Instructional Materials Evaluation - Student Standards Review

Louisiana educators engaged in a professional review of the state's academic standards for English language arts (ELA) and mathematics to ensure they continue to maintain strong expectations for teaching and learning aligned with college and workplace demands. The new ELA and math standards will be effective beginning with the 2016-2017 school year. As part of the Louisiana Department of Education's support for a seamless transition to these new standards, the LDOE identified the major changes of the standards and their potential impact upon criteria used to review instructional materials.

Title: **English Language Arts** Grade: **9-12**

Publisher: **Engage New York** Copyright: **2013**

Overall Rating: **Tier II, Approaching quality**

This English Language Arts review has been examined for the following changes in alignment resulting from the Louisiana Student Standards Review:

- Materials do not contain references to specific authors and texts
- Include citing *relevant* textual evidence beginning in grade 6
- Include an *awareness of audience* when making speeches and delivering presentations

This review remains a Tier 2 rating. As a result of these changes, the following chart identifies the potential impact on specific elements in the current review. The LDOE recommends that district curriculum staff, principals, and teachers take these findings into consideration when using these instructional materials.

Criteria	Currently in the Rubric	Next Steps for Educators
Quality of Texts (Non-Negotiable)	This program currently is reviewed as "Yes" for this criteria because the texts are quality texts and worth reading. The series is designed to develop fundamental skills such as using textual evidence and close reading. Texts are selected and presented in a way that also imparts knowledge while building skill.	Make sure to review texts in these materials for quality since references to specific texts and Appendix B are no longer included in the standards.
Text-Dependent Questions (Non-Negotiable)	This program currently is reviewed as "Yes" for these criteria because the model questions in these lessons are dependent on the texts from the units. The Units provide model text questioning sequence along with text specific questions to illustrate the process. Module Performance Tasks generate a close reading and analysis of paired texts.	Make sure to revise questions and tasks to require students to cite relevant textual evidence to support their ideas beginning in grade 6.
Speaking and Listening	The program currently is reviewed as "No" for these criteria for grade 9 because there are few activities that incorporate students to engage effectively in a range of conversations and collaborations by expressing well-supported ideas clearly and probing ideas under discussion by building on others' ideas. The program is currently reviewed as "Yes" for these criteria for grades 11-12 because materials direct students to collaborate with peers and engage in conversations directly related to the text under scrutiny.	Since these materials received a "No" for this indicator for grade 9, the current weakness will likely remain and should be addressed by adjusting or supplementing with stronger programs. Make sure to revise speaking and presentation tasks and rubrics to include adapting speech to various audiences for grades 11 – 12.

Instructional Materials Review for CCSS Alignment in ELA Grades 9-12

The goal for ELA students is that they can read and understand grade-level texts independently, as demonstrated through writing and speaking about those texts. A strong ELA classroom is structured with the below components.

Title: **English Language Arts** **Grade:** **9-12**

Publisher: **Engage New York** **Copyright:** **2013**

Overall Rating: **Tier II, Approaching quality**

Tier I, Tier II, Tier III elements of this review:

Grade 9

STRONG	WEAK
Complexity of Texts (Non-Negotiable)	Assessment
Quality of Texts (Non-Negotiable)	Writing to Sources
Range and Volume of Texts	Speaking and Listening
Text-Dependent Questions (Non-Negotiable)	Language
Scaffolding and Support	

Grades 11-12 Developing Core Proficiency Series

STRONG	WEAK
Complexity of Texts (Non-Negotiable)	Scaffolding and Support
Quality of Texts (Non-Negotiable)	
Range and Volume of Texts	
Text-Dependent Questions (Non-Negotiable)	
Assessment	
Writing to Sources	
Speaking and Listening	

Each set of submitted materials was evaluated for alignment with the standards beginning with a review of the indicators for the non-negotiable criteria. If those criteria were met, a review of the other criteria ensued.

Tier 1 ratings received a "Yes" for all Criteria 1-10.
Tier 2 ratings received a "Yes" for all non-negotiable criteria (Foundational Skills (as applicable), Complexity of Texts, Quality of Texts, and Text-Dependent Questions), but at least one "No" for the remaining criteria.
Tier 3 ratings received a "No" for at least one of the non-negotiable criteria.

Click below for complete grade-level reviews:

Grade 9 (Tier 2)
Grade 11-12 (Tier 2)

Instructional Materials Evaluation Tool for Alignment in ELA Grades 3 -12 (IMET)

The goal for ELA students is that they can read and understand grade-level texts independently, as demonstrated through writing and speaking about those texts. A strong ELA classroom is structured with the below components.

Title: **English Language Arts Modules 1 and 2** **Grade:** **9**

Publisher: **Engage New York** **Copyright:** **2013**

Overall Rating: **Tier II, Approaching quality**

Tier I, Tier II, Tier III elements of this review:

STRONG	WEAK
Complexity of Texts (Non-Negotiable)	Assessment
Quality of Texts (Non-Negotiable)	Writing to Sources
Range and Volume of Texts	Speaking and Listening
Text-Dependent Questions (Non-Negotiable)	Language
Scaffolding and Support	

To evaluate each set of submitted materials for alignment with the standards, begin by reviewing Column 2 for the non-negotiable criteria. If there is a "Yes" for all required indicators in Column 2, then the materials receive a "Yes" in Column 1. If there is a "No" for any required indicators in Column 2, then the materials receive a "No" in Column 1. (Note: If materials do not represent a full curricula, then some of Criteria 1-10 may not apply.)

Tier 1 ratings receive a "Yes" in Column 1 for Criteria 1-10.
Tier 2 ratings receive a "Yes" in Column 1 for all non-negotiable criteria (Foundational Skills (as applicable), Complexity of Texts, Quality of Texts, and Text-Dependent Questions), but at least one "No" in Column 1 for the remaining criteria.
Tier 3 ratings receive a "No" in Column 1 for at least one of the non-negotiable criteria.

