Grade/Course: 4-5



Instructional Materials Evaluation Review for Alignment in Social Studies Grades K – 12

Copyright: 2016



The goal for social studies students is develop a deep, conceptual understanding of the content, as demonstrated through writing and speaking about the content. Strong social studies instruction is built around these priorities.

Content: Students build an understanding of social studies content.

- They examine authentic sources to build knowledge of social studies content.
- They explore meaningful questions about sources and content to build understanding.

Claims: Students develop and express claims that demonstrate their understanding of content.

- They make connections among ideas, people, and events across time and place.
- They express understanding of content using evidence from authentic sources and outside knowledge.

Title: Mini-Qs in American History Volumes 1 and 2, Florida History, Civics, and World History Volume 2

Publisher: The DBQ Company dba The DBQ Project

Curriculum Type: Supplemental

Overall Rating: Tier I, Exemplifies quality

Tier I, Tier II, Tier III Elements of this review:

STRONG	WEAK
1. Scope and Quality of Content (Non-Negotiable)	
2. Range and Volume of Sources (Non-Negotiable)	
3. Questions and Tasks (Non-Negotiable)	
4. Response to Sources	
5. Scaffolding and Support	

Each set of submitted materials was evaluated for alignment with the <u>standards</u>, beginning with a review of the indicators for the non-negotiable criteria. If those criteria were met, a review of the other criteria ensued.

Tier 1 ratings received a "Yes" for all Criteria 1 - 5.

Tier 2 ratings received a "Yes" for all non-negotiable criteria, but at least one "No" for the remaining criteria. *Tier 3 ratings* received a "No for at least one of the non-negotiable criteria.

Click below for complete grade-level reviews: Grade 4 (Tier 1) Grade 5 (Tier 1)





The goal for social studies students is develop a deep, conceptual understanding of the content, as demonstrated through writing and speaking about the content. Strong social studies instruction is built around these priorities.

Content: Students build an understanding of social studies content.

- They examine authentic sources to build knowledge of social studies content.
- They explore meaningful questions about sources and content to build understanding.

Claims: Students develop and express claims that demonstrate their understanding of content.

- They make connections among ideas, people, and events across time and place.
- They express understanding of content using evidence from authentic sources and outside knowledge.

Title: Mini-Qs in American History Volumes 1 and 2, Florida History, and Civics	Grade/Course: <u>4</u>
Publisher: The DBQ Company dba The DBQ Project	Copyright: 2016

Curriculum Type: Supplemental

Overall Rating: Tier I, Exemplifies quality

Tier I, Tier II, Tier III Elements of this review:

STRONG	WEAK
1. Scope and Quality of Content (Non-Negotiable)	
2. Range and Volume of Sources (Non-Negotiable)	
3. Questions and Tasks (Non-Negotiable)	
4. Response to Sources	
5. Scaffolding and Support	

To evaluate each set of submitted materials for alignment with the <u>standards</u>, begin by reviewing Column 2 for the nonnegotiable criteria. If there is a "Yes" for all required indicators in Column 2, then the materials receive a "Yes" in Column 1. If there is a "No" for any required indicators in Column 2, then the materials receive a "No" in Column 1. (Note: If materials do not represent a full curricula, then some of Criteria 1 - 5 may not apply.)

Tier 1 ratings receive a "Yes" in Column 1 for Criteria 1 – 5.

Tier 2 ratings receive a "Yes" in Column 1 for all non-negotiable criteria, but at least one "No" in Column 1 for the remaining criteria.

Tier 3 ratings receive a "No" in Column 1 for at least one of the non-negotiable criteria.

CRITERIA	INDICATORS OF SUPERIOR QUALITY	MEETS METRICS (YES/NO)	JUSTIFICATION/COMMENTS WITH EXAMPLES
Section I. Content			
Tier 1 and 2 Non-Negotiable 1. SCOPE AND QUALITY OF CONTENT:	REQUIRED (FULL CURRICULUM ONLY) 1a) Materials address the content of 90% of the GLEs.	N/A	
Materials adequately address the <u>Louisiana's Grade-Level</u> <u>Expectations (GLEs)</u> at sufficient depth, accuracy, and quality to build social studies content knowledge.	1b) Materials provide regular opportunities for students to explore key questions and build knowledge and skills with the social studies content indicated by the GLEs.	Yes	Materials do provide regular opportunities for students to explore key questions and build knowledge and skills within social studies content. For example, American History Volume 1 features the most lessons where students are exploring key questions aligned with the GLEs. This is also seen in a lesson location in Florida History (What types of citizens does a democracy need). In American History Volume 2 there are also lessons that align with the GLEs
Tier 1 and 2 Non-Negotiable2. RANGE AND VOLUME OFSOURCES:Materials include varied types ofprimary and secondary sourcesthat support students'understanding of social studiescontent.YesNo	REQUIRED 2a) The main focus of the materials is on primary and secondary sources ¹ to develop content knowledge and express claims; materials may also include text to support students in using the sources.	Yes	All units have the option of a long or short version. The short version contains between 8-12 primary and/or secondary sources. The long version contains 14-18 primary and/or secondary sources. Students are given multiple opportunities to develop content knowledge and express claims. In the set titled, "Cabeza de Vaca, How did he Survive?" students are asked to use four primary and secondary sources to develop knowledge. These materials include maps,

¹ Primary sources provide first-hand testimony or direct evidence concerning a topic under investigation and are created by witnesses or recorders who experienced the events or conditions being documented. Often these sources are created at the time when the events or conditions are occurring, but primary sources can also include autobiographies, memoirs, and oral histories recorded later. Primary sources are characterized by their content, regardless of whether they are available in original format, in microfilm/microfiche, in digital format, or in published format. (<u>http://www.yale.edu/collections_collaborative/primarysources/primarysources.html</u>) For additional definitions and examples, see also: <u>http://www.princeton.edu/~refdesk/primary2.html</u> and <u>http://www.archives.gov/education/research/history-in-the-raw.html</u>.

