a peer who reviews the writing against using a peer review checklist.	**Not Evaluated**	This section was not evaluated because the non-negotiable criteria were not met.
	REQUIRED *Indicator for grades K-2 only **8e)** Submissions address grade-level foundation standards that require students in the early grades to know their letters, phonetic conventions, sentence structures, and spelling.	**Not Evaluated**	This section was not evaluated because the non-negotiable criteria were not met.

CRITERIA	INDICATORS OF SUPERIOR QUALITY	MEETS METRICS (Yes/No)	JUSTIFICATION/ COMMENTS WITH COMMENTS
	8f) *Indicator for grades K-2 only Materials provide opportunities for educators to monitor student progress in the development of these foundational skills and respond to the needs of individual students. This monitoring should include attention to invented spelling as appropriate for its diagnostic value.	**Not Evaluated**	This section was not evaluated because the non-negotiable criteria were not met.
	8g) Materials engage students in many shared (grades K-2) or short research projects annually to develop the expertise needed to conduct research independently.	**Not Evaluated**	This section was not evaluated because the non-negotiable criteria were not met.
VI. Speaking and Listening			
9. SPEAKING AND LISTENING: Oral tasks must be text-dependent and materials for speaking and listening must reflect true communication skills required for college and career readiness. ☐ Yes ☐ No	**REQUIRED** **9a)** Speaking and listening questions and tasks use the texts measured by Criteria 1, 2, and 3.	**Not Evaluated**	This section was not evaluated because the non-negotiable criteria were not met.
	REQUIRED **9b)** Materials demand that students engage effectively (as determined by grade-level standards) in a range of conversations and collaborations with peers about texts.	**Not Evaluated**	This section was not evaluated because the non-negotiable criteria were not met.
	REQUIRED **9c)** Materials build in frequent opportunities for connections between speaking and listening, reading, writing, and the language standards. For example, in grades K-12, materials build in frequent opportunities for discussion about texts and, through directions and modeling, encourage students to use academic language and grade-appropriate oral language conventions. In grades 3-12, materials require students to gather and use evidence to orally present findings from research.	**Not Evaluated**	This section was not evaluated because the non-negotiable criteria were not met.
	9d) Materials develop active listening skills, such as taking notes on main ideas, asking relevant questions, and elaborating on remarks of others to develop understanding of complex texts and tasks.	**Not Evaluated**	This section was not evaluated because the non-negotiable criteria were not met.

CRITERIA	INDICATORS OF SUPERIOR QUALITY	MEETS METRICS (Yes/No)	JUSTIFICATION/ COMMENTS WITH COMMENTS
VII. Language			
10. LANGUAGE: Materials must adequately address the Language standards for the grade, including through unpacking the vocabulary and syntax of text(s) (indicator 5e) as models of language use. ☐ Yes ☐ No	**REQUIRED** **10a)** Materials address the grammar and language conventions specified by the Language standards at each grade level and build on those standards that build from previous grade levels, as indicated by pages 30 and 56 of the standards.	**Not Evaluated**	This section was not evaluated because the non-negotiable criteria were not met.
	REQUIRED **10b)** Materials create opportunities for students to discover accurate usage patterns, compare them to their own (oral and written), and develop proficiency in usage and language conventions.	**Not Evaluated**	This section was not evaluated because the non-negotiable criteria were not met.
	REQUIRED **10c)** Selected vocabulary focuses on words critical to the meaning of the texts included in Criteria 1, 2, and 3. Materials also require students to model their own writing after texts measured by Criteria 1, 2, and 3 as a way to develop more complex sentence structure and language usage.	**Not Evaluated**	This section was not evaluated because the non-negotiable criteria were not met.
	REQUIRED **10d)** Vocabulary study emphasizes advancing depth of word knowledge through determining word meaning and relationships among words (e.g., concept- and thematically-related words, word families, etc.).	**Not Evaluated**	This section was not evaluated because the non-negotiable criteria were not met.
	REQUIRED **10e)** Materials build in frequent opportunities for connections between the language standards, writing, reading, and speaking and listening. For example, through directions and modeling, materials encourage students to use grade-appropriate language conventions when speaking and writing about texts.	**Not Evaluated**	This section was not evaluated because the non-negotiable criteria were not met.
	10f) Materials provide real-world activities for student practice with natural language (e.g. mock interviews, presentations).	**Not Evaluated**	This section was not evaluated because the non-negotiable criteria were not met.

CRITERIA	INDICATORS OF SUPERIOR QUALITY	MEETS METRICS (Yes/No)	JUSTIFICATION/ COMMENTS WITH COMMENTS
FINAL EVALUATION ***Tier 1 ratings*** receive a "Yes" in Column 1 for Criteria 1 – 10. ***Tier 2 ratings*** receive a "Yes" in Column 1 for all non-negotiable criteria (Foundational Skills (as applicable), Complexity of Texts, Quality of Texts, and Text-Dependent Questions), but at least one "No" in Column 1 for the remaining criteria. ***Tier 3 ratings*** receive a "No" in Column 1 for at least one of the non-negotiable criteria.			
Compile the results for Sections I-VII to make a final decision for the material under review.			
Section	**Criteria**	**Yes/No**	**Final Justification/Comments**
I: Text Selection	1. Complexity of Texts **(Non-Negotiable)**	**Yes**	Texts are at the appropriate complexity level, and justification for placement as easy, moderate, or challenging is provided in Teacher Edition.
	2. Quality of Texts **(Non-Negotiable)**	**No**	Anchor texts are identified but are not developed as meaningful texts within the unit. Anchor texts are not reread for close understanding and are not connected to other supporting texts in unit.
	3. Range and Volume of Texts	**Not Evaluated**	This section was not evaluated because the non-negotiable criteria were not met.
II: Foundational Skills	4. Foundational Skills **(Non-Negotiable*)**	**N/A**	
III: Text-Dependent Questions and Tasks	5. Text-Dependent Questions **(Non-Negotiable)**	**No**	While 80% or more of the questions are text-dependent and drive the student back to the texts, the vast majority of the questions do not address the complexity of the Common Core State Standards for the eleventh grade.
	6. Assessment	**Not Evaluated**	This section was not evaluated because the non-negotiable criteria were not met.
IV: Scaffolding and Support	7. Scaffolding and Support	**Not Evaluated**	This section was not evaluated because the non-negotiable criteria were not met.

CRITERIA	INDICATORS OF SUPERIOR QUALITY	MEETS METRICS (Yes/No)	JUSTIFICATION/ COMMENTS WITH COMMENTS
V: Writing to Sources and Research	8. Writing to Sources	**Not Evaluated**	This section was not evaluated because the non-negotiable criteria were not met.
VI: Speaking and Listening	9. Speaking and Listening	**Not Evaluated**	This section was not evaluated because the non-negotiable criteria were not met.
VII: Language	10. Language	**Not Evaluated**	This section was not evaluated because the non-negotiable criteria were not met.
FINAL DECISION FOR THIS MATERIAL: **Tier III, Not representing quality**			

*As applicable (e.g., when the scope of the materials is comprehensive and considered a full program)

The goal for ELA students is that they can read and understand grade-level texts independently, as demonstrated through writing and speaking about those texts. A strong ELA classroom is structured with the below components.