CRITERIA	INDICATORS OF SUPERIOR QUALITY	MEETS METRICS (Y/N)	JUSTIFICATION/ COMMENTS
I.			
Tier 1 and 2 Non-Negotiable **1. COMPLEXITY OF TEXTS:** Materials present a progression of complex texts as stated by Reading Standard 10[1]. ■ Yes ☐ No	**REQUIRED** **1a)** Materials provide texts that fall within grade-level complexity bands, indicating that quantitative measures and qualitative analysis[2] were used in selection of texts. Poetry and drama are analyzed only using qualitative measures.	**Yes**	The quantitative measures and qualitative analyses that were used are labeled on the materials. It is clear that the suggested texts fall within the grade-level complexity band (e.g., one anchor text is 1130L;, another, *Oedipus the King*, is an Appendix B exemplar; two authors used, Edgar Allan Poe and Emily Dickenson, are also found in Appendix B for 9th grade).
	REQUIRED **1b)** Texts for each grade band align with the complexity requirements outlined in the standards and with the complexity of exemplars provided in Appendices A and B.	**Yes**	Some of the texts align with the complexity requirements for this grade band and many are identified as exemplars (e.g., *Oedipus the King* is in Appendix B exemplar; *The Tell-Tale Heart* is in the grades 6-8 text complexity exemplars and also used as a sample anchor text for grade 8 with Louisiana Dept. of Education).
	REQUIRED **1c)** Texts increase in complexity as materials progress across grade bands. Read-aloud texts follow the same trend, although they may have greater variability because listening skills in elementary school generally outpace reading skills	**Yes**	Texts increase in complexity as material progress across grade bands (e.g., the Unit two emphasis on non-fiction reading from an excerpt *True Crime* paired with *New York Times Review* from Liaquat Ahamed's novel, *How Bernard Madoff Did It*.
Tier 1 and 2 Non-Negotiable **2. QUALITY OF TEXTS:** Texts are of sufficient scope and quality to provide text-centered and integrated learning that is sequenced and scaffolded to advance students toward	**REQUIRED** **2a)** 90% of texts are worth reading in the particular grade (i.e., serve an instructional purpose); they are content rich and well crafted, representing the quality of writing that is produced by authorities in the discipline and include texts from history/social studies, science, technical subjects, and the arts.	**Yes**	The texts are quality texts and worth reading (e.g., Romeo and Juliet, Oedipus Rex are classics widely-anthologized for study).

[1] Grades 3-12 Example: Texts present vocabulary, syntax, text structures, levels of meaning/purpose similar to exemplars in Appendices A and B

[2] The process for determining quantitative and qualitative measures is described in the Supplement to Appendix A. Grade band conversions for quantitative measures are determined using the chart on page 4 of the document. A description of the criteria for analyzing the qualitative features of the text is located on pages 4-6 of the document.

CRITERIA	INDICATORS OF SUPERIOR QUALITY	MEETS METRICS (Y/N)	JUSTIFICATION/ COMMENTS
I.			
independent reading of grade level texts and build content knowledge (ELA, social studies, science and technical subjects, and the arts). The quality of texts is high—they support multiple readings for various purposes and exhibit exceptional craft and thought and/or provide useful information. ■ Yes ☐ No	**REQUIRED** **2b)** Materials provide a sequence or collection of texts that build knowledge systematically through reading, writing, listening and speaking about topics or ideas under study.	**Yes**	Much time is devoted to on reading and writing. Although speaking and listening is addressed through turn and talk strategies, it is not included in specific assignments.
	REQUIRED **2c)** Within a sequence or collection of texts, specific anchor texts of grade-level complexity are selected for multiple, careful readings.	**Yes**	Within the sequence of texts, there are specific texts selected for careful readings. Passages are identified and paired with close-reading activities with answers and differentiation guides provided in the teacher edition.
	2d) Nearly all texts are previously published rather than "commissioned."	**Yes**	Nearly all texts are previously published rather than commissioned (e.g., Shakespeare's, Romeo and Juliet, Plato's Apology and I felt a funeral in my brain, by Emily Dickinson).
3. RANGE AND VOLUME OF TEXTS: Materials reflect the distribution of text types and genres suggested by the standards: Text types and genres generally reflect the definitions provided on page 31 (grades K-5) and page 57 (grades 6-12) of the standards and included in the text of the standards (e.g., RL.2.9, RL.9-10.6, RI.7.7, or RI.11-12.9). ■ Yes ☐ No	**REQUIRED** **3a)** In grades K-12, ELA materials seek a balance in instructional time between 50% literature/ 50% informational texts.	**Yes**	Although individual modules vary in percentages, materials seek a balance between instructional texts and literary texts (e.g., Unit 1 is focused on the use of fictional texts, Unit 2 reflects a 50/50 balance, while Unit 3 is focused on informational texts).
	REQUIRED **3b)** Materials include texts of different formats (e.g., print and non-print, including film, art, music, charts, etc.) and lengths.	**Yes**	There are four different mediums represented in this unit: art, film, audio and print. A 1996 film version of Romeo and Juliet is also in the unit.
	3c) Materials include many informational texts with an informational text structure rather than a narrative structure; grades 6-12 include literary nonfiction.	**Yes**	Materials provide texts that are examples of literary nonfiction such as Animals in Translation: Using the Mysteries of Autism to Decode Animal Behavior and examples of informational text structure such as Monkeys Can Perform Mental Addition.
	3d) Additional materials increase the opportunity for regular, accountable independent reading of texts that appeal to students' interests to build reading stamina, confidence, motivation, and enjoyment and connect to classroom concepts or topics to develop knowledge.	**Yes**	There are minimal additional materials available.