CRITERIA	INDICATORS OF SUPERIOR QUALITY	MEETS METRICS (YES/NO)	JUSTIFICATION/COMMENTS WITH EXAMPLES
	REQUIRED	Yes	timelines, paintings and excerpts. Also, an audio support option is available which reads the additional text information aloud if needed There are also background essays in all of the units for the student version which preface the sources portion of the student version of the materials. Materials include primary and secondary
	2b) Materials include primary and secondary sources of different types (i.e., print and non-print, including video, audio, art, maps, charts, etc.) and varied lengths.		sources and they are of different types and lengths. For example in American History Volume 2, the lesson, What Caused the Dust Bowl, contains photographs, charts and quotes in one lesson. In the lesson, "What was Harriet Tubman's Greatest Achievement?" students are provided with maps, a trip log, photographs and personal accounts. Although the DBQ resources do not include videos or audio files, the materials that are included cover a wide range of primary and secondary sources that students can use to support their understanding of social studies.
	2c) Materials focus on both primary and secondary sources from different perspectives to allow opportunities for comparison and contrast, including sourcing ² and corroboration. ³	Yes	Materials focus on both primary and secondary sources. There are multiple opportunities for students to analyze different perspectives, compare and contrast including sourcing and corroboration. The lesson, "How did the Constitution guard

² Sourcing asks students to consider a document's author, occasion, and purpose to determine how those factors influence the content.

³ Corroboration asks students to determine points where details and evidence across multiple documents agree and disagree.

CRITERIA	INDICATORS OF SUPERIOR QUALITY	MEETS METRICS (YES/NO)	JUSTIFICATION/COMMENTS WITH EXAMPLES
			against Tyranny?" located in Mini-Qs U.S.
			History Volume 1, allows the students to
			source and corroborate and is most aligned
			with the fourth grade GLEs for standard 7-
			government and political systems. In Florida
			History, the lesson, "Why are Hurricanes so
			dangerous?" features multiple secondary
			sources and allows multiple opportunities
			for souring. In the Civics unit there are also
			opportunities for students to compare and
			contrast documents from different
			perspectives, such as the lesson "The Ideals
			of the Declaration: Which are most
			important?" Also, in "Remembering the
			Alamo: A Personal Journal," students are
			asked to put themselves in the place of an
			Alamo defender based on the various
			accounts of events from the sources.
			Document A provides a speech from a war
			general in hopes of convincing troops to stay
			involved in the fight, while Document B
			shows a letter written from the American
			perspective. Students are asked to consider
			perspectives of both authors as well as
			determine where details between both
			accounts, comparing and contrasting
			perspectives. For example, in the Valley
			Forge lesson, the individual units provide
			students with opportunities to view sources
			from different perspectivesespecially in the
			form of looking at different sides of an

CRITERIA	INDICATORS OF SUPERIOR QUALITY	MEETS METRICS (YES/NO)	JUSTIFICATION/COMMENTS WITH EXAMPLES
			argument.
	2d) Materials focus on both primary and secondary sources from different time periods to enable students to make connections within and across time periods, including contextualization. ⁴	Yes	Materials focus on both primary and secondary sources from different time periods. In the Civics unit the lesson "The Ideals of the Declaration: Which are most important?" students are given the opportunity to contextualize through primary sources from the Women's Rights Convention and 1848 and secondary sources from the Affordable Care Act (2010). Also in the Civics unit, the lesson, "Should the Electoral College be abolished?" features materials that enable students to contextualize through secondary sources, graphs from the 1990 and 1982 presidential elections and primary source documents from a political scientists' essay in 2012. Materials are also located in U.S. History, Volume 1, in lessons such as: "Early Jamestown: Why did so many colonists die? and "What caused the Salem Witch Trial hysteria in 1692?" In U.S. history, Volume 2, contextualization is featured in, "Politics or principals: Why did LBJ sign the Civil Rights Act of 1964?" and "Should the U.S. drill for oil in Alaska's wilderness?" Also, in the lesson, "Why did Spain settle St. Augustine," students are asked to use what they already

⁴ Contextualization asks students to determine the time and place a document was created and examine how those factors influence the content.