Title: **Mirrors & Windows: Connecting with Literature** Grade: **11**

Publisher: **EMC Publishing, LLC** Copyright: **2016**

Overall Rating: **Tier III, Not representing quality**

Tier I, Tier II, Tier III Elements of this review:

STRONG	WEAK
1. Complexity of Texts (Non-Negotiable)	2. Quality of Texts (Non-Negotiable)
	5. Text-Dependent Questions (Non-Negotiable)

To evaluate each set of submitted materials for alignment with the standards, begin by reviewing Column 2 for the non-negotiable criteria. If there is a "Yes" for all required indicators in Column 2, then the materials receive a "Yes" in Column 1. If there is a "No" for any required indicators in Column 2, then the materials receive a "No" in Column 1. (Note: If materials do not represent a full curricula, then some of Criteria 1 – 10 may not apply.)

Tier 1 ratings receive a "Yes" in Column 1 for Criteria 1 – 10.
Tier 2 ratings receive a "Yes" in Column 1 for all non-negotiable criteria (Foundational Skills (as applicable), Complexity of Texts, Quality of Texts, and Text-Dependent Questions), but at least one "No" in Column 1 for the remaining criteria.
Tier 3 ratings receive a "No" in Column 1 for at least one of the non-negotiable criteria.

CRITERIA	INDICATORS OF SUPERIOR QUALITY	MEETS METRICS (Yes/No)	JUSTIFICATION/ COMMENTS WITH COMMENTS
I. Text Selection			
Tier 1 and 2 Non-Negotiable **1. COMPLEXITY OF TEXTS:** Materials present a progression of complex texts as stated by Reading Standard 10[5]. *(**Note:** In K and 1, Reading Standard 10 refers to read-aloud material, which is typically from grades 2+. Complexity standards for student-read texts are applicable for grades 2+.)* ☒ Yes ☐ No	**REQUIRED** **1a)** In grades 2-12, materials provide texts that are appropriately complex for the identified grade level according to the requirements outlined in the standards. Measures for determining complexity include quantitative and qualitative analysis.[6] Poetry and drama are analyzed only using qualitative measures. In grades K-2, extensive read-aloud texts allow sufficient opportunity for engagement with text more complex than students could read themselves.	**Yes**	Texts are classified as easy, moderate, or challenging. Descriptors of each level are provided in the Teacher Edition to justify alignment to text complexity bands.For example, on page 94 students read "Sinners in the Hands of an Angry God" which has been identified as challenging with a Lexile of 1290.
	REQUIRED **1b)** Texts increase in complexity as materials progress throughout the grade level and across grade bands. Read-aloud texts follow the same trend, although they may have greater variability because listening skills in elementary school generally outpace reading skills.	**Yes**	Texts increase in complexity as the year progresses. For example, in unit one, students read "from The Interesting Narrative of the Life of Olaudah Equiano, or Gustavus Vassa, the African, Written by Himself" which has a Lexile level of 1220 and is rated moderate but as students progress through unit four, they read "from The Souls of Black Folks" which has a Lexile level of 1400 and is rated moderate. By the end of the year in unit 8, students are reading "The Handsomest Drowned Man in the World" which has a Lexile level of 1550and is rated moderate. This demonstrates an increase in text complexity as the materials progress.
Tier 1 and 2 Non-Negotiable **2. QUALITY OF TEXTS:** Texts are of sufficient scope and quality to provide text-centered and integrated learning that is sequenced and scaffolded to	**REQUIRED** **2a)** 90% of texts provide rich opportunities for students to engage with tasks that allow them to meet the grade-level ELA standards using texts; the texts are well-crafted and authentic, representing the quality of content, language, and writing that is produced by experts in various disciplines (e.g.,	**Yes**	At least 90% of the texts are worth reading. All of the text are content rich and include various topics. For example, "Getting it Right at Ground Zero" and We Heard It Before We saw Anything" about a Tsunami.

[5] Grades 3-12 Example: Texts present vocabulary, syntax, text structures, levels of meaning/purpose similar to exemplars in Appendix B.
[6] The process for determining quantitative and qualitative measures is available at http://www.louisianabelieves.com/docs/teacher-toolbox-resources/guide---how-to-determine-text-complexity-grades-k-12.pdf?sfvrsn=5 or the Supplemental Information for Appendix A.

CRITERIA	INDICATORS OF SUPERIOR QUALITY	MEETS METRICS (Yes/No)	JUSTIFICATION/ COMMENTS WITH COMMENTS
advance students toward independent reading of grade level texts and build content knowledge (ELA, social studies, science and technical subjects, and the arts). The quality of texts is high—they support multiple readings for various purposes and exhibit exceptional craft and thought and/or provide useful information. ☐ Yes ☒ No	English language arts, history/social studies, science, technical subjects, and the arts).		
	REQUIRED **2b)** Materials provide a coherent sequence or collection of connected texts that build vocabulary knowledge and knowledge about concepts, themes, and topics through reading, writing, listening and speaking. In grades K-2, the inclusion of read-aloud texts in addition to what students can read themselves ensures that all students can build knowledge about the world through engagement with rich, complex text. These texts as well must form a coherent sequence or collection of connected texts that build vocabulary knowledge and knowledge about concepts, themes, and topics through reading, writing, listening and speaking.	**Yes**	The collection of texts builds knowledge systematically by establishing six units. The units consist of: Short stories, Nonfiction, Poetry, Drama, Folk Literataure and Reading Independently.
	REQUIRED **2c)** Within a sequence or collection of texts, specific anchor texts of grade-level complexity, as determined in 1a, are selected for multiple, careful readings throughout the unit of study.	**No**	While anchor texts are identified in each unit, there are no clear indicators as to how close reading of these anchor texts is supported by other texts in the unit.
	2d) 90% of texts are previously published rather than "commissioned."	**Yes**	Almost all works appear to be previously published and many of the informational texts are primary documents or analytical essays about literature.
3. RANGE AND VOLUME OF TEXTS: Materials reflect the distribution of text types and genres suggested by the standards: Text types and genres generally reflect the definitions provided on page 31 (grades K-5) and page 57 (grades 6-12) of the standards	**REQUIRED** **3a)** In grades K-12, ELA materials seek a balance in instructional time between 50% literature/ 50% informational texts. (Reviewers will consider a balance within units of study as well as across the entire grade level.)	**Not Evaluated**	This section was not evaluated because the non-negotiable criteria were not met.
	REQUIRED **3b)** Materials include texts of different formats (e.g., print and non-print, including film, art, music, charts, etc.) and lengths (e.g. short stories and novels).	**Not Evaluated**	This section was not evaluated because the non-negotiable criteria were not met.