CRITERIA	INDICATORS OF SUPERIOR QUALITY	MEETS METRICS (Y/N)	JUSTIFICATION/ COMMENTS
II. Foundational Skills (grades 3-5 only)			
Tier 1 and 2 Non-Negotiable* **4. FOUNDATIONAL SKILLS:** Materials provide instruction and diagnostic support in concepts of print, phonics, vocabulary, development, syntax, and fluency in a logical and transparent progression. These foundational skills are necessary and central components of an effective, comprehensive reading program designed to develop proficient readers with the capacity to comprehend texts across a range of types and disciplines. ☐ Yes ☐ No *As applicable (e.g., when the scope of the materials is comprehensive and considered a full program)	**REQUIRED** **4a)** Materials demand knowledge of grade-level phonic patterns and word analysis skills.	**N/A**	
	REQUIRED **4b)** Materials encourage students to use context to confirm or self-correct word recognition and understanding, directing students to reread purposefully to acquire accurate meaning.	**N/A**	
	REQUIRED **4c)** Materials provide instruction and practice in word study, including systematic examination of grade-level morphology, decoding of multisyllabic words by using syllabication, and automaticity with grade-level regular and irregular spelling patterns.	**N/A**	
	REQUIRED **4d)** Opportunities are frequently built into the materials that allow for students to achieve reading fluency in oral and silent reading, that is, to read on-level prose and poetry with accuracy, rate appropriate to the text, and expression.	**N/A**	
	REQUIRED **4e)** Materials guide students to read grade-level text with purpose and understanding.	**N/A**	

CRITERIA	INDICATORS OF SUPERIOR QUALITY	MEETS METRICS (Y/N)	JUSTIFICATION/ COMMENTS
III. Questions and Tasks			
Non-Negotiable 5. TEXT-DEPENDENT QUESTIONS: Text-dependent questions and tasks reflect the requirements of Reading Standard 1 by requiring use of textual evidence in support of meeting other grade-specific standards. ■ Yes ☐ No	**REQUIRED** **5a)** At least 80% of all questions in the materials are text-dependent questions; student ideas are expressed through both written and spoken responses.	**Yes**	The model questions in these lessons are dependent on the texts from the units. At least 80% of the questions are dependent on text with the exception of some lessons in Unit 3 where students explore inquiry questions in research.
	REQUIRED **5b)** Coherent sequences of text-dependent questions elicit sustained attention to the text and its illustrations (as applicable), its impact (including the building of knowledge), and its connection to other texts.	**Yes**	The Units provide model text questioning sequence along with text specific questions to illustrate the process. Module Performance Tasks generate a close reading and analysis of paired texts.
	REQUIRED **5c)** Questions include the language of the standards, and assess the depth and complexity required by the standards at each grade-level over time to advance and deepen student learning. *(**Note:** not every standard must be assessed with every text.)*	**Yes**	Questions refer to specifics within the texts and require students to refer back to specific parts of the text using language such as, *cite specific details.*
	5d) Questions and tasks often begin with comprehension of the text before focusing on interpretation or evaluation.	**Yes**	Questions and tasks often begin with comprehension of the text.
	5e) Questions support students in unpacking the academic language (vocabulary and syntax) prevalent in complex texts to determine meaning from texts and in learning new vocabulary from reading.	**Yes**	Questions support students in unpacking academic language.

CRITERIA	INDICATORS OF SUPERIOR QUALITY	MEETS METRICS (Y/N)	JUSTIFICATION/ COMMENTS
III. Questions and Tasks			
6. ASSESSMENT: Materials offer assessment opportunities that genuinely measure progress and elicit direct, observable evidence of the degree to which students can independently demonstrate the assessed grade-specific standards with appropriately complex text(s). ☐ Yes ☐ No	**REQUIRED** **6a)** Measurement of progress via assessments should include gradual release of supporting scaffolds for students to measure their independent abilities.	**No**	There are daily formative assessments in the form of *quick writes*. However, there is no clear evidence that they become less scaffolded.
	REQUIRED **6b)** Aligned rubrics or assessment guidelines (such as scoring guides or student work exemplars) are included and provide sufficient guidance for interpreting student performance.	**No**	Rubrics are not included, but they are mentioned.
	REQUIRED **6c)** Materials use varied modes of assessment, including a range of pre-, formative, summative and self-assessment measures.	**Yes**	There are varied modes of assessments for each unit.
	6d) Materials assess student proficiency using methods that are unbiased and accessible to all students.	**Yes**	Requirements are evident.

CRITERIA	INDICATORS OF SUPERIOR QUALITY	MEETS METRICS (Y/N)	JUSTIFICATION/ COMMENTS
IV. Scaffolding and Support			
7. SCAFFOLDING AND SUPPORT: Materials provide all students, including those who read below grade level, with extensive opportunities and support to encounter and comprehend grade-level complex text as required by the standards. ■ Yes ☐ No	**REQUIRED** **7a)** Pre-reading activities and suggested approaches to teacher scaffolding are focused and engage students with understanding the text itself. Pre-reading activities should be no more than 10% of time devoted to any reading instruction.	**Yes**	Pre-reading activities are included with each text, in each unit. These activities fall within the 10% time limitation.
	REQUIRED **7b)** Materials do not confuse or substitute mastery of strategies for full comprehension of text; reading strategies support comprehension of specific texts and focus on building knowledge and insight. Texts must not serve as platforms to practice discrete strategies.	**Yes**	The materials are clear and easy to use. Texts do not serve as platforms for various strategies.
	REQUIRED **7c)** Materials regularly direct teachers to return to focused parts of the text to guide students through rereading, discussion and writing about the ideas, events, and information found there.	**Yes**	Materials regularly direct teachers to guide students through rereading, discussion and writing (e.g., In the *Romeo and Juliet* unit, students must read, analyze and cite strong and thorough evidence of what the text says, plus draw inferences from the text).
	REQUIRED **7d)** The materials are easy to use and cleanly laid out for students and teachers. Each page of the submission adds to student learning rather than distracts from it. The reading selections are centrally located within the materials and obviously the center of focus.	**Yes**	Materials are easy to use.
	7e) Appropriate suggestions and materials are provided for supporting varying student needs at the unit and lesson level (e.g., alternate teaching approaches, pacing, instructional delivery options, suggestions for addressing common student difficulties to meet standards, remediation strategies or suggestions for supporting texts, suggestions for more advanced texts for extension, etc.).	**No**	There were minimal suggestions on remediation strategies to meet the various needs of the students; however the teacher can allow for accommodations.
	7f) The content can be reasonably completed within a regular school year and the pacing of content allows for maximum student understanding. The materials provide guidance about the amount of time a task might reasonably take.	**Yes**	The content can be reasonably completed within a regular school year.