CRITERIA	INDICATORS OF SUPERIOR QUALITY	MEETS METRICS (YES/NO)	JUSTIFICATION/COMMENTS WITH EXAMPLES
Section II. Claims Tier 1 and 2 Non-Negotiable 3. QUESTIONS AND TASKS: Materials offer opportunities to elicit direct, observable evidence of the degree to which students can independently demonstrate	REQUIRED 3a) Questions and tasks focus on engaging students with content in varied contexts (e.g., examining different sources, completing tasks, answering multiple-choice questions, engaging in speaking/listening).	Yes	know about Christopher Columbus' explorations to make connections to what they will learn about St. Augustine. Document A shows a painting that was created in 1965 as a secondary source, based on the 1565 event. In many of the units covering Jamestown, students are given sources that come from the original time period discussed in the unit as well as modern secondary sources that offer interpretations of historical events for students to consider. Materials focus on engaging students with content in varied contexts. All units contain multiple different sources and document analysis questions, which assist students in recording their understanding of the
the grade-level expectations with source(s) described in Criteria 2 and genuinely measure how well students are able to understand social studies content.			sources. In the lesson, "What types of Citizen Does a Democracy Need?" students are asked the larger focus question through the completion of mini tasks. Students are first asked to engage in speaking/listening with a partner by rating different activities that will help them determine characteristics needed of active citizens. They are then asked to answer sourcing and contextualizing questions based on the documents to assist them in writing a cumulative essay. They also have a "bucketing" process, which allows students to compile their understanding of

CRITERIA	INDICATORS OF SUPERIOR QUALITY	MEETS METRICS (YES/NO)	JUSTIFICATION/COMMENTS WITH EXAMPLES
			each source and examine how it contributes to the overall question of the task. Each unit also has literacy tools which feature activities such as "think alouds and collaborative reading" which allow students to engage in speaking and listening.
	REQUIRED 3b) Coherent sequences of source-dependent questions ⁵ and tasks focus students on building, applying, and synthesizing knowledge and skills through various sources, classroom research, conversations, etc. to develop an understanding of social studies content.	Yes	There is a coherent sequence of source- dependent questions and tasks that focus on building, applying, and synthesizing knowledge and skills. In the lesson, "The Ideals of the Declaration: Which is Most Important?" students are asked to synthesize knowledge from the Declaration to identify those that are most important to what the United States came to be as a nation. They are provided with 4 sources and source-dependent questions to form an opinion based on this stimulus material. All lessons in the mini-DBQ units feature tasks that help students build knowledge and a coherent sequence of source dependent questions is present. In addition to this, each unit features the literacy tools which engage students in group conversations about the sources with exercises such as: say something, funnel protocol and save the last word for me. Questions in all mini DBQ units focus on synthesizing, building and applying

⁵ Source-dependent questions or tasks are those that require students to pull information from a given source(s) to answer the question. Students still pull from prior learning, but the evidentiary support required in the students' responses are dependent upon the source(s).

CRITERIA	INDICATORS OF SUPERIOR QUALITY	MEETS METRICS (YES/NO)	JUSTIFICATION/COMMENTS WITH EXAMPLES
			knowledge.
	REQUIRED 3c) Source-dependent written and oral tasks require students to make claims which demonstrate understanding of social studies content (e.g., make connections between ideas, people, and events; explain how society, the environment, the political and economic landscape, and historical events influence perspectives, values, traditions, and ideas; evaluate the causes and consequences of events and developments; recognize recurring themes across time and place).	Yes	Source dependent written tasks are consistent and continuous among all mini DBQ units. The oral tasks are featured in the literacy tools portion of the units. All units require students to make written claims to demonstrate understanding of social studies content. In addition to the written tasks, which serve as the culminating product of the units, there are also oral tasks (discussions, etc.) that are built into the units to support student understanding as they analyze the sources. Materials also provide options for conducting debates as the learning product in lieu of the essay when the question framing the unit is appropriate for a debate structure.
	FULL CURRICULUM ONLY 3d) Materials use varied modes of assessment, including a range of pre-, formative, summative and self-assessment measures that are unbiased and accessible to all students.	N/A	
	FULL CURRICULUM ONLY 3e) Aligned rubrics or assessment guidelines (such as scoring guides) are included and provide sufficient guidance for interpreting student performance.	N/A	
4. RESPONSE TO SOURCES: Materials provide frequent opportunities for students to engage in discussions (both formal and informal) around the content and then express their	REQUIRED 4a) Writing opportunities for students occur on a regular basis and are varied in length and time demands (e.g., notes, summaries, short-answer responses, whole-class shared writing/formal essays, on-demand and process writing, etc.).	Yes	Writing opportunities for students occur on a regular basis and are varied in length and time demands. These opportunities are frequent throughout all mini-DBQ units Each writing assignment varies in length. Within the lesson, "Cabeza de Vaca, How did he