CRITERIA	INDICATORS OF SUPERIOR QUALITY	MEETS METRICS (Yes/No)	JUSTIFICATION/ COMMENTS WITH COMMENTS
and included in the text of the standards (e.g., RL.K.9, RI.1.9, RI.2.3, RL.2.9, RL.9-10.6, RI.7.7, or RI.11-12.9). ☐ Yes ☐ No	**3c)** Materials include many informational texts with an informational text structure rather than a narrative structure. In grades 6-12, materials include literary nonfiction (e.g. speeches, biographies, essays).	**Not Evaluated**	This section was not evaluated because the non-negotiable criteria were not met.
	3d) Additional materials increase the opportunity for regular, accountable independent reading of texts that appeal to students' interests to build reading stamina, confidence, motivation, and enjoyment and connect to classroom concepts or topics to develop knowledge.	**Not Evaluated**	This section was not evaluated because the non-negotiable criteria were not met.
II. Foundational Skills (grades K-5 only)			
Tier 1 and 2 Non-Negotiable* **4. FOUNDATIONAL SKILLS:** Materials provide instruction and diagnostic support in concepts of print, phonics, vocabulary, development, syntax, and fluency in a logical and transparent progression. These foundational skills are necessary and central components of an effective, comprehensive reading program designed to develop proficient readers with the capacity to comprehend texts across a range of types and disciplines. ☐ Yes ☐ No *As applicable (e.g., when the scope of the materials is comprehensive and considered a full program)	**REQUIRED *Indicator for grades K-2 only** **4a)** Materials follow a sequence of foundational skills instruction indicated by the standards and beginning on page 17 of Appendix A, while providing abundant opportunities for every student to become proficient in each of the foundational skills.	**N/A**	
	REQUIRED **4b)** In grades K-2, materials include student texts that allow for systematic, regular and frequent practice of foundational skills as they are introduced. In grades 3-5, materials demand knowledge of grade-level phonic patterns and word analysis skills.	**N/A**	
	REQUIRED **4c)** In grades K-2, materials provide instruction and practice in word study including pronunciation, roots, prefixes, suffixes and spelling/sound patterns, as well as decoding of grade-level words by using sound-symbol knowledge and knowledge of syllabication and regular practice in encoding (spelling) the sound symbol relationships of English. In grades 3-5, materials provide instruction and practice in word study including systematic examination of grade-level morphology, decoding of multisyllabic words by using	**N/A**	

CRITERIA	INDICATORS OF SUPERIOR QUALITY	MEETS METRICS (Yes/No)	JUSTIFICATION/ COMMENTS WITH COMMENTS
	syllabication, and automaticity with grade-level regular and irregular spelling patterns.		
	REQUIRED **4d)** Materials encourage students to use context to confirm or self-correct word recognition and understanding, directing students to reread purposefully to acquire accurate meaning.	**N/A**	
	REQUIRED **4e)** Opportunities are frequently built into the materials that allow for students to achieve reading fluency in oral and silent reading, that is, to read a wide variety of prose and poetry at students' reading level with accuracy, rate appropriate to the text, and expression.	**N/A**	
	REQUIRED **4f)** Materials guide students to read grade-level text with purpose and understanding and to make frequent connections between acquisition of foundation skills and making meaning from reading.	**N/A**	
	4g) *Indicator for grades K-2 only Materials provide opportunities for educators to monitor student progress on every aspect of the foundational skills through diagnostic assessments offered at regular intervals. Monitoring must also allow for students to receive regular feedback on their oral reading fluency in the specific areas of appropriate rate, expressiveness and accuracy.	**N/A**	
	4h) Submissions provide abundant and easily implemented materials so teachers can readily provide more time, attention and practice for those students who need it.	**N/A**	
III. Questions and Tasks			
Tier 1 and 2 Non-Negotiable **5. TEXT-DEPENDENT QUESTIONS:** Text-dependent questions and tasks reflect the requirements of Reading Standard 1 by requiring	**REQUIRED** **5a)** At least 80% of all questions in the materials are text-dependent questions; student ideas are expressed through both written and spoken responses.	**Yes**	80% of questions are text-dependent. Question stems often point students back to re-read portions of text. For example, in the "Iroquois Constitution" students answer questions like "Identify all the references to nature in the Iroquois Constituion. What do these descriptions reveal about the Iroquois people's relationship with nature?" Another examples is in the

CRITERIA	INDICATORS OF SUPERIOR QUALITY	MEETS METRICS (Yes/No)	JUSTIFICATION/ COMMENTS WITH COMMENTS
use of textual evidence in support of meeting other grade-specific standards. ☐ Yes ☒ No			text "A Journey Through Texas", one of the questions students will answer is "Find examples from the text that show why Cabeza de Vaca might have believed stories about advanced civilization and wealth."
	REQUIRED **5b)** Coherent sequences of questions and tasks focus students on understanding the text and its illustrations (as applicable), expressing the knowledge students have built about concepts, themes, or ideas presented in the texts, and making connections among the texts in the collection.	**No**	The sequence of questions does not elicit a deeper understanding of the provided texts. The vast majority of text dependent questions provided are low level comprehension questions. Following each text, students are asked questions that are categorizes as either "Refer to Text" or "Reason with Text". These categories are further broken down by level of thinking. While the publisher has labeled questions as to indicate an increase in higher order thinking, these questions are rarely aimed at analyzing craft and structure of the provided text nor do they meet the complexity of the standards. For example, following the text "A Wagner Matinee" on page 597, students are asked a lower level question that is labeled "Understanding" which asks, " State why Aunt Georgiana visits Boston." Two questions later students are asked a question labeled "Analyze" that asks, "Describe Aunt Georgiana's life experiences with music." The final question in this series labeled "Create" asks students, "What advice did Aunt Georgiana give Clark about Music when he lived with her in Nebraska?" These questions do not build upon on another nor do they demonstrate deep understanding of the text.
	REQUIRED **5c)** Questions and tasks include the language of the standards, and assess the depth and complexity required by the standards at each grade-level over time to advance and deepen student learning. *(**Note:** not every standard must be assessed with every text.)*	**No**	No. While the standards do address the first three reading standards of the Common Core, there is no evidence of questions requiring that students analyze craft and structure, nor are there questions that address the Integration standards. For example, in Unit 2 of the 11th grade curriculum, students read two texts

CRITERIA	INDICATORS OF SUPERIOR QUALITY	MEETS METRICS (Yes/No)	JUSTIFICATION/ COMMENTS WITH COMMENTS
			by Ralph Waldo Emerson. The two questions that the publisher has indicated address the Analyze level of Blooms thinking are, "In the poem, for whose benefit does the plant spread its blossoms?" and "Determine whether the speaker agrees with the sages that the flower's charm is wasted because of its isolated spot." Furthermore, for the same texts the Evaluate level of thinking asks students "In the essay, identify what Emerson says will happen when humans adapt their lives to "the pure idea" in their minds." and "Do you agree that when humans renew their spirtual link to the natural world, evil will disappear? Explain your response." Neither of these questions are aligned to the standards nor do they address the complexity of the standards that are expected from questions that have been labeled as eliciting high critical thinking skills. A final example of the questions not aligning to the complexity of the standards is on page 182. One of the questions that students are asked, "Which of the following best states the main idea of "The Present", the passage from Pilgrim at Tinker Creek?" The correct academic vocabulary word after 5th grade is central idea or theme, not main idea.
	REQUIRED **5d)** Questions and tasks support students in examining the language (vocabulary, sentences, and structure) of texts measured by Criteria 1, 2, and 3 to determine meaning; questions and tasks also focus on engaging students with multiple repetitions of words in varied contexts (e.g., reading different texts, completing tasks, engaging in speaking/listening).	**Yes**	End of text questions do focus on unpacking academic language. For example in unit two, questions ask students, "In the excerpts from Walden, what does the word earnest mean?"
6. ASSESSMENT: Materials offer assessment opportunities that genuinely measure progress and elicit	**REQUIRED** **6a)** Measurement of progress via assessments should include gradual release of supporting scaffolds for students to measure their independent abilities.	**Not Evaluated**	This section was not evaluated because the non-negotiable criteria were not met.