CRITERIA	INDICATORS OF SUPERIOR QUALITY	MEETS METRICS (Y/N)	JUSTIFICATION/ COMMENTS
V. Writing to Sources and Research			
8. WRITING TO SOURCES: The majority of written tasks are text-dependent and reflect the writing genres named in the standards. ☐ Yes ■ No	**REQUIRED** **8a)** A vast majority of written tasks at all grade levels require students to analyze and synthesize sources, as well as to present careful analysis, well-defended claims and clear information, drawing on textual evidence and to support valid inferences from text.	**No**	All written tasks ask for evidence, but there is no synthesis of sources.
	REQUIRED **8b)** Materials include multiple writing tasks aligned to the three modes of writing (opinion/argumentative, informative, narrative) as well as blended modes (i.e., analytical writing); narrative prompts decrease in number and increase in being based on text(s) as student progress through the grades, e.g., narrative description (text-based, chronological writing) rather than imaginative narratives.	**Yes**	Writing task vary (e.g., opinion, informative and narrative). Students must cite evidence from the text in many of the assignments.
	REQUIRED **8c)** Writing opportunities for students are prominent and varied in length and time demands (e.g., notes, summaries, short-answer responses, formal essays, on-demand and process writing, etc.).	**Yes**	The writing opportunities for students vary in length and styles. The teacher can decide if timed writing is necessary.
	REQUIRED **8d)** Materials build in opportunities for connections and alignment between writing, speaking and listening, reading, and the language standards. For example, students read a text, work collaboratively to develop a plan for analyzing or emulating the text, write a response, and then share their writing with a peer who reviews the writing against using a peer review checklist.	**No**	The materials allow for reading and writing opportunities but don't allow student planning for analysis. All of the activities are designed and dictated by the instructor. Students are allowed to share their answers with groups and partners.
	8e) Materials engage students in many short research projects annually to develop the expertise needed to conduct research independently.	**No**	The materials do not include short research projects.

CRITERIA	INDICATORS OF SUPERIOR QUALITY	MEETS METRICS (Y/N)	JUSTIFICATION/ COMMENTS
VI. Speaking and Listening			
9. SPEAKING AND LISTENING: Oral tasks must be text-dependent and materials for speaking and listening must reflect true communication skills required for college and career readiness. ☐ Yes ■ No	**REQUIRED** **9a)** Texts used in speaking and listening questions and tasks must meet the criteria for complexity, range, and quality of texts (Criteria 1, 2, and 3).	**Yes**	The texts meet the *complexity* requirement because they indicate research-based quantitative measurements and qualitative analysis were used in text selections and are balanced in terms of the number of fiction and non-fiction texts used.
	REQUIRED **9b)** Materials demand that students engage effectively in a range of conversations and collaborations by expressing well-supported ideas clearly and probing ideas under discussion by building on others' ideas.	**No**	Only one unit incorporated these strategies. There are a few activities that incorporate these discussions including jigsaw and fishbowl discussions. There simply are not enough.
	REQUIRED **9c)** Materials build in frequent opportunities for connections and alignment between speaking and listening, reading, writing, and the language standards. Examples: Materials build in frequent opportunities for discussion about texts and, through directions and modeling, encourage students to use academic language and grade-appropriate oral language conventions; materials require students to gather and use evidence to orally present findings from research.	**Yes**	Students are encouraged through the fishbowl and jigsaw methods to elaborate and ask questions of one another.
	9d) Materials develop active listening skills, such as taking notes on main ideas, asking relevant questions, and elaborating on remarks of others.	**Yes**	Requirements are evident.

CRITERIA	INDICATORS OF SUPERIOR QUALITY	MEETS METRICS (Y/N)	JUSTIFICATION/ COMMENTS
VII. Language			
10. LANGUAGE: Materials must adequately address the Language standards for the grade, including through unpacking the vocabulary and syntax of text(s) (indicator 5e) as models of language use. ☐ Yes ■ No	**REQUIRED** **10a)** Materials address the grammar and language conventions specified by the Language standards at each grade level and build on those standards that build from previous grade levels, as indicated by pages 30 and 56 of the standards.	**No**	There is no emphasis on grammar instruction evident.
	REQUIRED **10b)** Materials expect students to confront their own error patterns in usage and conventions (oral and written) and correct them.	**Yes**	Materials expect students to confront their own error in usage and convention. Students self and peer evaluate writing assignments.
	REQUIRED **10c)** Materials encourage students to examine the language of texts (vocabulary, sentences, structure) and model their own writing after texts they are listening to or reading as a way to develop more complex sentence structure and language usage.	**No**	There is no evidence that students engage in study of the language of texts for the purpose of emulating the writing.
	REQUIRED **10d)** Materials build in frequent opportunities for connections and alignment between the language standards, writing, reading, and speaking and listening. For example, through directions and modeling, materials encourage students to use grade-appropriate language conventions when speaking and writing about texts.	**Yes**	Material builds and connects between language standards, writing, reading and speaking and listening. Many of the units engage in all of the standards.
	10e) Materials provide real-world activities for student practice with natural language (e.g. mock interviews, presentations).	**No**	There are minimal real-world activities in the modules.