CRITERIA	INDICATORS OF SUPERIOR QUALITY	MEETS METRICS (YES/NO)	JUSTIFICATION/COMMENTS WITH EXAMPLES
understanding of the content through the development and support of claims in writing. Yes No			Survive?" students are asked to write a short summary in the beginning of the lesson. The middle of the lesson asks the students to add additional information to their original short writing. At the end of this lesson, students must build upon information gathered throughout the mini-DBQ and create a long write essay.
	REQUIRED (GRADES 3-12 ONLY) 4b) A vast majority of written and speaking tasks require students to present and develop claims with clear explanations and well-chosen information from sources and outside knowledge.	Yes	All of the written tasks require students to present and develop claims with clear explanations from sources and outside knowledge. The task set "Early Jamestown" asks students to engage in written tasks, which assist them in developing claims with clear explanations. Well-chosen information from sources and outside knowledge are included in these required tasks.
	REQUIRED 4c) Materials provide regular opportunities to develop students' skill in organizing and supporting their thinking in speaking and writing, including using evidence from sources and outside knowledge.	Yes	Materials provide regular opportunities to develop students' skills in organizing and supporting their thinking in writing using evidence from the sources and outside knowledge. The oral opportunities are present in the literacy portions of each unit.
	FULL CURRICULUM ONLY 4d) Materials provide regular opportunities for students to conduct shared (grades K-2) or short research projects to develop the expertise needed to conduct research independently.	N/A	
	4e) Materials build students' active listening skills, such as taking notes on main ideas, asking relevant questions, and elaborating on remarks of others to develop understanding of topics, sources, and tasks.	Yes	Materials build students' active listening skills through taking notes on main ideas, asking relevant questions and elaborating on

CRITERIA	INDICATORS OF SUPERIOR QUALITY	MEETS METRICS (YES/NO)	JUSTIFICATION/COMMENTS WITH EXAMPLES
			remarks of others to understand topics. Each unit features the literacy tools, which engage students in-group conversations about the sources, which allow the students to elaborate on the remarks of others to understand the sources and topics. Questions in all mini DBQ units focus on having students take notes on main ideas and asking relevant questions. In addition, there are literacy strategies such as think aloud, say something, funnel protocol, and save the last word that can be used within the units to support the development of students' active listening skills; there are also opportunities for students to engage in debates instead of written products to further develop their speaking and listening skills.
	4f) Materials provide models for writing and student exemplars to support writing development in social studies.	Yes	Materials provide models for writing student exemplars to support writing development in social studies. These are shown in the teacher's toolkit portion of the units. The "bucketing" process features student exemplars, which can guide teachers to specific focuses of the content for each unit. The toolkit also allows teachers to scaffold in order to reach these exemplars through the document analysis in the units. There are also student exemplars for writing available in the Mini-Qs.

Section III. Scaffolding and Support

CRITERIA	INDICATORS OF SUPERIOR QUALITY	MEETS METRICS (YES/NO)	JUSTIFICATION/COMMENTS WITH EXAMPLES
 5. SCAFFOLDING AND SUPPORT: Materials provide all students with extensive opportunities and support to explore key questions using multiple sources to make claims about social studies content. Yes No 	REQUIRED 5a) Activities and suggested approaches guide teachers on how to scaffold instruction for students to build understanding of the content.	Yes	Activities and suggested approaches guide teachers on how to scaffold instruction for students to build understanding of the content. This is available in the teacher's toolkit portion of the units. All mini units feature a toolkit portion where teachers are given a breakdown of all of the sources and the six-step process to guide students through the "bucketing" process. There are also two versions of each mini DBQ unit which showcase an enhanced version which is more scaffolded and a clean version which has no support but the same documents. There are also two versions, the short version that contains 8-12 lesson documents and the long version, which contains 14-18 documents.
	REQUIRED 5b) The materials are easy to use and well organized for students and teachers.	Yes	The materials are easy to use and organized for students and teachers. Teachers are given a dashboard where they can assign units to their classes. Students are given access to multiple primary and secondary source documents as well as interactive web-based recording fields. The teacher toolkit provides step-by-step information for teachers to provide students assistance through the writing process.

CRITERIA	INDICATORS OF SUPERIOR QUALITY	MEETS METRICS (YES/NO)	JUSTIFICATION/COMMENTS WITH EXAMPLES
	5c) Appropriate suggestions and materials are provided for supporting varying student needs at the unit and lesson level (e.g., alternate teaching approaches, pacing, instructional delivery options, suggestions for addressing common student difficulties to meet standards, etc.).	Yes	Appropriate suggestions and materials are provided for supporting various student needs at the unit and lesson level. These are available in the teacher's toolkit portion of the units. All mini units feature a toolkit portion where teachers are given a breakdown of all of the sources and the six- step process to guide students through the "bucketing" process. There are also two versions of each mini DBQ unit which showcase an enhanced version which is more scaffolded and a clean version which has no support but the same documents. There are also two versions, the short version that contains 8-12 lesson documents and the long version, which contains 14-18 documents. Teachers can determine how to teach each "unit" based on their students as the materials provide different options to support different levels. (Mini-Qs come in 2 versions. The Enhanced Version (EV) is highly scaffolded. The Clean Version (CV) includes the same documents, but no support. DBQ units come in a Long Version has 8-12 documents while the Long Version has 14- 18.) In addition, they also include strategies and audio of the text.