CRITERIA	INDICATORS OF SUPERIOR QUALITY	MEETS METRICS (Yes/No)	JUSTIFICATION/ COMMENTS WITH COMMENTS
direct, observable evidence of the degree to which students can independently demonstrate the assessed grade-specific standards with appropriately complex text(s). ☐ Yes ☐ No			
	REQUIRED **6b)** Aligned rubrics or assessment guidelines (such as scoring guides or student work exemplars) are included and provide sufficient guidance for interpreting student performance.	**Not Evaluated**	This section was not evaluated because the non-negotiable criteria were not met.
	REQUIRED **6c)** Materials use varied modes of assessment, including a range of pre-, formative, summative and self-assessment measures.	**Not Evaluated**	This section was not evaluated because the non-negotiable criteria were not met.
	6d) Materials assess student proficiency using methods that are unbiased and accessible to all students.	**Not Evaluated**	This section was not evaluated because the non-negotiable criteria were not met.
IV. Scaffolding and Support			
7. SCAFFOLDING AND SUPPORT: Materials provide all students, including those who read below grade level, with extensive opportunities and support to encounter and comprehend grade-level complex text as required by the standards. ☐ Yes ☐ No	**REQUIRED** **7a)** Pre-reading activities and suggested approaches to teacher scaffolding are focused and engage students with understanding the text itself. Pre-reading activities should be no more than 10% of time devoted to any reading instruction.	**Not Evaluated**	This section was not evaluated because the non-negotiable criteria were not met.
	REQUIRED **7b)** Materials must have the goal of students gaining full comprehension of complex text (through read-aloud in grades K-1) and do not confuse or substitute mastery of strategies for full comprehension of text; reading strategies support comprehension of specific texts and focus on building knowledge and insight. Texts must not serve as platforms to practice discrete strategies.	**Not Evaluated**	This section was not evaluated because the non-negotiable criteria were not met.
	REQUIRED **7c)** Materials regularly direct teachers to return to focused parts of the text to guide students through rereading,	**Not Evaluated**	This section was not evaluated because the non-negotiable criteria were not met.

CRITERIA	INDICATORS OF SUPERIOR QUALITY	MEETS METRICS (Yes/No)	JUSTIFICATION/ COMMENTS WITH COMMENTS
	discussion and writing about the ideas, events, and information found there.		
	REQUIRED **7d)** The materials are easy to use and cleanly laid out for students and teachers. The reading selections are centrally located within the materials and obviously the center of focus.	**Not Evaluated**	This section was not evaluated because the non-negotiable criteria were not met.
	7e) Appropriate suggestions and materials are provided for supporting varying student needs at the unit and lesson level (e.g., alternate teaching approaches, pacing, instructional delivery options, suggestions for addressing common student difficulties to meet standards, remediation strategies or suggestions for supporting texts, suggestions for more advanced texts for extension, etc.).	**Not Evaluated**	This section was not evaluated because the non-negotiable criteria were not met.
	7f) The content can be reasonably completed within a regular school year and the pacing of content allows for maximum student understanding. The materials provide guidance about the amount of time a task might reasonably take.	**Not Evaluated**	This section was not evaluated because the non-negotiable criteria were not met.
V. Writing to Sources and Research			
8. WRITING TO SOURCES: The majority of written tasks are text-dependent and reflect the writing genres named in the standards.	**REQUIRED *Indicator for grades 3-12 only** **8a)** A vast majority of written tasks at all grade levels require students to demonstrate the knowledge they built through the analysis and synthesis of texts, and present well--defended claims and clear information, drawing on textual evidence to support valid inferences from text.	**Not Evaluated**	This section was not evaluated because the non-negotiable criteria were not met.

CRITERIA	INDICATORS OF SUPERIOR QUALITY	MEETS METRICS (Yes/No)	JUSTIFICATION/ COMMENTS WITH COMMENTS
☐ Yes ☐ No	**REQUIRED** **8b)** Materials include multiple writing tasks aligned to the three modes of writing (opinion/argumentative, informative, narrative) as outlined by the standards at each grade level. In grades 3-12, tasks included blended modes (i.e., analytical writing); narrative prompts decrease in number and increase in being based on text(s) as student progress through the grades, e.g., narrative description (text-based, chronological writing) rather than imaginative narratives.	**Not Evaluated**	This section was not evaluated because the non-negotiable criteria were not met.
	REQUIRED **8c)** Writing opportunities for students are prominent and varied in length and time demands (e.g., notes, summaries, short-answer responses, whole-class shared writing/formal essays, on-demand and process writing, etc.).	**Not Evaluated**	This section was not evaluated because the non-negotiable criteria were not met.
	REQUIRED **8d)** Materials build in opportunities for connections between writing, speaking and listening, reading, and the language standards. For example, in grade 1, students listen to a text being read, work collaboratively to develop a plan for writing, write independently filling out an answer frame, and then share their writing with a peer who reviews the writing against a word wall to ensure high frequency words are spelled correctly. For example, in grade 6, students read a text, work collaboratively to develop a plan for analyzing or emulating the text, write a response, and then share their writing with a peer who reviews the writing against using a peer review checklist.	**Not Evaluated**	This section was not evaluated because the non-negotiable criteria were not met.
	REQUIRED *Indicator for grades K-2 only **8e)** Submissions address grade-level foundation standards that require students in the early grades to know their letters, phonetic conventions, sentence structures, and spelling.	**Not Evaluated**	This section was not evaluated because the non-negotiable criteria were not met.

CRITERIA	INDICATORS OF SUPERIOR QUALITY	MEETS METRICS (Yes/No)	JUSTIFICATION/ COMMENTS WITH COMMENTS
	8f) *Indicator for grades K-2 only Materials provide opportunities for educators to monitor student progress in the development of these foundational skills and respond to the needs of individual students. This monitoring should include attention to invented spelling as appropriate for its diagnostic value.	**Not Evaluated**	This section was not evaluated because the non-negotiable criteria were not met.
	8g) Materials engage students in many shared (grades K-2) or short research projects annually to develop the expertise needed to conduct research independently.	**Not Evaluated**	This section was not evaluated because the non-negotiable criteria were not met.
VI. Speaking and Listening			
9. SPEAKING AND LISTENING: Oral tasks must be text-dependent and materials for speaking and listening must reflect true communication skills required for college and career readiness. ☐ Yes ☐ No	**REQUIRED** **9a)** Speaking and listening questions and tasks use the texts measured by Criteria 1, 2, and 3.	**Not Evaluated**	This section was not evaluated because the non-negotiable criteria were not met.
	REQUIRED **9b)** Materials demand that students engage effectively (as determined by grade-level standards) in a range of conversations and collaborations with peers about texts.	**Not Evaluated**	This section was not evaluated because the non-negotiable criteria were not met.
	REQUIRED **9c)** Materials build in frequent opportunities for connections between speaking and listening, reading, writing, and the language standards. For example, in grades K-12, materials build in frequent opportunities for discussion about texts and, through directions and modeling, encourage students to use academic language and grade-appropriate oral language conventions. In grades 3-12, materials require students to gather and use evidence to orally present findings from research.	**Not Evaluated**	This section was not evaluated because the non-negotiable criteria were not met.
	9d) Materials develop active listening skills, such as taking notes on main ideas, asking relevant questions, and elaborating on remarks of others to develop understanding of complex texts and tasks.	**Not Evaluated**	This section was not evaluated because the non-negotiable criteria were not met.