Tier 1 ratings receive a "Yes" in Column 1 for Criteria 1-10.
Tier 2 ratings receive a "Yes" in Column 1 for all non-negotiable criteria (Foundational Skills (as applicable), Complexity of Texts, Quality of Texts, and Text-Dependent Questions), but at least one "No" in Column 1 for the remaining criteria.
Tier 3 ratings receive a "No" in Column 1 for at least one of the non-negotiable criteria.

FINAL EVALUATION			
Compile the results for Sections I-VII to make a final decision for the material under review.			
Section	**Criteria**	**Y/N**	**Final Justification/Comments**
I: Text Selection	1. Complexity of Texts **(Non-Negotiable)**	**Yes**	Texts are appropriately complex, indicating quantitative measures and qualitative analyses were considered in selection.
	2. Quality of Texts **(Non-Negotiable)**	**Yes**	The texts include Appendix B exemplars
	3. Range and Volume of Texts	**Yes**	There is a balance of informational and literary texts across the series.
II: Foundational Skills	4. Foundational Skills **(Non-Negotiable*)**	**N/A**	
III: Text-Dependent Questions and Tasks	5. Text-Dependent Questions **(Non-Negotiable)**	**Yes**	Questions are dependent on the texts in each lesson and unit.
	6. Assessment	**No**	There are no rubrics provided and no evidence of removing scaffolding
IV: Scaffolding and Support	7. Scaffolding and Support	**Yes**	There are plenty of suggestions for the teacher on how to support, differentiate, and scaffold these lessons
V: Writing to Sources and Research	8. Writing to Sources	**No**	There is no research component
VI: Speaking and Listening	9. Speaking and Listening	**No**	There is not enough emphasis on speaking and listening
VII: Language	10. Language	**No**	Students are not asked to study the language of the texts.
FINAL DECISION FOR THIS MATERIAL: <u>Tier II, Approaching quality</u>			

*As applicable (e.g., when the scope of the materials is comprehensive and considered a full program)

Instructional Materials Evaluation Tool for Alignment in ELA Grades 3 -12 (IMET)

The goal for ELA students is that they can read and understand grade-level texts independently, as demonstrated through writing and speaking about those texts. A strong ELA classroom is structured with the below components.

Title: **Engage NY ELA Developing Core Proficiency Series** **Grade:** **11-12**

Publisher: **Odell Education for New York State** **Copyright:** **2013**

Overall Rating: **Tier II, Approaching quality**

This resource has been evaluated as a gap-fill set of units designed to instruct students in skills such as research, close reading, and using textual evidence. These are not curriculum modules; therefore, some of the criteria cannot be evaluated in the same way as traditional year-long curricula.

Tier I, Tier II, Tier III elements of this review:

STRONG	WEAK
Complexity of Texts (Non-Negotiable)	Scaffolding and Support
Quality of Texts (Non-Negotiable)	
Range and Volume of Texts	
Text-Dependent Questions (Non-Negotiable)	
Assessment	
Writing to Sources	
Speaking and Listening	

To evaluate each set of submitted materials for alignment with the standards, begin by reviewing Column 2 for the non-negotiable criteria. If there is a "Yes" for all required indicators in Column 2, then the materials receive a "Yes" in Column 1. If there is a "No" for any required indicators in Column 2, then the materials receive a "No" in Column 1. (Note: If materials do not represent a full curricula, then some of Criteria 1-10 may not apply.)

Tier 1 ratings receive a "Yes" in Column 1 for Criteria 1-10.
Tier 2 ratings receive a "Yes" in Column 1 for all non-negotiable criteria (Foundational Skills (as applicable), Complexity of Texts, Quality of Texts, and Text-Dependent Questions), but at least one "No" in Column 1 for the remaining criteria.
Tier 3 ratings receive a "No" in Column 1 for at least one of the non-negotiable criteria.

CRITERIA	INDICATORS OF SUPERIOR QUALITY	MEETS METRICS (Y/N)	JUSTIFICATION/ COMMENTS
I. Text Selection			
Tier 1 and 2 Non-Negotiable **1. COMPLEXITY OF TEXTS:** Materials present a progression of complex texts as stated by Reading Standard 10[1]. ■ Yes ☐ No	**REQUIRED** **1a)** Materials provide texts that fall within grade-level complexity bands, indicating that quantitative measures and qualitative analysis[2] were used in selection of texts. Poetry and drama are analyzed only using qualitative measures.	**Yes**	Quantitative and qualitative measures are used to justify text selections (i.e., Lexile).
	REQUIRED **1b)** Texts for each grade align with the requirements outlined in the standards and with the complexity of exemplars provided in Appendix B.	**Yes**	Texts align with complexity requirements of the standards and model the complexity of Appendix B exemplars.
	REQUIRED **1c)** Texts increase in complexity as materials progress across grade bands. Read-aloud texts follow the same trend, although they may have greater variability because listening skills in elementary school generally outpace reading skills.	**Yes**	There is an increase in text complexity from the skills-based units in 9th and 10th grades, but since these are not curricular units, complexity does not increase over the course of units.
Tier 1 and 2 Non-Negotiable **2. QUALITY OF TEXTS:** Texts are of sufficient scope and quality to provide text-centered and integrated learning that is sequenced and scaffolded to advance students toward independent reading of grade level texts and build content knowledge (ELA, social studies,	**REQUIRED** **2a)** 90% of texts are worth reading in the particular grade (i.e., serve an instructional purpose); they are content rich and well crafted, representing the quality of writing that is produced by authorities in the discipline and include texts from history/social studies, science, technical subjects, and the arts.	**Yes**	All texts are worth reading, and most are US seminal documents, such as the U.S. Constitution and Supreme Court judicial interpretations of amendments.
	REQUIRED **2b)** Materials provide a sequence or collection of texts that build knowledge systematically through reading, writing, listening and speaking about topics or ideas under study.	**N/A**	The proficiency series does not provide year-long curriculum modules. The series is designed to serve as gap-fill units to develop fundamental skills such as using textual evidence and close reading. Although building knowledge is not the intent of these units,

[1] Grades 3-12 Example: Texts present vocabulary, syntax, text structures, levels of meaning/purpose similar to exemplars in Appendix B.
[2] The process for determining quantitative and qualitative measures is described in the Supplement to Appendix A. Grade band conversions for quantitative measures are determined using the chart on page 4 of the document. A description of the criteria for analyzing the qualitative features of the text is located on pages 4-6 of the document.