CRITERIA	INDICATORS OF SUPERIOR QUALITY	MEETS METRICS (YES/NO)	JUSTIFICATION/COMMENTS WITH EXAMPLES
	5d) The content can be reasonably completed within a regular school year and the pacing of content allows for maximum student understanding. The materials provide guidance about the amount of time a task might reasonably take.	Yes	The content can be reasonably completed within a regular school year and the pacing of the content allows for maximum student understanding. The materials provide guidance about the time a task might reasonably take. These are featured in the teacher toolkit portion of the unit. If teachers follow the provided pacing guides, the activities for each individual unit can be completed within one week of instructional time.
Tier 3 ratings receive a "No" in Col	lumn 1 for all non-negotiable criteria, but at least one "No" in Co umn 1 for at least one of the non-negotiable criteria.	olumn 1 for the r	emaining criteria.
Section	VII to make a final decision for the material under review. Criteria	Yes/No	Final Justification/Comments
l: Content	1. Scope and Quality of Content (Non-Negotiable)	Yes	Materials do adequately address the Louisiana GLEs and the quality of content in regards to depth and accuracy to build social studies content knowledge is present.
	2. Range and Volume of Sources (Non-Negotiable)	Yes	Range and volume of sources meet outlined criteria. Materials present include a wide variety of primary and secondary sources.
II: Claims	3. Questions and Tasks (Non-Negotiable)	Yes	Questions and tasks do meet outlined criteria. Materials offer opportunities for students to elicit direct, observable evidence of the degree to which students can independently demonstrate the grade-level expectations with source(s).
	4. Response to Sources	Yes	Materials provide frequent opportunities for the students to engage in discussions about the content and express their understanding

CRITERIA	INDICATORS OF SUPERIOR QUALITY	MEETS METRICS (YES/NO)	JUSTIFICATION/COMMENTS WITH EXAMPLES
			of the content through the development and support of claims in writing.
III: Scaffolding and Support	5. Scaffolding and Support	Yes	Materials provide all students with extensive opportunities and support key questions using multiple sources to make claims about social studies content.
FINAL DECISION FOR THIS MATERIAL: Tier I, Exemplifies quality			





The goal for social studies students is develop a deep, conceptual understanding of the content, as demonstrated through writing and speaking about the content. Strong social studies instruction is built around these priorities.

Content: Students build an understanding of social studies content.

- They examine authentic sources to build knowledge of social studies content.
- They explore meaningful questions about sources and content to build understanding.

Claims: Students develop and express claims that demonstrate their understanding of content.

- They make connections among ideas, people, and events across time and place.
- They express understanding of content using evidence from authentic sources and outside knowledge.

Title: Mini-Qs in World History Volume 2, American History Volume 1, and Florida History	Grade/Course: <u>5</u>
Publisher: The DBQ Company dba The DBQ Project	Copyright: 2016

Curriculum Type: Supplemental

Overall Rating: Tier I, Exemplifies quality

Tier I, Tier II, Tier III Elements of this review:

STRONG	WEAK
1. Scope and Quality of Content (Non-Negotiable)	
2. Range and Volume of Sources (Non-Negotiable)	
3. Questions and Tasks (Non-Negotiable)	
4. Response to Sources	
5. Scaffolding and Support	

To evaluate each set of submitted materials for alignment with the <u>standards</u>, begin by reviewing Column 2 for the nonnegotiable criteria. If there is a "Yes" for all required indicators in Column 2, then the materials receive a "Yes" in Column 1. If there is a "No" for any required indicators in Column 2, then the materials receive a "No" in Column 1. (Note: If materials do not represent a full curricula, then some of Criteria 1 - 5 may not apply.)

Tier 1 ratings receive a "Yes" in Column 1 for Criteria 1 – 5.

Tier 2 ratings receive a "Yes" in Column 1 for all non-negotiable criteria, but at least one "No" in Column 1 for the remaining criteria.

Tier 3 ratings receive a "No" in Column 1 for at least one of the non-negotiable criteria.

CRITERIA	INDICATORS OF SUPERIOR QUALITY	MEETS METRICS (YES/NO)	JUSTIFICATION/COMMENTS WITH EXAMPLES
Section I. Content			
Tier 1 and 2 Non-Negotiable 1. SCOPE AND QUALITY OF CONTENT:	REQUIRED (FULL CURRICULUM ONLY) 1a) Materials address the content of 90% of the GLEs.	N/A	
Materials adequately address the Louisiana's Grade-Level Expectations (GLEs) at sufficient depth, accuracy, and quality to build social studies content knowledge. Yes No	1b) Materials provide regular opportunities for students to explore key questions and build knowledge and skills with the social studies content indicated by the GLEs.	Yes	Materials do provide regular opportunities for students to explore key questions and build knowledge and skills within social studies content. American History Volume 1 features the most lessons where students are exploring key questions. This is also seen in one lesson location in Florida History (Cabeza de Vaca: How did he survive?). In World History Volume 2 the lesson that is most aligned with the content indicated by the GLEs is the lesson "The Maya: What Was Their Most Remarkable Achievement." This lesson features students asked to produce clear and coherent writing through research and the use of primary and secondary sources (standard 5.1.4). Students are also asked to describe characteristics of the Mayan prior to European exploration (standard 5.2.1).