CRITERIA	INDICATORS OF SUPERIOR QUALITY	MEETS METRICS (Yes/No)	JUSTIFICATION/ COMMENTS WITH COMMENTS
VII. Language			
10. LANGUAGE: Materials must adequately address the Language standards for the grade, including through unpacking the vocabulary and syntax of text(s) (indicator 5e) as models of language use. ☐ Yes ☐ No	**REQUIRED** **10a)** Materials address the grammar and language conventions specified by the Language standards at each grade level and build on those standards that build from previous grade levels, as indicated by pages 30 and 56 of the standards.	**Not Evaluated**	This section was not evaluated because the non-negotiable criteria were not met.
	REQUIRED **10b)** Materials create opportunities for students to discover accurate usage patterns, compare them to their own (oral and written), and develop proficiency in usage and language conventions.	**Not Evaluated**	This section was not evaluated because the non-negotiable criteria were not met.
	REQUIRED **10c)** Selected vocabulary focuses on words critical to the meaning of the texts included in Criteria 1, 2, and 3. Materials also require students to model their own writing after texts measured by Criteria 1, 2, and 3 as a way to develop more complex sentence structure and language usage.	**Not Evaluated**	This section was not evaluated because the non-negotiable criteria were not met.
	REQUIRED **10d)** Vocabulary study emphasizes advancing depth of word knowledge through determining word meaning and relationships among words (e.g., concept- and thematically-related words, word families, etc.).	**Not Evaluated**	This section was not evaluated because the non-negotiable criteria were not met.
	REQUIRED **10e)** Materials build in frequent opportunities for connections between the language standards, writing, reading, and speaking and listening. For example, through directions and modeling, materials encourage students to use grade-appropriate language conventions when speaking and writing about texts.	**Not Evaluated**	This section was not evaluated because the non-negotiable criteria were not met.
	10f) Materials provide real-world activities for student practice with natural language (e.g. mock interviews, presentations).	**Not Evaluated**	This section was not evaluated because the non-negotiable criteria were not met.

CRITERIA	INDICATORS OF SUPERIOR QUALITY	MEETS METRICS (Yes/No)	JUSTIFICATION/ COMMENTS WITH COMMENTS
FINAL EVALUATION ***Tier 1 ratings*** receive a "Yes" in Column 1 for Criteria 1 – 10. ***Tier 2 ratings*** receive a "Yes" in Column 1 for all non-negotiable criteria (Foundational Skills (as applicable), Complexity of Texts, Quality of Texts, and Text-Dependent Questions), but at least one "No" in Column 1 for the remaining criteria. ***Tier 3 ratings*** receive a "No" in Column 1 for at least one of the non-negotiable criteria.			
Compile the results for Sections I-VII to make a final decision for the material under review.			
Section	**Criteria**	**Yes/No**	**Final Justification/Comments**
I: Text Selection	1. Complexity of Texts **(Non-Negotiable)**	**Yes**	Texts are at the appropriate complexity level, and justification for placement as easy, moderate, or challenging is provided in Teacher Edition.
	2. Quality of Texts **(Non-Negotiable)**	**No**	Anchor texts are identified but are not developed as meaningful texts within the unit. Anchor texts are not reread for close understanding and are not connected to other supporting texts in unit.
	3. Range and Volume of Texts	**Not Evaluated**	This section was not evaluated because the non-negotiable criteria were not met.
II: Foundational Skills	4. Foundational Skills **(Non-Negotiable*)**	**N/A**	
III: Text-Dependent Questions and Tasks	5. Text-Dependent Questions **(Non-Negotiable)**	**No**	While 80% or more of the questions are text-dependent and drive the student back to the texts, the vast majority of the questions do not address the complexity of the Common Core State Standards for the eleventh grade.
	6. Assessment	**Not Evaluated**	This section was not evaluated because the non-negotiable criteria were not met.
IV: Scaffolding and Support	7. Scaffolding and Support	**Not Evaluated**	This section was not evaluated because the non-negotiable criteria were not met.

CRITERIA	INDICATORS OF SUPERIOR QUALITY	MEETS METRICS (Yes/No)	JUSTIFICATION/ COMMENTS WITH COMMENTS
V: Writing to Sources and Research	8. Writing to Sources	**Not Evaluated**	This section was not evaluated because the non-negotiable criteria were not met.
VI: Speaking and Listening	9. Speaking and Listening	**Not Evaluated**	This section was not evaluated because the non-negotiable criteria were not met.
VII: Language	10. Language	**Not Evaluated**	This section was not evaluated because the non-negotiable criteria were not met.
FINAL DECISION FOR THIS MATERIAL: **Tier III, Not representing quality**			

*As applicable (e.g., when the scope of the materials is comprehensive and considered a full program)

The goal for ELA students is that they can read and understand grade-level texts independently, as demonstrated through writing and speaking about those texts. A strong ELA classroom is structured with the below components.

Title: **Mirrors & Windows: Connecting with Literature** Grade: **12**

Publisher: **EMC Publishing, LLC** Copyright: **2016**

Overall Rating: **Tier III, Not representing quality**

Tier I, Tier II, Tier III Elements of this review:

STRONG	WEAK
1. Complexity of Texts (Non-Negotiable)	2. Quality of Texts (Non-Negotiable)
5. Text-Dependent Questions (Non-Negotiable)	

To evaluate each set of submitted materials for alignment with the standards, begin by reviewing Column 2 for the non-negotiable criteria. If there is a "Yes" for all required indicators in Column 2, then the materials receive a "Yes" in Column 1. If there is a "No" for any required indicators in Column 2, then the materials receive a "No" in Column 1. (Note: If materials do not represent a full curricula, then some of Criteria 1 – 10 may not apply.)

Tier 1 ratings receive a "Yes" in Column 1 for Criteria 1 – 10.
Tier 2 ratings receive a "Yes" in Column 1 for all non-negotiable criteria (Foundational Skills (as applicable), Complexity of Texts, Quality of Texts, and Text-Dependent Questions), but at least one "No" in Column 1 for the remaining criteria.
Tier 3 ratings receive a "No" in Column 1 for at least one of the non-negotiable criteria.

CRITERIA	INDICATORS OF SUPERIOR QUALITY	MEETS METRICS (Yes/No)	JUSTIFICATION/ COMMENTS WITH COMMENTS
I. Text Selection			
Tier 1 and 2 Non-Negotiable **1. COMPLEXITY OF TEXTS:** Materials present a progression of complex texts as stated by Reading Standard 10[7]. *(**Note:** In K and 1, Reading Standard 10 refers to read-aloud material, which is typically from grades 2+. Complexity standards for student-read texts are applicable for grades 2+.)* ☒ Yes ☐ No	**REQUIRED** **1a)** In grades 2-12, materials provide texts that are appropriately complex for the identified grade level according to the requirements outlined in the standards. Measures for determining complexity include quantitative and qualitative analysis.[8] Poetry and drama are analyzed only using qualitative measures. In grades K-2, extensive read-aloud texts allow sufficient opportunity for engagement with text more complex than students could read themselves.	**Yes**	Texts are classified as easy, moderate, or challenging. Descriptors of each level are provided in the Teacher Edition to justify alignment to text complexity bands. For example in unit one, students read "The Conversion of King Edwin" which is listed at Lexile level 1420. The Teacher's Edition lists specific characteristics of the text that make it more challenging, such as reading level, unfamiliar setting, and vocabulary.
	REQUIRED **1b)** Texts increase in complexity as materials progress throughout the grade level and across grade bands. Read-aloud texts follow the same trend, although they may have greater variability because listening skills in elementary school generally outpace reading skills.	**Yes**	Complexity increases across grade bands. Since the text for grade 12 is arranged chronologically, units contain materials that are labeled easy, moderate, and challenging within each unit. For example, in unit five, students read "To Lucasta Going to the Wars," poetry that is catorgized at the easy level, and then progress to more challenging material such as Paradise Lost by John Milton.
Tier 1 and 2 Non-Negotiable **2. QUALITY OF TEXTS:** Texts are of sufficient scope and quality to provide text-centered and integrated learning that is sequenced and scaffolded to advance students toward independent reading of grade level texts and build content knowledge (ELA, social studies,	**REQUIRED** **2a)** 90% of texts provide rich opportunities for students to engage with tasks that allow them to meet the grade-level ELA standards using texts; the texts are well-crafted and authentic, representing the quality of content, language, and writing that is produced by experts in various disciplines (e.g., English language arts, history/social studies, science, technical subjects, and the arts).	**Yes**	90% of texts are worth reading and are instructional in purpose. Historical documents supporting the development of the British Isles are included in order to allow students to explore the historical implications of the literature through student reading.
	REQUIRED **2b)** Materials provide a coherent sequence or collection of	**Yes**	While the text is arranged chronologically, there are more than the traditional "British Literature"