CRITERIA	INDICATORS OF SUPERIOR QUALITY	MEETS METRICS (Y/N)	JUSTIFICATION/ COMMENTS
I. Text Selection			
science and technical subjects, and the arts). The quality of texts is high—they support multiple readings for various purposes and exhibit exceptional craft and thought and/or provide useful information. ■ Yes ☐ No			texts worthy of study are selected and presented in a way that also imparts knowledge while building skill. Materials provide students the opportunity to develop a deeper understanding of a topic or theme.
	REQUIRED **2c)** Within a sequence or collection of texts, specific anchor texts of grade-level complexity are selected for multiple, careful readings.	**Yes**	Although specific anchor texts are not explicitly identified, texts are given multiple readings as the unit progresses, and texts connect across a central theme.
	2d) Nearly all texts are previously published rather than "commissioned."	**Yes**	All texts are previously published, and many are foundational US documents.
3. RANGE AND VOLUME OF TEXTS: Materials reflect the distribution of text types and genres suggested by the standards: Text types and genres generally reflect the definitions provided on page 31 (grades K-5) and page 57 (grades 6-12) of the standards and included in the text of the standards (e.g., RL.2.9, RL.9-10.6, RI.7.7, or RI.11-12.9). ■ Yes ☐ No	**REQUIRED** **3a)** In grades K-12, ELA materials seek a balance in instructional time between 50% literature/ 50% informational texts.	**Yes**	Although more than 50% of texts are informational (i.e., approximately 85% across all units is informational), the series seeks a balance between US seminal documents and literary works indicative of traditional 11th American Literature curriculum.
	REQUIRED **3b)** Materials include texts of different formats (e.g., print and non-print, including film, art, music, charts, etc.) and lengths.	**Yes**	The materials incorporate poetry, multi-media, and art.
	3c) Materials include many informational texts with an informational text structure rather than a narrative structure; grades 6-12 include literary nonfiction.	**Yes**	There is a 50/50 mix of narrative informational text and literary nonfiction
	3d) Additional materials increase the opportunity for regular, accountable independent reading of texts that appeal to students' interests to build reading stamina, confidence, motivation, and enjoyment and connect to classroom concepts or topics to develop knowledge.	**Yes**	Students are given opportunity to select student-interest texts during the *research unit*. There is limited opportunity for student-selection of texts in other units.

CRITERIA	INDICATORS OF SUPERIOR QUALITY	MEETS METRICS (Y/N)	JUSTIFICATION/ COMMENTS
II. Foundational Skills (grades 3-5 only)			
Tier 1 and 2 Non-Negotiable* **4. FOUNDATIONAL SKILLS:** Materials provide instruction and diagnostic support in concepts of print, phonics, vocabulary, development, syntax, and fluency in a logical and transparent progression. These foundational skills are necessary and central components of an effective, comprehensive reading program designed to develop proficient readers with the capacity to comprehend texts across a range of types and disciplines. ☐ Yes ☐ No *As applicable (e.g., when the scope of the materials is comprehensive and considered a full program)	**REQUIRED** **4a)** Materials demand knowledge of grade-level phonic patterns and word analysis skills.	**N/A**	
	REQUIRED **4b)** Materials encourage students to use context to confirm or self-correct word recognition and understanding, directing students to reread purposefully to acquire accurate meaning.	**N/A**	
	REQUIRED **4c)** Materials provide instruction and practice in word study, including systematic examination of grade-level morphology, decoding of multisyllabic words by using syllabication, and automaticity with grade-level regular and irregular spelling patterns.	**N/A**	
	REQUIRED **4d)** Opportunities are frequently built into the materials that allow for students to achieve reading fluency in oral and silent reading, that is, to read on-level prose and poetry with accuracy, rate appropriate to the text, and expression.	**N/A**	
	REQUIRED **4e)** Materials guide students to read grade-level text with purpose and understanding.	**N/A**	

CRITERIA	INDICATORS OF SUPERIOR QUALITY	MEETS METRICS (Y/N)	JUSTIFICATION/ COMMENTS
III. Questions and Tasks			
Non-Negotiable 5. TEXT-DEPENDENT QUESTIONS: Text-dependent questions and tasks reflect the requirements of Reading Standard 1 by requiring use of textual evidence in support of meeting other grade-specific standards. ■ Yes ☐ No	**REQUIRED** **5a)** At least 80% of all questions in the materials are text-dependent questions; student ideas are expressed through both written and spoken responses.	**Yes**	The model questions and worksheet tasks in these units are dependent on the texts from the units. Materials such as the *Questioning Texts Worksheet* are modeled then used independently.
	REQUIRED **5b)** Coherent sequences of text-dependent questions elicit sustained attention to the text and its illustrations (as applicable), its impact (including the building of knowledge), and its connection to other texts.	**Yes**	The *reading closely* units provide a model text questioning sequence along with text specific questions to illustrate the process.
	REQUIRED **5c)** Questions include the language of the standards, and assess the depth and complexity required by the standards at each grade-level over time to advance and deepen student learning. *(**Note:** not every standard must be assessed with every text.)*	**Yes**	The language of the standards is prevalent throughout the unit and assesses the depth of the standards on which each unit is focused.
	5d) Questions and tasks often begin with comprehension of the text before focusing on interpretation or evaluation.	**Yes**	All unit tasks initially focus on comprehension of texts either through independent reading or read aloud.
	5e) Questions support students in unpacking the academic language (vocabulary and syntax) prevalent in complex texts to determine meaning from texts and in learning new vocabulary from reading.	**Yes**	Students are required to unpack vocabulary. In addition, units such as *Reading Closely for Textual Details* have tasks that focus on syntax and sentence structure more heavily than others .