CRITERIA	INDICATORS OF SUPERIOR QUALITY	MEETS METRICS (YES/NO)	JUSTIFICATION/COMMENTS WITH EXAMPLES
Tier 1 and 2 Non-Negotiable 2. RANGE AND VOLUME OF SOURCES: Materials include varied types of primary and secondary sources that support students' understanding of social studies content. Yes No	REQUIRED 2a) The main focus of the materials is on primary and secondary sources ⁶ to develop content knowledge and express claims; materials may also include text to support students in using the sources.	Yes	The main focus of the materials is on primary and secondary sources to develop content knowledge and express claims. In the lesson, "The Maya: What Was Their Most Remarkable Achievement," students are tasked with using primary and secondary sources to create an informed opinion on social studies content by answering document based questions for each of the 4 provided documents that all help build to a conceptual answer for the overarching question. All units have the option of a long or short version. The short version contains between 8-12 primary and/or secondary sources. The long version contains 14-18 primary and/or secondary sources. An audio support option is available which reads the additional text information aloud if needed There are also background essays in all of the units for the student version which preface the sources portion of the student version of the materials.
	REQUIRED 2b) Materials include primary and secondary sources of different types (i.e., print and non-print, including video, audio, art, maps, charts, etc.) and varied lengths.	Yes	Materials include primary and secondary sources and they are of different types and lengths. For example in World History Volume 2, the lesson, "The Aztecs: Should

⁶ Primary sources provide first-hand testimony or direct evidence concerning a topic under investigation and are created by witnesses or recorders who experienced the events or conditions being documented. Often these sources are created at the time when the events or conditions are occurring, but primary sources can also include autobiographies, memoirs, and oral histories recorded later. Primary sources are characterized by their content, regardless of whether they are available in original format, in microfilm/microfiche, in digital format, or in published format. (<u>http://www.yale.edu/collections_collaborative/primarysources/primarysources.html</u>) For additional definitions and examples, see also: <u>http://www.princeton.edu/~refdesk/primary2.html</u> and <u>http://www.archives.gov/education/research/history-in-the-raw.html</u>.

CRITERIA	INDICATORS OF SUPERIOR QUALITY	MEETS METRICS (YES/NO)	JUSTIFICATION/COMMENTS WITH EXAMPLES
	2c) Materials focus on both primary and secondary sources from different perspectives to allow opportunities for comparison and contrast, including sourcing ⁷ and corroboration. ⁸	Yes	historians emphasize agriculture or human sacrifice?" contains maps, drawings and murals in one lesson. Although the resources do not include videos or audio files, the materials that are included cover a wide range of primary and secondary sources that students can use to support their understanding of social studies. Materials focus on both primary and secondary sources. There are multiple opportunities for students to analyze different perspectives, compare and contrast including sourcing and corroboration. In the lesson, "The Maya: What Was Their Most Remarkable Achievement," students are tasked with using primary and secondary sources to examine different perspectives. Students are able to compare and contrast, source and corroborate through this lesson as well. In the lesson on Aztecs, the individual units provide students with opportunities to view sources from different
			perspectivesespecially in the form of looking at different sides of an argument.

⁷ Sourcing asks students to consider a document's author, occasion, and purpose to determine how those factors influence the content.

⁸ Corroboration asks students to determine points where details and evidence across multiple documents agree and disagree.

CRITERIA	INDICATORS OF SUPERIOR QUALITY	MEETS METRICS (YES/NO)	JUSTIFICATION/COMMENTS WITH EXAMPLES
	2d) Materials focus on both primary and secondary sources from different time periods to enable students to make connections within and across time periods, including contextualization. ⁹	Yes	Materials focus on both primary and secondary sources from different time periods. In "What Caused the Salem Witch Trials Hysteria of 1692?" students are asked to examine five primary and secondary sources to identify the cause for the Salem Witch Trials. These sources include a death toll chart as well as a historian's opinion of the hysteria, based on primary source records. Here students are allowed to contextualize and make connections within and across time periods to better understand the content. In many of the units covering the Declaration of Independence, students are given sources that come from the original time period discussed in the unit as well as modern secondary sources that offer interpretations of historical events for students to consider.
Section II. Claims			
Tier 1 and 2 Non-Negotiable 3. QUESTIONS AND TASKS: Materials offer opportunities to elicit direct, observable evidence of the degree to which students can independently demonstrate the grade-level expectations with source(s) described in Criteria 2 and genuinely measure how well	REQUIRED 3a) Questions and tasks focus on engaging students with content in varied contexts (e.g., examining different sources, completing tasks, answering multiple-choice questions, engaging in speaking/listening).	Yes	Materials focus on engaging students with content in varied contexts. All units contain multiple different sources and document analysis questions, which assist students in recording their understanding of the sources. They also have a "bucketing" process, which allows students to compile their understanding of each source and

⁹ Contextualization asks students to determine the time and place a document was created and examine how those factors influence the content.

CRITERIA	INDICATORS OF SUPERIOR QUALITY	MEETS METRICS (YES/NO)	JUSTIFICATION/COMMENTS WITH EXAMPLES
students are able to understand social studies content.	REQUIRED	Yes	examine how it contributes to the overall question of the task. In, "What Caused the Salem Witch Trials Hysteria of 1692?" students are asked to examine five primary and secondary sources to identify the cause for the Salem Witch Trials. These sources include a death toll chart as well as a historian's opinion of the hysteria, based on primary source records. Each unit also has literacy tools which feature activities such as "think alouds and collaborative reading" which allow students to engage in speaking and listening. There is a coherent sequence of source-
	3b) Coherent sequences of source-dependent questions ¹⁰ and tasks focus students on building, applying, and synthesizing knowledge and skills through various sources, classroom research, conversations, etc. to develop an understanding of social studies content.		dependent questions and tasks that focus on building, applying, and synthesizing knowledge and skills. All lessons in the mini- DBQ units feature tasks that help students build knowledge and a coherent sequence of source dependent questions is present. In addition to this, each unit features the literacy tools which engage students in group conversations about the sources with exercises such as: say something, funnel protocol and save the last word for me. In, the lesson "Cabeza De Vaca: How did he Survive?" students are asked to answer source dependent questions on each of the

¹⁰ Source-dependent questions or tasks are those that require students to pull information from a given source(s) to answer the question. Students still pull from prior learning, but the evidentiary support required in the students' responses are dependent upon the source(s).