[7] Grades 3-12 Example: Texts present vocabulary, syntax, text structures, levels of meaning/purpose similar to exemplars in Appendix B.
[8] The process for determining quantitative and qualitative measures is available at http://www.louisianabelieves.com/docs/teacher-toolbox-resources/guide---how-to-determine-text-complexity-grades-k-12.pdf?sfvrsn=5 or the Supplemental Information for Appendix A.

CRITERIA	INDICATORS OF SUPERIOR QUALITY	MEETS METRICS (Yes/No)	JUSTIFICATION/ COMMENTS WITH COMMENTS
science and technical subjects, and the arts). The quality of texts is high—they support multiple readings for various purposes and exhibit exceptional craft and thought and/or provide useful information. ☐ Yes ☒ No	connected texts that build vocabulary knowledge and knowledge about concepts, themes, and topics through reading, writing, listening and speaking. In grades K-2, the inclusion of read-aloud texts in addition to what students can read themselves ensures that all students can build knowledge about the world through engagement with rich, complex text. These texts as well must form a coherent sequence or collection of connected texts that build vocabulary knowledge and knowledge about concepts, themes, and topics through reading, writing, listening and speaking.		selections included so that students can build knowledge and understanding of the development of literature and the English language over the centuries.
	REQUIRED **2c)** Within a sequence or collection of texts, specific anchor texts of grade-level complexity, as determined in 1a, are selected for multiple, careful readings throughout the unit of study.	**No**	While anchor texts are identified in each unit, there are no clear indicators as to how close reading of these anchor texts is supported by other texts in unit. Clear, meaningful re-reading of challenging portions of text is not included.
	2d) 90% of texts are previously published rather than "commissioned."	**Yes**	Almost all works appear to be previously published and many of the informational texts are primary documents or analytical essays about literature.
3. RANGE AND VOLUME OF TEXTS: Materials reflect the distribution of text types and genres suggested by the standards: Text types and genres generally reflect the definitions provided on page 31 (grades K-5) and page 57 (grades 6-12) of the standards and included in the text of the standards (e.g., RL.K.9, RI.1.9,	**REQUIRED** **3a)** In grades K-12, ELA materials seek a balance in instructional time between 50% literature/ 50% informational texts. (Reviewers will consider a balance within units of study as well as across the entire grade level.)	**Not Evaluated**	This section was not evaluated because the non-negotiable criteria were not met.
	REQUIRED **3b)** Materials include texts of different formats (e.g., print and non-print, including film, art, music, charts, etc.) and lengths (e.g. short stories and novels).	**Not Evaluated**	This section was not evaluated because the non-negotiable criteria were not met.
	3c) Materials include many informational texts with an informational text structure rather than a narrative structure.	**Not Evaluated**	This section was not evaluated because the non-negotiable criteria were not met.

CRITERIA	INDICATORS OF SUPERIOR QUALITY	MEETS METRICS (Yes/No)	JUSTIFICATION/ COMMENTS WITH COMMENTS
RI.2.3, RL.2.9, RL.9-10.6, RI.7.7, or RI.11-12.9). ☐ Yes ☐ No	In grades 6-12, materials include literary nonfiction (e.g. speeches, biographies, essays).		
	3d) Additional materials increase the opportunity for regular, accountable independent reading of texts that appeal to students' interests to build reading stamina, confidence, motivation, and enjoyment and connect to classroom concepts or topics to develop knowledge.	**Not Evaluated**	This section was not evaluated because the non-negotiable criteria were not met.
II. Foundational Skills (grades K-5 only)			
Tier 1 and 2 Non-Negotiable* **4. FOUNDATIONAL SKILLS:** Materials provide instruction and diagnostic support in concepts of print, phonics, vocabulary, development, syntax, and fluency in a logical and transparent progression. These foundational skills are necessary and central components of an effective, comprehensive reading program designed to develop proficient readers with the capacity to comprehend texts across a range of types and disciplines. ☐ Yes ☐ No *As applicable (e.g., when the scope of the materials is comprehensive and considered a full program)	**REQUIRED *Indicator for grades K-2 only** **4a)** Materials follow a sequence of foundational skills instruction indicated by the standards and beginning on page 17 of Appendix A, while providing abundant opportunities for every student to become proficient in each of the foundational skills.	**N/A**	
	REQUIRED **4b)** In grades K-2, materials include student texts that allow for systematic, regular and frequent practice of foundational skills as they are introduced. In grades 3-5, materials demand knowledge of grade-level phonic patterns and word analysis skills.	**N/A**	
	REQUIRED **4c)** In grades K-2, materials provide instruction and practice in word study including pronunciation, roots, prefixes, suffixes and spelling/sound patterns, as well as decoding of grade-level words by using sound-symbol knowledge and knowledge of syllabication and regular practice in encoding (spelling) the sound symbol relationships of English. In grades 3-5, materials provide instruction and practice in word study including systematic examination of grade-level morphology, decoding of multisyllabic words by using syllabication, and automaticity with grade-level regular and irregular spelling patterns.	**N/A**	

CRITERIA	INDICATORS OF SUPERIOR QUALITY	MEETS METRICS (Yes/No)	JUSTIFICATION/ COMMENTS WITH COMMENTS
	REQUIRED **4d)** Materials encourage students to use context to confirm or self-correct word recognition and understanding, directing students to reread purposefully to acquire accurate meaning.	**N/A**	
	REQUIRED **4e)** Opportunities are frequently built into the materials that allow for students to achieve reading fluency in oral and silent reading, that is, to read a wide variety of prose and poetry at students' reading level with accuracy, rate appropriate to the text, and expression.	**N/A**	
	REQUIRED **4f)** Materials guide students to read grade-level text with purpose and understanding and to make frequent connections between acquisition of foundation skills and making meaning from reading.	**N/A**	
	4g) *Indicator for grades K-2 only Materials provide opportunities for educators to monitor student progress on every aspect of the foundational skills through diagnostic assessments offered at regular intervals. Monitoring must also allow for students to receive regular feedback on their oral reading fluency in the specific areas of appropriate rate, expressiveness and accuracy.	**N/A**	
	4h) Submissions provide abundant and easily implemented materials so teachers can readily provide more time, attention and practice for those students who need it.	**N/A**	
III. Questions and Tasks			
Tier 1 and 2 Non-Negotiable **5. TEXT-DEPENDENT QUESTIONS:** Text-dependent questions and tasks reflect the requirements of Reading Standard 1 by requiring use of textual evidence in support of meeting other grade-specific standards.	**REQUIRED** **5a)** At least 80% of all questions in the materials are text-dependent questions; student ideas are expressed through both written and spoken responses.	**Yes**	80% of questions are text-dependent. Question stems often point students back to reread portions of text. For example, students read "To Althea from Prison" and then revisit the text to answer these questions: How does the speaker feel about war? According to the speaker, which is more important, war or love? Why? What are the threats to true liberty? Explain your answer. What is the speaker's state of mind during his imprisonment? Rereading is also instructed in the teacher's edition with sidebar annotations to