CRITERIA	INDICATORS OF SUPERIOR QUALITY	MEETS METRICS (Y/N)	JUSTIFICATION/ COMMENTS
6. ASSESSMENT: Materials offer assessment opportunities that genuinely measure progress and elicit direct, observable evidence of the degree to which students can independently demonstrate the assessed grade-specific standards with appropriately complex text(s). ■ Yes ☐ No	**REQUIRED** **6a)** Measurement of progress via assessments should include gradual release of supporting scaffolds for students to measure their independent abilities.	**Yes**	Multiple formative assessment opportunities are given throughout the unit, giving students and teachers opportunity to adjust instruction to meet skill requirements.
	REQUIRED **6b)** Aligned rubrics or assessment guidelines (such as scoring guides or student work exemplars) are included and provide sufficient guidance for interpreting student performance.	**Yes**	The units provide model worksheets, rubrics, and student writing samples for teachers to assess student understanding.
	REQUIRED **6c)** Materials use varied modes of assessment, including a range of pre-, formative, summative and self-assessment measures.	**Yes**	The materials provide a variety of assessment opportunities with checklists, rubrics, student model worksheets and student writing samples.
	6d) Materials assess student proficiency using methods that are unbiased and accessible to all students.	**Yes**	Some units provide students with checklists to measure their own progress.

CRITERIA	INDICATORS OF SUPERIOR QUALITY	MEETS METRICS (Y/N)	JUSTIFICATION/ COMMENTS
IV. Scaffolding and Support			
7. SCAFFOLDING AND SUPPORT: Materials provide all students, including those who read below grade level, with extensive opportunities and support to encounter and comprehend grade-level complex text as required by the standards. ☐ Yes ☐ No	**REQUIRED** **7a)** Pre-reading activities and suggested approaches to teacher scaffolding are focused and engage students with understanding the text itself. Pre-reading activities should be no more than 10% of time devoted to any reading instruction.	**Yes**	Pre-reading strategies are scaffolded throughout the unit, but texts are used to give students foundational, skill-based instruction.
	REQUIRED **7b)** Materials do not confuse or substitute mastery of strategies for full comprehension of text; reading strategies support comprehension of specific texts and focus on building knowledge and insight. Texts must not serve as platforms to practice discrete strategies.	**No**	These skill-based units are designed to fill gaps in instruction; therefore, more attention is given to the skills of close reading, using textual evidence, and writing to sources rather than directly building knowledge within the unit.
	REQUIRED **7c)** Materials regularly direct teachers to return to focused parts of the text to guide students through rereading, discussion and writing about the ideas, events, and information found there.	**Yes**	Materials guide teachers to use specific chunks of text for instruction. Students return to text for evidence used in discussion and writing.
	REQUIRED **7d)** The materials are easy to use and cleanly laid out for students and teachers. Each page of the submission adds to student learning rather than distracts from it. The reading selections are centrally located within the materials and obviously the center of focus.	**Yes**	The format allows teachers and students to progress through the instruction. Emphasis is placed on the text and using the text to support all student activities.
	7e) Appropriate suggestions and materials are provided for supporting varying student needs at the unit and lesson level (e.g., alternate teaching approaches, pacing, instructional delivery options, suggestions for addressing common student difficulties to meet standards, remediation strategies or suggestions for supporting texts, suggestions for more advanced texts for extension, etc.).	**No**	Suggestions for differentiated instruction are not outlined in the units.
	7f) The content can be reasonably completed within a regular school year and the pacing of content allows for maximum student understanding. The materials provide guidance about the amount of time a task might reasonably take.	**N/A**	This resource is intended for supplemental instruction. It is not a complete English curriculum.

CRITERIA	INDICATORS OF SUPERIOR QUALITY	MEETS METRICS (Y/N)	JUSTIFICATION/ COMMENTS
V. Writing to Sources and Research			
8. WRITING TO SOURCES: The majority of written tasks are text-dependent and reflect the writing genres named in the standards. ■ Yes ☐ No	**REQUIRED** **8a)** A vast majority of written tasks at all grade levels require students to analyze and synthesize sources, as well as to present careful analysis, well-defended claims and clear information, drawing on textual evidence and to support valid inferences from text.	**Yes**	The written tasks in the unit set require students to analyze and synthesize sources, research, and make evidence-based claims.
	REQUIRED **8b)** Materials include multiple writing tasks aligned to the three modes of writing (opinion/argumentative, informative, narrative) as well as blended modes (i.e., analytical writing); narrative prompts decrease in number and increase in being based on text(s) as student progress through the grades, e.g., narrative description (text-based, chronological writing) rather than imaginative narratives.	**Yes**	Across the scope of all units, the resource covers the three modes of writing, but individual unit texts and writing assignments focus on developing the proficiency in one mode of writing at a time. Opportunities for narrative writing are given in some units, although it is not the focus.
	REQUIRED **8c)** Writing opportunities for students are prominent and Varied in length and time demands (e.g., notes, summaries, short-answer responses, formal essays, on-demand and process writing, etc.).	**Yes**	Students are required to respond in short critical analysis and in more lengthy essays and research-based opportunities.
	REQUIRED **8d)** Materials build in opportunities for connections and alignment between writing, speaking and listening, reading, and the language standards. For example, students read a text, work collaboratively to develop a plan for analyzing or emulating the text, write a response, and then share their writing with a peer who reviews the writing against using a peer review checklist.	**Yes**	Students are given multiple opportunities to make connections between class discussions and writing to analyze a text. Units that focus on writing as a skill also have time built in to allow for peer review and feedback.
	8e) Materials engage students in many short research projects annually to develop the expertise needed to conduct research independently.	**Yes**	Research writing/projects are contained in the units to help develop expertise needed to conduct research independently.