CRITERIA	INDICATORS OF SUPERIOR QUALITY	MEETS METRICS (YES/NO)	JUSTIFICATION/COMMENTS WITH EXAMPLES
			four sources within the set. The task focuses students on applying and synthesizing knowledge and skills through various sources to develop and understanding of the content and to ultimately use this knowledge to write a cohesive essay. Questions in all mini DBQ units focus on synthesizing, building and applying knowledge.
	REQUIRED 3c) Source-dependent written and oral tasks require students to make claims which demonstrate understanding of social studies content (e.g., make connections between ideas, people, and events; explain how society, the environment, the political and economic landscape, and historical events influence perspectives, values, traditions, and ideas; evaluate the causes and consequences of events and developments; recognize recurring themes across time and place).	Yes	Source dependent written tasks are consistent and continuous among all mini DBQ units. The oral tasks are featured in the literacy tools portion of the units. All units require students to make written claims to demonstrate understanding of social studies content. All units require students to make written claims to demonstrate understanding of social studies content. In addition to the written tasks, which serve as the culminating product of the units, there are also oral tasks (discussions, etc.) that are built into the units to support student understanding as they analyze the sources. Materials also provide options for conducting debates as the learning product in lieu of the essay when the question framing the unit is appropriate for a debate structure.
	FULL CURRICULUM ONLY 3d) Materials use varied modes of assessment, including a	N/A	
	range of pre-, formative, summative and self-assessment measures that are unbiased and accessible to all students.		

CRITERIA	INDICATORS OF SUPERIOR QUALITY	MEETS METRICS (YES/NO)	JUSTIFICATION/COMMENTS WITH EXAMPLES
	FULL CURRICULUM ONLY 3e) Aligned rubrics or assessment guidelines (such as scoring guides) are included and provide sufficient guidance for interpreting student performance.	N/A	
 4. RESPONSE TO SOURCES: Materials provide frequent opportunities for students to engage in discussions (both formal and informal) around the content and then express their understanding of the content through the development and support of claims in writing. Yes No 	REQUIRED 4a) Writing opportunities for students occur on a regular basis and are varied in length and time demands (e.g., notes, summaries, short-answer responses, whole-class shared writing/formal essays, on-demand and process writing, etc.).	Yes	Writing opportunities for students occur on a regular basis and are varied in length and time demands. These opportunities are frequent throughout all mini-DBQ units. Within the lesson, "Renaissance" students are asked to first to compile two lists. Within the middle of the lesson, students are asked to build upon these lists by answering questions about documents. The final task asks students to create a long write essay featuring information gathered throughout the lesson.
	 REQUIRED (GRADES 3-12 ONLY) 4b) A vast majority of written and speaking tasks require students to present and develop claims with clear explanations and well-chosen information from sources and outside knowledge. 	Yes	The tasks in the individual units require students to present claims that require evidence from both the supplied sources as well as their background knowledge. Well- chosen information from sources and outside knowledge are included in these required tasks.
	REQUIRED 4c) Materials provide regular opportunities to develop students' skill in organizing and supporting their thinking in speaking and writing, including using evidence from sources and outside knowledge.	Yes	Materials provide regular opportunities to develop students' skills in organizing and supporting their thinking in writing using evidence from the sources and outside knowledge. The speaking opportunities are only featured in the literacy portion of the units.

CRITERIA	INDICATORS OF SUPERIOR QUALITY	MEETS METRICS (YES/NO)	JUSTIFICATION/COMMENTS WITH EXAMPLES
	FULL CURRICULUM ONLY 4d) Materials provide regular opportunities for students to conduct shared (grades K-2) or short research projects to develop the expertise needed to conduct research independently.	N/A	
	4e) Materials build students' active listening skills, such as taking notes on main ideas, asking relevant questions, and elaborating on remarks of others to develop understanding of topics, sources, and tasks.	Yes	Materials build students' active listening skills through taking notes on main ideas, asking relevant questions and elaborating on remarks of others to understand topics. Each unit features the literacy tools, which engage students in-group conversations about the sources, which allow the students to elaborate on the remarks of others to understand the sources and topics. Questions in all mini DBQ units focus on having students take notes on main ideas and asking relevant questions. In addition, there are literacy strategies such as think aloud, say something, funnel protocol, and save the last word that can be used within the units to support the development of students' active listening skills; there are also opportunities for students to engage in debates instead of written products to further develop their speaking and listening skills.
	4f) Materials provide models for writing and student exemplars to support writing development in social studies.	Yes	Materials provide models for writing student exemplars to support writing development in social studies. These are shown in the teacher's toolkit portion of the units. The "bucketing" process features student