CRITERIA	INDICATORS OF SUPERIOR QUALITY	MEETS METRICS (Yes/No)	JUSTIFICATION/ COMMENTS WITH COMMENTS
☒ Yes ☐ No			direct reading purpose, such as in Pilgrim's Progress when students are instructed to reread a paragraph to identify conflicts that have developed.
	REQUIRED **5b)** Coherent sequences of questions and tasks focus students on understanding the text and its illustrations (as applicable), expressing the knowledge students have built about concepts, themes, or ideas presented in the texts, and making connections among the texts in the collection.	**Yes**	In the After Reading section, questions do build through the five levels of questioning (Understand, Apply, Analyze, Evaluate, and Create). Students are required to refer back to the text and use textual evidence to respond to questions and prompts
	REQUIRED **5c)** Questions and tasks include the language of the standards, and assess the depth and complexity required by the standards at each grade-level over time to advance and deepen student learning. *(**Note:** not every standard must be assessed with every text.)*	**Yes**	Reading Assessment sections use the language of the standards and incorporate students' knowledge of academic vocabulary into the question series. For example, when reading "A Modest Proposal" students are asked to "Consider the interplay of text and subtext. Why did Swift likely choose satire to present his program to solve Ireland's problem?" and "Discuss what lessons about the goals, methods, and reception of satire can be inferred from these selections (Gulliver's Travels and A Modest Proposal") which addresses RL.11-12.6
	REQUIRED **5d)** Questions and tasks support students in examining the language (vocabulary, sentences, and structure) of texts measured by Criteria 1, 2, and 3 to determine meaning; questions and tasks also focus on engaging students with multiple repetitions of words in varied contexts (e.g., reading different texts, completing tasks, engaging in speaking/listening).	**Yes**	End of text questions do focus on unpacking academic language. For example, when reading Gulliver's Travels and A Modest Proposal, students have access to a vocabulary and spelling workshop that focuses on political and historical terms such as czar, bicameral, oligarchy. Students read the terms in context and use context clues and etymology to determine meaning.
6. ASSESSMENT: Materials offer assessment	**REQUIRED** **6a)** Measurement of progress via assessments should include	**Not Evaluated**	This section was not evaluated because the non-

CRITERIA	INDICATORS OF SUPERIOR QUALITY	MEETS METRICS (Yes/No)	JUSTIFICATION/ COMMENTS WITH COMMENTS
opportunities that genuinely measure progress and elicit direct, observable evidence of the degree to which students can independently demonstrate the assessed grade-specific standards with appropriately complex text(s). ☐ Yes ☐ No	gradual release of supporting scaffolds for students to measure their independent abilities.		negotiable criteria were not met.
	REQUIRED **6b)** Aligned rubrics or assessment guidelines (such as scoring guides or student work exemplars) are included and provide sufficient guidance for interpreting student performance.	**Not Evaluated**	This section was not evaluated because the non-negotiable criteria were not met.
	REQUIRED **6c)** Materials use varied modes of assessment, including a range of pre-, formative, summative and self-assessment measures.	**Not Evaluated**	This section was not evaluated because the non-negotiable criteria were not met.
	6d) Materials assess student proficiency using methods that are unbiased and accessible to all students.	**Not Evaluated**	This section was not evaluated because the non-negotiable criteria were not met.
IV. Scaffolding and Support			
7. SCAFFOLDING AND SUPPORT: Materials provide all students, including those who read below grade level, with extensive opportunities and support to encounter and comprehend grade-level complex text as required by the standards. ☐ Yes ☐ No	**REQUIRED** **7a)** Pre-reading activities and suggested approaches to teacher scaffolding are focused and engage students with understanding the text itself. Pre-reading activities should be no more than 10% of time devoted to any reading instruction.	**Not Evaluated**	This section was not evaluated because the non-negotiable criteria were not met.
	REQUIRED **7b)** Materials must have the goal of students gaining full comprehension of complex text (through read-aloud in grades K-1) and do not confuse or substitute mastery of strategies for full comprehension of text; reading strategies support comprehension of specific texts and focus on building knowledge and insight. Texts must not serve as platforms to practice discrete strategies.	**Not Evaluated**	This section was not evaluated because the non-negotiable criteria were not met.

CRITERIA	INDICATORS OF SUPERIOR QUALITY	MEETS METRICS (Yes/No)	JUSTIFICATION/ COMMENTS WITH COMMENTS
	REQUIRED **7c)** Materials regularly direct teachers to return to focused parts of the text to guide students through rereading, discussion and writing about the ideas, events, and information found there.	**Not Evaluated**	This section was not evaluated because the non-negotiable criteria were not met.
	REQUIRED **7d)** The materials are easy to use and cleanly laid out for students and teachers. The reading selections are centrally located within the materials and obviously the center of focus.	**Not Evaluated**	This section was not evaluated because the non-negotiable criteria were not met.
	7e) Appropriate suggestions and materials are provided for supporting varying student needs at the unit and lesson level (e.g., alternate teaching approaches, pacing, instructional delivery options, suggestions for addressing common student difficulties to meet standards, remediation strategies or suggestions for supporting texts, suggestions for more advanced texts for extension, etc.).	**Not Evaluated**	This section was not evaluated because the non-negotiable criteria were not met.
	7f) The content can be reasonably completed within a regular school year and the pacing of content allows for maximum student understanding. The materials provide guidance about the amount of time a task might reasonably take.	**Not Evaluated**	This section was not evaluated because the non-negotiable criteria were not met.
V. Writing to Sources and Research			
8. WRITING TO SOURCES: The majority of written tasks are text-dependent and reflect the writing genres named in the standards.	**REQUIRED *Indicator for grades 3-12 only** **8a)** A vast majority of written tasks at all grade levels require students to demonstrate the knowledge they built through the analysis and synthesis of texts, and present well--defended claims and clear information, drawing on textual evidence to support valid inferences from text.	**Not Evaluated**	This section was not evaluated because the non-negotiable criteria were not met.

CRITERIA	INDICATORS OF SUPERIOR QUALITY	MEETS METRICS (Yes/No)	JUSTIFICATION/ COMMENTS WITH COMMENTS
☐ Yes ☐ No	**REQUIRED** **8b)** Materials include multiple writing tasks aligned to the three modes of writing (opinion/argumentative, informative, narrative) as outlined by the standards at each grade level. In grades 3-12, tasks included blended modes (i.e., analytical writing); narrative prompts decrease in number and increase in being based on text(s) as student progress through the grades, e.g., narrative description (text-based, chronological writing) rather than imaginative narratives.	**Not Evaluated**	This section was not evaluated because the non-negotiable criteria were not met.
	REQUIRED **8c)** Writing opportunities for students are prominent and varied in length and time demands (e.g., notes, summaries, short-answer responses, whole-class shared writing/formal essays, on-demand and process writing, etc.).	**Not Evaluated**	This section was not evaluated because the non-negotiable criteria were not met.
	REQUIRED **8d)** Materials build in opportunities for connections between writing, speaking and listening, reading, and the language standards. For example, in grade 1, students listen to a text being read, work collaboratively to develop a plan for writing, write independently filling out an answer frame, and then share their writing with a peer who reviews the writing against a word wall to ensure high frequency words are spelled correctly. For example, in grade 6, students read a text, work collaboratively to develop a plan for analyzing or emulating the text, write a response, and then share their writing with a peer who reviews the writing against using a peer review checklist.	**Not Evaluated**	This section was not evaluated because the non-negotiable criteria were not met.
	REQUIRED *Indicator for grades K-2 only **8e)** Submissions address grade-level foundation standards that require students in the early grades to know their letters, phonetic conventions, sentence structures, and spelling.	**Not Evaluated**	This section was not evaluated because the non-negotiable criteria were not met.