CRITERIA	INDICATORS OF SUPERIOR QUALITY	MEETS METRICS (Y/N)	JUSTIFICATION/ COMMENTS
VI. Speaking and Listening			
9. SPEAKING AND LISTENING: Oral tasks must be text-dependent and materials for speaking and listening must reflect true communication skills required for college and career readiness. ■ Yes ☐ No	**REQUIRED** **9a)** Texts used in speaking and listening questions and tasks must meet the criteria for complexity, range, and quality of texts (Criteria 1, 2, and 3).	**Yes**	Texts used in speaking and listening meet appropriate text complexity criteria.
	REQUIRED **9b)** Materials demand that students engage effectively in a range of conversations and collaborations by expressing well-supported ideas clearly and probing ideas under discussion by building on others' ideas.	**Yes**	Materials direct students to collaborate with peers and engage in conversations directly related to the text under scrutiny.
	REQUIRED **9c)** Materials build in frequent opportunities for connections and alignment between speaking and listening, reading, writing, and the language standards. Examples: Materials build in frequent opportunities for discussion about texts and, through directions and modeling, encourage students to use academic language and grade-appropriate oral language conventions; materials require students to gather and use evidence to orally present findings from research.	**Yes**	The units offer students the opportunity to listen to and discuss texts in small groups, jigsaws, and panel discussions. Some units offer students more opportunities to engage in discussion as it relates to the focus skill of the unit.
	9d) Materials develop active listening skills, such as taking notes on main ideas, asking relevant questions, and elaborating on remarks of others.	**Yes**	Text Centered Discussion Checklists enforce the Speaking and Listening standards. The materials offer *Model Text Questioning Sequence* and critical disciplinary vocabulary and concepts are built into the instruction through handouts and worksheets.

CRITERIA	INDICATORS OF SUPERIOR QUALITY	MEETS METRICS (Y/N)	JUSTIFICATION/ COMMENTS
VII. Language			
10. LANGUAGE: Materials must adequately address the Language standards for the grade, including through unpacking the vocabulary and syntax of text(s) (indicator 5e) as models of language use. ☐ Yes ☐ No	**REQUIRED** **10a)** Materials address the grammar and language conventions specified by the Language standards at each grade level and build on those standards that build from previous grade levels, as indicated by pages 30 and 56 of the standards.	**N/A**	The proficiency series provides skill-based units that are not designed to focus on the language standards.
	REQUIRED **10b)** Materials expect students to confront their own error patterns in usage and conventions (oral and written) and correct them.	**N/A**	
	REQUIRED **10c)** Materials encourage students to examine the language of texts (vocabulary, sentences, structure) and model their own writing after texts they are listening to or reading as a way to develop more complex sentence structure and language usage.	**N/A**	
	REQUIRED **10d)** Materials build in frequent opportunities for connections and alignment between the language standards, writing, reading, and speaking and listening. For example, through directions and modeling, materials encourage students to use grade-appropriate language conventions when speaking and writing about texts.	**N/A**	
	10e) Materials provide real-world activities for student practice with natural language (e.g. mock interviews, presentations).	**N/A**	

Tier 1 ratings receive a "Yes" in Column 1 for Criteria 1-10.
Tier 2 ratings receive a "Yes" in Column 1 for all non-negotiable criteria (Foundational Skills (as applicable), Complexity of Texts, Quality of Texts, and Text-Dependent Questions), but at least one "No" in Column 1 for the remaining criteria.
Tier 3 ratings receive a "No" in Column 1 for at least one of the non-negotiable criteria.

FINAL EVALUATION			
Compile the results for Sections I-VII to make a final decision for the material under review.			
Section	**Criteria**	**Y/N**	**Final Justification/Comments**
I: Text Selection	1. Complexity of Texts **(Non-Negotiable)**	**Yes**	Texts are appropriately complex and explanations justifying complexity are included in unit descriptions.
	2. Quality of Texts **(Non-Negotiable)**	**Yes**	The proficiency series does not provide year-long curricular units. The units within the series are not designed to build knowledge over time, but rather to teach skill; criteria 2b is not applicable to this resource.
	3. Range and Volume of Texts	**Yes**	While a greater percent of material is nonfiction, there is a good balance between literary nonfiction and narrative informational texts.
II: Foundational Skills	4. Foundational Skills **(Non-Negotiable*)**	**N/A**	Required for Grades 3-5.
III: Text-Dependent Questions and Tasks	5. Text-Dependent Questions **(Non-Negotiable)**	**Yes**	Suggested questions rely on the text and require textual evidence for support.
	6. Assessment	**Yes**	Opportunities for formal assessment are given throughout the unit with student writing samples used as guidelines
IV: Scaffolding and Support	7. Scaffolding and Support	**No**	Scaffolding is built into the units; however, support for struggling learners is not provided.
V: Writing to Sources and Research	8. Writing to Sources	**Yes**	Students write throughout the units; some units focus on one specific mode of writing throughout the unit
VI: Speaking and Listening	9. Speaking and Listening	**Yes**	Students use text to communicate and collaborate throughout the unit.
VII: Language	10. Language	**N/A**	The proficiency series provide skill-based units and are not designed to focus on the language CCSS.
FINAL DECISION FOR THIS MATERIAL: <u>Tier II, Approaching quality</u> This resource has been evaluated as a gap-fill set of units designed to instruct students in skills such as research, close reading, and using textual evidence. These are not curriculum modules; therefore, some of the criteria cannot be evaluated in the same way as traditional year-long curricula.			

*As applicable (e.g., when the scope of the materials is comprehensive and considered a full program)