CRITERIA	INDICATORS OF SUPERIOR QUALITY	MEETS METRICS (YES/NO)	JUSTIFICATION/COMMENTS WITH EXAMPLES
Section III. Scaffolding and Supp	oort		exemplars, which can guide teachers to specific focuses of the content for each unit. The toolkit also allows teachers to scaffold in order to reach these exemplars through the document analysis in the units. There are also student exemplars for writing available in the Mini-Qs.
5. SCAFFOLDING AND SUPPORT: Materials provide all students with extensive opportunities and support to explore key questions using multiple sources to make claims about social studies content. Yes No	REQUIRED 5a) Activities and suggested approaches guide teachers on how to scaffold instruction for students to build understanding of the content.	Yes	Activities and suggested approaches guide teachers on how to scaffold instruction for students to build understanding of the content. This is available in the teacher's toolkit portion of the units. All mini units feature a toolkit portion where teachers are given a breakdown of all of the sources and the six-step process to guide students through the "bucketing" process. There are also two versions of each mini DBQ unit which showcase an enhanced version which is more scaffolded and a clean version which has no support but the same documents. There are also two versions, the short version which contains 8-12 lesson documents and the long version which contains 14-18 documents
	REQUIRED 5b) The materials are easy to use and well organized for students and teachers.	Yes	The materials are easy to use and organized for students and teachers. Teachers are given a dashboard where they can assign units to their classes. Students are given access to multiple primary and secondary source documents as well as interactive

CRITERIA	INDICATORS OF SUPERIOR QUALITY	MEETS METRICS (YES/NO)	JUSTIFICATION/COMMENTS WITH EXAMPLES
	5c) Appropriate suggestions and materials are provided for	Yes	web-based recording fields. The teacher toolkit provides step-by-step information for teachers to provide students assistance through the writing process.
	5c) Appropriate suggestions and materials are provided for supporting varying student needs at the unit and lesson level (e.g., alternate teaching approaches, pacing, instructional delivery options, suggestions for addressing common student difficulties to meet standards, etc.).	Yes	Appropriate suggestions and materials are provided for supporting various student needs at the unit and lesson level. These are available in the teacher's toolkit portion of the units. All mini units feature a toolkit portion where teachers are given a breakdown of all of the sources and the six- step process to guide students through the "bucketing" process. There are also two versions of each mini DBQ unit which showcase an enhanced version which is more scaffolded and a clean version which has no support but the same documents. There are also two versions, the short version that contains 8-12 lesson documents and the long version, which contains 14-18 documents. Teachers can determine how to teach each "unit" based on their students as the materials provide different options to support different levels. (Mini-Qs come in 2 versions. The Enhanced Version (EV) is highly scaffolded. The Clean Version (CV) includes the same documents, but no support. DBQ units come in a Long Version (LV) and a Short Version (SV). The Short Version has 8-12 documents while the Long Version has 14- 18.) In addition, they also include strategies

CRITERIA	INDICATORS OF SUPERIOR QUALITY	MEETS METRICS (YES/NO)	JUSTIFICATION/COMMENTS WITH EXAMPLES
			and audio of the text.
	5d) The content can be reasonably completed within a regular school year and the pacing of content allows for maximum student understanding. The materials provide guidance about the amount of time a task might reasonably take.	Yes	The content can be reasonably completed within a regular school year and the pacing of the content allows for maximum student understanding. The materials provide guidance about the time a task might reasonably take. These are featured in the teacher toolkit portion of the unit. If teachers follow the provided pacing guides, the activities for each individual unit can be completed within one week of instructional time.
FINAL EVALUATION Tier 1 ratings receive a "Yes" in Co	lumn 1 for Criteria 1 – 5.		

Tier 2 ratings receive a "Yes" in Column 1 for all non-negotiable criteria, but at least one "No" in Column 1 for the remaining criteria. *Tier 3 ratings* receive a "No" in Column 1 for at least one of the non-negotiable criteria.

Compile the results for Sections I-VII to make a final decision for the material under review

Section	Criteria	Yes/No	Final Justification/Comments
		Yes	Materials do adequately address the
	1. Scope and Quality of Content (Non-Negotiable)		Louisiana GLEs and the quality of content in
			regards to depth and accuracy to build social
I: Content			studies content knowledge is present.
	2. Range and Volume of Sources (Non-Negotiable)	Yes	Range and volume of sources meet outlined
			criteria. Materials present include a wide
			variety of primary and secondary sources.
		Yes	Questions and tasks meet outlined criteria.
II: Claims			Materials offer opportunities for students to
	3. Questions and Tasks (Non-Negotiable)		elicit direct, observable evidence of the
			degree to which students can independently
			demonstrate the grade-level expectations
			with source(s)

CRITERIA	INDICATORS OF SUPERIOR QUALITY	MEETS METRICS (YES/NO)	JUSTIFICATION/COMMENTS WITH EXAMPLES
	4. Response to Sources	Yes	Materials provide frequent opportunities for the students to engage in discussions about the content and express their understanding of the content through the development and support of claims in writing.
III: Scaffolding and Support	5. Scaffolding and Support	Yes	Materials provide all students with extensive opportunities and support key questions using multiple sources to make claims about social studies content.
FINAL DECISION FOR THIS MATERIAL: Tier I, Exemplifies quality			

Appendix I.

Publisher Response

The publisher had no response.

Appendix II.

Public Comments

There were no public comments submitted.