CRITERIA	INDICATORS OF SUPERIOR QUALITY	MEETS METRICS (Yes/No)	JUSTIFICATION/ COMMENTS WITH COMMENTS
	8f) *Indicator for grades K-2 only Materials provide opportunities for educators to monitor student progress in the development of these foundational skills and respond to the needs of individual students. This monitoring should include attention to invented spelling as appropriate for its diagnostic value.	**Not Evaluated**	This section was not evaluated because the non-negotiable criteria were not met.
	8g) Materials engage students in many shared (grades K-2) or short research projects annually to develop the expertise needed to conduct research independently.	**Not Evaluated**	This section was not evaluated because the non-negotiable criteria were not met.
VI. Speaking and Listening			
9. SPEAKING AND LISTENING: Oral tasks must be text-dependent and materials for speaking and listening must reflect true communication skills required for college and career readiness. ☐ Yes ☐ No	**REQUIRED** **9a)** Speaking and listening questions and tasks use the texts measured by Criteria 1, 2, and 3.	**Not Evaluated**	This section was not evaluated because the non-negotiable criteria were not met.
	REQUIRED **9b)** Materials demand that students engage effectively (as determined by grade-level standards) in a range of conversations and collaborations with peers about texts.	**Not Evaluated**	This section was not evaluated because the non-negotiable criteria were not met.
	REQUIRED **9c)** Materials build in frequent opportunities for connections between speaking and listening, reading, writing, and the language standards. For example, in grades K-12, materials build in frequent opportunities for discussion about texts and, through directions and modeling, encourage students to use academic language and grade-appropriate oral language conventions. In grades 3-12, materials require students to gather and use evidence to orally present findings from research.	**Not Evaluated**	This section was not evaluated because the non-negotiable criteria were not met.
	9d) Materials develop active listening skills, such as taking notes on main ideas, asking relevant questions, and elaborating on remarks of others to develop understanding of complex texts and tasks.	**Not Evaluated**	This section was not evaluated because the non-negotiable criteria were not met.

CRITERIA	INDICATORS OF SUPERIOR QUALITY	MEETS METRICS (Yes/No)	JUSTIFICATION/ COMMENTS WITH COMMENTS
VII. Language			
10. LANGUAGE: Materials must adequately address the Language standards for the grade, including through unpacking the vocabulary and syntax of text(s) (indicator 5e) as models of language use. ☐ Yes ☐ No	**REQUIRED** **10a)** Materials address the grammar and language conventions specified by the Language standards at each grade level and build on those standards that build from previous grade levels, as indicated by pages 30 and 56 of the standards.	**Not Evaluated**	This section was not evaluated because the non-negotiable criteria were not met.
	REQUIRED **10b)** Materials create opportunities for students to discover accurate usage patterns, compare them to their own (oral and written), and develop proficiency in usage and language conventions.	**Not Evaluated**	This section was not evaluated because the non-negotiable criteria were not met.
	REQUIRED **10c)** Selected vocabulary focuses on words critical to the meaning of the texts included in Criteria 1, 2, and 3. Materials also require students to model their own writing after texts measured by Criteria 1, 2, and 3 as a way to develop more complex sentence structure and language usage.	**Not Evaluated**	This section was not evaluated because the non-negotiable criteria were not met.
	REQUIRED **10d)** Vocabulary study emphasizes advancing depth of word knowledge through determining word meaning and relationships among words (e.g., concept- and thematically-related words, word families, etc.).	**Not Evaluated**	This section was not evaluated because the non-negotiable criteria were not met.
	REQUIRED **10e)** Materials build in frequent opportunities for connections between the language standards, writing, reading, and speaking and listening. For example, through directions and modeling, materials encourage students to use grade-appropriate language conventions when speaking and writing about texts.	**Not Evaluated**	This section was not evaluated because the non-negotiable criteria were not met.
	10f) Materials provide real-world activities for student practice with natural language (e.g. mock interviews, presentations).	**Not Evaluated**	This section was not evaluated because the non-negotiable criteria were not met.

CRITERIA	INDICATORS OF SUPERIOR QUALITY	MEETS METRICS (Yes/No)	JUSTIFICATION/ COMMENTS WITH COMMENTS
FINAL EVALUATION ***Tier 1 ratings*** receive a "Yes" in Column 1 for Criteria 1 – 10. ***Tier 2 ratings*** receive a "Yes" in Column 1 for all non-negotiable criteria (Foundational Skills (as applicable), Complexity of Texts, Quality of Texts, and Text-Dependent Questions), but at least one "No" in Column 1 for the remaining criteria. ***Tier 3 ratings*** receive a "No" in Column 1 for at least one of the non-negotiable criteria.			
Compile the results for Sections I-VII to make a final decision for the material under review.			
Section	**Criteria**	**Yes/No**	**Final Justification/Comments**
I: Text Selection	1. Complexity of Texts **(Non-Negotiable)**	**Yes**	Texts are at the appropriate complexity level, and justification for placement as easy, moderate, or challenging is provided in Teacher Edition
	2. Quality of Texts **(Non-Negotiable)**	**No**	Anchor texts are identified but are not developed as meaningful texts within the unit. Anchor texts are not reread for close understanding and are not connected to other supporting texts in unit.
	3. Range and Volume of Texts	**Not Evaluated**	This section was not evaluated because the non-negotiable criteria were not met.
II: Foundational Skills	4. Foundational Skills **(Non-Negotiable*)**	**N/A**	
III: Text-Dependent Questions and Tasks	5. Text-Dependent Questions **(Non-Negotiable)**	**Yes**	80% of questions are text dependent and provide opportunity for students to reread portions of text.
	6. Assessment	**Not Evaluated**	This section was not evaluated because the non-negotiable criteria were not met.
IV: Scaffolding and Support	7. Scaffolding and Support	**Not Evaluated**	This section was not evaluated because the non-negotiable criteria were not met.
V: Writing to Sources and Research	8. Writing to Sources	**Not Evaluated**	This section was not evaluated because the non-negotiable criteria were not met.

CRITERIA	INDICATORS OF SUPERIOR QUALITY	MEETS METRICS (Yes/No)	JUSTIFICATION/ COMMENTS WITH COMMENTS
VI: Speaking and Listening	9. Speaking and Listening	**Not Evaluated**	This section was not evaluated because the non-negotiable criteria were not met.
VII: Language	10. Language	**Not Evaluated**	This section was not evaluated because the non-negotiable criteria were not met.
FINAL DECISION FOR THIS MATERIAL: **Tier III, Not representing quality**			

*As applicable (e.g., when the scope of the materials is comprehensive and considered a full program)